Contents

Prelude vii

Prefaces ix

Foreword xv

Perspectives and Framework

1 International perspectives on music education policies 3
   Chi Cheung LEUNG, Lai Chi Rita YIP and Tadahiko IMADA

2 A theoretical framework on effective implementation of music/arts education policy in schools 8
   Chi Cheung LEUNG

From Policy to Practice

3 A new policy, a new approach, a change in culture: Putting the arts at the centre of the curriculum 19
   Martin COMTE

4 Policy and practice in music education: Elementary education through an integrated arts approach in two cultural contexts, Canada and Japan 25
   Joi FREED-GARROD, Ritsuko KOJIMA, and Stan GARROD

5 The arts and culture policy scenario in South Africa 41
   Schalk FREDERICKS

6 The impacts of school policies on music education in Hong Kong: Four case studies 52
   Chi Cheung LEUNG and Lai Chi Rita YIP

7 Music education curriculum, new media policies, and the next generation: A philosophical opportunity 63
   J. Scott GOBLE

8 Policy studies as a component of music teacher education: Building the profession’s capacity for strategic action 72
Patrick M. JONES

Creativity and Assessment

9 Policy and music education: A “new” culture of “creativity”?
Neryl JEANNERET and David FORREST

10 The impact of music education policy on creative music making in the school music curriculum
Jane Wai Yee CHEUNG-YUNG, Estella Suk Ching CHAM-LAI, and Clarence Wai Chu MAK

11 Policy to practice: Support for secondary music teachers implementing mandatory information and communication technology requirements in New South Wales government schools
Julie MONTAGUE

12 Soundscape, postcolonialism and music education: Experiencing the earliest grain of the body and music
Tadahiko IMADA

13 Assessment for learning in the New South Wales Music Years 7–10 Syllabus: An approach to promote best practice
Jay McPHERSON

14 Establishing standards-based assessment in music performance
Lai Chi Rita YIP

15 Reflections on issues related to assessment and creativity, and music education policies in the United States
Cecilia Chu WANG

16 Points of intersection and the problems of agency and place in assessment and creativity in music
Sandra L. STAUFFER

Traditional and Contemporary Music

17 Inheritance of traditional music faced with globalization impact in schools of
mainland China
Jiaxing XIE

18  The enjoyment of popular music as a valuable experience in music learning 182
Chi Cheung LEUNG and Chi Chung HUNG

19  Between popular and classical music: The creative process of a digital film scoring project in Hong Kong 195
Chi Wai Jason CHEN

20  The effect of the yo-kyoku experiential learning program for music teachers 208
Yayoi BITOH

21  The learning motivations, adjustments, and career expectations of Taiwanese university students majoring in Chinese and traditional music 221
Chio-ling LU and Chun-fei YANG

22  Meaning, autonomy and authenticity in the music classroom 231
Lucy GREEN

Contributors 255

About the Commission 261
Commission on Music in Cultural, Educational and Mass Media Policies in Music Education
Prelude

Liane HENTSCHKE
ISME President 2006-2008

ISME is celebrating 30 years of the Commission on ‘Music in Cultural, Educational, and Mass Media Policies’. During those years, we witnessed the work of the Policy Commission who offered ISME members a unique opportunity to collaborate across countries and cultures and to learn about different experiences of policy development around the world.

Music education is presently facing all sorts of challenges. These include: a) lack of recognition of the importance of music with the notion that music is not an important part of the formal education of children and youth, because it serves only to entertain school children, or as a means to learn other subjects; b) lack of financial support from schools and local government authorities; 3) lack of policies for an adequate music education provision in schools.

In recent years, we have witnessed a weakening of policies supporting music education. In the past, music seemed to be taught for its own sake, where what counted were the intrinsic values of music education. Nowadays, in a majority of countries, music is seen as forming either a small part of arts education or it is considered a cross-disciplinary subject, acquiring almost a subservient role to achieve other learning outcomes. Music is also intrinsically devalued as being the ‘fun’ part of the curriculum. With education becoming a commodity and schools an industry that produces and sells specific goods, music has not always be seen as a subject that can help students to build a professional career and to have good jobs opportunities in the future. This could be one of the main reasons why music lost much of its financial support and has faced the weakening of policies for music education.

Although educational institutions around the world are working to become part of an international system of comparable education, in music it is possible to observe that the diversity of thinking and practicing of music education is almost equivalent to the number of locus in which it happens, making it difficult to circumscribe what is considered “music education” in an international perspective. In many parts of the world music education does not appear in the official curriculum, but it is rather considered as part of the daily life experience, taught and learned in an informal way. In some medium and low HDI (Human Developmental Index),
community music became high on governments’ agenda for promoting economical, social, and health sustainable development. Mainly run by NGOs, the community music program, are spaces where informal music learning and unconventional teaching approaches have been considered an important vehicle to promote the empowerment and social inclusion of disadvantaged children and youth.

Academics and music educators, on the other hand, have been highly committed in searching for effective ways of demonstrating through research, pedagogical experiences, and advocacy programs that music education should be a core subject in our schools, and being valued as any other knowledge area.

The recurrent question has been where to start, if through developing better advocacy programs, or to engage in an effective dialog with educational authorities seeking adequate policies for music education. There is not a unique answer, because all decisions and actions have to be context based, in a sense that there are no universal rules and not a single solution. However, what we can do, and have seen embodied in the work of the Policy Commission, is to engage in an international professional community, such as ISME, and try to learn from experiences of other people from around the world.

As President of ISME I would like to share with our members the honor to celebrate with the editors, and chapter authors of this book, the Commission’s 30th Anniversary. There would be no better way to mark this celebration than by publishing a book that pays homage to a Commission that has devoted it’s time to study of the impact of policies internationally and to contribute to this vital area of our discipline.

My special congratulations!
Prefaces

Liora BRESLER
University of Illinois

This is an important book that connects central issues in music and arts education including curriculum and evaluation to creativity, informal learning and interdisciplinarity, to current policy issues. Warm applause to the editors who have gathered an international group of scholars presenting compelling case-studies from various parts of the world, from Australia, and Canada, to South Africa, England, Japan, China, Hong Kong and Taiwan.
There can be no better way to commemorate the 30th anniversary of the Commission on Music in Cultural, Educational, and Mass Media Policies of the International Society for Music Education (ISME) than with this unique and highly readable publication of *Music Education Policy and Implementation: International Perspectives*. Indeed, the need to critically address, interpret and organize contemporary educational thinking on policy and practice in relation to music/arts education, and provide conceptual definition and theoretical framing to this area of inquiry, is well upon us. In this most timely book, leading thinkers from around the world set out to further our understanding of diverse and critical perspectives on policy agendas and related discourses which significantly influence and underpin different practices and organizing processes in arts/music education. They offer new and critical ways of thinking about issues which illuminate policy and policy gaps, sketched against change agendas that promote the translation of music/arts education policy into practice as rarely a straightforward and unproblematic process. Each chapter confronts some of the myths of music/arts education we have cherished for too long and calls upon us to think critically, politically and strategically; to inform not only teachers, the academic community and possible policy makers but also the general public on the ways in which arts/music education curriculum and practices are shaped by educational reform. This publication highlights how issues of creativity, assessment, curriculum, diversity and achievement (amongst others) have become a powerful agenda for change. Further it highlights how arts/music education is still conceptualized in policy terms as a problem and argues for policies to improve teacher education and include children and young people in developing policy. This book will be essential reading for anyone involved in music education, policy making, school improvement and effectiveness, including academics, music educators, researchers, headteachers and music advisers.
This volume examines real cases across the continents to reveal the impact of policies on music and arts education. It allows readers to think outside of the box and to learn more about self and others. It brings policies to a much heightened level of awareness to music educators of our time.
Foreword

Chi Cheung LEUNG
The Hong Kong Institute of Education

This book, entitled *Music Education Policy and Implementation: International Perspectives*, is published to commemorate the 30th anniversary of the Commission on Music in Cultural, Educational, and Mass Media Policies of the International Society for Music Education (ISME). The book covers a wide range of areas concerning public policies, policy implementation, and the developments in music, art and culture. While recognizing the dynamic nature of policy development and implementation, this book is a critical analysis and expansion of knowledge in the areas concerned from the perspectives of the scholars, policy makers, and government agencies in different parts of the world.

The chapters of this book, developed mainly from the selected papers of the 2006 Commission Seminar held in Hong Kong, have undergone the vigorous and critical processes of blind reviews and peer scrutiny by experts of the professions. The editorial team would like to thank all the reviewers who have given their valuable comments, the organizers of the Commission Seminar, the past and present Commissioners, the Board members of the ISME, the publisher of the University of Hirosaki, and the assistants Tim Hung, Lily Chan, Yuta Takahashi and Kazuya Tani who have contributed to the book. It is through their concerted effort that the plans for this book have come true.
Perspectives and Framework
Chapter 1

International Perspectives on Music Education Policies

Chi Cheung LEUNG, Lai Chi Rita YIP, and Tadahiko IMADA

This book covers a wide spectrum of issues and aspects in music/arts education policy written by scholars coming from five continents: Africa, Asia, Australia, Europe, and North America. The book presents the international perspectives concerning music/arts education in four parts, namely: Perspectives and framework, from policy to practice, creativity and assessment, and traditional and contemporary music.

Policies mentioned in this book cover both government policies and initiatives of schools or the community. The purpose of this book is to investigate and reflect the situations of some of the innovative policy initiatives that echo, adapt, tackle, vary, or even transform government policies in implementation, which accommodate local contexts and needs of schools or the community. Furthermore, issues related to policies or ignored in policies are raised for discussion hoping that the government, the agencies and the public are better informed of the situations.

PERSPECTIVES AND FRAMEWORK

The first section Perspectives and framework includes two chapters. In Chapter 1, Leung, Yip and Imada introduce the international perspectives of this book while in Chapter 2 Leung, drawing from different established theories and research based findings, provides a theoretical framework for effective implementation of music/arts education policy in schools. The framework highlights six premises crucial for effective implementation of school policies in arts/music: leadership, school culture and value, management, communication, environment and resources, and time and timing. He highlights two successful implementation examples reported in Chapter 3 and 6 to illustrate the validity of the theoretical framework.

FROM POLICY TO PRACTICE

From policy to practice is the second section which consists of six chapters. The areas of the chapters range from new initiatives, integrated arts approach, school policy implementation, policy scenario, philosophical issues, and policy studies.

In Chapter 3, Comte prompts to put the arts at the centre of the curriculum. He argues to put the Arts (including music, dance, drama and visual art) at the centre of the curriculum because it functions effectively as a means of engaging children in all aspects of learning, which supports their emotional, social and intellectual development. He successfully experimented his innovation in a special needs school in Australia. The success was due to a number of factors including building on existing strengths, employment of expert consultants, strong leadership from the principal, open and frank discussion with staff, emphasis on children’s identity, establishment of a curriculum framework model, ongoing process of evaluation, staff induction, and emphasis on team-building.

Freed-Garrod, Kojima and Garrod in Chapter 4 report two elementary school cases of integrated arts initiative in Canada and Japan. The writers highlight the differences of cultural contexts, and identify five policy elements that could sustain/constrain implementation in schools. These elements include the flexibility/ambiguity inherent in curriculum mandates and legislation,
leadership and initiatives of individual administrators or teachers, union policies and contract language, cultural contexts of schools, and parent initiatives. Leadership and initiatives of administrators or teachers are found to be crucial in both cases while the other elements have differences in practice. All in all, the writers affirm that both government and school policy play an important role in helping to actualize the initiatives.

In Chapter 5, Fredericks focuses on the arts and culture policy scenario in South Africa. He highlights a series of educational policy changes there, and their effects on implementation in arts and culture. He points out that the changes in support for education happened after the democratic elections in 1994 in South Africa was an attempt to wipe out illiteracy and poverty. This chapter provides a thorough picture of the recent development and changes in art and culture policy in South Africa. Fredericks pinpoints the issue of discrepancies of teaching resource allocation, imbalance in relevant teaching contents, and the lack of skilled teachers in the areas of music and art in South Africa, which have hampered the effective implementation of the policies.

Leung and Yip investigate, in Chapter 6, four cases where school policies assert significant impacts on their students’ school music education in Hong Kong. Case one features a strong initiative from a parent-teacher association in shaping the school policy which builds a concert-going culture among parents and their children. Case two sheds light on a successful change of school policy from a competition-oriented tradition to learning satisfaction cross-disciplinary pursuit. Case three reports on the establishment of the first school (primary through secondary) in the territory with music as its primary focus while case four testifies the building of a spiritually happy singing school.

In Chapter 7, Goble studies music education curriculum, new media policies, and the next generation from a philosophical perspective. He portrays the historical development illuminating the differences in aesthetic and praxial philosophies in music education, and discusses their strengths and limitations. Students in the examples he quoted fell into the trap of misunderstanding the context as well as the art form of the music they encountered via easily accessible media technologies. As such, he argues that the next generation of adult citizens will need to learn the intellectual aspect, and the personal and cultural context of music. In other words, both aesthetic and praxial philosophical perspectives are needed.

Jones emphasizes the importance of policy studies as a component of music teacher education. In Chapter 8, he asserts that this is a means to establish the profession’s capability for strategic action. He argues school music teachers were unnoticed of operating under the influences of numerous policies induced by various organizations and authorities. He categorizes policy studies into policy as topic, policy impact and/or implications, policy analysis, and policy recommendations. However, due to the lack of research in policy related to music, he prompts for more activities in this area and that music educators should act strategically for the best interest of music education.

CREATIVITY AND ASSESSMENT

The third section Creativity and Assessment consists of eight chapters, which explore the current situations and issues of children’s creativity in terms of policy related to the curriculum, methodology and assessment in Australia, Hong Kong, Japan, and the United States. Jeanneret and Forrest promote a “new” culture of creativity. In Chapter 9, the two writers explore the background for the more recent resurgence in thinking about creativity, and consider some of the ways in which creativity has been viewed over the last 100 years. They reveal where these latest impetuses have come from, how they manifest, and what the implications are for music education. They also investigate the ways in which the development and assessment of creativity
is being presented at the policy level in curriculum documents and the implications of these models for music education.

In Chapter 10, Cheung-Yung, Cham-Lai and Mak provide an opportunity for music educators and composers to investigate the impact of music education policy on creative music-making in the school music curriculum. For the first time, developing creativity has become one of the explicit guiding principles in the recent education reform in Hong Kong. Changes of curriculum emphasis to develop creativity both as a generic skill and as a learning target in the music curriculum are deliberated. In the chapter, the writers discuss the impacts of and issues arisen from the change in policy on pre-service and in-service teacher preparation, curriculum planning, implementation, the weakening of curriculum boundaries in music, and exploration of new possibilities.

In Chapter 11, Montague outlines some of the strategies being employed in government schools in New South Wales (NSW), Australia. She traces the support of the public system for government schools in the implementation of the syllabus over the last twenty years. The recently released NSW Music Years 7-10 Syllabus has an increased emphasis on incorporating Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) skills into the music classroom. The syllabus has moved from encouraging the inclusion of technology in teaching and learning to making its inclusion a mandatory requirement. A central concern in meeting this requirement is the updating of music teachers’ skills, and the provision of strategies for both accessing and utilising ICT as a tool for delivering effective learning in the music classroom.

In Chapter 12, Imada draws readers’ attention to some postcolonial issues in music education, and proposes a new pathway using the concept of soundscape coined by R. Murray Schafer. Imada states that non-Western nations have experienced de-colonization and dismantlement of Euro-American imperialism in the late twentieth century. Many musicians and music educators, however, have not yet found the place where they can reclaim their own indigenous identification in music. He argues that humans are born in particular socio-cultural settings; and at the same time, have their own sense inside their minds. Musicians and music educators, therefore, are dealing with both sides. The writer attempts to enter into the socio- and psycho-discourse of his argument.

McPherson concentrates his study on assessment issues. In Chapter 13, he reports the works conducted by the NSW Board of Studies as a centralised curriculum authority responsible for the development of curriculum for all students from kindergarten through to the end of secondary schooling, the registration of non-government schools and the setting, marking and reporting of external examinations. He explores assessment for learning as a philosophy, discusses ways this occurs in music classrooms, and develops support materials to assist music teachers in implementation.

Yip also focuses on assessment. In Chapter 14, she covers an investigation of what standards are, and analyses the present practice with a focus on learning to perform music in Hong Kong. In response to the new standards-based assessment policy, Yip examines what could be considered in the planning process to ensure a better implementation. She demonstrates impacts on music performance in Hong Kong with reference to internationally renowned standards-based assessment practices, and shed light on establishing local music performing standards by scrutinizing other compatible forms of assessment practices.

In the last two chapters of Part III, Wang and Stauffer provide their comprehensive observations as well as analyses of the writings in Chapter 9 through 14. Wang provides her thoughts about the current status of music education in the United States. She particularly mentions about the activities of the National Association for Music Education (MENC) and National Association of the School of Music (NASM). She concludes that creative music thinking can only be learned when children are guided to practice critical thinking and problem solving skills on a regular basis, and in a musically-rich, comfortable, enjoyable environment that is emotionally and socially rewarding. Stauffer manifests her scrupulous thoughts about the
relationship between assessment and creativity in music education and its policy.

TRADITIONAL AND CONTEMPORARY MUSIC

Traditional and contemporary music, the last section, has six chapters. Studies concerning the teaching and learning, in school and tertiary levels, of traditional and contemporary music in Mainland China, Hong Kong, Taiwan, Japan and the United Kingdom are covered. The importance of supportive polices for these musics are realized.

In Chapter 17, Xie extends concerns on conserving the cultural heritage of traditional music in Mainland China. He deliberates that the impact of popular music brought about by globalization and Americanization on school music education. Successful practices in promoting the transmission and preservation of traditional music call upon the collaborate efforts of music teachers, teacher educators, and expert musicians or music organizations in the community. However, the writer is also cautioned about the striving for a balance in the inclusion of music from cultures outside China. All in all, he argues that the keeping of music heritages relies on the setting music education policy by the government as a whole as well as subsequent support from the local government and school-based policies in education.

From researching on the perspectives of six Hong Kong amateur musicians reflecting on their interest in popular music in relation to their music education, Leung and Hung in Chapter 18 deliberated that there are deficiencies in school music provision for the stimulation and education of popular musicians. Broader context of popular music other than Cantopop and provisions of related extra-curricular activities are suggested. In expecting opportunities for the development of not only traditional or classical music but also popular music, the writers suggest that attention to the interests of the young generation is necessary in the provision of music education.

With attention to the recent curriculum reform in Hong Kong placing more emphasis on music creativity and technology, Chen in Chapter 19 reveals the ways and means deployed by tertiary music students in scoring film music. Possibilities provided by computer technology in tracking the compositional process of students in creating film music by employing multimusical ideas mixing musics from classical, traditional, western, popular, and jazz styles were verified in accordance with structured interviews revealing thoughts of students. Connections among students previous learning, use of technology, intrinsic motivation, teacher guidance were drawn to illustrate the problem-based approach of teaching students to compose music for films.

In Chapter 20, Bitoh reported an experimental program in the teaching of the Yo-kyoku, a kind of Japanese traditional music. Difficulties in comprehending and performing this kind of traditional music were minimized with the writer’s modified traditional notation of the music showing the vertical and horizontal sonorities of the verses. The values of learning and teaching Japanese traditional music for internationalization and cultural understanding are emphasized. Various complexity and focus of learning are discussed to throw light on further transmission of the music from experience through this program, which started with training of music teachers and changing their pre-conceptions about traditional music.

In Chapter 21, the study of Lu and Yang explored the situations of students majoring in modern Chinese classical music and traditional Taiwanese music in universities. Interestingly, the study reveals that some of these students originally studied western music and most were from talented music programs. Strong intrinsic motivations as well as extrinsic ones in learning Chinese music were exhibited. However, students do have problems in adjusting to their learning. Compounded with the lack of opportunities for works in performing Chinese music, many of the graduates switched to jobs related to Western music or became school music teachers. The writers urge that government policies and those of universities have to be supportive in promoting indigenous and classical Chinese music.
Green in Chapter 22 opens up the discussion of the meaning of music in different context, in its authentic form, to performers, learners, and listeners to illuminate the concept of autonomy, in particular, both musical and personal. Musically, the autonomy relates to the inclusion or seclusion of music, whether classical, popular, or various other kinds of music, in formal or informal learning practices, while personal autonomy refers to the music learner. In allowing personal and musical autonomy to learners in an informal learning experiment, Green notes the ways of students in making meaning in the music learning process, shedding light on easing the split between pupils’ music and classroom music, and containing authenticity in music development.

INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVES

This book highlights the concerns of scholars from around the world their perspectives, philosophies, theoretical frameworks, beliefs, approaches, strategies, and practices on arts and music education in relation to policies. The focuses ranges from music to arts education, elementary to tertiary education, creativity to multi-disciplinarity, standard to assessment, traditional to contemporary culture, colonization to globalization, and autonomy to authenticity learning in music classroom. It is hoped that these concerns and studies will further stimulate more enlightened discussions in the areas concerned.
Chapter 2

A Theoretical Framework on Effective Implementation of Music/Arts Education Policy in Schools

Chi Cheung LEUNG

The study of education policy, which has a relatively short history, is new in the discipline of policy studies. It is extraordinarily complex, vast, and varied with a staggering array of structural settings (Coombs, 1994). Education policy is formulated and implemented at multiple levels with an intricate web of authority distribution. Consideration of goals and objectives can lead to disagreements among different groups and institutional settings. Numerous studies (Bogason & Toonen, 1998; Bressers, O’Toole, & Richardson, 1995; Jordan & Schubert, 1992; Klijn, 1996; Marsh & Rhodes, 1992; Milward & Provan, 2000; Peterson & O’Toole, 2001) show that policy implementation involves complex networks of organizations. Music education in schools, as such, is “caught up in an interlocking web of policies and policy making at all levels (Hope, 2002, p. 7)”. According to Fullan (Fullan & Stiegelbauer, 1996), the difficulties lie in planning and coordinating thousands of people from multi-social levels. Fullan states, “Education change is technically simple and socially complex (p.65)”. Furthermore, education policy has always been a public concern involving the well-being of the future generation (Coombs, 1994), and a battlefield among politicians (Chubb & Moe, 1990; Meier & Stewart, 1991). Hogwood and Gunn (cited in Pal, 1992) concede that policy implementation can never be executed properly, and some degree of failure is almost inevitable. At the macroscopic level, the system and most of its policy deliberations are highly visible and sensitive, which further complicates the effectiveness of policy implementation. At the microscopic level, Cheung (1999) points out that the complexities arise from teachers’ different personal backgrounds and professional training; differences in the scope and extent of the implementation; and the unpredictability of the cross-impacts of implementation on teachers.

Education policy often involves innovations in curriculum and organization change. These innovations have to be consistent with the values of society in order to be successful (Kennedy, 1995) and be directed at the students and teachers (Glatthorn & Jailall, 2000). Change or reform is only part of the proposal: there are numerous factors affecting the innovation and its implementation. This chapter focuses on the effectiveness of the implementation of educational change, which is a critical phase in the cycle of planning and development of a change. Fullan and Stiegelbauer (1996) state, “Implementation consists of the process of putting into practice an idea, program, or set of activities and structures new to the people attempting or expected to change (p. 65).” The change can be externally imposed or voluntarily sought; explicitly defined in advance or adapted for incremental use; or designed to be uniformly used or with modifications.

LITERATURE ON EFFECTIVE POLICY IMPLEMENTATION

Policy implementation involves unavoidable constraints, complex networking and coordination, negotiation and communication, attitude changes of various stakeholders, mobilization of resources and provision of support, and timely schedule planning and sequencing. The study of Cheng and Cheung (2002) concludes that there are always gaps between implementation and planning no matter how well the policy is perceived. As such, preparation of policy
implementation should focuses on the readiness of the stakeholders cognitively, psychologically and technologically; the readiness of human resources, facilities, accommodation/space, monetary and other related resources; availability of time and schedule; and preparation concerning legal rights and legislation. Hogwood and Gunn (cited in Pal, 1992, pp. 172-174) identify ten ideal factors for perfect implementation of policy. They include no insurmountable external constraints, adequate time and sufficient resources, required combinations of resources, policy based on valid theory, direct and uncluttered cause and effect relationships, minimal dependency relationships, objectives agreed upon and understood, tasks specified in correct sequence, perfect communication and coordination as well as power and compliance. Hope (2002) states several strategic issues are critical in dealing with policy. They are understanding, engagement, values, investment, expertise, working room, funding, and sustained will. Coombs (1994) simplifies the phenomena of policy implementation by identifying three competing educational values: quality, equity, and efficiency. However, the issue of how to justify policy positions on these values is still complicated. Pal (1992) states it is hard to design policy in ways that can include every conceivable important administrative detail. As such, “policy-makers have to rely on others to translate their proposals in action (p. 172).” Long (1992) also stresses that the function and efficacy of strategic facilitation in policy implementation depends on others to put into action. These others include the school, its principals, teachers and other stakeholders. In other words, although they cannot necessarily change the policy, they can act with more sophistication about it by providing opportunities for individual achievement.

Meier and O'Toole's (2003) study shows that network management contributes greatly to effective implementation and tangible policy results; frees educational units from existing constraints; and allows them to effectively select available resources. They state, “Effective action often requires managers (in this case, government agencies) to deal with an array of actors to procure resources, build support, co-produce results, and overcome obstacles to implementation (p. 689).” The capability of managers in mobilizing resources and enhancing support is vital to effective implementation of policies. The overall planning and its actions are often nonlinear, interactive, and contingent. The choices of when, where, and how to network is especially pertinent.

From another approach, Long (1992) substantiates several features of conducting strategic facilitation. First, facilitation must specifically relate to the needs of the entity, in this case the schools concerned. In other words, government agencies (that is, the facilitators) must approach definitive statements of the needs in order to avoid as much as possible obscurity and misunderstanding. Second, effective facilitation requires a good sense of timing. Third, effective negotiation and communication skills are vital in reaching acceptable agreements. The facilitator needs to know, to hear, and to deal with the feedback in an appropriate manner. Fourth, the job of the facilitator is to change and affect the attitudes of the delegates, in this case, the principals and teachers. This is because delegates, unlike the facilitator, do not necessarily have an immediate acceptance and enthusiasm for the facilitation process. In short, the responsibility for a policy to be implemented successfully lies with the organization or the group that has to identify, define, and own the problems, as well as select appropriate actions. The facilitator is responsible for explaining and clarifying issues concerning the policy to principals and teachers in order for them to understand the rationale, objectives, approaches, timing and schedule, and resource support available for implementation. According to Marsh (2004), curriculum implementation needs careful planning and development but it also depends heavily on the awareness and skills of the teachers to implement the curriculum. House (1979) also highlights the cultural transformation as the major factor determining the success of implementation endeavors. In other words, it is the deep-rooted beliefs and values of the stakeholders, especially the teachers, who ultimately affect what happens in classrooms.

Kellett and Nind (2003) highlight several crucial interactive factors for effective policy implementation. First, there must be a critical need for the policy implementation. Second,
stakeholders need to be clear about the essential features of the innovation as well as the complexity and extent of the change in order for them to appreciate and support the policy. Last, the programme of change needs to be practical and ‘sound’ for teachers to be confident that it is workable. Marsh (2004) highlights some of the important factors in promoting successful implementation practices, which include time needed for teachers to experiment and attitudes to change, technology support, recognition of the individual school culture, provision of incentives and rewards, a sharing of the burden in the schools, creating the appropriate environment for innovation, providing a collaborative framework, finding good leadership, awareness of intention and content of the overall policies, keeping stakeholders visible, acquiring joint forces, and recognizing individual contributions.

Fullan (1996) identifies six core premises for effective implementation, which include leadership and vision, evolutionary planning, initiative taking and empowerment, staff development and assistance, monitoring/problem solving, and restructuring. Rogers (1995) adds that innovation has five stages comprising knowledge, persuasion, decision, implementation and confirmation. Cheung (1999) sub-divides implementation into four phases: experiment, adjustment, mastery, and personalization. In other words, continuous refinement is the key to implementation.

Cohen’s study (1988) emphasizes the importance of developing collaborative work cultures, which can contribute to raise morale and enthusiasm; encourage experimentation to innovation; foster collegiality with trust, support and open communication. According to Cohen, a collaborative working environment can lead to more effective implementation outcomes. Alfred (2006) identifies several essentials for policy implementation. These essentials are to select appropriate leaders, focus on conditions supporting the need for strategy; emphasize inclusiveness by involving participants; thus fostering trust, teamwork and an open participatory process; develop a sense of urgency for change to bring energy to the process and ensure efficient work; use language understood and easily acted upon by stakeholders; reinforce commitment through continuous communication; and adjust and diagnose behavioral patterns to new performance requirements.

However, there is always one aspect in implementation that is often overlooked - evaluation (Kellett & Nind, 2003). This could include measuring teachers’ understanding of the change, their adaptations and modifications of the innovations, the gap between concept and practice, the process of the implementation, teachers’ performance and their activities, students’ achievements, and the use of curriculum materials. This is an area of study which is highly complex and difficult to conduct.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The study of music education policy and implementation has never had substantial in-depth investigation. The establishment of a theoretical framework will facilitate better future studies and practical investigations in this area. The above literature investigates policy implementation from different perspectives that substantially highlight pertinent premises affecting the effective implementation of education policy, be it a change in the curriculum or a shift of emphases on different disciplines. By collating, absorbing, analyzing, and organizing different premises effecting policy implementation, a theoretical framework is established. The premises of this framework are based on various policy theories and practices (summarized in Table 2.1), from which the six essential premises impacting the effectiveness of policy implementation are developed and generated. They six premises are categorized as leadership, school culture and value, management, communication, environment and resources, and time and timing. The following elaborates on each of these categories:
1. **Leadership:** Leadership with clear vision and objectives, taking initiative and empowerment based on informed theory, knowledge, and expertise with supportive strategy, persuasion and decision making;

2. **School culture and value:** Identify the need(s) and sense of urgency for change, recognize individual school culture, relate the innovation to the values and needs of the school, and direct a cause and effect relationship to the school;

3. **Management:** Quality managerial coordination and procedures which emphasize evolutionary planning, adequate sequence and schedule, and practical and workable actions;

4. **Communication:** Continuous and effective communication and negotiation to enhance mutual understanding among stakeholders on the intent and extent of the change in order to facilitate acceptance and appreciation of the innovation;

5. **Environment and resources:** Provide a collaborative environment and sufficient resource and staff development support for the innovation, which recognize individual contributions, provide incentives and rewards, engage, involve and include the stakeholders, change their attitude, and sustain their will to change;

6. **Time and timing:** Adequate provision of time and a good sense of timing for stakeholders to identify, define, experiment, adjust, master, diagnose, evaluate, restructure, modify, refine, personalize, and sustain the innovation

### Table 2.1 A Theoretical framework for effective policy implementation in music/arts education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Premises</th>
<th>Elaboration</th>
<th>Literature support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1 Leadership | Leadership with clear vision and objectives, taking initiative and empowerment based on informed theory, knowledge, and expertise with supportive strategy, persuasion and decision making | • leadership and vision (Fullan, 1996)  
• search for good leadership (Marsh, 2004)  
• select appropriate leaders (Alfred, 2006)  
• clear vision and objectives based on valid theory (Hogwood & Gunn, cited in Pal, 1992)  
• knowledge, persuasion, and decision (Rogers, 1995)  
• expertise (Hope, 2002)  
• initiative taking and empowerment (Fullan, 1996)  
• power and compliance (Hogwood & Gunn, cited in Pal, 1992)  
• focus on conditions supporting the need for strategy (Alfred, 2006) |
| 2 School culture and value | Identify the need(s) and sense of urgency for change, recognize individual school culture, relate the innovation to the values and needs of the school, and direct a cause and effect relationship to the school | • a critical need for the policy implementation (Kellett & Nind, 2003)  
• develop a sense of urgency for change (Alfred, 2006)  
• no surmountable external constraints (Hogwood & Gunn, cited in Pal, 1992) recognize individual school culture (Marsh, 2004)  
• relate to the needs of the schools (Long, 1992)  
• values (Hope, 2002)  
• direct cause and effect relationships (Hogwood & Gunn, cited in Pal, 1992) |
| 3 Management | Quality managerial coordination and procedures which emphasize evolutionary planning, adequate sequence and schedule, and practical and workable actions | • evolutionary planning (Fullan, 1996)  
• the change needs to be practical, with quality and workable (Kellett & Nind, 2003)  
• appropriate network management (MeierO’Toole,2003) and strategic facilitation (Long, 1992)  
• adequate timing and schedule (Long, 1992)  
• tasks specified in correct sequence (Hogwood & Gunn, cited in Pal, 1992)  
• monitor and problem solving (Fullan, 1996)  
• minimal dependency relationships (Hogwood & Gunn, cited in Pal, 1992)  
• burden shared in schools (Marsh, 2004) |
4 Communication
Continuous and effective communication and negotiation to enhance mutual understanding among stakeholders on the intent and extent of the change in order to facilitate acceptance and appreciation of the innovation
- perfect communication and coordination (Hogwood & Gunn, cited in Pal, 1992)
- effective negotiation and communication skills, and avoid possible obscurity and misunderstanding (Long, 1992)
- continuous communication, use languages understood by stakeholders (Alfred, 2006)
- keep stakeholders visible (Marsh, 2004)
- awareness of intention and content of the policies (Marsh, 2004)
- objectives agreed upon and understood (Hogwood & Gunn, cited in Pal, 1992)
- understanding (Hope, 2002)
- stakeholders appreciate the policy, clear about the essential features of the innovation, as well as the complexity and extent of the change (Kellett & Nind, 2003)
- readiness of stakeholders cognitively, psychologically, and technologically (Cheng & Cheung, 2002)

5 Environment and resources
Provide a collaborative environment and sufficient resource and staff development support for the innovation, which recognize individual contributions, provide incentives and rewards, engage, involve and include the stakeholders, change their attitude, and sustain their will to change
- create appropriate environment for innovation (Marsh, 2004)
- provide a collaborative framework (Marsh, 2004)
- staff development and assistance (Fullan, 1996)
- sufficient and required combination of resources (Hogwood & Gunn, cited in Pal, 1992)
- adequate provision of resources and related support (Cheng & Cheung, 2002)
- working room, investment and funding (Hope, 2002)
- recognize individual contributions (Marsh, 2004)
- provide incentives and rewards (Marsh, 2004)
- acquire joint forces (Marsh, 2004)
- inclusiveness of involving participants (Alfred, 2006)
- sustained will (Hope, 2002)

6 Time and timing
Adequate provision of time and a good sense of timing for stakeholders to identify, define, experiment, adjust, master, diagnose, evaluate, restructure, modify, refine, personalize, and sustain the innovation
- timely preparation for legal legislation and change of attitudes of stakeholders (Cheng & Cheung, 2002)
- a good sense of timing for making easier the path forward (Long, 1992)
- adequate time (Hogwood & Gunn, cited in Pal, 1992)
- time needed for teachers to experiment and attitudes to change (Marsh, 2004)
- adjust and diagnose behavioral patterns to new performance requirements (Alfred, 2006)
- change and affect the attitudes of the principals and teachers (Long, 1992)
- identify, define, and own the problems (Long, 1992)
- experiment, adjust, master, and personalize (Cheung, 1999)
- restructure (Fullan, 1996)
- continuous refinement (Cheung, 1999)
- implement and confirm (Rogers, 1995)

TWO CASES OF EFFECTIVE POLICY IMPLEMENTATION OF MUSIC/ARTS EDUCATION PROGRAMMES

Two cases of effective policy implementation of music education programmes in schools are identified from this book. The two cases are the Port Phillip Specialist School (PPSS) reported by Comte in Chapter 3 of the book, and the Good Hope School (GHS) written by Leung and Yip in Chapter 6. The PPSS focuses on the Arts as the basic disciplines for children’s learning and as a
thereupatic tool for children with special needs while GHS engaged students in thematic learning through various learning activities across disciplines with Music as the major core discipline. The following two sections summarize the two cases and identify the features associated with the six premises of the theoretical framework established in this chapter.

**Port Phillip Specialist School (Melbourne, Australia)**
The Port Phillip Specialist School is a school for special needs children in Melbourne. A change was initiated in early 2004 by the principal in order to implement a curriculum adapted to the needs of the students. The major feature of the change is based on The Arts – music, dance, drama, and visual art -- of which there is a deep, philosophical and pedagogical belief that they engage children in all aspects of learning, including literacy and numeracy, and support children’s emotional, social and intellectual development. Consequently, the change allows for easy movement from one arts modality to another, and builds linkages between the Arts in education and the therapeutic role of the Arts.

A team of consultants in the areas of the arts, arts therapy, and special, primary and secondary education were employed to provide professional advice. The change implemented is based on the existing strengths of the staff and the school. The principal has provided strong leadership and has allowed the consultants to have open and frank discussions with the staff. The Child Pathways and Partnerships Model (Comte, 2007) emphasizing the child’s identity and administrative structure, and the Curriculum Framework Model (see pages 21) focusing on arts education, arts therapy, and the teaching of arts as an instrument for learning across all curriculum areas were established. Some of the other features of this initiative include an ongoing process of evaluation, induction for new teachers, emphasis on team-building, and a shared sense of purpose amongst staff, students and parents. For detailed information, Professor Martin Comte has written a thorough report on this initiative in Chapter 3 (see pages 19-24) of this book.

1. **Leadership**
The vision, initiative, and commitment of the principal have provided the strong leadership in this innovative project. A project manager, capable of choosing people to work together efficaciously, built a multi-level, networking form of leadership among team leaders at the school. In addition, a team of consultants provided the expertise and professional advices for the development of the project. The curriculum framework model evolved is based on the school's mission and vision statement.

2. **School culture and value**
The change implemented is based on the existing strengths and the many years of teaching experience of the staff in the school. The change takes into account the actual needs and learning styles of the children with special needs, and in particular, emphasizes the Child Identity. There was a shared sense of purpose and understanding amongst staff and parents.

3. **Management**
An effective management structure has been established to ensure that each child has an Individual Education Plan, recorded in the Communication Book, identifying the child's opportunity for future growth, supported by an appropriate curriculum for each child with an effective and flexible timetable that serves to facilitate development.

4. **Communication**
A timely process of open, frank discussion in a non-intimidating environment, among school policy makers, consultants and front-line staff facilitates staff engagement. The needs of students and the concerns of parents are taken into consideration.
5. Environment and resources
Induction for new teachers, emphasis on team-building and flexibility with a shared sense of purpose, beliefs and understandings, and internal and external partnerships, including a partnership between arts educators and arts therapists, are some of the features of this innovation. To support this project, a $2.4 million Visual and Performing Arts Centre was built in 2005.

6. Time and timing
The entire change process was started in early 2004 with an audit process that began with an identification of the strengths and weaknesses of the existing curriculum, leading ultimately to an ongoing process of evaluation and refinement of the newly implemented curriculum.

**Good Hope School (Hong Kong, Special Administrative Region, China)**
The Good Hope School is a Catholic school for girls in Hong Kong. A change towards implementing a cross-disciplinary programme with music as the core of its learning activity was launched in 2002 in response to the direction of the curriculum change in Hong Kong at that time. The change aimed to break the rigidity of the compartmentalized learning practices of the past, and encourage more students to participate in arts learning. Traditionally, only a limited number of elite students in this school had been selected to participate in the choirs and orchestras. The principal however believes that music education is for all and cross-disciplinary education is vital to students’ learning (Leung & Yip 2007, cited in Chen).

The change was initiated in early 2002 and has been carried on for four school years. A number of projects consisting of different topics or emphases were launched. These started with an English-visual art-music integrated project, followed by a list of projects focussing on Chinese folk festivals, Western music-visual art, religious study, and world musics, and developed from a small scale form-level project to a large scale school-wide project. The world music project was conducted across two school years, engaging students from the whole school with various projects, concerts, music camp, plus an excursion to New Zealand. The four major features of this initiative for this school are its strong musical tradition, a committed team of music teaching staff, the various other disciplines they can teach, the full support of the principal, and the perseverance of the school community in this endeavour. For detailed information, see pages 55-57 Chapter 6 of this book.

1. Leadership
There is strong support, vision, and leadership from the principal and the head music teacher. Their initiatives and ideas were based on the expertise of a team of highly committed teachers as well as professional advice from external consultants.

2. School culture and value
The emphasis on cross-disciplinary learning was conducted in response to the curriculum change currently undergoing in the Territory which posed a need to break the rigidity of the compartmentalized learning of the past. The school has long placed high value and emphasis on music and related activities. The initiative is based on the existing strong tradition of high standard music performances and achievements in music competitions. Such involvement opens up opportunities for students with talent in music and other disciplines as well as providing them with a valuable form of ‘recognition’.

3. Management
The Music panel head has 29-years teaching experience in different subjects including music, visual art, and English. She leads and manages the initiatives and is assisted by a strong of team of four qualified music teachers who possess undergraduate and post-graduate education in music and/or music education. Three of them also teach religious studies and English. They form a
favourable management team for the implementation of the initiatives, offering highly organized and well-planned cross-disciplinary programmes that engage the active participation and enjoyment of the students.

4. Communication
From the case study reported, it is evident that a high degree of communication has occurred among all stakeholders, but how effectively this was done has not been reviewed in the report.

5. Environment and resources
The huge number of performers in choirs and orchestras, participants in music competitions, different project initiatives, involvement across different disciplines, as well as the annual music camp, concerts and exchange programmes are strong evidence of the support the school has provided in resources, making possible a rewarding environment.

6. Time and timing
The change was initiated in 2002 through the successive launching of a number of projects progressively across the years. The processes of targeting, identifying, implementing, modifying, adjusting, refining, and personalizing have continued through the years of implementation. The change is a timely and gradual process of persistent commitment.

CONCLUSION

The two cases examined have highlighted the importance of the six premises identified in the theoretical framework, which highly reflect their validity of application for effective implementation of new music/arts programmes in schools. The cases underscore the pertinent role of multi-level expertise leadership, the importance of change acknowledging a school’s strength and culture, the existence of a complex human management network, effective communication among stakeholders, the provision of substantial resources facilitating a rewarding environment, and progressive planning and long-term commitment. The study shows that theories in policy implementation and/or curriculum change could have close reference to music/arts programme implementations. Though not all successful cases are identical in detail, the premises offer boundaries for music educators to consider in implementing new initiatives, in particular in change of policy or direction.

REFERENCES


From Policy to Practice
Chapter 3

A New Policy, a New Approach, a Change in Culture: Putting the Arts at the Centre of the Curriculum

Martin COMTE

This paper outlines an exemplary model in policy change, cultural change, and school improvement. It details a change process based around The Arts - music, dance, drama and visual art - at a school for Special Needs Children, aged 3 to 18, with a wide range of disabilities. This government school in Melbourne, Australia, is “Port Phillip Specialist School”. Early in 2004 the school engaged a team of consultants to design a unique and innovative arts-based curriculum – a curriculum in which the arts underpin all teaching and learning for all children.

For some years the principal and many teachers had questioned the ‘traditional’, ‘one size-fits-all’ curriculum that schools of this type were expected to follow in the State of Victoria. That is, they believed that the traditional, mandated delivery of curriculum was inappropriate for students at this school whose needs are such that it does not make sense merely to duplicate the curriculum offered in mainstream schools. Yet – unbelievable as it might seem – teachers in ‘special schools’ have been expected to teach the same curriculum as teachers in mainstream schools – and special schools have been expected to follow the same reporting guidelines used for mainstream children, despite the fact that children in special (or specialist) schools in Victoria have disabilities and learning needs that are generally different from or much more acute than those of other children.

The majority of children at Port Phillip Specialist School are working at a level corresponding to Years 1-4 of primary (elementary) school, but some are performing below this. That is, even though the range in age levels corresponds to that of children from kindergarten to the end of secondary school, the most advanced students at this particular school seldom achieve beyond an age level of nine or ten.

It should not be surprising – even though it has not been adequately acknowledged by the Department of Education with respect to curriculum documents – that the learning styles stressed in mainstream schools are often inappropriate in this school where children, regardless of their age, learn to a very large extent by doing: by hands-on, practical, kinesthetic experience. Consequently, an ongoing task in the design and delivery of the new curriculum has been to maximize opportunities for the children to be involved with their whole body and mind. A major challenge was to design a curriculum that would involve every sense throughout all the years of the children’s schooling. This, of course, is what The Arts, collectively, do: they engage the mind and the senses in a unique way. No other medium does it so well. And it is for this reason that The Arts are at the core of the new curriculum that has been designed for Port Phillip Specialist School in Melbourne. That is, The Arts – music, dance, drama and visual art - now underpin all areas of the curriculum, including literacy and numeracy. The Arts now provide the focus for all learning and teaching.

The school is convinced that it is through the Arts that it can make the greatest strides and have the most impact on children’s learning and development. And so the new and innovative curriculum that was implemented in 2005 is strongly embedded in The Arts because of a deep, philosophical and pedagogical belief that they represent a means of engaging children in all aspects of learning that is not possible in any other way. The Arts also have an important therapeutic role in supporting children’s emotional, social and intellectual development. Consequently, Arts Therapy – Music therapy, Dance Therapy, Drama Therapy and Art Therapy...
Music education has been a particularly new addition to the program. Additionally, the teachers and the team of consultants are convinced that The Arts help thinking and learning across all discipline areas—that is, they assist children in perceiving ‘relationships’ which form part of the web of learning and understanding.

The task of designing this innovative curriculum was made easier because the experience of the teachers themselves over many years has been that arts activities do in fact facilitate development and learning in a range of areas. In part it is the non-verbal nature of the arts. And in part it is because children can express things in music, movement, dance, drama and visual art that they are unable to express in language. (This, of course, is true also for children in regular schools.)

The task presented to the writer and his colleagues who formed the team of consultants was threefold: first, how to make the curriculum more meaningful to ensure optimal development for the school’s unique students; second, how to resource the project in terms of both human and physical resources; and third, how to maximize the engagement of staff and the wider school community in the process of educational and cultural change.

So how did the team of five consultants set about re-designing the curriculum? We had been chosen because of our particular expertise—covering The Arts, Arts Therapy, Special Education, primary education, and teaching and learning. The project manager is renowned for her ability to choose people who will be able to work together most efficaciously. From the first meeting we were of one accord in our quest. Our first task was to ‘audit’ the existing curriculum. It was important to acknowledge what was already in existence: what was working and what was not. It was important to acknowledge best practice. This was a vital part of the process because we did not want to go into the school and be seen as throwing everything out and starting completely afresh. The teachers and the many ‘teacher assistants’ had a wealth of experience that we could not ignore—and which it was important that we acknowledge. We met with every teacher and teacher assistant, principally in small focus groups. An over-riding—but not surprising—revelation was not merely the dedication and commitment of all staff, but their willingness to be open and frank in their discussions of the children’s needs, their own needs, and what was and what was not working in the existing program. Many hours were spent in this ‘audit’ process. Of course, it was also important that we considered the perspective of parents. The stresses and strains on parents—and families in general—when they have a ‘special needs’ child is enormous.

It is important to mention that the Principal, who is a leading Australian educator with a lifetime commitment to special education, showed great courage throughout the audit process: she encouraged all of her staff to be completely open and frank in their discussions of the school. And she absented herself from the focus group discussions so that staff would not feel intimidated in any way from expressing themselves freely. It takes an extremely enlightened manager to encourage an environment in which all staff can speak freely! But, of course, it was the Principal who initiated the process of change and who was most committed to it. It would not have happened without her vision. In addition to spending much time with the teachers and assistants, and the other support personnel who work with the children—including psychologists, speech therapists, and physiotherapists—the consultants also worked with the Principal and her senior team.

The audit process took several weeks, after which the team of consultants met regularly to consider what might be retained in the curriculum—and where change might be introduced. Over the ensuing months we considered many models of curriculum design—some existing and others which were new or an amalgamation of various designs. We had one year in which to complete the task (Comte, Russell & Irlicht, 2005). Finally, we came up with the model in Figure 3.1 below.
We approached the new curriculum design from two perspectives: firstly that of the Child’s Identity, and secondly by considering an appropriate Administrative Structure. With respect to the Child’s Identity, we began by considering the child’s Special Needs, which led us to a consideration of the Possibilities this affords; then we considered the Opportunities that were or might be available to meet the child’s needs; next we considered the multitude of ways in which the child’s teachers and assistants contribute to the ongoing process of development and learning; then we addressed the importance of – and gave significantly increased attention to - Arts Therapy (as distinct from Arts Education) whilst continuing to acknowledge the importance of paramedics, such as hearing specialists, speech pathologists, physiotherapists and psychologists; next we stressed the importance of teams of teachers and support staff working within and across leadership teams; finally we saw this process leading to an increased sense of Identity for the Child and, ideally – although this is not always possible – the possibility of the child living (and, albeit often to a limited extent, working) in the community away from the parents. It was and is a working model; it is not definitive – and certainly not applicable to all such schools.

With respect to the second perspective – the administrative perspective – we began with a consideration of the fact that each child has an Individual Education Plan which is based on a concept of Identity and takes into account the sense of passion that all involved with the child feel with regard to his or her growth; all of this is recorded in the Communication Book which is an essential reference point for everyone involved in the child’s development: information gathered here leads all involved with the child to consider the Opportunities available for future growth and how this can best be handled administratively; next is a consideration of the most appropriate curriculum for the ongoing development of the child and what skills staff need in terms of professional development in order to deliver the child’s particular curriculum needs: this process must consider an Overlay of input from all who work with the child - teachers, assistants,
therapists and paramedics - and how best to accommodate this input with an effective ‘timetable’; all of this involves a strong sense of Leadership, not only from the Principal but also from all team leaders concerned with the development and growth of the child – such leadership often involves Networking with those who have the potential to make a significant contribution; finally, and ideally, all of this occurs within an Administrative Structure that not only enables but maximizes the possibilities for the development of each child within the context of the broader school community.

But we still needed another, complementary model in order to develop our new curriculum. This one evolved from a consideration of the school’s Mission and Vision Statements, as follows in Figure 3.2:

![Curriculum framework model](image)

**Figure 3.2** Curriculum framework model

After considering the Mission and Vision Statements, we found it essential to consider pathways for each individual child and the many internal and external partnerships that needed to be fostered in order to maximize each child’s development throughout their years at the school. This led us to a consideration of three basic Domains of Learning: the Cognitive, Affective, and Psychomotor. Much has been published in relation to these domains over the past fifty or so years and we drew heavily on such models and research. From here, we developed an approach to the curriculum based on the Arts. Firstly, there was consideration of the art forms in themselves. But a curriculum cannot confine itself to teaching The Arts! Of course, the curriculum model includes education in Literacy, Numeracy, General Education, and Physical Education – there is nothing unique in this. What is unique, however, is that we envisaged that in all of these areas, The Arts would be integral to learning. That is, teaching and learning in Literacy would be based on experiential involvement in The Arts, as would teaching and learning Numeracy, General Education, and Physical Education. This entails that all teachers and assistants are provided with appropriate professional development to ensure that The Arts underpin all teaching and learning. This is unique – and is an ongoing process, not only for new teachers entering the school, but also for continuing teachers. To ensure success it is essential that teachers develop a Unit Planner for each – small - group of children as well as appropriate Learning Activities based on The Arts. In a sense, the Visual and Performing Arts are tools to learning; at the same time they also have an important therapeutic role.

And so this is the story of how Port Phillip Specialist School set about the task of reviewing
and re-writing its entire curriculum – not simply its arts curriculum (Comte & Russell, 2005). Integral to this project was the appointment of the team of Consultants. There were no appropriate models for writing a curriculum for a specialist school that had the arts as the basis of learning and teaching of all subjects.

Effectively, the curriculum has been turned upside down and the consultants, working closely with the staff, have come up with a radical alternative to teaching and learning: one which, we believe, might be adopted or adapted in other special schools. We have designed a curriculum that is sensory in nature – a curriculum in which the arts are explored and used educationally, instrumentally and therapeutically to maximize sensory experience, development and learning across all curriculum areas, including English and Mathematics.

It must be stressed that in wishing to put The Arts at the centre of the curriculum the aim was not to downgrade essential areas of learning: on the contrary, the aim was to use the arts instrumentally, as tools to learning across the broad curriculum perspective, so that English, Mathematics and other Key Learning Areas were taught more effectively than in a traditional curriculum model.

It also needs to be stressed that in a school of this type The Arts not only have an educational role, where they are taught for their intrinsic value, but also a therapeutic role. And so another aim of the project was to strengthen the school’s commitment to the arts as therapy as distinct from an emphasis on arts education. The goals of these two streams – arts education and arts therapy – are not the same, even though there are some overlaps in terms of process. But in addition to these two approaches, the vision brings in a third stream, an instrumental stream: the arts as a tool for learning across all curriculum areas – again, as with therapy, understanding of the arts per se is not the primary goal in this approach. Underpinning all three streams is an emphasis on sensory learning.

To some extent, the school already had an arts culture. But what was not apparent were the linkages between the arts in education and arts therapy. It is vitally important in this school that arts educators and arts therapists work collaboratively. This change process has involved establishing a culture in which it is recognized that the arts in education and the arts in therapy need not be seen as discrete areas. And relatedly, we also had to ensure that each art form is not treated as a separate, rigid entity: between art forms themselves there is also a degree of overlap. A teacher or an arts therapist working in music, for example, can easily slide into a dance or dramatic activity, where appropriate. In other words, it is important that our arts teachers and our arts therapists feel free to move from one arts modality to another according to student needs. Of course, this requires much more flexibility in thinking on the part of arts educators and arts therapists compared to working in one arts modality only. And this flexibility underpins the use of the arts in the new curriculum.

The school has now defined and embraced the differences and commonalities between an arts specialist and an arts therapist, and is emphasizing more strongly than it has in the past the value of the therapist. And all of these specialists work closely with the paramedical staff located at the school: the physiotherapists, occupational therapists, speech therapists and psychologists.

A major task has not been so much ‘selling’ the new approach to those within the school community – but convincing others in the broader community – including, commendably, a sympathetic Department of Education – of the importance of such a change.

The school has had to make some new appointments, particularly in relation to arts therapy. No longer are arts therapists seen as ‘additional’: they are essential to the overall program. And classroom teachers too are being assisted to incorporate arts therapy into their work with the children.

At the same time as the curriculum was being developed the school began building a Visual and Performing Arts Centre. Considerable financial assistance was received from a range of philanthropic organizations, individuals and the Victorian State Government. This Centre, which was opened in 2005, the same year that the curriculum was introduced, cost $2.4 million.
This innovative curriculum is now in its second year of implementation and already there are many indicators pointing to the success of the project. Integral to this process of educational and cultural change is an ongoing process of evaluation; the first evaluation having occurred two-thirds of the way through the 2005 school year – its first year of operation – with a much more extensive evaluation taking place at the beginning of the 2006 school year. Of course there were problems and issues with regards to the new curriculum’s implementation. But the school is systematically addressing these in a spirit of openness and frankness.

From my own perspective the biggest issue in a change of curriculum – and culture – such as this is ensuring that the program is subjected to ongoing evaluation. The biggest impediment to its success will be if the school – from the Administration to the teachers and assistants – adopts an attitude of “we’ve done it and so let’s get on to the next task at hand.” Such an approach would be the death knell of this daring and innovative curriculum change.

The program will continue to develop and evolve over time. An ongoing challenge will be how best to induct new teachers into the culture of the school. Every effort is being made to enable both new and continuing staff to embrace the new culture. The school recognizes that finding time for change enhances the prospects for success. This has involved an increased and ongoing emphasis on team-building and a shared sense of purpose. Central to this process of cultural regeneration and transmission has been the importance of working from a set of shared beliefs and understandings which are not rigid.

Underscoring the development of the new Arts curriculum is a strong belief that society must not be deprived of the contribution of students with disabilities. For this reason the school is committed to giving its students every appropriate support to realize their potential and maximize their ongoing contribution to society. The future belongs to them as much as it does to children in mainstream schools. But in this context it is worth noting a disconcerting perspective that was provided recently when a teacher from a middle class government primary school – one from which most students go on to elite private schools at the secondary level – arranged for her Grade 6 students to visit the school to learn something about disability and difference. One parent objected and refused her child permission to go, saying that she did not want her child to be exposed to “these sort of children”! Sadly, combating such prejudice is still an issue for special schools and their students.

Finally, let me stress that that the school hasn’t turned to music and the other arts as a soft option. Far from it! It has embarked on an experiment that we believe will have great benefits for its students. It’s an experiment that will be the subject of ongoing evaluation and refinement over the coming years. It has been a very courageous initiative on the part of the school community. The project has already received both national and international interest. And the school is arranging an international conference on The Arts in Special Education, to be held in Melbourne in July, 2008.

REFERENCES


Integrated arts programs and schools which have chosen to base their organizational structure and/or foundational philosophy on the arts being fundamentally interwoven through content areas across the curriculum, have become increasingly common in North America since the early 1990s. Recently, the idea of public schools of choice, including integrated arts as a focus, has tentatively been explored in Japan as well. This chapter investigates the processes through which two elementary schools, one in British Columbia (BC), Canada and the other in Mie Prefecture, Japan, emerged as integrated fine arts schools. Policy elements that encourage, sustain, or constrain arts-based elementary schools are discussed.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The available literature on integrated curriculum is substantial (see Wood, 1996; Schwartz & Pollishuke, 2002; Sunal et al., 2000; Miller & Drake, 1995; Jacobs, 1996; among others) regarding the efficacy of linking learning across subject areas for maximum learning. Literature on the arts as tools for increasing abilities, skills and understanding in such areas as critical and creative thinking, risk taking, self concept, cooperation and collaboration and problem solving is also well established (see Eisner & Day, 2004; Rabkin & Redmond, 2004; Goldberg, 2006; Upitis & Smithrim, 2003; among others). As well, in Canada and the United States (US), vibrant partnerships between various socio-cultural contexts of community, business and school are becoming increasingly common (see Learning Through the Arts, n.d.; Chicago Arts Partnerships in Education (CAPE), 2004; The DANA Foundation, 2002; among others).

The literature on policies in arts based or integrated arts curriculum as the foundational philosophy or organizational structure for broad instructional programs or whole schools is minimal in both North America (Canada and the US) and Japan. Recently, however, there has been a surge of interest in strengthening the arts in schools. Their significance as separate, vital art forms in their own right, as well as their value within an integrated framework to enhance learning across other curriculum areas is being increasingly acknowledged in public arenas. This “grass roots” lobbying by parents, teachers and/or the business community is proving to be a powerful agent of change in North America, driving curriculum policy reform from the ground up rather than “top-down”, which has often been the case in the past. Some of the current literature available concerning policy changes to arts curriculum and the building of viable partnerships between schools, the wider community and business include Canada, the US and Japan.

In Canada, the Ontario College of Teachers (2005), the teacher certification agency in Ontario, has introduced a course in integrated arts to be added to the qualifying course of study for teachers. By introducing the Negotiating New Models of Curriculum in Changing Times: Year 1, Miller and Drake (1995) looks at mandated curriculum change in Ontario, and notes that while
integrating curriculum “made sense” and was “greeted with enthusiasm” (p. 2), the changes required shifts in pedagogy and training and would take time.

In US, the Arts Education Partnership sponsored the Second National Forum: Partnerships Improving Teaching in the Arts, on March 30-31, 2003 in Philadelphia to determine the efficacy and future directions for “eighteen effective partnerships developing innovative practices in pre-service education and professional development of arts teachers, classroom teachers and teaching artists” (p. 1), in relation to policies in place regarding national professional teaching standards, teacher competency exams, et cetera.

In the Arts Education Resources Initiative, the Washington State Arts Commission (2005) surveyed 32 schools for the quantity, quality and purpose of arts education programs. Findings included:

formal arts programs are inconsistent and while generally excellent, there is a “lack of systematic support (regarding budget, curriculum and personnel) making arts instruction…fragile… (depending primarily on individuals as) catalysts who were often…singular and isolated” (p. 7); districts often depended on levies or bonds for money to offer arts experiences or buy equipment; and approximately 50% of the principals said that within the last five years they were actively making positive changes to the arts offerings in their schools.

Support for Integrated Arts Education Opinion Poll, conducted by Douglas Gould and Company (2005) for the Ford Foundation, found that business leaders and households (including non-parental and parental randomly) were polled to provide information on support for current policy regarding curriculum mandates. Findings included:

Arts education is being driven out by increased attention to standardized tests required by the No Child Left Behind (NCLB) (Federal legislation), and the public knows it and is unhappy…people…view arts education as essential and greatly short-changed as schools scramble to increase test scores. (p. 3)

Principals and administrators say they don’t have the budgets or the personnel to increase arts education in schools. (p. 4)

and 48% of the public polled said that there is too little arts education in elementary and middle schools (p. 4).

In Japan, the Council for Cultural Affairs was established by the Japanese government in January, 2001. The Council’s mandate includes a focus on the arts because it is one avenue through which the Council can promote its work, supporting peoples’ increasingly demonstrated interest in their cultural heritage (“MENC,” n.d.). Through the dynamic relationship between arts and culture, people can recapture traditional performing arts and express their cultural selves through engaging in various art forms.

At the academic level awareness of the value of integration in arts education, particularly in a multi-media culture, is emerging. In Symposium: Aesthetic Education in Japan Today (2003), Okazaki and Nakamura report on the issue of advocacy for integrating arts and media literacy from various authors and perspectives. The authors determine this issue is significant as it “stress[es] the importance of the communal, cultural and linguistic considerations of integrated study, historically overlooked in traditional aesthetic education” (p. 2). Attention to this aspect of education in Japan is indicative of a shift in contemporary focus towards the arts as imperative to a comprehensive and relevant education.

In Japanese schools, however, integration remains a distant speck on the horizon and the arts in general appear to be losing ground in Japanese schools. Beginning with the National
Curriculum Standards of 1998, Japan has experienced a steady reduction of time allocated to the arts in grades 1 through 9. The time now given to music, for example, is less than 6% of total instruction – amounting to 473 hours over nine years. The next National Curriculum Standards Reform from the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT) is supposed to be implemented in 2008. At the time of writing, Japanese arts educators were anticipating further reduction of time for music classes as MEXT currently tends to emphasize scientific subjects much more than the arts. On the other hand, an optimistic note for arts education in Japan has been recently struck with the establishment in 2005 of a special committee on the Arts by MEXT's Central Education Council. This is the first ever recognition of the arts as a formal policy area by Japan’s central education authority.

In January 2006, the Japan Association for the Study of School Music Educational Practice (2006) and the Association of Art Education held an “Urgent Symposium on Significance of Arts (Music and Visual Art) in School Curriculum”, in Tokyo. The purpose of the symposium was to make a public appeal regarding the significance of the arts as school subjects from a variety of perspectives including psychology, pedagogy, cognitive science, and educational practice. It also demonstrated that arts education contributes to the formation of well-rounded character on the side of emotional development.

THE THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The process of creating arts-focused magnet schools, or other schools of choice, is fraught with tensions. These conflicts reflect the policies and procedures regarding educational/cultural decision-making, often at several levels of school governance and administration. According to Gaskell (1999), the process of setting policy regarding school choice is highly politicized, reflecting differing ideological perspectives on both the purpose of public schooling, and the locus of power and authority in making decisions about individual schools, the educational programs they offer, and how those programs are designed and implemented. Brown (2004) identifies shifts in provincial guidelines as a major catalyst, setting in motion policies that facilitate or constrain the creation of schools that determine their own philosophical and organizational focus. A study conducted for the Richmond School District (“School Choice,” 2001), indicated that the development of schools of choice was driven by parent desire for individual freedom in selecting educational programs for their children based on the principle of “individual liberty” and by District governing bodies responding to what they perceived to be “market forces” acting on public school systems. Anderson and Tupman (2005) see shifting school and district demographics, the rise in home schooling and independent schools as competition to public schools, and a shortage of qualified specialist teachers as factors impacting music education policy and program formation in BC. Gaskell (2002) examines local policies at the district and school levels that influenced the creation of BC’s first fine arts magnet school. She sees the terms and conditions of local teacher contracts as important factors in the shaping of schools of choice.

The literature, and our experiences as music teachers, teacher-educators and researchers, led us to identify five key variables relating to policy issues attendant upon the creating and sustaining of public, elementary, arts-based magnet schools:

1. The flexibility/ambiguity inherent in national/regional/local curriculum mandates and supporting legislation;
2. Leadership or initiatives by individual administrators or teachers;
3. Union policies and contract language;
4. The diverse cultural contexts of individual schools within multi-cultural social settings; and
5. Parent initiatives that bring pressure/influence for change on local school boards and/or district administrators.

These variables were first explored with respect to the creation of an integrated arts elementary school in Kamloops, BC. To see if they were applicable in a broader educational cultural context, a long-established elementary school in Higashi-Oizu, Japan, where arts integration became the guiding philosophical perspective and basis for curricular structuring, was also examined.

Data were gathered through observation during on-site visits, from interviews with teachers, administrators and parents, and from documents relating to the creation of the schools. Relevant ministerial or departmental policies, and procedures regarding music/arts education and school governance were also examined.

**MUSIC EDUCATION – BRITISH COLUMBIA, CANADA**

Education policy in Canada is made at the provincial level. According to provincial policy in BC, decisions about “schools of choice” can be made at the local level without approval or consultation with the provincial Ministry of Education. The decision to create a magnet school or school of choice can result in tensions and conflicts. Policies, procedures and program decisions are fraught with difficulty when the various stakeholders vie for the power to design and implement what they each feel is the “best” organizational structure and practice. As a result, in BC, where there is flexibility in terms of who the decision makers are, policies vary across and within districts as well as individual schools.

Music education in BC, as part of the larger arts curriculum, reflects policies at both the ministerial (province-wide) and school district (local) levels. While broad philosophical guidelines, recommended content and prescribed time allocations are set by the Ministry of Education, policies regarding implementation and delivery of the provincial curriculum are established at the school district and individual school levels. Consequently, arts education in general, and school music programs specifically, vary greatly from district to district as well as from school to school within districts. Such variation in policy at the local level can be attributed to a variety of factors. Five significant elements shaping these policy decisions are:

1. **The flexibility/ambiguity inherent in the national/regional/local curriculum mandates**
   Policies regarding curriculum content and methods/resources for delivery and assessment are determined by provincial ministries of education; there is no national policy. “Canada is a multicultural, multinational state with a commitment to pluralism, and the educational system reflects the politics of the country…” (Wilson & Lazerson, 1982, & Shapiro, 1985, as cited in Gaskell, 2002, pp.1-2). In BC, broad content delineation for each subject, from kindergarten through grade 12, is mandated in documents called Integrated Resource Packages (IRPs). Instructional and assessment strategies and some key resources are ‘recommended’ but actual implementation is further decentralized, left to the individual discretion of the teacher. Assessment, for the most part, is also teacher determined, except for provincial testing at prescribed intervals in specific, ‘core’ academic areas.

2. **Leadership or initiatives by individual administrators or teachers**
   Variation between district music education programs and amongst individual schools within districts frequently results from the roles played by individual educators. Administrators or teachers can initiate special programs such as lunch-time choirs, weekly sing-along sessions for the whole school, a guitar club after school, or a school wide music listening/appreciation program that is ‘piped’ through the intercom system to all classrooms after lunch each day.
3. **Union policies and contract language**

Hiring practices in BC schools are determined by union contract language, and all public school teachers are required to be union members. Certification standards are set by the BC College of Teachers, which issues teacher licences. The teachers’ union, BC Teachers’ Federation, affects staffing of magnet schools through its control over the seniority list. Different school districts may have slightly different language around the seniority issue, as well as around what qualifies someone as a ‘specialist’ – for example, in Kamloops, a ‘specialist’ is anyone having three upper level courses in a concentration (for example, music or visual art), and is rated at the same level in terms of hiring practice as someone with a degree in that same subject. In other districts, however, the person with the degree might be considered at a higher level than the person having taken three courses. Limitations placed on districts with regard to hiring appropriate artist-educators can pose problems, as many professional artists have limited ‘paper’ qualifications.

In most BC school districts, elementary school teachers are given a fixed amount of preparation time within the school week. How this is done varies, with students going to computer laboratories, library, or other specialised activities, as this decision is left to the school administrator (who usually makes this decision in consultation with the teaching staff). Music is often the program chosen to provide such “prep” time, and ‘specialist’ teachers are sometimes hired for this purpose. Students receive one or two 40-minute music classes each week during which time the regular classroom teacher is able to use that time to prepare for other classes. In situations such as mounting a school production that demands rehearsals during lunch hours and after the school day ends, timetables, schedules and school hours need to be somewhat flexible, wherein conflict with the teachers’ union hours of work guidelines may occur.

4. **The diverse cultural contexts of individual schools within multi-cultural social settings**

BC has been slower than some other provinces in creating schools of choice that reflect distinctive cultural communities. A significant exception is *L’ecole Central Elementary School of the Arts* in Fort St. John, BC, where an integrated arts model has been adopted for the delivery of French Immersion instruction.

5. **Parent initiatives that bring pressure/influence for change on local school boards and/or district administrators**

In BC, “schools of choice” (magnet or charter, for example) began to appear and grow in popularity in the 1990s due to a growing dissatisfaction with the public “one-size-fits-all” curriculum. In 2002, the BC government changed its closed-catchment system of school enrolment to one of open boundaries. After the 2002 policy change, there was an upsurge of magnet/choice schools. Brown (2004) notes:

> …74 applications for new schools or programs of choice [were] received by 20 boards between 1999-2004…traditional, French immersion and fine arts schools were the most frequently proposed. A majority (74%) of proposals brought to boards were approved, and the rate of applications appears to be increasing. Parents are the primary source of proposals (71%).

In addition to the boundary restrictions being lifted, there are other reasons for parental pressure on School Boards to offer magnet schools. One reason stems from budgetary concerns. Possible program cuts or threatened school closures due to low enrolments, particularly in small communities where local school closure may mean unwanted travel to some distance outside the community on a daily basis, may stimulate demand for a magnet school. Establishment of a magnet school ensures that the local children will be able to stay
in their neighbourhood, and that an influx of others will vitalize the community. One example is the Dunster Fine Arts School, located in a 1916 historic schoolhouse near Prince George. It was created in order to preserve a small rural school that faced closure because of declining enrolment. The lobbying process took five years before parents succeeded in getting the school designated as a fine arts school. Another example is Leary Elementary School in Chilliwack, BC, whose staff and parents petitioned to have the school turned into a fine arts school to prevent closure. The Board “unanimously voted in favour of making Leary a fine arts school” (Chouinard, 2005, para. 16).

MUSIC EDUCATION – JAPAN

In Japan, the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT) prescribes the purpose, content, scope of subject matter, and time allocation for school music at the national level. This is outlined in the National Course of Study. On the basis of the National Course of Study, individual teachers determine their curriculum for one calendar year. The National Course of Study provides an outline about content and subject matter, so the individual teacher can plan curriculum and lessons, and teach music (and other subjects) at her own discretion. The classroom teacher usually provides music instruction at the elementary level and often the curriculum centres, around performance skills including theory, and recorder. Music literacy is expected, although movement to music and some composing is included. Time allocation is regulated more strictly than in BC. Inquiry into the same five elements investigated in BC, Canada shows the following:

1. The flexibility/ambiguity inherent in the national/regional/local curriculum mandates

In Japan, policy regarding curriculum content is determined by MEXT. Content for each subject in elementary through senior high school is mandated, whereas instructional and assessment strategies, resources, and actual implementation are left to the individual discretion of the teacher.

In most schools, primary generalist teachers teach the arts (music and visual art), which are treated as separate subjects. Dance is included in the physical education curriculum. For students up to the grade 5 level, music is often taught by classroom teachers without special training, who use the MEXT teachers’ manuals as a guide. Beyond grade 5, specialist teachers are hired by district school boards, particularly in the larger cities where the pool of teachers is more extensive. In many schools, extra-curricular band or chorus ‘clubs’ are organized by a music specialist or by a generalist teacher who loves music. These groups often enter competitions and contests.

In 1998, MEXT introduced a new area of study in addition to subjects (language, social studies, science, music, visual arts, physical education, and so on). This new focus is “Time of Integrated Learning”, which encompasses various kinds of activities such as farming, weaving, and so on, or research, including studies about the environment, life, internet technology, et cetera. The time allotted for “Time of Integrated Learning” studies is 105 hours at grade 3 and 4 level, and 110 hours at grades 5 and 6. To implement this new program of study, 10 hours were cut from music and visual arts programs in grades 3 and 4, and 20 hours from grades 5 and 6.

In an indication of more flexibility, MEXT has introduced a new policy allowing more local (district) discretion concerning curriculum content and time considerations. Beginning in 2000, schools can get local permission to develop a new type of model on a trial basis. Presently, there are no “arts-focused” or “integrated learning” schools in Mie prefecture.

2. Leadership or initiatives by individual administrators or teachers
Teachers are expected to be an advisor of a club in extra-curricular time if the principal asks them to. Music teachers are expected to show good leadership by organizing students to perform in such events as entrance and graduation ceremonies as well. Students play an important role for the school by participating in these performances. Any teacher or administrator is encouraged to initiate concerts that several schools within the district can participate in.

3. Union policies and contract language
Teacher unions negotiate pay and the amount of teaching time, but can only make recommendations to the central government or the local administration regarding working conditions, status enhancement and curriculum changes. Union membership in Japan is voluntary; there is no “closed-shop” system in Japanese schools. In 2004, approximately 50% of the teachers joined a union, and the rate of enrolment is generally declining, although enrolment in Mie prefecture continues to be high and the union presence remains strong. Regardless of union membership, all teachers receive benefits that the union negotiates for them.

4. The diverse cultural contexts of individual schools within multi-cultural social settings
Japan is largely a monolingual, mono-cultural society although there are minority groups (Ainu, Ryukyu), and a significant Korean population represented in various schools and districts. Schools can, at their own initiation or district discretion, implement special programs for a particular cultural group. The multi-cultural content of music classes includes cultural musical traditions of Korean music and world-music.

5. Parent initiatives that bring pressure/influence for change on local school boards and/or district administrators
Parent initiatives do not seem to be catalysts for policy change in Japan at this time.

**TURNING POLICY INTO PRACTICE: TWO CASE STUDIES**

In the following sections, each of the mentioned dimensions is explored in the specific context of the adoption of an integrated arts approach by two public schools: Beattie Elementary School of the Arts in Kamloops, BC, and Higashi-Oizu Elementary School in Ise, Mie prefecture, Japan.

**Beattie Elementary School of the Arts**

**Background**
Beattie School of the Arts is an example of a parent initiated school of choice. Officially opened in September 2004, it was the product of several years of negotiations, lobbying, community discussions and political decisions. It is located in a once working-class, small city whose economy historically rested on ranching, mining and the railway. Its creation, in part reflects the “gentrification” marked by the increased number of middle-class and professional families that has resulted from its shift to an administrative centre with a university, regional hospital, and various government agencies. Kamloops is a culturally diverse community whose members comprise indigenous peoples (North American First Nations), Anglo-Canadian residents and other immigrants from Southern Europe, India and South Asia, among others.

Kamloops-Thompson School District (2001) adapted an “educational choice” policy in 2001 which requires that the initiative for schools of choice be parent/community driven; and proposals have a clearly articulated philosophy and mission statement.
In 2002, a group of parents brought a proposal for a fine arts school of choice to the Kamloops School Board. Acting on this proposal, the Trustees (elected school board members) conducted a survey to determine the level of interest in the wider community. The results indicated a high level of interest, with the majority supporting an elementary program. Public meetings and discussions with the local university resulted in action being taken to establish an elementary Fine Arts School (K-7), in an existing school, beginning with the 2004-2005 academic year.

This grassroots policy initiative was encouraged by the District’s senior administration. In a 2003 open letter in support of this initiative, Dr. Terry Sullivan (2003, p. 3), Superintendent of School District #73 provides support for a policy of learning in and through the arts. His statement reflects the potential for schools to adopt a more diversified curriculum and alternative modes of program delivery through an integrated arts approach inherent in the following Ministerial curriculum guidelines:

The arts can be a powerful tool for teaching concepts in academic subjects. Teachers who have developed ways of integrating the arts into the curriculum can employ the arts to increase comprehension in reading, math and the sciences. Students whose learning styles are less compatible with teaching methods based on text, language and logic can often benefit from an arts-centered approach that makes use of full-body learning and symbolic communication. (Churchley, 2005)

District policy requires Beattie, as a school of choice, to be openly accessible to all those wanting to enrol. Enrolment at Beattie is voluntary, with children able to enrol regardless of which part of Kamloops they live in (no “boundary” issues) and on a first-come-first-served basis. Parents choosing to enrol children at this magnet school report a shared belief in the value of a fine arts education, cross-disciplinary study (integration) and multiple ways to demonstrate knowledge through self-expression. The school site, an existing elementary school on the city’s south side, close to the suburban fringe, was selected for its size (ability to house 400 pupils), its relatively central location, and its proximity to public bus transportation (school bus service is also provided). Kamloops is divided by a major river with the region south of that divide characterized by a higher socio-economic status than that of northern neighbourhoods. The school is located within two blocks of the university. Close collaboration between the school and the university has already been established.

The school administrator (principal) was given the direction to staff the school with teachers who also held this philosophy as well as had the necessary qualifications of classroom generalist plus a specialty (minimum of three university level courses) in a specific arts area.

Program delivery policy at Beattie

Beattie, as an elementary arts magnet school, is currently delivering arts education on an integrated model, where learning in, about and through the arts take place concurrently. Arts magnet schools in British Columbia are increasingly structuring their programs on this model first adopted at North Poplar School in Langley. There is no provincial curriculum policy directive to arts magnet schools on this topic. The benefit of integrating the arts with other subject areas, however, is acknowledged in the BC Ministry’s mandated the Fine Arts Integrated Resource Packages, Fine Arts K to 7 in 1998 (British Columbia Ministry of Education, 1998):

Learning and instruction often take place in an integrated manner and do not always stay within the boundaries of a particular subject. Learning in the fine arts, in particular, offers great potential for connections among subject areas: the common areas of learning in dance, drama, music and visual arts build on and reinforce one another. These subjects also become
richer and more relevant for students when linked to topics and skills in humanities, sciences, and applied skills subject areas. (para.2)

At Beattie, all students participate in all facets of an arts program; ‘core’ academic subjects (math, language arts, science, et cetera) are also formally taught. While the teachers follow the curriculum content generally outlined in the IRPs for each grade level, curriculum focus (within IRP guidelines) and pedagogical methods are left to individual teachers. These teachers, who are all classroom generalists as well as specialists in one of the arts areas, consult and collaborate with colleagues and the principal on such things as themes and integration ideas.

Beattie School, like most Kamloops elementary schools, follows a curriculum that tends to reflect the dominant culture and the middle class values evident in both the official curriculum of the province and the dominant decision-makers at the District and school levels. For example, despite a large non-Christian, non-European population, Christmas is a focus across the various arts in many Kamloops schools and music choices that typify Western art or folk music are standard fare in thematic curriculum across grades. At the present time, Beattie School’s student population over-represents the dominant culture with one notable exception, First Nations (aboriginal) pupils, who – at 10% of enrolment - closely approximate their numbers in the larger community. At the time of writing, it is still unclear as to the influence this group and its artistic traditions will have on policies regarding curriculum, teaching and learning at Beattie.

Higashi-Oizu Elementary School

Background
Higashi-Oizu Elementary School is a public school in Ise, Mie prefecture. It is located near the sea and most of the people make their livelihood by fishing or in fishing-related industries. In 1983, teachers in the school began to study student academic competence, attitudes and behaviour. By observing what students were doing when engagement and achievement were at the highest levels, the teachers developed a new approach to learning that they called “integrated learning”. The teachers believed that engagement in the arts was a necessary part of balanced emotional and intellectual development for everyone, and that the arts would be the best way to express the learning acquired through the integrated curriculum.

To demonstrate to families and the community what the students were learning through this new program, the teachers devised an event called “Field Play”, which included music, recitation, drama, physical activity and original art/craft pieces. When the integrated learning structure was implemented, teachers noted a huge difference in the students – those who had been disruptive or ambivalent in regular classes became engaged and enthusiastic about representing their learning in these multiple ways. The “field play” continued; after three years, the students created their own scenario, integrating learning from across the curriculum. On the theme of “Reviving Life of the Sea”, they expressed their concern and hope about protecting and sustaining their environment, including the sea, through music, dance, drama and visual arts. Creating and expressing core values and beliefs about their culture and relating school learning to real life in this coastal, sea-dependent community was an important message. Everyone involved recognized that an integrated curriculum, grounded in the arts, was an effective learning tool through which the students could express their learning in a variety of ways.

Although there was no formal policy outlining this format for teaching and learning, teachers, administrators, students and the wider community were committed to learning using this model and the school continues today. Over time, however, many of teachers holding this philosophy left Higashi-Oizu, a new principal rejected the “integrated learning” through fear of reprimand from the school board, and the model eventually disappeared. Revived interest in this model for education has occurred since 1997, when the Mie Education Center produced The
Integrated Learning (Higashi-Oizu Elementary School, 1986/1997) document. New initiatives have been slow to be realized, however, and to date there is no school practising integrated learning on this model.

Mission statement, rationale and goals
As a public school, Higashi-Oizu must follow the National Course of Study as outlined by MEXT, which mandates content. Teachers have autonomy regarding how they teach the content. At Higashi-Oizu, the arts function as a process to learn across curricular areas and to develop aesthetic education. The rationale and major goals of the school as revised in 1997 include:

- learning in school should be closely linked to real life; students should self-initiate, take charge and be responsible for their learning;
- try to consider how coursework in specific subjects is linked to everyday life experience;
- be able to synthesize and apply knowledge from school in real life tasks;
- become good citizens of their wider community; and
- be able to choose ways to be involved in their cultural community.

Program design at Higashi-Oizu
Curriculum is organized around five broad themes that spiral from grades 1 through 6; experiences revolve around problem solving through integrated activities and projects. The five themes are community, living, peace, human rights, and love and life. Music is one of the courses that are infused in the activities. The arts are utilized as a means to express emotion and holistically engage in the learning. This “bottom-up” learning is unusual, as most arts education has been in a “top-down” format where teachers embrace an ‘art-for-art’s sake’ philosophy.

ANALYSIS AND IMPLICATIONS FOR MUSIC EDUCATION POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION

Beattie Elementary School of the Arts
1. The flexibility/ambiguity inherent in the national/regional/local curriculum mandates
   At Beattie, as in other schools, teachers have pedagogical decision-making power as well as some choice about which aspects of the IRPs they concentrate on, which speaks to the flexibility of the provincially mandated curriculum.

2. Leadership or initiatives by individual administrators or teachers
   Leadership in shaping policy at Beattie has clearly been shown by both the principal and teachers. Teachers freely choose to teach at this school, and are passionately committed to both the arts and integration. Initiative and collaboration around program design are encouraged by the principal. Time is allotted for pod teachers to plan together; their autonomy is supported, and all that is required by the administration is a yearly curricular plan (overview) that represents the planning choices (collaborative and individual). They report a need for greater training to sustain these initiatives; aside from a workshop with the school whose timetabling structure they borrowed, these teachers have little or no preparation in working so intensely in collaboration, and in integrating curriculum so deeply. Teachers also report that they feel tremendous pressure to be exemplary in all ways at all times to all students. As the ‘flagship’ arts school in SD. 73, there is a constant stream of visitors and inquiries, and with so much outside attention, both successes and challenges are magnified. It has been difficult at times to keep a balanced perspective, and focus on change increments that are both appropriate and manageable.
3. Union policies and contract language
Generally, the British Columbia Teachers’ Federation (BCTF) (n.d.) is not in favour of schools of choice; it argues that all schools could/should offer all programs and, as ‘democratic’ institutions, provide equity of accessibility to all children. The BCTF also views teachers as generalists, saying that ‘a teacher is a teacher is a teacher’. They tend to not support, in principle, the idea of specialists. This stance can create problems and tensions for schools like Beattie, which depends on specialists to carry out its mandate. The BCTF does not interfere with schools or programs requiring specialists, but tends to be unsupportive, if and when specific issues arise with one of their members. To date, there have been no instances of such policy conflicts at Beattie; however, there is awareness among both teachers and administrators that this may arise in the future.

4. The diverse cultural contexts of individual schools within multi-cultural social settings
Beattie School location was chosen for this new initiative in part because of its location, being accessible by public transportation from anywhere in Kamloops. The location was hotly debated because Kamloops is physically and psychologically divided by the Thompson River. People on both the north and south sides of the city seem to find crossing the socio-economic boundary represented by the river problematic, in spite of several bridges. This issue based on demographics has not yet been explored, however, probably because there is a long waiting list to enrol in the school. Originally, concern was expressed at community meetings that, if one school focused on the arts, student and teacher interest and expertise might be drained from other schools. Alternately, teachers in other schools who were not particularly well trained or did not feel confident in teaching the arts would no longer attempt to teach the arts because students interested in arts learning could move and go to Beattie. It is too early in Beattie’s existence to address either of these concerns with adequate evidence from either Beattie or other Kamloops schools; however, informal data note that these same concerns have not been raised during the debates over the proposed arts high school and several elementary schools have expanded their music programs (perhaps due to a sense of competition) over the last academic year.

All information about the proposed school policies and procedures, community meetings, et cetera was distributed through the media, including local newspapers and radio stations, printed flyers placed in public places, and on school bulletin boards. While this was a wide coverage, there was no assurance that everyone possibly interested was fully informed. Language and lifestyle are two factors that may have mitigated this access; it is possible that the “first-come-first-served” enrolment policy is unexpectedly discriminatory. However, one non-dominant group is represented well at Beattie; approximately 10% of the school is First Nations (15% of enrolment in Kamloops schools are indigenous peoples, including First Nations). According to the principal, this may be because the integrated model and multiplicity of teaching and demonstration of learning opportunities more closely align with traditional First Nations’ cultural values and life-style than the more usual compartmentalized structure of school.

5. Parent initiatives that bring pressure/influence for change on local school boards and/or district administrators
Beattie Fine Arts Elementary School is clearly an example of a parent-initiated policy shift at the School District level. The school was created in response to parent desire for a distinctive approach to teaching and learning centred on the arts. Parent demand remains high; there is a waiting list for admission to the school. Some parents, however, have taken their children out of the school, realizing that the ‘match’ is not the best for the child. Parent involvement in school policy, at Beattie as in most other Kamloops schools, is informal and limited. There is a parent advisory committee (PAC) made up of volunteers, whose
representatives are invited to sit in on staff meetings and contribute ideas and requests on issues ranging from fund raising to curriculum. The group has no official role or power, and there is no policy around parental involvement in school affairs. Most PACs are involved in fund raising – usually for field trips, playgrounds or extra sports or music equipment – things beyond District budget allotments.

Parent pressure has initiated another proposal for a school of choice in Kamloops – this time a secondary school of the arts. Parents of children in senior grades approached the Board requesting that the policy begun at Beattie be continued for grades 8 through 12. The initial proposal was filed in November, 2004 and ratified by the School Board (“Proposal for Education Choice,” 2004). In the 2005-2006 school year, the first high school group (grade 8) divided their time between Beattie and the local high school, depending on particular needs (for example, science laboratories). For the time begin, details of procedures and programs are being determined as the need arises. The success of this expanding school has led to an interesting potential policy shift as the Board contemplates the possibility of creating a K-12 fine arts school with a dedicated campus. This would represent a major policy change from the current model of dividing local schools into elementary and secondary enrolments. As of November, 2006, a currently vacant elementary school building is scheduled to be re-fit to accommodate the high school age students. The elementary (grades K-7) and secondary (grades 8-12) will be at separate locations for the foreseeable future, although the integrated arts model will be implemented at both locations.

Higashi-Oizu Elementary School
1. The flexibility/ambiguity inherent in the national/regional/local curriculum mandates Since 1997, MEXT has been relaxing its curriculum and time allocation restrictions, and decisions are becoming more decentralized to districts. However, at the time Higashi-Oizu teachers initiated the “integrated learning” approach, the School Board in Mie prefecture criticized them for allocating instructional time in a different way from the MEXT directives.

2. Leadership or initiatives by individual administrators or teachers Creation of an integrated learning educational policy that included the arts as a fundamental teaching and learning modality at Higashi-Oizu was almost exclusively a teacher-driven initiative.

3. Union policies and contract language Teachers are hired for all schools by individual districts. Once a person has met the qualifications and passed an examination given by a district committee, he/she is assigned to a school within the district. Although union membership in Japan is voluntary, almost 100% of all teachers at Higashi-Oizu school were union members. The Teachers’ Union was in favour of the “integrated learning” model, which was in opposition to the School Board’s position.

4. The diverse cultural contexts of individual schools within multi-cultural social settings At Higashi-Oizu, the curriculum was designed with the cultural needs of the student body in mind. Such a radical organizational and philosophical program seems to be unusual, however; schools generally follow the national curriculum to some extent and teaching methods tend to be shared across a whole school.

5. Parent initiatives that bring pressure/influence for change on local school boards and/or district administrators
Parents do not play a part in initiatives regarding school structure or programs, but they supported the teachers at Higashi-Oizu. At that time, there was no system of school choice in Japan; there was no indication that students came to Higashi-Oizu from outside the immediate community, although that may have been the case during the 1980s when the integrated arts curriculum was in place.

COMPARISON BETWEEN BEATTIE AND HIGASHI-OIZU SCHOOLS

Interestingly, the trend in public policy regarding flexibility in school structure and focus under the banner of “choice” has followed a similar timeline in both Canada (BC in particular) and Japan; formal policy to offer options for different models was initiated around 2000-2002. But while legislation has been a trigger for growing alternatives in school choice in BC in recent years, the initial emergence of a different philosophical and curricular perspective in Japan came from a teacher initiative at one specific school, and at a far earlier time in 1983. It is only now that national policy is being written to create opportunities for individual schools to structure themselves in diverse ways that respond to community needs.

In the last ten years, BC has seen the growth of various kinds of schools of choice, including many that are arts-focused. These schools have been founded for a variety of reasons, although most of the public initiatives have stemmed from parental urging. So far, in BC, policies have been flexible in terms of development and implementation of these schools (types, programs, pedagogy), as long as the general guidelines for curriculum content and hiring practices have been followed. In Japan, the one early (1983) attempt at radically altering philosophy and curricular design in response to an untenable teaching and learning condition was an anomaly, thought of as a kind of historical heritage for the current efforts in school choice. Official policy and procedures at that time regarded the “integrated learning” format at Higashi-Oizu as ‘out of place’. Now, these policies are changing, although the prompt to do so is based more on economic efficiency than community/client need. And while there is revived interest in this curricular structure, the actual implementation of alternative designations is not yet in the actualization stage, and the original arts-focused integrated learning format at Higashi-Oizu no longer exists. Therefore, it is not possible at this time to make actual comparisons regarding designation and implementation policies.

Policies around curricular and pedagogical decisions at Beattie and Higashi-Oizu are similar. Broad curricular frameworks are mandated by the governing body, while the details of specific curriculum design and implementation methods are flexible, left to school personnel.

Hiring practices are similar, but in both contexts teacher candidates must meet certain qualifications. In BC, certification is provincially determined and hiring is locally decided; in Japan, certification is decided through prefecture exams, and hiring is locally determined. In BC, unions play a very strong role in contract considerations, both around hiring and school conditions. All public school teachers must be members of their local union, each a branch of the provincial teachers’ federation. In Japan, membership in the national teachers’ union is voluntary, but all teachers receive benefits negotiated by the union in regards to salary and working time. The union in Mie prefecture strongly supported the integrated learning model and was, in turn, supported by most teachers at Higashi-Oizu through their membership.

Parents play different roles in initiating school change in the two contexts. In BC, district policy states that new schools (specifically schools of choice) must come from parent/community initiatives; in Japan, parents do not have this mandate, although in the case of Higashi-Oizu, teachers received strong emotional support from the parents in the community. Attention to diversity varied between the two schools: at Beattie, which draws its students from the entire Kamloops area, no particular attempt was made to accommodate any particular socio-cultural
group; at Higashi-Oizu, the cultural climate of the surrounding community was the protagonist for change, although there was no attention given to diversity beyond this group.

IMPLICATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

In both schools, arts-focused, integrated curriculum was the foundation for learning, although the reasons for initiation and cultural contexts were different. At the time of the original implementation of curriculum integration at Higashi-Oizu, adherence to official policies and regulations was expected from all schools, and Higashi-Oizu was considered in contravention of policy. Now, however, policies regarding the locus of control around such things as curriculum, personnel, purpose, *et cetera* are becoming more decentralized in both contexts. While the arts are mandated in public schools as subjects in themselves in both countries, they are generally seen as separate content areas rather than organizational or philosophical structures. Development of alternative or choice models may be a catalyst for policy and procedural change across various types of schools, opening the door for opportunities to investigate the efficacy of integrated learning through the arts as a foundational learning structure and philosophical perspective through on-going implementation.

Findings at this time are primarily empirical and from short-term review. We hope that sharing these data will: contribute to greater awareness of the need to continue development and implementation of policy that includes integrated arts as a learning structure; and create interest in further research inquiry into the value of arts integration as an alternate ‘way of knowing’ and paradigm for learning across cultural contexts.

NOTES

1. Prefecture: Japanese political administrative unit corresponding to a province, though at a smaller geographic scale. Each of Japan’s 47 prefectures has a governor and unicameral parliament.
2. The term “magnet school” is essentially synonymous with school of choice; it takes its name metaphorically from the “attraction,” or draw, of such schools as contrasted to the normal practice in most school districts of having geographically defined “catchment” areas surrounding individual schools to which parents either must send their children in the case of closed catchment areas or for which they have first priority in sending their children in the case of open catchment areas in districts that permit cross-boundary enrolments.
3. The term “school of choice” refers to schools offering alternative curricula or programs to which parents can elect to send their children. Such schools in Canada include French Immersion programs, fine arts schools, traditional (pre-progressive models), or year-round – to name just a few.
4. Gentrification refers to an upward change in socio-economic status of a neighbourhood or community.

REFERENCES


Integrated Arts Approach In Two Cultural Contexts


Chapter 5

The Arts and Culture Policy Scenario in South Africa

Schalk FREDERICKS

There has been a series of educational policy changes in South Africa that have impacted on arts and culture implementation. After the democratic elections in 1994, the entire racially segregated and fragmented system of education consisting of 18 departments was consolidated into one department. Support for education is evident in a number of policies. Education is seen as the fulcrum to propel South Africa into the first world, and to wipe out the legacy of illiteracy and poverty. Unequal curriculum and resource provision in the past makes it difficult to make up the backlog to ensure that every child is provided with the same opportunities. Arts and culture is one of the Eight Learning Areas provided for in the compulsory schooling General Education and Training Phase. This chapter will discuss the problems emanating from both human and physical resources and curriculum policy requirements.

POLICY CHANGES

The advent of a democratic state in South Africa in 1994 started a political process that advocated a complete change in public education. An agreement was reached between the Ministries of Labour and Education to amalgamate training and education to ensure a skilled and employable workforce. A new curriculum guide called Curriculum 2005 (Burger, 2006a) was introduced in 1997. As envisaged by William Spady (Spady & Schlebusch, 1999, p. 30-35), this was the South African version of Outcomes Based Education (OBE), of which the four pillars or principles are: clarity of focus, design back2, high expectations and expanded opportunity.

Twelve Critical Outcomes were formulated to achieve the envisaged curriculum reform. One of these outcomes specifically pertains to Arts and Culture: “To be culturally and aesthetically sensitive across a range of social contexts” (Department of Education, 2003b, p. 2). Please note that all the learning areas are required to achieve all the outcomes.

South Africa is a culturally diverse nation. It has 11 official languages, and a great variety of cultural groups can be represented in any single school. Therefore, teachers face two primary curriculum development challenges in Arts and Culture in Curriculum 2005 (C2005) (Burger, 2006a). One of the problems is to determine which cultures to include. The other is to develop the expertise to teach the various cultures. Debates around the multi-cultural content of the music curriculum have been going on for years at conferences of the South African Music Educators Society, and it is a challenge for teachers to have knowledge of, and to present content in various indigenous cultural practices. John Blacking states:

As a European, it is my impression that in Africa nothing would function unless diversity was working in practice. It is reflected in the wealth of African music where styles are both distinct and fused. In contemporary South Africa, music reflects both the power struggle and the diversity in society, not to mention all the layers of time and cultural change and encounters with the other continents: Europe, Asia and the Americas. The cultural range between traditional African songs, symphonic work and high-tech pop music is enormous. (Selimovic, 2002, Foreword)
In line with the statement above a diverse curriculum is being offered at some tertiary institutions. The curriculum at educational institutions has changed. It is no longer exclusively Eurocentric as it was pre 1994. African music and dance are being offered at some tertiary institutions as an alternative to the western classical curriculum. And, as school communities have become integrated, a cross section of songs from different cultures has started a process of deepening a common national identity.

In the new C2005, as opposed to being compartmentalized along disciplinary lines, subjects are integrated in order to present a holistic system of education. The curriculum organization is divided into the Foundation, Intermediate, and Senior Phases. In the Foundation, Early Childhood Development Phase, Arts and Culture is integrated into Life Skills. In the Intermediate and Senior Phases Arts and Culture stands on its own. But, even then, as we know, Arts and Culture consists of an integration of music, visual arts, drama and dance.

An additional change introduced through C2005 was in the area of assessment. Previously the arts were not formally examined in the primary school, but now they have to be assessed just like any other learning area. Assessment practices were broadened which allow for more than teacher-centred, pen and paper tests. Approaches such as peer review, group testing, self-evaluation, et cetera were added. Continuous Assessment is encouraged counter to summative evaluation.

Curriculum 2005 (Burger, 2006a) was phased in as follows: 1998 grades 1 and 4; 1999 grades 2 and 5 and so forth. It was envisaged that a complete reform would take place by 2005. However, more changes were in the offing as a new Minister of Education was appointed in 1999, replacing the Minister who had introduced OBE. Criticism was levied at the existing curriculum (Burger, 2006a) implementation. The Minister of Education appointed a Review Committee, known as the Chisholm Commission (headed by Linda Chisholm) to make recommendations. This resulted in the Revised National Curriculum Statements (RNCS) replacing C2005. One criticism of the C2005 curriculum was that it was full of jargon and technical terms that made it difficult to understand and implement. The RNCS attempted to simplify application of the new curriculum. The streamlining of what was a conceptually confusing C2005 received acclaim. The lack of consultation with teachers was a particular sore point amongst unions as they were not represented on the Review Committee. Unions were exercising their democratic right and were wary of processes from which they were excluded lest they again have to contend with material that is foisted on them in a top-down manner as in the old paternalistic, apartheid regime. They insisted on being part of a consultative team developing materials. If they had representation on the review committee they would have felt that they could give input and be part of the curriculum changes.

At first, the development of the RNCS met with resistance because the teachers had just started to get to grips with C2005 when the RNCS came about. Schools were in a limbo state. C2005, in a manner of speaking, was put on hold resulting in a curriculum vacuum. Although schools were officially supposed to be implementing C2005 or NATED 550 (‘NATED,’ n.d., p. 25), teachers were uncomfortable with implementing curricula that were about to change anyway or were outdated. RNCS was needed within a few months, new materials developed and piloted, and training cascaded from master trainers to education officials to teachers. The short revision and implementation time span elapsing between revising C2005, and introducing RNCS was criticised by unions as they felt they were being pressurized into accepting changes to the curriculum. They wanted to be a part of the teams developing the curriculum materials, have a say as to where the materials were to be piloted, and have union members in the training teams (Chisholm, 2005). The resistance to changes in C2005 which was orchestrated by unions, and supported by education officials crumbled when they were co-opted onto the committees developing the new curriculum. In addition, the introduction of certain learning areas, including Arts and Culture, was viewed with doubt because of the lack of trained arts teachers, and facilities and resources in the majority of the schools.
Revised National Curriculum Statements (RNCS)
The RNCS implemented a phase-by-phase schedule in order not to delay the educational change. The schedule was as follows: 2001 – Foundation Phase, Grades R (that is the initial, inception, preschool year) to 3; 2002 – Intermediate Phase, Grades 4 to 6; 2003 – Senior Phase, Grades 7 to 9; and 2006 – Further Education and Training Phase, Grades 10 to 12. This schedule was not without problems. An infrastructural problem that complicated implementation is that the Senior Phase spans both primary and high schools, as grade 7 is located in the primary school, and grades 8 and 9 in the high school.

It was also common to find that three different curricula were in use in one school at the same time, that is, NATED 550 (“NATED,” n.d., p. 25), C2005 and RNCS. While the RNCS is being phased in, schools also have the obligation of offering the pre-1994 curriculum as contained in the NATED 550 documents, in the grades that had not implemented C2005, and not yet implementing the RNCS (Mahomed, 2004).

The implementation of the new curriculum in the Further Education and Training (FET) Phase, as contained in the National Curriculum Statements (NCS)\(^4\) (Department of Education, 2003b), commenced in 2006 in Grade 10. Music is a possible elective and is offered for the first time as a discrete discipline. While the NCS incorporates all cultural traditions, musical styles and technological applications, one must take heed that this implementation is improbable in poorly resourced schools in rural areas, towns with extreme poverty, or areas with a huge Black population. It is therefore understandable that teachers were in a state of turmoil. The environment for providing Arts and Culture was not conducive to implementation as the situation with regard to resources and skilled teachers had not been improved (see paragraphs on resources and skilled teachers that follow).

In the FET Phase, the learning areas are no longer integrated. Music is offered as a discrete discipline as opposed to the integrated arts and culture learning area. The purpose for the study of Music has been described as follows in the NCS: “Music gives learners access to opportunities of musical expression and communication through the creation and performance of music within a South African, pan-African and global context” (Department of Education, 2003b, p. 9). The goals of Music are to create and ensure an appreciation and respect for South Africa’s diverse musical practices and other diversities; contribute to the building of a shared national musical heritage and identity; and equip learners with the knowledge and understanding of the musics of the world (p. 9).

Support for Music / Education by Other Policies
A review of the policy documents, such as the Draft White\(^5\) Paper on e-Education (2004), the Broadcasting Policy White Paper (BPWP, 1998), and the Telecommunications Policy White Paper (1996), reveals that South Africa has progressive media policies, and educational support has been forthcoming from various sources, including radio, printing, television, and electronic means. These policy papers are generally drafted by government departments in consultation with the general public, private organisations and non-governmental organisations.

Draft White Paper on e-Education
The Draft White Paper on e-Education (2004) is about infusing information and communication technologies into education. The Paper provides a legislative and policy framework for ICT implementation. It states:

Conventional print media, as well as the use of devices such as conventional radio broadcast and tape recorders, will continue to be used in e-schools. However, we have relatively under-developed digital teaching and learning resources at present. It is crucial, therefore, that we develop as a matter of urgency an education-industry partnership to develop

As has been the case in other instances, priority areas have been identified, but unfortunately, arts and culture is not one of these areas:


The Broadcasting Policy White Paper
The BPWP (1998) proposes, “The use of broadcasting to support the provision of education and information to the South African population” (par. 8.1; also see “Broadcasting Act,” 1999, p. 22). Broadcasting covers areas including radio, television and the worldwide web. Furthermore, it:

Relates to the use of broadcasting as a resource in support of both formal and informal education. In this context broadcasting is a tool for the dissemination of educational materials to learners in all corners of the country in a timeous and cost effective way. Broadcasting is used as a support structure in the provision of materials for human resource development aiding educators, teachers, trainers and learners wherever they may gather for educational purposes. (BPWP, 1998,par. 8.1; “Broadcasting Act,” 1999, pp. 22-23)

A Task Team consisting of stakeholders assembled by the Department of Communications (n.d.) commented on the BPWP (1998) and recommended that there is “the need for the broadcasting system to offer a structured service supporting curriculum-based education, distance learning, adult basic education and training, early childhood development, teacher development and professional skills development” (par. 8.1; “Broadcasting Act,” 1999, p. 13).

The Dedicated Educational Channel
The Independent Broadcasting Authority in its Triple Inquiry Report of 1995 found support for the idea of a dedicated educational channel. A feasibility study was completed in 1998. This has become a reality. Media support for education is quite substantive as is reflected in television. The South African Broadcasting Corporation (n.d.), a portfolio organisation of the Department of Communications (n.d.), implements the educational aspects of the broadcasting policy.

The Terms of reference of this Task Team (“Broadcasting Act,” 1999, p. 22; “Electronic Communications,” 2006, p. 106) identified such a dedicated channel as contributing to the provision of educational materials, which are integrated into the educational process and supporting educators and learners through the country; and supporting distance education. The BPWP has since then become a statutory Act of Parliament, the Broadcasting Act No. 4 of 1999 (1999), but retains the objectives of the White Paper.

Telecommunications Policy White Paper
The Government Communications Department states in the Telecommunications Policy White Paper (1996) that it “aims to enable ordinary people to have access to Information and Communication Technology. This includes tele-education – enabling the country to reverse illiteracy through distance education” (“Telecommunications Act,” 1996, Chap. X, 80, 85; “Electronic Communications,” 2006, p. 100). It encourages diversity in media industry, and the social responsibility of business to develop various media.
The BPWP, the Broadcasting Act and the Telecommunications Policy White Paper (1996) have been replaced by the Electronic Communications Act 2005, and amended under the Independent Communications Authority of SA Amendment Act (2006). The Electronic Communications Act (2006) therefore converges broadcasting and telecommunications, and basically preserves the intention of the two policies. Its objective is to ensure that broadcasting services can “promote the provision and development of a diverse range of sound and television broadcasting services on a national, regional and local level, that cater for all language and cultural groups and provide entertainment, education and information” (p. 20). As can be seen, an active policy developing process has taken place in this sector as the Broadcasting and the Telecommunications Policy documents have been subsumed into the Electronic Communications Act.

**Arts and Culture Policy Scenario**

The policy framework within South Africa is supportive of education in the area of arts and culture, including music. However, much still needs to be done to ensure the implementation of the arts in the educational set-up. Crucial areas to address, include the professional development of Arts and Culture, and Music teachers, and providing access to the use of technology. Similar developmental packages for teachers, which include television, printing, and internet, as that being used for Maths and Science should be used for music teaching. Media resources can be used advantageously in this pursuit, in particular and obviously, those media that have an audio element. The building of computer infrastructure in one province, Gauteng, is probably about 90% on target (Otter, 2001; Kuzwayo, 2001). Educators need to grab opportunities of integrating computer information technology and music teaching, thus making full use of the computer laboratories. Departmental curriculum officials and educators should develop outcomes-based arts and culture lessons that utilise the excellent computer facilities. Regular usage by arts and culture officials, educators and learners will ensure that the skills, which are an integral part of music learning, will be developed. “Stakeholders in education should work with the ICT sector to build content and exploit the current infrastructure to improve delivery and access to educational resources across the country” (“Regional Roundup,” n.d.).

**RELATED ISSUES**

**Resources**

The provisioning in the Apartheid Education Department reflected the unequal provisioning by the State in other spheres. The white minority received the largest part of the budget. White schools had more than adequate resources in the arts as well. The new democratic government initially provided Arts and Culture learning and teaching resources in the Foundation Phase, grades R to grade 3. Generally, schools were encouraged to become self-governing, and therefore had to budget for and acquire their own resources from the Intermediate Phase upwards. No learning and teaching support materials for Arts and Culture were acquired, if teachers did not request them or school principals did not show an interest in Arts and Culture.

It appears that schools that were previously disadvantaged still do not have adequate resources for curriculum purposes, even though funding has been slanted in their favour for basic infrastructure and services such as toilets, water, electricity, nutrition. Equipment such as recordings of songs, tape-recorders, CD-players, television sets, and radios are in short supply, and generally have to be replaced on an annual basis because of the precarious security and safe-keeping at schools (Department of Education, 2003a; Burger, 2006b).

While some resources are in short supply, music instruments are provided to public schools by the government. Recently all public primary schools received 5 guitars, 25 recorders, and 5 harmoniums. Magnet schools that are instrumental music schools have also been supplied with
violins, clarinets, and trumpets. Magnet schools are strategically placed so that they are accessible, and cater for both rural and urban needs.

Textbooks for music present a unique problem. The music textbook material that has been scrutinised shows ambivalence and uncertainty regarding for whom it has been written - the general Arts and Culture teacher or the music specialist. Some of the texts are clearly flawed with inaccuracies that are not perceived by a non-musician. There is also a lack of textbooks - this has been a point of concern to support the implementation of the Arts and Culture curriculum (Maree, 2005).

There is a possibility of support for teachers in their implementation of the new curriculum by using technology – computers, the Internet, radio and television broadcasts, and local newspapers. This support is, however, also beset with problems. Although all public schools are being provided with computer laboratories, the ICT application of the curriculum, and possible arts and culture usage of these laboratories have not been adequately developed. The public broadcaster has developed a number of programmes for school purposes, but these programmes are not optimally utilised by schools. The security/safe-keeping and availability of equipment, such as television and radio receivers, and the synchronisation of broadcasts with school timetables are the problems experienced. Newspapers publish lesson plans on a weekly basis. Music and dance have never been featured in these publications, perhaps because of the sound and movement aspects of the medium. Drama is integrated into Language and Life Orientation, and Art lessons dominate in this respect.

Arts and Culture, and the use of media are catered for adequately in the education policy documents. In the National Curriculum Statements (NCS) document for grades 10 – 12, FET Band, reference is made to a multitude of Learning Support Materials that learners and educators can use in the classroom, for doing homework or researching a project: musical scores, textbooks, music dictionaries, encyclopaedias and other reference works, posters and pamphlets, magazines and newspapers, journals, videos, audio-cassettes and CD’s, multimedia packages, computer software, internet, musicians, and live performances (Department of Education, 2003b, p. 23).

With regard to public broadcasts on radio the South African Music Quota Alliance (SAMQC) has attempted to increase people’s exposure to local music of different cultures to a higher percentage, comparable to 75% in Ghana, and 40% in Holland and France. The South African radio media is therefore fighting against the 25% local content aired (SAMQC Manifesto, 2003) on English language stations. However, an adequate number of radio stations cater for different language and cultural needs. Television enjoys a much higher production, and viewing of local content even during prime time. Various television channels also have a fair spread of broadcasts for different cultural groups.

Skilled teachers
Music tuition at Magnet schools is expected to cover a wide range of cultures according to the demographics of South African society. It is envisaged that learners should not only play European instruments but a variety of traditional African instruments should be used as well like: African drums, mbiras, marimbas, et cetera. This has not yet happened in South Africa, and it is a challenge to both learners and educators to explore material, and to develop content and methods. The National Curriculum Statements also aim at a global music education while the implementation documents of the Gauteng Department of Education (1999) refer to pan-Africanist and multicultural approaches. However, even in the multicultural policy approach, local, indigenous or African instrumental practices have not yet been developed sufficiently to be on par with Western or European practice.

It may be argued that there are no models for teaching African instruments within a Western education system, and that the line of least resistance (Western instruments, even electronic ones) has to remain the norm. Yet, the Centre for Indigenous African Instrumental Music and Dance Practices (CIIMDA) base in Pretoria has a vision for building a theoretical and practical base for
the study and practice of indigenous instruments and dances across Africa. Musical Arts Education Action Teams or MAT cells have already been established in seven African countries, including South Africa, and have intentions of expanding into four others. The project’s immediate aim is to publish a guide on African Drumming. CIIMDA aims to promote and advance African indigenous instrumental music and dance performances, and offers intensive programmes in playing the African classical drum, mouth bow, mbira, xylophones, and other African instruments.

The teaching of traditional music and instruments from non-African cultures, including indigenous cultures does not occur in public schools. Cultural centres offer classes in traditional music. The instrumental needs of various ethnic communities are therefore not fulfilled by the public schooling system or the Magnet Schools. The trend in Magnet Schools seems to be leaning from teaching Eurocentric to popular music, and from employing white to black teachers. This is not necessarily bad. Nzewi says, “Modern popular music is sneered at and snubbed for educational purposes by the modern music educators” (Herbst, Nzewi & Agawu, 1999, p. 78). He continued:

Music education in Nigeria as an African example, has failed to recognize [that] the modern popular music of any culture has strong music and human/societal interests, and should, therefore, be taken seriously as an important resource genre in music education”, all the more so, as he puts it, “because poorly understood and carelessly disseminated popular music consumption could be deleterious to the social-moral education of the young, vis a vis traditional models for value-imbued life and living. (p. 78)

This view is supported by Bender (2004) who says:

If one ignores popular culture or, worse, excludes for example popular dance music from one’s attention or awareness when studying society at large in Africa, this leads to seriously false notions. Dance music in Africa is something that has to be given proper value. (p. 87)

Access to Resources and Skills

Farista’s research (2005) indicates that very few Black, grade 12 learners and schools offer music as a subject. Historically music and the arts have only been offered at schools that served other racial groups (White, Coloured, Indian). Black teachers were not trained in the arts before 1994, therefore, no Black schools offered the arts. The only arts’ offering in Black schools was choral singing. Drama and dance teachers only had posts at specialised arts high schools, and these were the only schools that would have teachers in all four components. In general, skilled teachers in the arts have always been in the minority.

A proposal to improve the learning situation for Black students has been the development of Schools of Focussed Learning, (also see Magnet Schools below) which would support particularly Black learners who have the talent to excel in a selected range of subjects including the arts. Although most learners still attend traditionally Black schools, there has been a migration of Black students to previously White, Indian and Coloured schools because they have better resources, highly qualified teachers and smaller class sizes.

The largest number of unqualified and under-qualified educators is still to be found amongst black teachers. This is a legacy of Apartheid, which is difficult to overcome although efforts have been made for the upgrading of these educators. Tertiary institutions across the country have enrolled and trained a small number of educators in an Advanced Certificate in Education (Arts and Culture). The training content of the course consists of four strands – music, art, dance and drama. In discussions with two music facilitators from two separate institutions, both concluded that the time allocated to music could not be equivalent to the time for the other arts, as music skills require much more effort to develop. In order to cater for the demand at every school, the
training of arts and culture educators needs to continue for a number of years. Schools need a stable cohort of teachers who will be competent in both knowledge and skills in arts and culture. The Foundation Phase, generalist teachers need to be motivated to integrate arts and culture into their learning activities. From the Intermediate Phase upwards, one or two teachers may be sufficient to teach all classes. Ideally there should be two or three arts and culture teachers at every school. However, since there are few specialist arts and culture teachers, all teachers currently teach arts and culture to their particular register class. The quality of this arts and culture teaching is called into question in the present situation, since teachers have limited skills in arts and culture. The number of learners in classes (on average 40 learners) also makes it difficult for teachers to provide quality individual attention, and lends itself to group activities.

One concern is teachers’ lack of qualification in all four arts strands. The District facilitators who should be supporting teachers also need to be trained, as they also are skilled in only one of the arts. The use of traditional and local musicians as teachers (artists-in-residence), though necessary in view of the diverse cultural groups and musical skills, needs official sanction as the qualifications of these musicians are not of the required standard (Maree, 2005, p. 6). In addition, teachers have been complaining about the overloading of assessment. The variety of assessment tools (projects, simulations, assignments, et cetera), the development of assessment tasks, and the numbers of learners (individual assessment profiles are required) – leave teachers confused, and unable to cope. The application of assessment in what is a new learning area for teachers must therefore also be taken into account in the implementation of arts and culture and education policy.

The necessity to have a continuous, life-long developmental programme for educators has been proposed by various instances, such as the National Research Foundation. One such approach which is being implemented for the first time by the Education Department, is the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS), which compels teachers to develop their teaching skills because of the incentive of having salary increases. In the IQMS programme schools could take charge of their own professional development or develop their skills with the assistance of district facilitators or service providers of their choice. Teachers indicate their developmental needs by means of professional growth plans. However, analyses of developmental needs in one specific district were of a general nature requesting, for instance, development in assessment or RNCS. No specific learning area has been identified for development. One would expect a request for arts and culture training. Maree (2005) rightly concludes that arts and culture learning and teaching in schools is of a negligible nature and comments that there seems to be disjuncture between policy and the reality on the ground. She specifically refers to the implementation of arts and culture where teachers have not been adequately prepared and implementation is of a poor standard. Comparisons in England indicate that the arts are being “squeezed out” (Helsby & McCulloch, 1997, p. 56).

Arts and culture curriculum developers in South Africa could make use of IQMS as an opportunity to ensure the continued development of teaching skills. Action research by students and teachers should be encouraged to build a corpus of knowledge from bottom-up.

**Instrumental Teaching**

Privatised music centres employing orchestral musicians, and musicians with private teaching studios, do a large amount of the instrumental teaching in the country. Orchestral and western classical instruments were previously taught in extra-curricular music centres located at White schools. Black learners received instrumental instruction in private, church schools or from non-governmental organisations that were funded from foreign governments or overseas sponsorships. The majority of extra-curricular music centres were closed in 2002, and the teachers were relocated to disadvantaged areas where Magnet schools were opened to provide instrumental teaching to neighbouring feeder schools. These Magnet schools have been in existence for two years, and are still experiencing various problems, such as the development of a curriculum
relevant to the changed needs of the community, which they serve. To date, no local, indigenous or traditional music instruments are offered at Magnet schools. Musical styles taught include jazz, popular music, and standard western classical fare.

CONCLUSION

Policy formulation and policy implementation processes have received a great deal of attention from a number of sources, such as the National Research Foundation (NRF, 2005) and education policy units established at various tertiary institutions. Teacher unions also play an active role in the debates that ensue.

Education and music education is apparently adequately supported by a number of media policies. However, the process from policy formulation to policy implementation concerning arts and culture has a long way to go before a satisfactory conclusion is reached. It seems that South African education policies are on par with the rest of the world (for example, Australia, UK, America, China), in terms of participative, consultative and democratic procedures, learner centeredness, and curriculum contents (knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values), curriculum statements, the integration of the arts, and assessment standards. Much work still needs to be done, perhaps in the form of multi-media packages, to build the confidence and skills of educators to present an integrated curriculum that has a relevant content true to South African traditions and cultures. The need for the professional, life-long, and ongoing development of a stable cohort of educators, who are involved in action research have been identified. Political imperatives of democracy, equity, human rights, and social justice have taken the attention away from educational and progressive skills development considerations. Building capacity in Arts and Culture skills will take a much longer time to develop than acquiring the physical resources, such as textbooks, musical instruments, and ICT. We are still a long way off from providing all 12 million learners, and 28,000 schools with adequate arts and culture facilities.

The timeframes involved in training and developing teachers needs careful consideration. RNCS and NCS training for teachers were only one week long. The Advanced Certificate in Education is a part-time course over two years. To develop skills in four arts will entail a commitment to life-long learning by teachers; the use and development of resources, such as audio and video (CDs and DVDs), in arts and culture needs to be supported; careful timetabled and synchronised use of radio and TV broadcasts; infusing ICT into the Arts and Culture curriculum; use of computer technology and the Internet; well developed textbook materials by specialists in the field; well trained and informed district facilitators; and security and safe-keeping of resources.

NOTES

1. The Eight Learning Areas are: 1. languages; 2. mathematics; 3. natural science; 4. social science; 5. economic and management sciences; 6. life orientation; 7. technology; and 8. arts and culture.
2. Usually this means planning from the end – with their Exit or Critical Outcomes of greatest significance – and building the curriculum and its essential knowledge and competence “back” from there (Spady & Schlebusch, 1999, p. 32).
3. National Education Policy that reflects the formal school instructional programmes in the Republic of South Africa – being replaced by the new National Curriculum Statements.
4. The NCS referred to the curriculum in the Further Education and Training Band (grades 10 – 12) that had not yet been implemented. This is different to the RNCS that was the revised Curriculum 2005 that had been implemented in Grades 1 – 9.
5. White Papers are part of the policy development process in South Africa. The process starts with a Green Paper, followed by a White Paper, which becomes a Bill and finally becomes an Act if accepted by Parliament.

6. Magnet schools within the Arts and Culture framework involves the identification of a school that acts like a magnet within a cluster of schools across phases for the development of chosen fields. They are ‘Schools of excellence’ according to the Gauteng Department of Education, Circular 61/1999.

7. Previously teachers were trained in discrete arts subjects such as music, drama, dance and visual arts. These were therefore specialist arts teachers. With the new curriculum the arts were integrated into the arts and culture field. Therefore generalist teachers with expertise in the four strands, mentioned above, were needed.

8. In South Africa these were racial classifications. Black includes Africans, Coloureds and Indians, while African refers to black, indigenous tribes for example Zulu, Xhosa, et cetera.

9. Instruments such as the mbira, a thumb piano, or marimbas (wooden African xylophone) or drumming.

REFERENCES


Department of Communications. soln.329&catid=10&category=Reports&legtype=null


Arts and Culture Policy Scenario


Chapter 6

The Impacts of School Policies on Music Education in Hong Kong: Four Case Studies

Chi Cheung LEUNG and Lai Chi Rita YIP

Government education policy provides guiding principles for the implementation of music education in schools, the success of which, however, heavily depends on individual school policies. Four different case studies are deliberated in this chapter, which showcase impacts of school policies on music education in schools in Hong Kong. The policies exhibit different emphases on both the intrinsic and extrinsic values of music, which affect students’ music education in school immensely.

GOVERNMENT AND SCHOOL POLICY IN MUSIC EDUCATION

Education policy change in Hong Kong at the beginning of the twenty-first century has positioned arts education as one of the eight key learning areas (Curriculum Development Council [CDC], 2001) with music and visual arts being the two major disciplines. As in many countries/cities, the curriculum in Hong Kong is a guideline and not mandatory. In the new curriculum, the time allocated for arts education is 10-15% and 8-10% in primary and secondary schools respectively. Targets set for music are suggested to be achieved through integrated activities in creating, performing (singing and instrumental playing), and listening (CDC, 2003). In addition, integrated arts education is also emphasized (CDC, 2002). Classes for integrated arts education can be scheduled within or outside the normal school timetable. They can be partly in art, partly in music, or in combination with any other art forms. Cross-disciplinary approaches that promote integrating other disciplines with arts were introduced at the same time. Schools started to use the thematic approach in designing their school-based curriculum, which is highly encouraged by the government (CDC, 2003). On one hand, it can be argued that time for the study of music could be at risk because other disciplines are included in the music curriculum. On the other hand, it can be viewed as a golden chance to be proactive in designing various music curricula that can fit in with other disciplines, in addition to the existence of music as a discrete class in the school curriculum. Which approach is implemented depends greatly on the policy of each school.

FOUR CASE STUDIES

The shaping of school policies that affect music education depends to a large degree on the beliefs and leadership of the principal, the music teachers, and sometimes the chair of the parent-teacher association. Their combined efforts are crucial to the successful implementation of the policies of the schools. Case studies of various schools reveal that individual interpretations and values result in music curricula that are unique in both their content and delivery. This chapter as such is a study of four schools: the Diocesan Boys’ School Primary Division, Good Hope School, International Christian Quality Music School, and Fanling Rhenish Church Secondary School. The place of music education varies in each school. Each has its own approach to and emphasis on the value of music education. The data collected is derived from a
variety of sources, including transcripts of presentations the schools’ leaders made at an international education forum and the discussion after the presentations, school publications (including school web-sites), supplementary documents provided by school principals, and subsequent interviews with music teachers and/or principals. The following sections illustrate how school policies have been shaped, and have impacted on school music education in each of these schools as follows:

**Diocesan Boys’ School Primary Division (DBSPD)** highlights a rare example of strong leadership from the Chair of the Parent-teacher Association in shaping the school policy. Close partnership among the Chair, the principal, the music teacher, and the parents helps to articulate the development of music activities in and outside of school.

**Good Hope School (GHS)** demonstrates the principal’s determination to change the school’s learning and teaching culture from detached discipline studies towards cross-disciplinary studies. Her policy was highly supported by a group of teachers from different disciplines, who facilitate its implementation.

**International Christian Quality Music School (ICQM)** reveals a unique situation of having a school with music training being the major focus of its curriculum. The strong Christian faith, long struggle and hard work of the principal and a group of dedicated school council members successfully actualized the founding of the school and continue to shape its policy.

**Fanling Rhenish Church Secondary School (FRCSS)** exhibits the principal’s strong commitment to her Christian belief that music serves to build a spiritually joyful and harmonious culture among students and staff in the school. Both the principal and the music teacher believe that all students should have an equal opportunity to learn and enjoy music.

The above four school cases though are exemplary and unique are limited to four Christian schools which, of course, cannot represent the general situation of schools in Hong Kong. Furthermore, although there are individual cases where religion is the emphasis of the school’s policy, the focus of this chapter is still on music education. This religious issue, in fact, is an historical phenomenon inherited from the past when missionaries came to China to preach the Christian faith. The prime purpose of establishing schools in China by the missionaries is not just to educate the children but also to spread the Christian faith. The phenomenon has persisted even after the return of Hong Kong back to China. On one hand, this reflects to certain extent the successful actualization of the “One country, two system” policy. On the other hand, this is a situation which is very different from a lot of Western countries where the practice of the separation of church/religion and state are commonly adopted. This issue is an interesting area for discussion, but surely not the focus of this chapter, which is on music education.

### CASE ONE: ACTIVE PARENT-TEACHER ASSOCIATION INVOLVEMENT

The Diocesan Boys’ School Primary Division (DBSPD), established in 2004, has inherited the long established music tradition of its secondary school counterpart, which was founded in 1869. The school’s mission is “to provide a liberal education based on Christian principles” (DBSPD, 2007b) and its vision is to prepare students for the 21st Century, who will become contributors to society and leaders of the community. It is directly subsidized by the government and has a through-train establishment that prepares primary students for a smooth transition to the secondary level. The school believes that “modern education is not confined only to the school hours or within the school boundary but is a continuous process involving a dedicated partnership between parents and the school and a guided interaction within the community” (DBSPD, 2007a). Currently, the school has 720 students and 52 teachers including three who teach music. All aspects of a child’s development, including academic, aesthetic, physical, emotional and spiritual, are valued equally (Committee on Home-School Co-operation, 2007a). A dynamic curriculum is designed by the teachers together with a team of expert advisors. Cross-curricular approaches to
teaching are used and student progress is monitored by teachers in liaison with parents.

With 137 years of music as a tradition in their secondary school, music also plays a prominent role in school life in the Primary Division, including hymn singing, music lessons, and numerous concert performances. Students receive two 30-minute music lessons per week that cover basic music knowledge, singing, and music appreciation. Students are also encouraged to improvise music or compose in an unstructured manner. Attention is also paid to including popular music appreciation. Students have the opportunity to perform and sing with a pop singer, a DBS alumna, in an annual fund-raising concert. In addition, senior students attend at least one concert and write a review report on a concert.

Performance is strongly supported. Students are encouraged to perform in concerts of different kinds, in assemblies or open days for new and old students, parents, alumni, etc. Student participation is high. For example, over 250 students (around one-third of the 720 students) participated in the last school music festival (2005-06).

There are also a variety of instrumental classes. All students are encouraged to learn a musical instrument and the school offers extra-curricular instrumental classes including western string, wind and brass instruments, and Chinese instruments. DBSPD has formed a number of orchestras and a choir in addition to general music classes. These groups include a 70-member senior school orchestra, 30-member junior school orchestra, 30-member wind ensemble, 50-member string orchestra, and 55-member treble choir. Furthermore, the Parent-Teacher Association (PTA) has planned to launch a mandatory Chinese instrumental scheme in the coming school year: an unprecedented policy in building the status of Chinese music in the highly westernized school. Primary 3 students will learn to play the erhu (a two-string fiddle), while Primary 4 students will learn the dizi (a traverse bamboo flute).

The long established musical tradition of the secondary school helps attract numerous talented students from comparatively well off families to the Primary Division. Peer pressure to learn at least one instrument is probably another reason that leads to the affluent situation of instrumental learning. The high rate of participation is evidenced by a survey reported by the Chair of the PTA which indicated that 90% of the respondents learnt at least one instrument, and 40% of them learnt more than one (Wong, 2006).

**Parent-Teacher Association and concert-going education**

The Chair of DBSPD Parent-Teacher Association (PTA) is a DBS alumnus who plays the yangqin (a Chinese hammer dulcimer). He believes that concert going should be a part of music education (Wong, 2006). He is concerned that older rather than younger people go to concerts these days. Therefore, he is attempting to cultivate a concert-going habit among the students and their parents. In line with his thought, the PTA has taken a leading role in encouraging parents to take their children to concerts. The Chair has successfully negotiated for group ticket discounts from local professional orchestras (namely the Hong Kong Philharmonic Orchestra and the Hong Kong Sinfonietta). Six concerts were organized for the students and parents, among them are concerts for traditional new year, film music of *Star Wars* and some piano concertos, Japanese modern drum music, Mozart’s piano concertos, Broadway music (the most popular concert among the students and parents), and a violin concerto concert (performed by a DBS alumnus).

The results of the promotion of concert going were revealed in a survey conducted by the PTA Chair of parents of the 720 students (Wong, 2006). The return rate was 40% (this is satisfactory considering that the survey was conducted in a critical period when many school students suffered from foot and mouth disease, preventing them from attending school). The results show that the PTA’s efforts in arranging concerts for the students and their parents to attend has had a substantial impact on them and that factors affecting concert attendance include the reputation of the orchestra, the artist, the repertoire (the popularity of the film music), the conductor, and the PTA (in descending order of importance).

Among the parents, 3% of them are frequent goers (six to ten times per year), 30% go once,
21% go twice a year, and 26% never do so. Whereas Wong reported that in the United States, 3% of the parents attend concerts six to ten times a year, and 18% attend three to five times a year (Princeton University, 2005, as cited in Wong, 2006). Under the PTA's effort in arranging the concerts, 46% of the respondents have attended the concerts organized; 23% of them who indicated attending only one concert per year previously have increased to more than one concert; and 26% who attended the PTA concerts were the frequent goers. The increase in the number attending concerts has prompted the PTA to continue the service of providing more concerts based on the interests of students and parents.

The survey also indicates that parents’ attitude towards the importance of music education is very positive. Eighty-seven percent of them agree or totally agree that music is vital in a well-rounded education and 86% agree or totally agree that attending concerts is part of music education. The correlation between parents who agree or totally agree with concert attending as part of education and actual concert attending is high (75%). As a result of this programme, the percentage of parents who listen to classical music and bring their children to concerts (80%) nearly doubled that of those who did not listen to classical music but bring their children to concerts (48%). The percentage of parents who listen to classical music and accompany their children in practicing instruments (68%) is much higher than those who do not listen but accompany their children (19%). Some parents who listen to classical music but have never attended a concert before (17%) indicate they have attended a concert arranged by the PTA (8%). Some students who learn an instrument but have not attended concerts before (27%) indicate they have attended the PTA concerts (20%).

Finally, the PTA's concert programme has encouraged parents to attend concerts. About 70% agree or totally agree that the programme can encourage them to attend concerts, and the percentage is higher than the subscription rate. Eighty-three percent agree or totally agree that the concert programme should continue. In addition to classical concerts, parents indicate their favour of musicals and drama programmes.

CASE TWO: A CROSS-DISCIPLINARY APPROACH

Good Hope School (GHS) is a Catholic school for girls run by the Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Conception. It was founded in 1957. In 2002, the Education and Manpower Bureau approved to convert it from an aided school to a Direct Subsidy Scheme school, which means that students attending have to pay substantial school tuition. The school currently has 1,303 students, 101 teachers, and 4 teacher assistants. Students and teachers come from a diversity of social backgrounds and ethnic groups. The school’s motto is “tu es spes mea” meaning “you are my hope”. The mission of the school aims to develop the unique potential of each student, and provide each with an all-round education. Students should possess global perspective, strong citizenship responsibilities, and capability of making a difference. The principal believes that music education is for all and cross-disciplinary education is vital to students’ learning (Chen, 2006).

GHS has a strong team of music staff. The music panel head of GHS is an experienced teacher who has taught music and different subjects for 29 years. She has tertiary training in music, visual art, and English language. She is assisted by four music teachers who have both undergraduate and post-graduate education majors in music and/or music education. Three of them teach religious studies and English as well (Tham-Fung, 2007).

The music curriculum under the changing school policy

The provision of general music classes in GHS is two classes per week for the junior form students with one class for senior form students. Each student is required to learn an instrument. The school has a long tradition of participating in music competitions. Last year, in the Hong
Kong Schools Music Festival, the school choirs won six first/second prizes, one of which was the honour of the Best Girls’ Choir of the Year, plus 24 solo/duet prizes and numerous merits. At present, the school maintains a force of approximately 200 choir members and 150 players in the western orchestra, the dance troupe, and other performing groups. In 2002, the school initiated two major changes in policy with regard to its teaching and learning approach in the arts. The first change is an emphasis on cross-disciplinary learning: a response to the curriculum change in Hong Kong. The second is an emphasis on opening up opportunities to students with creative talents.

The first objective of the school policy is to break the rigidity of compartmentalized learning that has existed for decades in school education in Hong Kong. The change, a gradual one, is to encourage students to learn through cross-disciplinary approaches. In line with the approach, the school launched a number of projects from 2002 onwards. The first project integrated English, visual arts and music by incorporating choral speaking, music writing or sound effects creating for English poems, stage movement, and artwork display on stage. The second attempt integrated the learning of music and visual art with two theme-based or project-based endeavours: Chinese cultural festivals, and western music with visual art production. In the Chinese festival project, students identify cultural elements related to music and art, produce related artifacts such as making lanterns, and singing Chinese songs about the festivals. In the western music project, students present art works using overlapping techniques in colouring to reflect their imagination about the music they have heard in the concert. Another attempt focuses on religious studies. Students research the life work of a clergy artist who happens to have written many chants as well as painted artworks. Students present their music, artworks and related life experiences (Tham-Fung, 2007).

In some of these cross-disciplinary studies, students explore and identify common elements in music and visual art. Not only do they sing in the art room but also they study art works in music classes. The intention is to engage students in aesthetic experiences regardless of the settings. It aims to cater to the diversity of the students’ abilities. Students can then apply their acquired knowledge and techniques in music performance and multi-media production.

In the 2006-07 school year, world music was the theme. The project included most of the students in the school covering general music classes and co-curricular activities such as music camps and concert tours. Form 1 students focused on African music and culture in general. Form 2 students used elements of African music to create a 45-second audio and visual story. Form 3 students broadened their search to different African musics and cultures along the River Nile. Form 4 students explored music originated from African culture, and Form 6 students chose their own interested ethnic music. Form 5 and 7 students were exempted from this theme-based project because they were having their public examinations. In the music camp, an expert on world music was invited to conduct workshops and rehearsals based on the “African Sanctus” with students, and introduced them to African music as well as ethnic music in the 20th Century. In the music tour, students will go to New Zealand in April 2007 and they will be meeting Maori people to have a first-hand experience of the music, dance and culture there. In this way, the music teachers planned and implemented both the general music activities and co-curricular activities under a common theme for all students in a school year (Tham-Fung, 2007).

The second objective is to open up more opportunities for talented students, which is daring because the school has traditionally emphasized winning prizes in music competitions. This emphasis on winning is not uncommon in many of the elite schools in Hong Kong. In the past, only a few selected GHS students were given the opportunity to perform on stage. The school provides a variety of activities and enrichment programmes to refocus students’ energy from competitions to lifelong musicing. Such activities include community service such as singing for the elderly and in Jockey Clubs/hotels/shopping malls, local and overseas exchange tour/music festivals, music camps and concerts, joint concerts with local schools, in-school and public concerts, seminars or workshops, visits by students from foreign countries, etc. Through these
experiences, students can share their passion and enjoyment of music rather than merely for the glory of winning. Furthermore, students are encouraged to form interest groups to perform in school. The Fringe Exhibition provides opportunities for the students to share their talents and hard work to their fellow schoolmates. During lunch hours, they can perform in the school’s covered playground, staircase, corridors, canteen, et cetera. In this way, not only the selected few will be able to perform, but students with other creative abilities and talents also participate. They can sing, play an instrument, present their creative art works, and even multi-media productions. As a result, more students can participate and exhibit their creative ideas across disciplines alongside with performing music (Chen, 2006).

Through the vision and leadership of the principal, the availability of teachers with different expertise, the commitment of the head teacher, the team spirit of the teaching staff in support of the school policy, together with a gradual process of implementation, GHS succeeds in implementing a change of policy in cross-disciplinary approaches. In GHS, the experienced head teacher who possesses different subject expertise together with a team of younger music teachers sets a favourable situation for the policy implementation. The long tradition of a high quality music programme, the large number of staff input in music, and the highly organized and well-experienced planning of the programme facilitate the successful shift of school policy to focus on students’ enjoyment and satisfaction of engaging in music activities, but still maintain the high standard performances of the elite tradition.

CASE THREE: CONSERVATORY STYLE MUSIC EDUCATION

The International Christian Quality Music Secondary and Primary School (ICQM) was founded in 2003 by the Hong Kong International Institute of Music (HKIIM), which has a history of about 18 years. HKIIM has provided quality classical music training for more than 7000 students throughout its history (HKIIM, 2007). Many of them have continued studying music in universities locally or abroad, or have graduated to become music teachers in primary and secondary schools. ICQM is the manifestation of the mission of a group of Christian musicians from HKIIM to produce young talents for Hong Kong and China with Biblical truth as a foundation and music as its soul (Chong, 2006). Students are nurtured to be well cultured academically, artistically, and full of creativity, while grounded in cultural awareness and with a high moral standard (ICQM, 2007). They are expected to graduate with a sense of mission and be willing to contribute to society as well as the church.

Both the principal and vice-principal are accomplished musicians. The principal, who is the founder of both HKIIM and ICQM, was recognized by the Spanish Education Ministry as a Superior Professor of Classical Guitar. The vice-principal participates actively in the composition of music dramas, children’s choir and church music ministry (ICQM, 2007). The School has 600 students for the Primary Section and around 700 for the Secondary Section (Committee on Home-School Co-operation, 2007b). Grades 1 to 6 are the Primary Section and Grades 7 to 12 are the Secondary Section. Students from Grade 6 may proceed directly to Grade 7 and thus do not have the pressure to participate in the Secondary School Places Allocation System in Hong Kong. ICQM has 10 full-time music teachers teaching music classes such as music appreciation and chamber music; and around 20 full-time instrumental teachers (Chong, 2006).

ICQM values the importance of music education in developing students’ potential, intellectual growth and logical thinking. The vice-principal of ICQM states that music can “console and balance emotion as well as musical comprehension and learning ability” (Chong, 2006). The academic curriculum is similar to those provided by most schools in Hong Kong. The academic subjects and music studies complement one another in developing students’ multi-intelligence. Integrated curriculum is designed for students’ holistic development and a well-balanced education.
Quality music facilities and substantial music curriculum

The ICQM is well-equipped with up-to-date facilities, most of which are not typically available in schools in Hong Kong. It has an 800-seat concert hall, three recital halls, 44 instrumental practice rooms, a 300-seat chapel, and a computer room consisting of electronic components specifically designed for computer music learning. In addition, all classrooms are provided with a piano and whiteboard with staves so that music lessons can be conducted in any room in the school. These facilities are provided for both the primary and secondary students.

The ICQM provides systematic music training from primary through secondary level. The training includes music appreciation, music history, sight singing, music rudiments and theory, computer music, creativity, movements, and improvisation. There are also individual instrumental tuition, vocal ensemble, master class, performance, and music sharing. The curriculum uses a Kodály syllabus for vocal ensemble and sight singing; and the Dalcroze method for rhythm and creative movement. The vice-principal believes that logical, spatial, intellectual and creative thinking could be enhanced through the learning of music rudiments, improvisation, and mathematics (Chong, 2006). The above learning activities are conducted within the normal school time. In addition, music groups such as choir, orchestra, woodwind society, flute and percussion band, and chamber music group are provided. Other music activities include classical guitar playing and composition workshops. Students are also encouraged to participate in local and international performances and music festivals. Through different kinds of music learning and musical activities, “students are trained and inspired to be imaginative, creative, and expressive with a solid musical foundation” (ICQM, 2007).

CASE FOUR: A SPIRITUALLY HAPPY SINGING SCHOOL

The Fanling Rhenish Church Secondary School (FRCSS) was founded in 1999 by the Chinese Rhenish Church, Hong Kong Synod. It has a student population of around 1150 coming from a wide range of social backgrounds with a majority of them from low income families. The motto of the school is “To strive for excellence in learning and to understand and manifest Biblical truths” (FRCSS, 2007a). According to what is stated in the school booklet (FRCSS, 2007b), the school aims to provide quality education. Five of its stated strengths are forward-looking vision and professionalism of the teaching team, rustic simplicity of the school culture, whole-person development approach (which has already helped students attain outstanding achievements in choral and verse speaking, music, sports, drama and academic subjects), firm convictions to cultivate students’ achievements, and readiness to face challenges for future fruition.

The principal and her beliefs

The principal of FRCSS, a music-lover who sings, and plays the piano and the organ, believes that “a singing school is a happy school” and “a singing student is a happy student” (Li-Ip, 2006, p.2). She highlights that each student has a vocal instrument, and singing should be prioritized in music lessons. This priority was a consented direction of the principal and the music head teacher since the founding of the school: “singing is a common language” and “doesn’t belong to a privileged group of students” (Li-Ip, 2006, p.3). Through singing, the students are educated with Christian values: they are spiritually happy when they sing. The principal stresses that music and its co-activities have not been given extra resources, and the musical culture is not built at the expense of other subjects. For example, students are not excused from normal classes for the sake of practices and rehearsals. The principal believes that the students should excel in all parts of the school curriculum. For her, the original aim of music education was to enable the students to be spiritually happy. But more than what she expected, music turned out to be a tool through which the students have their personality shaped, confidence enhanced, sense of achievement developed, self-esteem built, team spirit consolidated and most of all, a musical culture developed in the
The Music Panel Head and her beliefs
The school has a teaching team of 61 teachers. They come from a strong Christian background in which singing is a staple of the culture. About one-third of the teachers play an instrument. The teachers thus possess the musical skills and enthusiasm to participate in assisting or organizing various musical activities through which the musical culture of the school is being cultivated. They sing with students in ceremonies. The principal is proud to say that the entire teaching team agrees music has done a lot to achieve harmony and cooperation in the school. She believes this has resulted in a strong team spirit. The established musical culture has helped to bridge the gap between the teachers and the students, as well as among teachers.

The school has two music teachers. The Music Panel Head (Li-Ip & Yu, 2006) is an experienced organist who graduated from a local university with a Bachelor of Arts degree in music. She is currently a member of an active *a cappella* ensemble in Hong Kong. As a lyricist, she has written a theme song for the school’s Parent-Teacher Association. Before entering the teaching profession, she was a presenter of music educational programmes for Radio and Television in Hong Kong and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department. Her colleague graduated from a local teacher-education institution with a Bachelor of Education degree majoring in music. He specialized in contemporary music and improvisation. Their combination of strong musicianship and specialism in contemporary music form a good partnership for running the school’s music programme.

The Music Panel Head’s music education philosophy forms an essential perspective in guiding the school’s music education policy. As a candidate for the Chief Executive’s Award for Teaching Excellence 2006-07, she stated:

As a music educator in a secondary school, I persist to promote popularizing music in education rather than the elite training of techniques and artistry. I place my priority of using music as a means to stimulate learning in other areas rather than the mere teaching of its subject knowledge and techniques. As such, I neither treat music as a discipline, nor do I distinguish its teaching and learning from within and outside of the curriculum. (Li-Ip & Yu, 2006, p. 6)

She further supplemented her argument:

Of course, as a music educator, I cannot solely place my emphasis on popularizing music in education but ignoring the elite training of techniques and artistry. At the same time, focusing on learning outcomes other than the music discipline but ignoring students’ desire to acquire musical knowledge surely is not what my intent. (Li-Ip & Yu, 2006, p, 9)

Like her principal, she has a strong belief that music belongs to all, and students should have equal opportunity in learning music.

The singing culture forms the music curriculum
FRCSS provides general music classes for all forms in the school. For junior forms (Form 1 to 3), the school has two music lessons per cycle; for senior forms (Form 4 to 7), one lesson is provided. Junior form students are required to sing in front of the class or the whole school. Senior form students participate in the inter-school music festival competition. The provision of music lessons in senior forms is not common in Hong Kong because the pressure of attaining high grades in public examinations in Form 5 and 7. The provision of music classes in senior forms would mean less class time for academic subjects. Thus the music provision would further tighten the schedule of the school curriculum, but this is a good evidence of the school’s policy in its
emphasis on music.

In FRCSS, students attending music lessons do not sit for public examinations. Yet, the standard is still demanding because students are required to pass both practical and written examinations. Marks received are counted towards students’ total academic score. In Hong Kong, marks for subjects like music, physical education, and visual arts are counted separately from academic subjects. This means these subjects are not considered as important and do not affect students’ overall academic results. The practice in FRCSS is not common in Hong Kong, and is a clear evidence of the emphasis on music for the whole-person development of the students.

Other than learning music in general music classes, students can learn instruments in instrumental classes or attend choirs. The school has several choirs. Choir conductors are recruited from outside of the school. Furthermore, performing musicals is a tradition. The school launched four musicals between 2000-2006. They are *Joseph and his Multi-colour Dream Coat*, *Daniel in the Lions' Den*, *Key to the Truth*, and *The Grateful Leper*. Not many schools in Hong Kong have more than two choirs and recruiting external choir conductors is not a typical practice. In addition, not many have established a tradition of presenting musicals. And, out of the 33 prizes or distinction/merit certificates received by FRCSS students in the Annual Hong Kong School Music Festival in 2006, 20 of them were in singing. Surely, the singing culture in this school is highly developed.

Students also participate in various performing activities, competitions, special occasions and gatherings. They perform in mini concerts, ceremonies such as Speech Day, the opening ceremony, Thanksgiving ceremony, prize giving ceremony; in inter-school music competitions and inter-class singing contests; in special occasions such as Chinese festivals and carol singing in shopping malls; and in gatherings such as singing in morning assemblies, gospel meetings, student fellowships, and graduation gatherings. Singing plays a large role in students’ life in the school. Through singing, the students worship, celebrate and console, and they express their feeling and passion. They also write lyrics for a theme song and for songs of one of the musicals. They sing on field trips and picnics, and in changing rooms and school courtyards. During a visit to Beijing, the students were highly praised when they chose singing to share their feelings (Li-Ip, 2006). The extensive singing culture has not detracted from students’ time for academic studies. On the contrary, these students have achieved good academic results in their public examinations despite the school’s short history.

**DISCUSSIONS**

Different school policies place different emphases on the educational value of music in schools. Music as a subject exists not only for its own sake in the school curriculum but also possesses extra functions and educational values that the stakeholders treasure. Its impact on students’ development is invaluable. It helps to enhance students’ cross-disciplinary learning, academic pursuit, spiritual development, life-long learning, school harmony, cultural awareness, confidence, self-esteem, and sense of achievement.

**The effects of school policies on music education**

School policies in the schools studied have immense effects on music education in the respective schools. These effects include music as an indispensable part of the school curriculum, a strong music curriculum, emphasis on co-curricular music activities, and a rich music tradition/culture in school.

DBSPD has a rich music environment filled with lots of opportunities for music performances. The regular music lessons of approximately an hour per week are provided for every primary level. The general music classes include comprehensive content that includes ranging western classics, Chinese, and popular music. Apart from music appreciation, music
creativity and music performances are encouraged. All students learn to play at least one instrument and many of them participate in music ensembles as co-curricular activities, and take part in music competitions. The PTA takes an active role in promoting a concert-going habit for parents and their children. Mechanisms are in place to foster various music activities both inside and outside of school. The school policies favour music and help nurture students who are proud of their music tradition.

With a supportive school policy, general music classes are provided for both junior and senior form students in GHS. The requirement for every student to learn a music instrument enables more students to take part in music performances. Participating for the glory of winning in music competition has become a tradition. The school is however changing its policy to support cross-disciplinary approaches and de-emphasize the “winning” tradition. In turning away from compartmentalized teaching and switching to cross-disciplinary approaches of thematic-based project learning, music education has become an integral part of students’ learning with more emphasis on cultural context. It generates much greater interest in students’ learning of music. At the same time, the promotion of participation in musical exchanges, performances, and community service tones down the elitist emphasis. The changes in school policy allow more enjoyment in the sharing of music.

Originated from a conservatory institution, the school policy of ICQM focuses on music training more than other schools in Hong Kong. Music is as important as other academic disciplines. The various domains of music are studied progressively and exceptionally different from general music classes in other Hong Kong schools. In addition, the formal music curriculum includes individual instrumental tuition and ensemble experiences that are scheduled within normal class time. The comprehensive content offered in the music curriculum provides a strong foundation for the students’ musical development. Students’ participations in local and international performances demonstrate their standards.

The development of a school culture filled with singing is the result of FRCSS school policy. The singing culture strengthens music education which is not only limited to students, but also to teachers and parents. Considering that most students are from the lower income group, the policy is extremely successful in educating the students in the enjoyment of music and spiritual sharing. The non-exam-oriented and non-elitist approaches to the provision of music classes throughout all the secondary classes foster a highly positive environment for music learning and enjoyment. Harmony in music learning draws a parallel to harmony in the teamwork of the school.

CONCLUSION

This chapter has investigated four school cases that display the role of music education asserted by the key school policy makers: the principals, PTA chair, and the music teachers. The shaping of each school’s policy depends largely on the policy makers’ beliefs about the values and functions of music in education. Their beliefs and the subsequent school policies greatly influence the music provisions including the music curriculum (general music classes and co-curricular activities), its contents, teaching approaches, which values and philosophies are emphasized, forms and extensiveness of activities, staffing, and facilities. These provisions together with the concerted efforts of the music teaching staff and their colleagues help to facilitate the students to build up a music tradition/culture in school, establishing a music environment in formal and informal ways.

The commonalities revealed in the four schools demonstrate that the success of school music education is dependent on the school’s policies regarding music. Individual school principals, school music teachers, alumni, and parents all can take a part in shaping policies that are beneficial for music education. The beliefs of these influential people help confirm the place of music in school education, which is crucial for the development of a flourishing music
atmosphere. The school tradition once developed becomes the vital driving force in continuing students’ musical development. The schools are usually well-equipped with personnel and facilities, fully support the promotion of music education, and realize the intrinsic and extrinsic values of music in education. These values contribute to the total development of the students, enhancement of learning through integrated approaches with music, and building a harmonious school environment. The overarching government policy can provide guidelines, but various school policies exert more impact leading to the blossoming of music education in these schools.

REFERENCES


Curriculum Development Council (CDC). (2001). Learning to learn: Life-long learning and whole-person development. Hong Kong: The Education and Manpower Bureau, HKSAR.

Curriculum Development Council (CDC). (2002). Arts education key learning area curriculum guide. Hong Kong: The Education and Manpower Bureau, HKSAR.


Wong, A. (2006, July 15). Presented at the discussion forum on the impact of school on music education held in the CMCEMMP seminar (C. C. Hung, Transcribed), Hong Kong.
Chapter 7

Music Education Curriculum, New Media Policies, and the Next Generation: A Philosophical Opportunity

J. Scott GOBLE

Over the past decade or so, discussions of music and music curriculum in elementary and secondary education in the United States and Canada have included debate over “aesthetic” versus “praxial” philosophies of music education (See Jorgensen & Yob, 2003). Differences in these two philosophical positions stem largely from the differing foundational concepts of “music” upon which they are based, and they thus have differing curricular implications. In fact, “aesthetic” philosophy is manifested in the music curriculum of most schools and the instructional approach of most teachers in the two nations. Notably, as new media technologies are emerging and media policies are changing at present, teachers who embrace each of these positions are encountering both validation for and challenges to their usual ways of instruction.

In this chapter, I will provide an historical framework to illuminate key differences in “aesthetic” and “praxial” philosophies of music education, discuss the respective strengths and limitations of the two positions (emphasizing their curricular implications), and describe how recent innovations in media and changes in media policies are raising challenges and opening a philosophical opportunity for music teachers who hold each position.

“AESTHETIC” AND “PRAXIAL” PHILOSOPHIES

The concepts that have supported music education in the Western Hemisphere throughout most of its history originated in the birth of modernity in the European Renaissance of the fourteenth, fifteenth, and sixteenth centuries, a time when autocratic systems of government gave way to new forms in the emerging city-states, when the Protestant Reformation shattered the supremacy of the Catholic church, and the “scientific revolution” displaced Biblical conceptions of the earth as the center of the universe. The worldview that emerged in Europe at this time and proliferated in the following centuries increasingly grounded human actions in reason (rather than religious faith), placing confidence in the effectiveness of scientific inquiry to provide final and universal answers to all questions, and in the expectation that social and technological progress would eventually solve all major human problems. The rise of the industrialized nation state, representative democracy, and the integral role of the mass media all have roots in the vision of modernity, that a perfect society could be built on shared scientific knowledge and social tolerance.

Reasoned inquiries into the philosophical area of “aesthetics” emerged in Europe, just as the United States was taking form as a nation in the eighteenth century, adopting freedom of expression, separation of religion from the state, and dedication to democracy as some of its guiding principles. The notion of “the aesthetic”—as a special realm for music and the other “fine arts”—stemmed from the writings of Alexander Baumgarten, and was developed by Immanuel Kant and other influential German philosophers of the time (Dixon, 1995). Kant (1914) drew a distinction between most aesthetic judgments (which he regarded as simple acknowledgements of pleasure or satisfaction) and true judgments of taste (which he held to involve “the faculty of judging the beautiful”) to support his argument that “disinterested” judgments of beauty could be made, having subjective universality or impersonal validity. The concept of “the aesthetic” as the special realm of “the arts” was tacitly adopted in the United...
States in the following decades, and “the aesthetic” has come to serve as a culturally and ideologically neutral mental space within which the disparate forms of music produced by the nation’s culturally diverse citizens could be considered intellectually (that is, in terms of their formal and sensuous properties) in the nation’s public forum, without necessarily giving attention to their particular cultural origins or their potentially politicized content.

The related concept of “art music” blossomed in the nineteenth century, when the term “art song” began to be used to delineate songs written by a professional composer (as one supposedly more in touch with true, present realities) as distinguished from songs composed for religious purposes, or the folksongs of different cultural groups. Notions of “art music” held by the so-called Romantics of the time manifested a renewed recognition of the importance of feeling and emotional intuition in the music of all eras, and the music itself accordingly reflected the unique influences (for example, personal, social, geographical) on each composer. The concept of “art music” has continued to take hold in nations influenced by European and American traditions, manifesting the subsuming of native traditions of various origins into modern “aesthetic” concepts. (See, for example, Omojola, 1994.)

The notions of music as a “fine art” and the realm of “the aesthetic” fit well with the goals of the recording and broadcast industries when they emerged in the twentieth century. They can be seen to have been a basis for Frances Elliott Clark’s pioneering of “music appreciation” in 1930 for the new Victor Talking Machine Company (later the RCA Victor Company) as the company sought to sell recordings of musical “masterworks” for profit. They remained strong throughout the following decade as evidenced in James Mursell’s influential arguments for the “intrinsic value” of music in support of music education in the public schools. Notably, while school textbooks of the time often featured “music of many lands” in their contents, the songs of different cultural groups were characteristically described in the terms of their formal and sensuous qualities, in keeping with “aesthetic” concepts. (See, for example, McConathy, Beattie, & Morgan, 1932.)

In the 1950s, American music education scholars Charles Leonhard and Robert W. House (1959) sketched a modern philosophy of music education grounded in the ideas of the European aesthetic philosophers in their book *Foundations and Principles of Music Education*, and this focus remained strong in the 1972 edition. Among their other arguments reflecting aesthetic ideals, they drew a distinction between “good music” and “great music”, suggesting that the latter was both more subtle and more abstract in expression, and thus better suited for teachers purposes to “improve taste and educate people musically” (Leonhard & House, 1972, pp. 102-103). Leonhard in particular had great influence not only through this book and his other writings, but also via the large number of music teacher educators he taught during his long tenure as head of the graduate program in music education at the University of Illinois.

American scholar Bennett Reimer, a doctoral student of Leonhard, forged for music educators a philosophy grounded in modern “aesthetic” concepts in *A Philosophy of Music Education* (1970). The following statement, central in his philosophy, illustrates his orientation:

> The major function of art is to make objective, and therefore conceivable, the subjective realm of human responsiveness. Art does this by capturing and presenting in its aesthetic qualities the patterns and forms of human feelingfulness. The major function of aesthetic education is to make accessible the insights into human feelingfulness contained in the aesthetic qualities of things. Aesthetic education, then, can be regarded as the education of feeling.... The deepest value of music education is the same as the deepest value of all aesthetic education: the enrichment of the quality of people’s lives through enriching their insights into the nature of human feeling. (Reimer, 1970, p. 39)

In developing his philosophy, Reimer emphasized a distinction, borrowed from musicologist Leonard Meyer (1956), between so-called formalist, referentialist, and expressionist theories of
Reimer (1970) advocated that music educators in the United States should adopt a position of absolute expressionism as the basis for their teaching, according to which the meaning and value of a given piece of music—as a work of art—are regarded as being primarily internal to the work itself. According to this position, the relationships of the tonal and rhythmic materials within a musical work alone are capable—in and of themselves—of exciting feelings and emotions in the listener, and the expressive emotional meanings evoked by music “exist without reference to the extramusical world of concepts, actions, and human emotional states” (Meyer, 1956, p. 3). Thus, any personal and social meanings that particular forms of music might have carried within their original cultural contexts were not to be considered by music educators. These aspects of Reimer’s philosophy rendered it especially suitable for an American society that had long striven to bracket consideration of its constituent cultural groups’ meanings and values from consideration in the public forum, in order to focus on shared concerns. Reimer was a guiding editor for the Silver Burdett music series in the 1970s and, as textbooks created with his guidance were adopted by many school districts, these philosophical perspectives influenced numerous public school music curricula.

But during the second half of the twentieth century, with enhanced global awareness stemming from the emergence of television as the primary source of news, challenges to authority originating in the United States civil rights movement, and fears stemming from the Cold War and the nuclear arms race (among other factors), many scholars and others in societal positions of leadership began to question the central ideas and values of modernity. Notably, the writings of “post-modern” scholars have suggested that the confidence in the rational pursuit of universal truths and the belief in scientific, social, and technological progress that characterized modernity were too limiting, since many of the practices that stemmed from the modern worldview came to affect individuals, societies, and even the Earth itself in detrimental ways. These scholars have suggested that because the confidence in rationalism that prevailed throughout the modern era was not tempered by a globally conscious, universally shared, moral or religious foundation, it led inevitably to such practices as colonialism, slavery, and fascism. In addition, they have observed that while the modern belief in the value of scientific, social, and technological progress brought great social benefits for certain members of the societies that embraced this belief (and not for others), it also led to the psychological and social disorientation of individuals and communities that had previously been comparatively well-balanced.

One modern idea that has long been central to music education, and that has been challenged is the aesthetic philosophers’ notion of music as a “fine art”. Postmodern scholars have asserted that this concept does not account for the range of socio-cultural meanings beyond those typically associated with Western art music. For example, philosopher Philip Alperson (1991) took issue with the aesthetic bases for music education philosophy, proffering instead a praxial approach that focused on understanding and teaching music “in terms of the variety of meanings and values evidenced in actual practice in particular cultures” (p. 228). Drawing from the ancient Greeks’ distinction (described by Aristotle) between three areas of knowledge, theoria (speculative knowledge of pure, eternal truth), techne (knowledge required for making or creating something), and praxis (knowledge that takes into account the sorts of reasoning and critical thinking necessary for getting the “right results” for human benefit in practice in a given situation), Alperson argued for the importance of attending to different cultural forms of musical engagement as personal and social practices in music education philosophy.

Likely compelled by Alperson’s argument, Canadian philosopher of music education David Elliott (1995) set forth a praxial philosophy in his influential book, Music Matters: A New Philosophy of Music Education. Elliott began with the idea that members of different cultural groups throughout the world who make music should be considered practitioners of “a diverse human practice”, which he called “MUSIC”, and he emphasized that “music ought to be understood in relation to the meanings and values evidenced in actual music-making and music listening in specific contexts” (Elliott, 1995, p. 14). This aspect of his philosophy met with a
positive response from music educators who had felt the aesthetic model did not adequately address different cultural values and practices (even those manifested in some traditional Western practices, such as marching bands and Broadway musicals).

Elliott went on to argue that a universal aspect of “musicing” (that is, the behavior he regards as common among the different forms of music-making practiced around the world) is that “musicers” are typically engaged in what psychologist Mihaly Cziksentmihalyi (1990) called autotelic or “flow” experiences, in which the individual experiences a loss of the sense of “self” and loses track of time. He asserted that, as members of different cultural groups throughout the world develop skills and take on challenges in musicking in their respective traditions, they typically effect “flow” and bring order to their own consciousness, with personal self-growth, greater self-knowledge, and raised self-esteem as concomitant results. On these bases, he affirmed the value of music in education. Elliott’s praxial philosophy has influenced thinking, writing, and teaching among music educators internationally, but it has been criticized for failing to account for the radically differing human motivations giving rise to many of the different forms of music-making manifested in different world societies. Indeed, the worshipful chanting of monks, the collective protest singing of labor union members, and a mother’s vocalizing of lullabies are among the many musical behaviors probably not motivated primarily by interest in developing skills or overcoming musical challenges.

In various writings throughout the 1990s and beyond, American music education philosopher Thomas Regelski advocated looking to “what music is good for” in different social contexts as the basis of his praxial philosophy. Regelski stressed that praxis implies that one is enjoined to get “right results” with one’s music-making in particular situations where contextually unique results are called for, and he emphasized that the goal of learning particular kinds of music-making should be in-line with individual, social, religious, and cultural practices, as well as the contexts and traditions within which they usually take place. In his urging that all music should be seen as “functional” in some way, Regelski’s praxial philosophy embraced the distinctiveness of different cultural forms of music more than Elliott’s. Still, Regelski’s (1996a) assertions that music is a “universal human trait” and that “a praxial philosophy of music in and through education is concerned to get people into action musically” (p. 125) seem to bring disparate cultural practices involving sound under the umbrella of the modern Western concept of “music” and to limit students’ possibility of seeing them for the radically unique practices they are.

STRENGTHS AND LIMITATIONS OF THE TWO POSITIONS FOR MUSIC EDUCATION CURRICULA

Both the “aesthetic” and “praxial” visions of music education warrant respect as philosophical foundations for music education curricula owing to the socially beneficent intentions of those who have argued for them. As I noted above, the realm of the “aesthetic” as the province of “the arts” has come to serve as an ideologically neutral mental space within which disparate forms of music produced by the culturally diverse citizenry of the United States could be considered intellectually, without necessarily giving attention to their particular cultural origins or their potentially politicized content. Furthermore, the argument has been made that, in focusing on high quality musical “works” in their teaching, music educators have developed the aesthetic sensitivity of students “for their own personal benefit, for the benefit of society which needs an active cultural life, . . . [and] for the benefit of the art of music which depends on a continuing supply of sympathetic, sensitive consumers” (Reimer, 1970, p. 112). This claim may or may not be well-founded, but in any case the efforts of “aesthetic educators” have indeed served well the purposes of those in the media industries who regard the creations of composers and performing artists as “intellectual property”, valuable products saleable in a market economy. “Aesthetic
educators” directions to students to focus on the internal, formal (that is, tonal and rhythmic) aspects of different musical works as the locus of musical value, rather than on the social meanings and effects of different musics, have contributed to legitimizing the commodification of music as an object, which has supported the growth of music publishing, recording, and broadcast industries that have provided livelihoods for countless individuals.

However, the efforts of “aesthetic educators” have also been criticized for being elitist, owing to their tendency to focus on the musical products of particular cultural groups (and not others) as “masterworks”, confirmed by “experts” to be exemplary works of “fine art”. The argument is that aesthetic concepts of “taste” and “true beauty” are not truly “disinterested” and universal (as Kant had argued), but are instead socio-culturally rooted and maintained by people in positions of power (see Regelski, 1996b, p. 27). Furthermore, critics have argued that those who use the concept “aesthetic” tend to downplay harmfully the different cultural origins of disparate forms of music as well as their meanings in the particular communities within which they emerged. Indeed, listening to the music used in a worship service or a song written for a workers’ union rally in terms of its aesthetic qualities (or as a potentially saleable “work”) does direct the listener’s focus away from the social and political importance those forms of music held (and often still hold) for the people with whom they originated. Considerations of religious beliefs, intercultural meanings, cultural identity, and political motivations are all suspended in the “aesthetic” context, so students do not necessarily grasp the social importance of different forms of music.

At the same time, the validity of arguments for the inclusion of music in elementary and secondary education on the basis that music education provides “education of feeling” has been challenged. Critics ask: If music education focuses on intra-musical meanings, and if music has no important connections to anything outside itself, isn’t music education just a “frill” subject? Indeed, without addressing the social meanings and significance of different forms of “music”, many teachers find it difficult to explain music education’s importance.

Meanwhile, music educators who base their teaching on “praxial” views can be lauded for advocating the study of different musical traditions on their own terms. Their emphasis on “understanding music in terms of the variety of meaning and values evidenced in actual practice in particular cultures” (Alperson, 1991, p. 228) opens up the possibility for students to learn about historical origins, and the social and political efficacy of different forms of music, and would seem to confirm its importance as a subject of academic study.

Yet the praxial vision also raises difficult questions when it comes to considering its implications in a curriculum. Beyond their shared primary concern with getting students to actually engage musically, both Elliott and Regelski have asserted the importance of attending to the personal and cultural meanings of different musical traditions. Elliott has recommended that listeners should learn “how to apprehend cultural information in, and attribute cultural meanings to musical patterns and musical works by convention” (Elliott, 1995, p. 192). Regelski (1996a) has emphasized that the “process-values” of particular musical practices are assessed as “good” by persons involved with that praxis only when they conform to the individual, social, religious, and/or cultural meanings the praxis is intended to serve (p. 30). But learning about the personal and cultural meanings of different musical traditions could take a significant amount of time in classes that have historically emphasized music performance and listening. Should in-class rehearsal and performance time be reduced to allow students to learn more about different cultural forms of music as personal and social practices? Many students and members of the adult public (for example, parents, school administrators, legislators) have come to expect that music education programs will emphasize performance (despite the emphasis placed on music listening by “aesthetic educators”), and they are not likely to be happy with any “social studies-like” approach to music education.

Also, if school music curricula do put emphasis on performance, then another question arises: Whose (that is, which cultural groups’) musics should be taught in the schools? Certainly,
there isn’t sufficient time to include all musical traditions in the curriculum. In making curricular recommendations, one praxial philosopher—Thomas Regelski (2000)—has promoted “general musicianship”—the kind of ‘knowing’ and ‘doing’ that travels well and thus has potential relevance for use across a variety of styles” (p. 82), but it must be acknowledged that studying such “general” kinds of musical “knowing” and “doing” will likely have the tendency to keep students’ musical experiences close to prevailing societal norms, limiting their opportunities to explore musical practices that differ widely from those dominant in the mainstream of the public forum.

If the quandaries of cultural diversity haven’t raised enough challenges for those seeking suitable philosophical bases for curricula in music education, recent innovations in music-related media, and changes in laws and policies associated with them are certainly providing additional hurdles, straining both the aesthetic philosophers’ and the praxial philosophers’ conceptions.

INNOVATIONS IN MEDIA AND CHANGES IN MEDIA POLICIES

Over the past few decades, striking technological developments have led to the emergence of numerous remarkable innovations in music-related media, including digital synthesizers; computer sequencing, sound sampling, and notation software; digital audio encoding equipment (for example, for compact disk recordings); digital audio transmission file formats (for example, MP3s); Internet Webcasting; satellite radio; as well as personal video production tools. These technological innovations have brought about changes in students’ experiences with music that many music educators “didn’t see coming”, and they raise challenges for school music teachers, and music teacher educators (and their students) in universities who hold both of the music education philosophies I have just described. I will briefly explore some of the more notable ones here.

In some of the North American secondary schools in which I have taught or supervised student teachers, students now have opportunities to take music courses in digital music laboratories in which they learn to compose, notate, arrange, and record music using synthesizers, computer sequencers, and sound sampling technologies. Perhaps the most striking feature of these classes is that students with relatively limited musical backgrounds are able to engage musically and to create complex, presentable compositions without the years of practice and experience formerly required to hone instrumental performance skills, master music notation, learn how to lead an ensemble, and develop proficiency at using analog recording equipment. While the music most students make with the new technologies tends to be drawn from contemporary pop music traditions (and mostly in predictable ways), I have observed that the compositions produced by some students reflect the unique musical-cultural traditions of their respective family heritages. Notably, their interest in the tonal and rhythmic organization of the musical “works” they are creating exemplifies the notion of “art music” that stems from aesthetic philosophy as they include formal “expressive” elements that stem from their own traditions. At the same time, the interest and involvement with the students’ compositions that is stimulated within their own families and cultural communities (as well as in their schools) manifests the praxial philosophers’ interest in having students experience and understand musical engagement as a meaningful social and cultural praxis.

However, other students using the same equipment are borrowing sounds and formal attributes from musical traditions of which they know very little as they compose, sometimes creating works similar to ones they have heard elsewhere, and setting them with their own lyrics, quite unaware of the conflicts and ironies inherent in their musical appropriations. For example, one student at a school near my university set Christian lyrics to Reggae-inspired music with no apparent awareness of the fundamental differences in the worldviews of Christians and the Rastafarians (with whom Reggae originated), let alone a purposeful intention of addressing such
differences meaningfully in her composition. Her teacher, who was oriented toward aesthetic philosophy (and who thus was focused primarily on musical form and expression and tended to discount cultural meanings), had no problem with the social conflicts manifested in her composition, but the student’s work would probably be dismissed or receive criticism for its odd incorporations if it were to reach a wider, musically and culturally knowledgeable listening public. Indeed, a teacher oriented toward helping students to understand the social meanings associated with different musical practices might regard the student as having “missed the point” of having engaged with the musical materials she brought together.

As the technological innovations in media I have described above have emerged, they have also motivated changes in media policies, especially concerning copyright laws, control of broadcast content, and media ownership regulations. In fact, laws and regulations are now changing so frequently that is presently difficult for scholars in the field to stay current with them. The most significant United States copyright law of the past twenty years is the Digital Millennium Copyright Act (1988), which criminalized not merely copyright infringement, but the production and dissemination of technologies that can circumvent measures taken to protect copyright. The most widely noted application of the law was the legal action brought against Napster, an online “music sharing” service that allowed listeners to exchange MP3 format song files without compensating the copyright owners of the songs. Not surprisingly, the recording industry raised accusations of massive copyright violations (See Menta, 1999). Napster was terminated by court order in 2001, but other decentralized peer-to-peer (“P2P”) file-sharing programs have emerged since then, and they have proven much more difficult to control.

Also, Webcasting, considered as a worldwide phenomenon, is largely unregulated at the time of this writing (although it is presently regulated in the United States), and satellite radio is not regulated at all. Not surprisingly, large media corporations have raised issues concerning the lack of regulations on satellite radio, arguing not that they are trying to shackle satellite radio, but that they simply seek a “level playing field” in their efforts to be competitive (Clark, 2005). But notably, Webcasts, file sharing, and satellite radio have represented a boon to music education students in universities seeking to gain access to recordings of music from different traditions (with relatively little effort and at little or no cost) for use in their lessons.

While most recorded music available via the Internet is still owned and promoted by media companies, a great deal of music of different cultural groups (that is, communities “outside the mainstream”) has also become accessible. What many of these communities lack, of course, is the promotion of media companies to give their music a wider listenership, but my students seem quite motivated to seek out culturally diverse musical examples, and to make copies of them for their own use.

In fact, in the university level classes I teach in music teacher education, students now frequently bring to class their iPods (portable digital media players and storage devices) on which they have placed sequences of musical examples culled from Webcasts, file sharing, and satellite radio for use in their in-class presentations and lessons. They connect their iPods to the classroom sound system so their musical examples can be heard on speakers by the entire class. Furthermore, they sometimes bring in musical examples from outside the theoretical frames of Western art and popular musics (featuring, for example, Indian classical music, Tuvan throat singing, and Australian aboriginal didgeridoo players) for use in their lessons. Unlike my previous example, the illustrations the students seek to make in their lessons usually reflect legitimate connections (as in a class discussion of how the human vocal mechanism can be manipulated to effect overtone singing as done by throat singers in Tuva), but at other times they do not (as when one student described aspects of a sitar performance using the analytical terminology of Western art music). Notably, at the beginning of each term, students tend to bring to class musical examples that they find attractive primarily on the basis of formal and sensuous (that is, “aesthetic”) characteristics. But over time my music education students conduct more in-depth historical research or substantive cultural explorations into the music they have chosen to
feature in their lessons (using the Internet or other means) in order that they may foster in their instruction others’ understanding of the social meanings of the different “praxes” manifested in their musical selections.

Sometimes, however, my music education students have encountered websites featuring music that they find disturbing or offensive, and some have brought examples of these musics with them to discuss before or during class. Notably, their experiences with such musics have contributed to moving their interest toward praxial concerns. Often the students’ discomfort stems from their having encountered music (some of it likely created for shock value) that runs contrary to their personal moral or religious views (as when rap lyrics have violent content, or when sacred music is put to commercial purposes). But some of their other selections actually stretch the limits of civil law (as when the works have racist messages). At such times, we have discussed, affirmed the importance of, and sometimes challenged the existence of the “ideologically neutral mental space”, which arose concomitantly with the concept of the “aesthetic”, and we have noted that the public availability of much music depends on citizens’ willingness to allow such freedom of expression. Indeed, the success of a praxial philosophy oriented teacher who attends to the personal and social meanings of music (which are sometimes politically charged) in her or his lessons actually depends on students’ having learned to consider them intellectually, dispassionately—that is, to adopt a posture stemming from the writings of the aesthetic philosophers.

CONCLUSION

As we have seen, differences in “aesthetic” versus “praxial” philosophies of music education stem largely from the differing foundational concepts of “music” upon which they are based, with “aesthetic” philosophies rooted in an historically longstanding, universalizing notion of music as an object meriting formal analysis, and “praxial” philosophies emphasizing understanding of the personal and social meanings of the disparate musical practices of different cultural groups. With the emergence of new media technologies and media policies in recent years, which have led to students’ engagement with many different forms of music, events in the classroom are making it clear that both “aesthetic” and “praxial” philosophies have strengths and limitations.

I would like to suggest that these challenges represent an opportunity for further reflection and adjustment by teachers who presently manifest one of the two philosophies in their teaching. The central question is: In light of recent innovations in media technology and changes in media policy, is it appropriate for teachers to focus only on intra-musical meaning (that is, on the formal and sensuous qualities of musical works within a context of aesthetic education as the “education of feeling”) or to emphasize primarily students’ understanding of the social meanings of musical practices from different socio-cultural traditions?

My own belief is that—in order for students to grasp the important place of “music” as a phenomenon in human life—both philosophical perspectives should inform elementary and secondary music education. Students need to learn to consider musical works intellectually in terms of their sensuous properties and formal organization, and recognize that most music practices reflect important personal and social meanings in particular cultural contexts. Given the wider accessibility students are presently gaining to different musics owing to the emergence of new media technologies and policies, they—as the next generation of responsible adult citizens of the world—will need aspects of both philosophical perspectives in order to make informed decisions about music and musical engagement in the world to come.
REFERENCES


School music teachers in the United States (US) do not enjoy complete intellectual and operational autonomy. Instead, they operate within a web of social relationships and expectations and under the influences of numerous policies made by various organizations and authorities. US education in general is regulated through state standards, required curricula, mandatory textbooks, and standardized testing. Music teachers typically have more autonomy in the selection of methods and materials than do other teachers. However, they are still subject to numerous policies. Some of them are overt, while others are so embedded in the culture of schools and music education as to operate in a covert way with teachers being unaware of them and the influence they wield. Overt policies outline teachers’ schedules, regulate their activities, and mandate curriculum content. Covert policies influence their knowledge, dispositions, expectations, pedagogies, and skills. Without awareness of how such policies are affecting them, and lacking skills to affect changes in policy, teachers can become deprofessionalized functionaries of an education bureaucracy. This is a dangerous prospect for education in a democracy, where it is the job of teachers to insure the country has an educated and critically thinking populace. Therefore, it is incumbent upon music teacher education to equip teachers with skills in policy research and formulation and to help them expand and refine those skills throughout their careers. Unfortunately, the US music education community has not developed the requisite body of policy studies, policy research expertise, or inclination to do so.

Policy research lags behind the level of sophistication developed in other areas of music education scholarship because the music education research community has not developed a significant body of policy studies. It is so undervalued that the National Association for Music Education’s Research Agenda for Music Education does not even include policy (MENC Research Task Force, 1998). There are at least five potential causes for the poor state of policy research in US music education. First, music education research is a relatively young endeavor. It is only natural that some forms of inquiry would develop sooner than others. Policy studies are perhaps the latest area to mature. Second, while music education in the schools is a policy-driven enterprise, research in music education is conducted primarily at the university level. The university culture values “basic” or “pure” research motivated strictly by curiosity over “applied” research that is designed to answer practitioner questions and inform policy makers. In fact, “writing for policy makers and practitioners may even have negative connotations since it might appear to sully an instructor’s credentials as an unbiased observer” (Lorenz, 2007, p. 6). This could have a negative impact on promotion and tenure in some universities, which provides a disincentive for professors to engage in policy research. Third, many music education researchers have focused on developing expertise in one methodological approach in a specific area of study. It is probable that many music education researchers have never considered that their expertise is applicable to researching policy. Fourth, advocacy efforts by national organizations and the professional arts industry often include exaggerated or unproven claims regarding the benefits of learning music (Gee, 2002; 2004). Perhaps music education researchers are intimidated from conducting much needed research into the actual impact of various programs and policies on music teaching and learning for fear of negative backlash or political trouble in their tenure and promotion processes. Finally, there is confusion within the music education community as to
Policy Studies as a Component of Music Teacher Education

73

what exactly policy is and what policy research entails. This has resulted from discussions of policy often coupling it in a murky relationship with philosophy and advocacy. Statements such as “philosophy provides the foundation for valid policy while policy deals with issues raised by but beyond the purview of philosophy” (Reimer, 1992, p. 33) and “the business of policy or advocacy is to translate a philosophy into terms understandable to and convincing for a great variety of influential publics” (Reimer, 1989, p. 9) can lead some people to incorrectly believe policy and advocacy are interchangeable, that they are both handmaidens of philosophy, and that the type of research necessary for policy studies is primarily philosophical inquiry.

This confused state of affairs must be remedied if the profession is to take control of the policy environment in which it operates. Therefore, in this article I will attempt to rectify misconceptions about policy by clearly defining and expounding on it, outline ways in which policy impacts teachers in order to make its effects more visible, discuss categories of policy studies with the hope it will encourage scholars to engage in policy research, posit that the profession needs a greater degree of activity in policy research, and advocate that music teachers need to study policy as part of their professional education in order for the profession to build the necessary policy capacity to act strategically on behalf of music education.

POLICY DEFINED

Before interrogating policy studies and their place in music teacher education, it is prudent to come to a consensus on what the term policy means. Policies are simply rules and can be formal or informal, explicit or implicit, or overt or covert. They are the rules by which societies, associations, businesses, professions, and all manner of groups are organized and function. Policies can outline both content and procedures.

Individuals and organizations develop policies to define themselves and guide their actions. Sam Hope (2004), Executive Director of the National Association of Schools of Music, described policy as a means to “make successful decisions or to influence the decisions of others” (p. 95). John Mahlmann (2003), Executive Director of MENC: the National Association for Music Education, stated that policies “help organizations deal with change, respond to their members’ needs, address real-world situations, allocate resources, and solve problems” (p. 71).

Educational policies range from international declarations such as the United Nations’ declaration on human rights stating elementary education shall be compulsory (United Nations General Assembly, 1948), to national and state laws, to local district and school policies, to departmental curricula and teachers’ classroom procedures. Ralph Smith (2004) has described how policies impact arts education in a variety of ways such as determining “the purposes and objectives of arts education, curriculum design, teaching and learning strategies, the selection of content, teacher preparation, administration, and types of advocacy and research” (p. 87). When viewed in this light, it is easy to see things as seemingly disparate and often considered to be neutral, such as state music educator association requirements for festival participation and prescriptive methodologies such as Dalcroze, Gordon, Orff, and Kodály, as policies that have a much greater regulatory impact on the values, content and conduct of music education than one might assume.

The next step in developing policy awareness is to investigate the role various policies play in music teachers’ professional lives. It is particularly important to become aware of those policies which tend to go unnoticed and, therefore, unquestioned. Revealing them illustrates the pervasive influence of policies on music teachers, and allows teachers to realize their effects and either accept, neutralize, or reverse their impact.
POLICY INFLUENCE ON TEACHERS

Policy affects music teachers at every stage of their careers. It impacts what they learn themselves as university students, what they are required to continue learning once employed as teachers, the types of settings in which they teach, and the content of the curriculum they are allowed to offer. The following exposition of policy influence on music teachers during their pre-service and in-service careers illustrates the reach policy has in the formation and practice of music teachers, and the conduct of music education in the nation’s schools.

Pre-service
Policies affecting pre-service teachers are focused on their selection, preparation, and attainment of prescribed competencies. Those wishing to become music teachers must typically attend a college or university, pass a prescribed sequence of courses, develop competencies mandated by the university and the government, and pass government mandated examinations. The first step to becoming a music teacher is entrance into the college or university. This usually requires having attained an acceptable score on a standardized test, passing a performance audition and other entrance requirements determined by the university, and compliant with policy of the National Association of Schools of Music (2006, pp. 86-87). This is the initial policy-induced weeding process to becoming a music teacher.

Once matriculated, the student must meet requirements set by policies of their individual institutions, NASM and other accrediting bodies, and certification requirements of their states. These policies include the structure and content of their degree program, competencies they must attain in a variety of areas, and specializations from which they must choose. Thus, the formation of a potential music teacher’s musical orientations, the types of musics to which she is exposed and in which she becomes fluent, the kinds of musical experiences she has, the musical and pedagogical skills, dispositions, and biases she develops, and the liberal arts perspectives she gains, are all developed in accordance with policies from NASM, the government, the university, and the faculty. The music teacher candidates are usually oblivious to this and simply accept the requirements as being universal for all those wishing to become music teachers. They don’t realize the customized experience created at the intersection of all the various policy makers to which they must adhere.

As an illustration of just how different requirements can be, Paul Doerksen (2007) identified 34 different certification tracks for music teachers required by different states across the US. When one considers the input of other policy stakeholders, such as university curriculum committees, music department policies, and the interests and emphases of the music education faculty, it is easy to recognize how teachers are differently prepared as driven by the policies to which they must adhere as university students. The end result is that policies, mostly unknown to the students, greatly influence the type of musician and the kind of teacher each graduate becomes.

In-service
Once teachers are certified and employed in a school (in-service), policies are focused on their continuing education, instructional schedule, the curriculum content they teach, and their pedagogical and assessment approaches. Formal policies are made by regional accrediting bodies for schools, state education departments, local school boards, administrators within school buildings, and the teachers within each music department. Curriculum mandates and assessment also differ by state and local school district.

Many teachers are required to attend professional development offerings and/or pursue further studies throughout their careers. Some states require teachers to obtain a prescribed number of continuing education credits or hours of professional development throughout their careers, and some require teachers to obtain a masters degree (Conway et al., 2005). Thus,
teachers’ thinking, teaching dispositions, value-systems, knowledge bases, and pedagogical approaches are further developed through professional development activities, graduate courses, the influence of music educator associations that provide publications and sponsor conferences and festivals, music education publishers and manufacturers that provide workshop presenters and produce materials, and the professional arts industry. All of these organizations have policies that guide their offerings.

Given the wide reach policy has in the formation and practice of music teachers and music education, it is pertinent for the profession to develop skills in policy research and in affecting policy decisions. Understanding the kinds of policy research one can conduct, and introducing some of the large research questions policy studies can answer, will hopefully encourage scholars to engage in policy study.

**POLICY STUDIES**

Policy scholars apply descriptive, historical, philosophical, qualitative, and quantitative approaches to study the impact of policies, and to make recommendations for changes to existing policies or for adopting new ones. As in all research, the type of methodology employed depends on the questions to be answered. Historical studies in policy can “construct a useable past in which the problems and limitations of past traditions can be delineated, with the intention of evaluating current educational policies” (Cox, 2002, p. 703), philosophical and qualitative inquiry in policy can “ponder core values and their manifestations in professional practice…explore the contexts in which these core values are then carried out…[and] reflect real debate and even rancor as competing ideologies strive to gain primacy in the value systems of our field” (Richmond, 2002b, p. 3) and descriptive, qualitative, and quantitative studies can focus on the impact of policies and “issues of decision making and resource allocation” (p. 3).

Policy studies tend to fall within four general categories: the study of policy as a topic itself, the implications of or actual impact of specific policies, analysis of policies from various perspectives, and policy recommendations. This list is intended merely as a means to demonstrate the variety of work in which policy researchers engage and many studies cross these categorical boundaries. Therefore, it is neither a definitive list nor is the following an exhaustive literature review. The studies included are merely intended to serve as examples.

**Policy as a topic**

Policy and policy making are treated as topics unto themselves. Some studies address procedures and criteria for policy making. For example, Smith (2001) has defined what he calls a defensible policy for art education. Hope (2004; 2007) has developed rubrics for one to consider when developing policies to insure they are focused on strategic goals and don’t cause unintended negative consequences. Barresi and Olson (1992; 1994) have addressed the nature of policy making, and have outlined types of policy and the policy process within the school culture. And Mahlmann (1999; 2002) proposed strategies to affect policy, and discussed the role of policy within organizations.

An important vantage point in the policy process is understanding the various legal influences exerted on policy decision makers. Richmond has studied the implications of law on music education policy in general (2002a), the right to have access to arts education, and how litigation influences policy decisions and implementation (1992; 1994).

Other studies have reviewed trends and actions in policy making. Smith (1992; 2001; 2002) has analyzed trends in policymaking from a speculative approach, basing his criticism on values, and recommending criteria for policies based on them. Olson, Barresi, and Nelson (1992) employed a historical approach and demonstrated how policies evolved from practice into explicit or implicit policies, such as the composition of university faculty, required components
of music education degrees, music teacher education curricula, and orientations of the profession. They outlined voluntary moves toward standardized practice throughout the profession that eventually took the form of explicit or implied policy.

Finally, some articles, such as the current one, address the need for more activity in policy research. Sam Hope (1992; 2002; 2004) has addressed this need in several articles, and has outlined areas where policy research is needed.

Policy Impact and/or Implications
An important role of policy research is to determine the impacts that polices have had on practice. This is an area of research that is greatly lacking in music education. Music educators have been less active in policy studies in general when compared with visual art teachers (Colwell, 2005), but this is the area of greatest need. Whereas visual artists have studied the impact of policies on visual art education, such as the National Endowment for the Arts’ residency programs, such studies for music education have not been located. This is possibly a result of art educators being more pressured by the policy work of professional arts organizations pursuing funding for artist residency programs under the rubric of arts education (Gee, 1994a; 1994b; 2004). The work of art education policy researchers provide examples music education researchers can follow. For example, Laura Chapman (2004; 2005) has studied the impact and posited potential fallout of the No Child Left Behind act on art education in elementary schools, and Gee (1994a; 1994b) has studied the degree to which arts education policy goals of the National Endowment for the Arts are, or are not, delivered by artists and performers who receive NEA grant funds to be artists-in-residence in schools and their impact on K-12 arts education curricula.

Much policy impact research in music education tends to focus on inputs rather than results. For example, Byo (1999) surveyed teachers for their perceptions about whether or not they could implement the standards. Fonder and Eckrich (1999) went a step beyond self-reported perceptions, and surveyed college and university music department chairs asking them if the national standards for music had had any impact on their teacher education curricula. Seventy-seven percent of their respondents reported having made curricular changes due to the standards. While it is tracking the impact of the standards on a programmatic level, it is reporting impact to the input of teacher preparation and provides no information on its effects on teacher competency or their instruction once employed. As Abrahams (2000) found, a lack of consistent performance standards between colleges and universities results in a patchwork of preparation to teach the standards. Orman (2002) went a step further and investigated the impact of the standards on teaching time. She observed practicing elementary music teachers to determine the percentage of class time teachers devoted to the various national standards. She found that time was spent on all nine standards, but that less time was devoted to those that require the students to make creative or artistic decisions. What is lacking from the literature at large is data on the impact of the standards on student learning in music.

Another perspective to address the effects of policies is the lack of impact they have. Colwell (2006a; 2006b) addressed the conservatism of universities in spite of policy, and their tendency toward voluntary standardization as outlined by Olson, Barresi, and Nelson (1992). He outlined how even though published accreditation standards allow and even encourage institutions to implement unique approaches to music teacher education, few actually do so. Instead of taking the initiative to be innovative, Colwell (2006a; 2006b) posits that most programs tend to parrot “standard” practice while erroneously blaming the NASM standards as being too rigid.

Scholars also address the implications of policies or of the ways in which they are implemented. Gee (1999a; 1999b) has determined that professional arts organizations’ willingness to claim that exposure to the arts can solve a host of social ills, and their blurring the lines between arts education and arts exposure, has created confusion and a loss of credibility and threatens the stability of arts education. In music education, Shuler (1995) speculated on how the
National Standards for Music Education could impact the preparation, professional development, and assessment of music teachers and Conway et al. (2005) have speculated on the implications of the No Child Left Behind Act for professional development of arts teachers.

**Policy Analysis**

Another form of studying policy is to analyze policies from various perspectives, and make policy recommendations based on scholarly critique or research. One approach is to analyze policies from a comparative standpoint. Benedict (2004) compared the US National Standards for Music to those of mathematics, language arts, science, and history. She found “pedagogical discrepancies” between the music standards and those of the other disciplines, and made recommendations for changes. Another approach is to analyze the intellectual foundations, often invisible and/or unquestioned, upon which policies are based. Bresler (2002) outlined how philosophies are often translated into policy, using Harry Broudy as her case in point. Moore (1994) addressed the influence of various movements such as multiculturalism, and the impact of various approaches such as comprehensive musicianship and methodologies on teachers’ emphases in the classroom. Her concern was their impact on teachers’ weighting of emphasis on the musical development of each individual versus the large group’s performance. She presented ways music teachers can balance the “development and valuing of both the individual and the community” (p. 36).

**Policy Recommendations**

Policy study can be undertaken for the purpose of making recommendations for changes or new policies based on data or concerns extrinsic to the organization's current policies or practices. For example, Jones (2005; 2007b) has studied the implications of the knowledge economy and globalization for music education, and has made recommendations for curriculum and practices that would meet the needs of students and communities in the age of globalization. Smith (1999) raised concerns for what he termed a “crisis in American civilization” based on work drawn from four perspectives outlining a crisis to advocate a humanistic approach to arts education. And Brophy (2002) used data from a national survey of in-service teachers to make recommendations for improving pre-service music teacher education. Other recommendations can be based on theories or other intellectual grounds. For example, Hope (1996) provides a theoretical framework for policy development based on decentralization and Colwell (2006a) advocates that the profession needs to strike a balance that includes both its own beliefs and knowledge from data when developing policy.

**THE NEED FOR MORE ACTIVITY IN POLICY RESEARCH**

The need for more activity in policy research for music education is acute. The federal government has begun to exercise increasing influence in education, and various state and federal policies have been reported to be having a negative impact on music education. Unfortunately, we lack the data to know the exact impact these policies are having on music learning. Extant research studies primarily document reductions in time allotted for music classes in many schools (Center on Education Policy, 2006; Jennings & Rentner, 2006; Zastrow & Janc, 2004). This does not reveal any impact on music learning. Thus, the profession is operating without the data necessary for accurate analysis of the impact of these policies. We need research that reveals the specific impact such laws and policies have on music education as well as a host of other policies, such as the implementation of recommended national standards, which many states have adapted or adopted into law (Consortium of National Arts Education Associations, 1994).

In spite of this situation, music education researchers have been widely focused on areas other than policy. Content analyses of the Journal of Research in Music Education (JRME),
arguably the premier research journal in US music education (Hamann & Lucas, 1998), reveal that the majority of research published in that journal has been experimental and descriptive (Yarbrough, 1984; 1996; 2002). While policy studies can employ those methodologies, and a couple of the articles cited in this paper were published in the JRME, Yarbrough’s descriptions of them as categories indicate the research published is generally not policy research. This is supported by reviewing the 1998 Anthology of research from the JRME, which does not include a single policy study (Price, 1998). There is a journal devoted to policy, *Arts Education Policy Review*, in which most policy studies in music education appear to be published. Its visibility in the profession, however, is more limited than journals devoted to other forms of scholarship indicating there is less interest and activity in policy. This situation must be improved.

The profession needs research on policies in order to appropriately inform policy makers and to empower music teachers. Barresi and Olson (1992) outlined the need for music educators to study policy in order to “develop strategies for influencing the direction of policies and to initiate the formulation of policy at various levels” (p. 760). Hope (2004) has stated that we must develop the capacity to understand and influence policy on our own behalf or accept and react to the policy decisions of others. Therefore, he has outlined several areas where research in policy is needed in order to guide a research agenda for policy in music and art education. They are greatly abbreviated here to pique the reader’s interest. Those wishing to pursue these areas are advised to consult the references cited (Hope, 1992; 2002; 2004):

1. Purposes – What are the distinctive purposes of music education?
2. Technique – What is the place of technique within the policy environment? How do we balance technique of policy advocacy and content?
3. Youth Cultures – What is the field’s role in preparing students to engage with mediated culture?
4. Technology – How can technology expand rather than narrow possibilities?
5. Teacher Preparation – What impact do policies have on teacher preparation?
6. Intellectual and Curriculum Issues – What impact do theories and pedagogies have on learning?
7. Funding and Rhetorical Support – What is the relationship between funding and rhetoric?
8. Standards and Resources – How are the national standards affecting policies and practices?

**DEVELOPING THE PROFESSION’S POLICY CAPACITY**

Hope (2004) has stated that the profession needs a small group of people with expertise in policy research to develop the policy capability of music education. I add that not only do we need to develop a cadre of policy experts, but that the entire profession must understand, value, and support policy research and engagement. Collecting the data necessary to analyze the impact of policies, and acting on policy recommendations, requires the cooperation of music educators at all levels. In addition, sound research-based policy recommendations will fail if the majority of the members of the profession don’t support them due to not understanding them or their value. Therefore, all members of the music education community must understand, and have some engagement with policy in order to recognize its importance and assist in the profession’s efforts. The best way to accomplish both goals, that of developing a cadre of policy experts and engaging the entire profession, is for all music teachers to develop skills in policy research and refine them throughout their careers. In order to do so, music teacher education programs must include policy studies as a required component of every degree program, beginning with an introduction to policy at the undergraduate level, and including policy analysis and research at the master and doctoral levels. Policy studies should also be included as a regular offering for professional development activities.
Pre-service teachers should be exposed to policy as an area of study and should engage in policy analysis as part of a course in music education. It could be a unit within a research or foundations of music education course. Further developing the disposition for policy analysis can be included in several types of courses. For example, Barrett (2006) provided a model for helping students develop policy capacity through studying and developing grading policies as part of their pre-service coursework.

Masters and doctoral degree programs should include policy studies both as examples within research and bibliography courses, and should have a complete course devoted to policy studies in which students review extant studies and articles on policy and conduct a policy study of their own. Policy studies should also be added to the list of encouraged thesis/dissertation topics and categories.

Finally, professional development offerings should routinely include opportunities for teachers to engage in policy study. Sessions at music educator conferences should be devoted to reporting the results of policy studies, workshops should be offered to teachers to help them develop their skills in policy research, and state music educator associations should form policy groups that research the impact of policies, communicate the results of their studies to the membership and policy-makers, and propose changes and new policies.

CLOSING

Developing the policy capacity of music education could elevate the profession to being a counselor and trusted partner in the policy process. Accomplishing this will require increasing the amount of research effort devoted to policy; insuring rigorous data collection, analysis, and synthesis; practicing integrity by accurately reporting the results of research findings; rejecting exaggerated claims made on behalf of music education; disseminating the results of research widely in various ways in order to reach a variety of stakeholders; maintaining independence from organizations with agendas other than the education of children; avoiding involvement in advocacy efforts that raise doubts about the integrity of our work; and developing a critically engaged professional membership. This will not be accomplished quickly, nor will it happen in any organized or linear fashion. It will be up to individual members of the profession to assume responsibility for policy engagement. Professors must begin including policy research in their degree programs and offering professional development opportunities in policy; professors and graduate students must devote at least some of their research to policy issues; university promotion and tenure committees must be made to see the value of such research; music educator associations must offer policy research sessions and form policy research groups; and individual music educators must engage in the policy process. Such a massive effort would not only build the policy capacity of the profession, but would also enable it to take control of its destiny and act strategically in the best interests of music education, instead of constantly reacting tactically to the decisions of others.

NOTES

1. This is evidenced by the historical development and emphases of research journals. The two leading all-inclusive print research journals were started in the second half of the 20th Century. Journals dedicated to specific areas of music education research such as history, philosophy, and policy are much newer. The Journal of Research in Music Education was started in 1953 and the Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education in 1963. The Journal of Historical Research in Music Education was started in 1980, Arts Education Policy Review in 1992 (As a continuation of Design for Arts in Education) and the Philosophy of Music Education Review in 1993. As these specific interest journals were founded, the Journal of Research in Music Education, which is arguably the
premier US music education research journal (Hamann, 1998), became more focused on quantitative and qualitative studies (Yarbrough, 2002).


3. I use the word organization here in the broadest sense, to mean all groups including societies, formal associations, schools, and so forth.

4. Pre-service teachers are those preparing to become music teachers, which is typically accomplished by attending state approved university programs and taking state-mandated examinations.

5. While not all institutions are NASM accredited, the association sets the recognized standard in the USA.

6. Education in the USA is the responsibility of the states. Therefore, each state and territory has a department of education that is responsible for developing policies and insuring their execution.

REFERENCES


Center on Education Policy. (2006). *From the capital to the classroom: Year 4 of the no child left behind act*. Washington, DC, WA: Center on Education Policy.


Creativity and Assessment
Chapter 9

Policy and Music Education: A “New” Culture of “Creativity”?

Neryl JEANNERET and David FORREST

This chapter examines the background for the more recent resurgence in thinking about creativity and considers some of the ways in which creativity has been viewed over the last 100 years. We ask where this latest impetus has come from, how is it manifesting itself and what are the implications for music education. We also investigate the ways in which the development and assessment of creativity is being presented at the policy level in curriculum documents and the implications of these models for music education.

There is a current and increasing emphasis on “creativity” being a desirable attribute in education outcomes and in the workplace. This emphasis has been exemplified in government reports such as the All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education (NACCCE, 1999), in current commentaries, advice and writings (for example, Robinson, 2005a, 2005b; Florida, 2002, 2005a, 2005b) and government policy documents such as the Victorian Essential Learning Standards (Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Authority [VCAA], 2005a) in Australia. A similar focus on the attribute of creativity being desirable received significant attention in the 1950s for a number of reasons one of which related to the USA not being the first in the space race at the time. We suggest that the current focus may have resurfaced for similar reasons.

Walker (2005) noted that a number of high profile businesses such as IBM, Apple and Hewlett-Packard have acknowledged the role of the arts as part of a balanced tertiary curriculum that will provide a “balance between technical skills and the education of intellectually creative thinkers…giving the future business leadership more resilience and success.” Where has this latest impetus come from? Could it be that the growth of highly industry specific university degrees may have narrowed tertiary curricula and graduates are not the lateral and imaginative thinkers that industry desires? Are there different conceptions (and requirements) of “creativity” and how are these manifested in different educational and industry sectors? What is the place of the arts and do they contribute to the development of the creative individuals industry and business apparently desire? Some views on creativity and its manifestation within curriculum documents in Victoria, Australia are presented in this chapter.

WHAT IS “CREATIVITY”?

The term “creativity” has no universally accepted definition although many writers have explored the concept. At the most basic level, the Oxford American Dictionary defines “create” as “bringing into existence; giving rise to, originate.” It defines “creative” as either “having the ability or power to create things, or showing imagination and originality as well as routine skill. This second meaning is a little confusing. It might be presumptuous but it could imply the “creative” person also possesses a knowledge/skill level that enables them to be “creative”. Similarly, the Encyclopaedia Britannica (n.d.) states that creativity is the “Ability to produce something new through imaginative skill, whether a new solution to a problem, a new method or device, or a new artistic object or form. The term generally refers to a richness of ideas and originality of thinking”.

85
Clearly creativity is not just about “thinking” but qualities of thinking. While not the first to do so, Torrance (1969) defined creativity in terms of divergent thinking, and developed terms to describe different levels of divergent thinking. He also stated that there is no universal definition of creativity but “newness” is a factor in all the definitions he has explored. He further states that “newness” can be in the perspective of the creator, not the world in general and this point would seem to be critical when examining the work of children. What is new to students may not be so from the perspective of the adult.

Many researchers slip more easily into talking about what they see as the process of creativity and the attributes needed to engage in the process. Hammond Leeper et al. (1974) propose that creativity is a complex process that usually involves a range of qualities including awareness, originality, fluency, flexibility, commitment, and complexity. The qualities of inventiveness, originality and the ability to solve problems in new ways can receive expression in a great diversity of tasks. Further to this, Gardner (1985) believes that “a human intellectual competence must entail a set of skills of problem-solving, enabling the individual to resolve genuine problems or difficulties that he or she encounters and, when appropriate, to create an effective product - and must also entail the potential for finding or creating problems - thereby laying the groundwork for the acquisition of new knowledge” (pp. 60-61). What seems to emerge from some of the literature that attempts to define “creativity” is the tendency to include “problem-solving” and the notion of “product”, but there are quite different views expressed elsewhere in the literature as noted below.

VIEWS OF CREATIVITY

Many and varied writings about creativity have existed since the time of Socrates (Plato, 1993). A truly comprehensive review is beyond the scope of this chapter and it is our intention is to explore more recent proposals. Freud (1916) viewed creativity as having a similarity to neurosis, both these aspects of personality originating in conflict. He proposed that creativity was the unconscious process through which sexual or aggressive energies were directed into culturally approved behaviours. He associated the creative person with partially abandoning the world of reality for “phantasy” which seems connected with his often disparaging view of creativity as an undue perpetuation of childhood play and the pleasure principle. Freud also believed that there was only a small population of creative individuals and that creativity was not necessarily socially desirable, “We may lay down that a happy person never phantasises, only an unsatisfied one” (Freud, 1908/1970, p. 129). His proposal that there is an interaction between creativity and psychopathy continues to receive comment in some research literature in the field. For example, Adaman and Blaney (1995) used music mood induction to induce an elated, depressed, or neutral mood in 71 college undergraduates. Their test of creativity measures, which was an unusual uses subtest of the Torrance Tests of Creative Thinking (Torrance, 1966), revealed that the elated and depressed groups rated higher than the neutral group.

Wallas (1926) arrived at what he saw as a model of the process of creative thinking that clearly implies that the process is about “problem-solving”: preparation--incubation--illumination--verification. It also gives the strong impression that the process is linear. During preparation, the person absorbs information. After a period of “incubation”, which could include experimentation, thought, examining a range of possibilities, and the general settling of information, the “illumination” or “aha” moment occurs when a solution emerges, which is followed by “verification” where the final product is created. This view of the creative process still receives considerable support as is noted below in the School Curricula section.

Comte (1976) makes a point that there has been criticism of Wallas’ model because it divides the creative process into over-orderly stages. He notes that Taft (1971) remarked that creative achievements can be made in more than one way. Taft “defines two creative styles: one
a measured, problem-solving approach, and the other an emotional and comparatively uncontrolled free expression. He suggests that these may be thought of as defining the extremes of a continuum” (Comte, 1976, p. 46). Building on the earlier work of Torrance and Guilford, Comte (1976) also argues that “the creative process is not a unitary process” and that “it is inaccurate to regard the process as simply a process of divergent thinking, for both divergent and convergent thinking would seem to operate variously during the process” (p. 56).

Gardner (1993, 1999) criticises the assumption that all creativity is of the same sort, particularly the idea “that all creativity fundamentally entails the solution of problems” (Gardner, 1999, p. 338). As a result of his 1993 study of “extraordinary creators”, he suggests that there are “at least five distinctly separate varieties of creative behaviour:

1. The solution of an agreed-upon problem – for example, the determination of the structure of genetic material or how to title an article about creativity.
2. The development of a general comprehensive theory – for example, Darwin’s theory of evolution as natural selection, or, for that matter, a theory of creativity.
3. The fashioning of a permanent instance of a genre – for example, the writing of a sonnet or the preparation of an article for a psychology journal.
4. A stylised performance – for example, the conduct of a dance recital or the delivery of a public lecture on creativity.
5. A high-stake performance – for example, the conduct of a military battle or a debate on the nature of creativity conducted in front of the committee that is deciding on the newly created Nobel Prize for the Behavioural Sciences” (p. 338).

Gardner’s 1999 article was prompted by the publication of D. K. Simonton’s (1999) book, Origins of Genius: Darwinian Perspectives on Creativity that gave rise to a number of responses by various researchers.

By the 1950s, creativity had come to be seen as a desirable attribute and part of being a complete and satisfied person. Guilford's focus on creativity in his 1950 presidential address before the American Psychological Association initiated a veritable explosion of research. There was an enormous growth of public interest in creativity and by the late 1960s it was assumed by many educators and parents that to be creative was not only desirable but it meant being a more complete and well-rounded person. Unfortunately as funding disappeared during the 1970s and the glamour of the subject waned, parents and educators turned their attention to the “basics” of education which saw a growing emphasis on literacy and numeracy, and the testing of such over the next two decades.

After the 1950s, research shows a distinct evolution as creativity became viewed as an ability shared by all individuals and therefore a normal trait. Mednick (1962) described the creative thinking process as “the forming of associative elements into new combinations which either meet specified requirements or are in some way useful. The more remote the elements of the new combination, the more creative the process or solution” (p. 131). This description implies that there is a hierarchy among creative responses depending upon the perceived value of the response or the remoteness of the elements being brought together.

Writers such as Fromm, Maslow, May, and Rogers (in H. H. Anderson’s Creativity and its Cultivation, 1959) argued that although the potential for creativity was present in everyone, its actualisation depended upon a social climate free from the pressures of conformity and harsh evaluation. In addition to the view that creativity was a normal, if variable, human trait, came greater inclusion in the language of research reporting of the problem-solving orientation. In a society where the methods of science have become the norm against which are measured all kinds of standards, it is hardly surprising that “problem-solving has emerged as the desideratum of creative behaviour” (LaChapelle, 1983, p. 132), so that the concept of “creativity” as used in many parts of Western society changed. Terms such as “creative” teacher, “creative” salesman or
“creative” historian have acquired meaning from a consideration that all those areas have problems that can be creatively solved” (LaChapelle, 1983, p. 133).

At the same time, the behaviourists are rather noticeable by their absence (or at least paucity) in the literature. Hargreaves (1986) suggests that behaviouristic theories have had little success in explaining creativity and states that:

Skinner's (1972) attempt is a simple, straightforward account in terms of the artist's reinforcement history, and of the environmental consequences of creative behaviour. ‘The artist puts paint on canvas and is or is not reinforced by the results. If he is reinforced, he goes on painting’. No account is taken of the internal processes or emotional states involved in creativity; Skinner is purely concerned with the associations between observable creative behaviour and external reinforcements. (p. 153)

It is interesting that Skinner regarded the manifestation of creativity as being artistic endeavours. It is worth noting that throughout this exploration of the literature, the arts and “creativity” are rarely mentioned together. Krathwohl and Anderson’s (2001) revision of Bloom’s Taxonomy of Cognition renamed the “evaluation” level as “creation” which they define as “putting elements together to form a novel, coherent whole or make an original product” which goes some way to accommodating the arts where the original “evaluation” level was lacking and would come some way to addressing aspects of the definition of creativity posited above. Perhaps the absence of specific reference to the arts lies in the fact that much that is researched and written about creativity comes from the psychology and associated fields where measurement and reporting results are key components in discussion.

On the other hand, in some fields of psychology, the Freudian notion of creativity being associated with psychoticism and personality continues in contrast with some perceptions that it is a natural, desirable trait. While personality might be a factor in creativity, Sternberg and Lubart (1993) are rightly critical of, in particular, Eysenck’s theory of creativity and his emphasis on psychoticism and abnormal personality. They note that there is a long history of attempts to link creativity with mental infirmities which has generated an unfortunate connection in the public’s mind between creativity and mental abnormality. “Creativity, we believe, is already discouraged in the interest of achieving conformity. Do we wish to add to that the notion that creativity should be discouraged in the interest of mental health?” (Sternberg & Lubart, 1993, p. 231). It almost seems that while being “creative” is acceptable in some contexts, there is a perception that there are degrees of “creativity”, some of which are associated with abnormal behaviour and go beyond that which is acceptable.

Winston’s (2003) discussion highlights the diversity of recent research in his brief examination. He refers to “creativity” as the “most elusive of human faculties” (p. 454) and his perspective comes from a medical background in obstetrics and genetic engineering. He looks to Sternberg for a definition of creativity as a starting point, noting that creative thinking has a number of observable traits – the ability to switch between primary conscious and secondary unconscious thought processes; a low level of cortical activity being observed in creative individuals, and Sternberg’s claim that creativity “is a right-brain activity – which entails making loose, or freeform associations between seemingly unrelated phenomena” (p. 455). Winston states that biofeedback machines that can show EEG (electroencephalogram) brainwave patterns on a screen have been able to demonstrate the phenomena that “creative individuals are better at unfocussed thought – at suggesting connections between ideas rather than solving problems” (p. 455). He also makes links between creativity and introverted personalities but counters the logical conclusion that creative people are right-brain introverts as being clearly not the case, noting the writer Ernest Hemingway as a clear example of the contrary. Winston notes that drawing, music and the high level of linguistic fluency demonstrated by novelists, playwrights, poets and the like, are left-brain activities which also contradicts Sternberg’s view that creativity
is a right-brain activity. He then refers to the proposal by Claxton (1999) that the “secret of creativity lies in an ability to switch modes” and takes this further by suggesting that “certain neurotransmitters like acetylcholine may help this process and this – a simple difference of our chemical inheritance – might explain why some individuals find it easier than others” (p. 456). Winston then goes on to outline a variety of approaches used by well-known composers and writers to stimulate the creative process – from Mozart, who played billiards to Brahms, who drank copious amounts of coffee, the writers who sought drug induced inspiration, to Francis Bacon who used sleep and food deprivation to heighten his creativity. This takes us back to the examination of “genius” à la Galton’s nineteenth century study where the research focuses on trying to find commonalities amongst exceptional individuals as a means of explaining creativity.

In marked contrast, there is a strong interest in creativity in the sciences, industry and management where the focus seems to be largely on the idea of “creative” problem-solving. For example, a recent edition of the journal entitled *Creativity and Management*, was devoted to the theory of inventive problem solving (TRIZ) and its application in various settings. Moelrle (2005) describes the conceptual approach of TRIZ as comprising of “the way from a concrete problem over an abstract problem to an abstract solution and from there to a concrete solution” (p. 3). There is also discussion about how TRIZ might be used in conjunction with tools like *Creative Problem Solving* by Isaksen (in Moelrle, 2005) or *Six Thinking Hats* by De Bono (1986). There is considerable evidence of investigation in industry and business into models of creativity in order to understand “how designers opportunistically develop new ideas and reach innovative products” (Bonnardel & Marmèche, 2004, p. 176). In fact, Bonnardel and Marmèche consider it a “major issue” in the field.

Sir Ken Robinson is Senior Advisor, Education Policy, Getty Institute in Los Angeles. He comes from a drama education background and provides an important link between the thinking of business and education. In his keynote address at the 2005 Australia Council of the Arts Education Symposium he made a clear distinction between “being creative” and “creativity”. Discussing the issue of what creativity is, Robinson suggests that “all human culture has been spurred by the growth of human imagination. But it’s not the same thing as creativity… It’s the foundation stone of it.” He states that to be creative, “you have to do something”. To this he adds that “Creativity is an idea”, it is “applied imagination”, “the process of having original ideas that are of value” (p. 24) and he contends that creativity is as important in education as literacy and numeracy (p. 4). In a published interview about American education, Robinson (2005b) talked of the importance of creativity, not just for education, but also for companies trying to compete in an ever-changing global marketplace. He asserted that “if America wants to remain competitive in the global markets of the 21st century, creativity is not a luxury. America needs a workforce that is flexible, adaptable and highly creative; and it needs an education system that can develop these qualities in everyone.” Robinson (2005b) also presents a series of what he calls “misconceptions” about creativity that echoes the thinking expressed by Guilford in the 1950s followed by writers in the 1960s and 1970s: that creativity is a generalised trait present in all humans and applicable across domains and disciplines:

One (misconception) is that only “special” people are creative… in reality, we are all born with tremendous creative potential. Another misconception is that creativity is confined to certain sorts of activities, like the arts or design…I think it’s a mistake to talk about the “creative” arts in schools and “creative arts” departments. We don’t talk about the “numerical math” department or the “objective sciences” department. Rather than investing in these misconceptions, companies and organizations should promote the creative capacities of all their people. (p. 2)

Robinson obviously sees education as playing a significant role in the development of creativity but notes that the focus on “standards” in education often equates to “standardisation” and stifles
schools and teachers who want to promote students’ creative abilities. Again, the notion of there being levels of “creativity” creeps in by implication. “Creativity” is desirable provided it is channelled into a productive and measurable outcome.

It would seem that “creativity” as an attribute in a range of educational and industry contexts might be better covered by words like “problem-solver”, “imaginative thinker” or “strategist”. In light of industry’s desire for innovation and efficient processes, a highly metacognitive individual would seem to fit the bill. The Honourable Barry Jones (2006) noted that there was a conflict of “creativity” and the culture of management when he headed the Victorian Innovative Schools Commission. He proposed there is a difference between “creativity” and “innovation” but that the managers in government education saw the terms as interchangeable. Could Robinson be criticised for the same confusion? Perhaps an ultimate extension of Robinson’s ideas is exemplified in the comments by Deborah Wince-Smith (2006), the president of America’s Council of Competitiveness. She states that her interest “lies in the connection between creativity and national prosperity” and that “Creativity may be about fun and games but it is also America’s single greatest comparative advantage in an increasingly competitive global market place” (p. 12). She also uses innovation and creativity interchangeably in reference to productivity and entrepreneurship, and echoes the sentiments expressed about the role of education in the 1950s: “Taking the cue from America’s success, countries around the world have also realised that they must focus on innovation by investing in education, research and infrastructure” (p. 12). Wince-Smith emphasises the role of a cross-disciplinary teams stating that “innovation is not the sole preserve of scientists and engineers. A truly cross-disciplinary team must span the arts, humanities, and social sciences as well as the sciences. And that is why creativity must be a fundamental goal of liberal education” (p. 14). And so, how does education respond to the notion of creativity in curriculum documents?

SCHOOL CURRICULA AND “CREATIVITY”

Over the last decade in Australia there has been some shift towards incorporating aspects of creativity and creative thinking into school curricula but there are quite distinct differences between arts documents and the more recent incorporation of creativity in broader curriculum statements. In A Statement on the Arts for Australian Schools (Curriculum Corporation, 1994a) the only mention of creativity is in the section of Characteristics of Learning in the Arts where a number of areas are identified including: Aesthetic learning, cognitive learning, physical learning, sensory learning and social learning. It is under Cognitive Learning that the first mention is made of “creativity”:

Thinking skills such as perception, creativity, logical thinking, metaphoric thinking, question-formation, decision-making, critical thinking, concept-formation and memory are all developed through participation in arts experiences. (p. 6)

What is evident in this document, and a number of arts curriculum documents across Australian States and Territories, is that “creativity” is an assumed focus for development without this being stated explicitly. The 1994 Statement was organised under the headings: creating, making and presenting; arts criticism and aesthetics; and past and present contexts.

Further to this, the commentary in The Profile states that creating, making and presenting “includes the complete range of processes engaged in when people generate ideas, experiment with ideas, bring a new product into existence, rework and transform existing works or ideas and rehearse and present their work to others” (Curriculum Corporation, 1994b, p. 4). This seems to be consistent with attempts to define the creative process noted by LaChapelle (1983).
The *Statement* and *Profile* were significant documents throughout the 1990s and in many ways were the foundation on which curriculum development in a number of Australian States was generated, notably in Victoria with the *Curriculum and Standards Framework* (CSF) (Board of Studies, 1995). In much the same language, the CSF did not talk explicitly about creativity. There is, however, a statement that the Arts are ways of “experiencing, developing, representing and understanding ideas, emotions, values and cultural beliefs. They learn to take risks, be imaginative, question prevailing values, explore alternative solutions, engage in arts criticism, develop, practice and refine techniques, share opinions and extend the limits of the arts” (p. 9), all characteristics of the creative process alluded to in the literature. In the revision of the CSF, *Curriculum and Standards Framework II* (Board of Studies, 2000) very little shifted in the arts regarding the identification of creativity. There was an acknowledgement of the role of “creating” and “understanding” but again, and understandably, it seems that creativity is assumed to be part of “creating”. Another important national direction was the release in 1999 of *The Adelaide Declaration on National Goals for Schooling in the Twenty-First Century* (Ministerial Council on Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs, 1999). These goals were intended to provide a foundation for the intellectual, physical, social, spiritual, moral and aesthetic development of young Australians and within the goals are the following statements that include reference to creativity and the characteristics associated with it:

1. Schooling should develop fully the talents and capacities of all students. In particular, when students leave school they should:
   1.1 - have the capacity for, and skills in, analysis and problem solving and the ability to communicate ideas and information, to plan and organise activities and to collaborate with others
   1.6 - be confident, creative and productive users of new technologies, particularly information and communication technologies, and understand the impact of those technologies on society
   1.8 - have the knowledge, skills and attitudes necessary to establish and maintain a healthy lifestyle, and for the creative and satisfying use of leisure time.

A more recent development in Victoria was the introduction of the *Victorian Essential Learning Standards* in 2005 with the identification of creativity as a significant component across all disciplines. It was this development that provided the impetus for this paper and an examination of the concept in the broad sense. As the name suggests “The Victorian Essential Learning Standards describe what is essential for students to achieve from Years Prep to 10…The Standards provide the means for all Victorian schools to use the best curriculum thinking to better prepare students for success at school and beyond” (VCAA, 2005a).

The cross-disciplinary nature of the plan makes this different from pervious documents. The Standards are structured around three core, interrelated strands:

1. Physical, Personal and Social Learning;
2. Discipline-based Learning; and
3. Interdisciplinary Learning.

It is in the Interdisciplinary Learning strand that students are presented with a range of cross disciplinary “knowledge, skills and behaviours” to prepare them as “active learners and problem-solvers for success at school and beyond”.

This strand focuses on ways of thinking, communicating, conceiving and realising ideas and information. It assists students to develop the capacity to design, create and evaluate processes as a way of developing creativity and innovation. (VCAA, 2005c)
The four domains under this strand include:

1. Communication;
2. Design, Creativity and Technology;
3. Information and Communications Technology; and
4. Thinking Processes.

It is in the domain of Design, Creativity and Technology where the clearest statements exist on creativity in the curriculum. Students engage with design, creation and evaluation “as a way of developing creativity and innovation“. Further Creativity is described as “applying imagination and lateral and critical thinking throughout design and development processes.” Much of this area is concerned principally with: the ability to use, manage, assess and understand design, creativity, technology, and their relationship to innovation. In more detail, this involves students:

- posing problems and actively identifying needs, wants, opportunities and areas for improvement
- gathering information and building knowledge about the nature of needs, wants, opportunities and areas for improvement and the best routes to take towards designing a solution
- developing and using design and technology skills, knowledge and processes, including proposing, experimenting, learning from results and synthesising, to create new and/or improved products and/or systems. (VCAA, 2005c)

In the Thinking Processes domain, standards are organised in three dimensions:

1. Reasoning, processing and inquiry,
2. Creativity, and
3. Reflection, evaluation and metacognition. (VCAA, 2005b)

It is here that “the capacity to think creatively is a central component of being able to solve problems and be innovative. In the Creativity dimension, students learn to seek innovative alternatives and use their imagination to generate possibilities. They learn to take risks with their thinking and make new connections” (VCAA, 2005b). Clearly the impetus for creativity in this context comes from the business/industry perceptions of creativity as an essential part of innovation and productivity in a similar way that Wince-Smith talked about the issue.

It is important that this material is placed against the dimension within the Arts of Creating and making which focuses on ideas, skills, techniques, processes, performances and presentations in much the same way that previous curriculum documents in the arts have:

It includes engagement in concepts that emerge from a range of starting points and stimuli. Students explore experiences, ideas, feelings and understandings through making, interpreting, performing, creating and presenting. Creating and making arts works involves imagination and experimentation; planning; the application of arts elements, principles and/or conventions; skills, techniques and processes; media, materials, equipment and technologies; reflection; and refinement. Individually and collaboratively, students explore their own works and works by other artists working in different historic and cultural contexts. (VCAA, 2005d)
While the word “creativity” appears frequently in the Interdisciplinary Domains, it does not appear in the Arts document other than in the form of “creating”. Perhaps the creative process is so deeply embedded in the arts and the minds of arts educators it simply doesn’t need to be emphasised. It simply comes with the territory and does not need elaboration.

As with any curriculum document, we turned to the proposed assessment guidelines to provide a more obvious manifestation of the curriculum writers’ perception of “creativity” by their expected outcomes. At this point, guidelines for assessment remain vague with little concrete direction for teachers attempting to design assessment tasks and schedules. There has, however, been some professional development offerings in the way of presentations by the VCAA. In 2005, the Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Authority devoted a professional development day to the Victorian Essential Learning Standards for education stakeholders such as professional teacher associations and the like. At the session on “Creativity”, a draft assessment framework was presented that was based on Wallas’ creative process. In addition, “originality” was suggested as one of the criteria for judging the work of children. The lack of familiarity with the research literature in this proposal was horrifying. As Torrance (1969) rightly notes, “originality” or “newness” is in the eyes of the creator and in the case of children, it would hardly seem appropriate to assess children’s work based on adult notions of originality. What was even more disturbing was the film footage shown as an exemplar of “creativity” at work in an English primary school. A musical based on highlighting the ethnic diversity of the school population was devised and performed. The extraordinary level of funding that was made available to the school meant that four adults from the arts community were employed to assist in the production. While the children contributed to the libretto, the music was written entirely by the musician employed, the director planned the sequence and the “stage manager” directed the production of sets, costumes and props without any contribution from the children. While the production was a wonderful social activity for the school with very positive outcomes, it certainly was not an exemplar of children’s “creativity” from a music educator’s point of view. It was interesting that representatives from Musica Viva Australia and the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra viewed this exemplar with the same concern as we did, saying that this was certainly not an example of the creative music capabilities of children. It was also interesting that while this new curriculum sees creativity as a more cross-disciplinary responsibility, this workshop presented the arts as an exemplar and failed to address the idea of creativity across the disciplines.

Perhaps the proposals by Reid and Petocz (2004) and Cropley (2006) should be taken into consideration when approaching creativity as a component across disciplines in school curricula. Reid and Petocz (2004) make the rather obvious observation that “creativity is viewed in different ways in different disciplines: in education it is called ‘innovation’, in business it is called ‘entrepreneurship’, in mathematics it is often equated with ‘problem-solving’, and in music it is ‘performance’ and ‘composition’” (p. 45). Given the scope of the review in that paper, the latter part of their proposal seems a little simplistic but they do make the important point that, “A creative product in different domains is measured against the norms of that domain, with its own rules, approaches and conceptions of creativity” (p. 45). To this end, Cropley (2006) offers an analysis of creativity across disciplines that is worthy of exploration. He makes a strong case for the idea that creativity in some disciplines is viewed in a rather “orthodox” way and that what arts educators might consider “creative” could be seen as “bizarre” or “radical” in disciplines such as mathematics and physics. He proposes a classification system (Figure 9.1) whereby “the X-axis would define kind of deviation from the usual (orthodox vs. radical); the Y-axis would specify the amount of deviation” (p. 127). In his system, “the upper right-hand quadrant would involve above average to high levels of radical creativity, the lower left-hand quadrant below average to low levels of orthodox creativity, and so on” (p. 127).
He tempers his proposal with the comment that, “The ratings are offered purely for exemplary purposes and are based upon my own subjective assessment of the disciplines in question as I have experienced them” (p. 127) but nevertheless, his ideas do resonate with our experiences of the school system in Australia. His suggestion that creativity has widely differing conceptions depending on the discipline serves to highlight for us what is missing from these current curriculum documents — instead of “Where’s Wally?”, it’s “Where’s whimsy?” “Whimsy” is what might better be termed as the Muse. Around the image of the music muse below (Figure 9.2) we have placed a number of words we associate with creativity in the arts and that are largely absent from the literature reviewed in this chapter.
Could it be they are not in the forefront of thinking in the business/industry sectors’ utilitarian process towards an innovative product while they are certainly acknowledged as critical in the artistic process? Perhaps the excitement generated in the arts by “unexpected” outcomes would not be shared by our industry colleagues? The word “wasteful” appears in quotation marks because we have yet to find a comparable word without the negative connotations. We were trying to highlight the fact that during the creative process there can be a great deal of time spent exploring and experimenting that won’t necessarily provide a “product” in the short term. In our view, it is not “wasteful” because that time goes towards building knowledge and schema that enrich the long term outcomes. We fear that this notion will be lost in the language and interests of “innovation” and “productivity” dominating the perspective of creativity presented in the curriculum we have noted.

CONCLUSION

It is critical to recognise, as we have attempted to highlight in this chapter, that creativity means different things to different people and different perspectives reside in different disciplines when it comes to incorporating identifiable creativity development components in school curricula and assessment. The notion of “creativity” is extremely complex and the subject of highly differing views throughout university research, the arts, education, industry, government and business sectors. The challenge for music educators is to ensure that while the flexibility and modes of expression of their discipline can do much to encourage thinking that is divergent, metacognitive and lateral, the artistic creative process has aspects that stand apart from current dominating perspectives exemplified by Wince-Smith that should be acknowledged, highlighted and defended from an informed stance that recognises diversity.

REFERENCES


Chapter 10

The Impact of Music Education Policy on Creative Music-making in the School Music Curriculum

Jane Wai Yee CHEUNG-YUNG, Estella Suk Ching CHAM-LAI
and Clarence Wai Chu MAK

This chapter provides an opportunity for music educators and composers to investigate the impact of music education policy on creative music-making in the school music curriculum. For the first time, developing creativity has become one of the explicit guiding principles in the recent education reform in Hong Kong. Changes of curriculum emphasis to develop creativity both as a generic skill and as a learning target in the music curriculum will be deliberated. Its impact and effects on pre-service and in-service teacher preparation at the Hong Kong Institute of Education, curriculum planning and implementation in weakening its curriculum boundaries to explore new possibilities and teacher readiness will be discussed. The findings of a recent questionnaire survey of in-service music teachers, and a study on the performances of pupils involved in the process of creative music-making activities at Key Stages 1 and 2 (Primary1-6), will be critically examined. The study urges the provision of suitable curriculum content, teaching materials and strategy and community support. Other recommendations for effective policy implementation in school will be shared and practical issues such as teaching theory and composition will be examined.

BACKGROUND: THE EMERGING MUSIC CURRICULUM AND POLICY IN HONG KONG SCHOOLS

Since the 1950s, no education policies in Hong Kong had focused explicitly on the development of music creativity in school music education (Cham, 2001, p. 271). It was not until half a century later, in the year 2000, that a policy specifically designed to address the need for developing pupils’ creativity through education was first introduced in Hong Kong (HKSAR, 2000, pp. 30-32). This policy, which constituted the goals of education for the 21st century, aimed at enabling pupils to enjoy learning, while at the same time enhancing effectiveness in communication, developing creativity and a sense of commitment.

In response to the new education policy, the Curriculum Development Council published a document advocating the development of creativity as one of the nine generic skills in 2001. Creativity, as stated in the document, is regarded as the ability to generate original ideas and solve problems appropriate to the contexts in which they arise (CDC, 2001, p. 24). The document further elaborated on the fact that the generic skills were fundamental in helping students to acquire knowledge and to construct knowledge, as well as to apply knowledge in solving problems. These proposals were then reiterated in the curriculum guides of all the eight Key Learning Areas (KLA). Music is therefore included in these proposals, since it falls into the KLA of the Arts Education.

In 2003, the Music Curriculum Guide was published, emphasizing the development of generic skills, which include creativity as a crucial element to facilitate music learning (CDC, 2003, p. 14). “Developing creativity and imagination” (CDC, 2003, pp. 12-13), has become one of the four learning targets, from which all the learning objectives of the three Key Stages are derived. It is hoped that such a direction will guide the design of music curriculum and activities.
to develop creative and imaginative individuals of the 21st century.

Tracing back to the 180s, creative music-making was grouped under the additional activities in the secondary school music syllabus (CDC, 1983), rather than being classified and with the same status as the basic music activities such as singing, music reading and listening. Without a strong education policy to support music and the limited time allotted, creative music-making activity was always neglected in both the primary and the secondary school curriculum until the turn of the century. A survey conducted in 1996 on secondary school music teachers found that the time assigned for singing and instrumental playing in the junior and senior secondary schools was 40.55% and 34.93% respectively, while the time assigned for creative music-making was only 5.5% and 9.33% respectively (Leung, 1999). The reasons for this imbalance were a lack of teaching time, large class size, limited classroom space, financial resources, inadequate teacher training and a lack of clear guidelines in the official syllabus.

**TIME FRAME AND GOALS FOR CURRICULUM IMPLEMENTATION**

According to the Arts Education KLA Curriculum Guide (CDC, 2002, pp. 14-17), the time frame for curriculum development is:

- **Short-term:** 2001/02 to 2005/06
- **Medium-term:** 2006/07 to 2010/11
- **Long-term:** Beyond 2011

The short-term goals require schools to prepare for the curriculum change and to start adopting and implementing the new curriculum as soon as possible. Within the set time frame, teachers have to be capable of adopting the Curriculum Guide for use in planning and implementing their school-based arts curriculum. The Education and Manpower Bureau (EMB), formerly known as the Education Department, has to help schools to adapt to the paradigm shift from teacher-centred to student-centred learning and teaching.

In 2006/07 the new Music Curriculum medium-term goals suggest that schools and teachers are to develop a balanced curriculum with different approaches to curriculum planning and implementation. In the meantime, the EMB is to consolidate and accumulate experiences and disseminate good practices in learning, teaching and assessment.

It is expected that from 2011 onwards, the long-term goals will be fulfilled in providing high quality learning, teaching and assessment. According to this high profile and top-down strategic developmental plan, it is expected that all schools would proceed as instructed in order to achieve success by 2011.

**TEACHER PREPARATION FOR CURRICULUM CHANGE**

**Music Teachers’ Perception and Readiness for Change**

The school year 2006/07 starts the Medium-term of curriculum implementation, as stated in the Arts Education Curriculum Guide. The following paragraphs present an examination of the present situation of music teachers’ perception and attitude towards the paradigm shift in developing children’s music creativity.

It is universally agreed that teachers play an utmost important role in any curriculum change. In order to investigate the teachers’ view to the 2003 new music curriculum, a seminar cum observation of a Primary 3 creative sound project lesson was organized in December 2005, in which 97 primary school music teachers participated. A questionnaire survey was conducted among 67 teachers after the lesson observation and the majority of them expressed an urgent
need for support in conducting creative music-making activities (Cham et al., 2006). A summary of the feedback is as follows:

1. **Consensus of teachers on music creating:**
   Out of the 67 teachers who responded, 98.5% agreed that creative music-making activities helped develop creativity and imagination. 88% agreed that creative music making should start as early as possible, and 78% of the teachers chose to conduct such activities in the coming school year.

2. **Perception of music teachers on the strategies in conducting creative music-making activities:**
   78% of the teachers considered that proper strategies to guide pupils to develop musical creativity were the top priority. 63% agreed that classroom management was also important. It was revealed that 40% of the teachers were concerned about ways of encouraging active pupil participation, while the modes and criteria for assessment were less important to the teachers: only 34% considered these as important.

3. **Perception of professional development necessary to enable music teachers to conduct creative music-making activities effectively:**
   89.5% of the teachers were of the opinion that they needed professional training in composition techniques. 53.7% of them expressed the need for acquiring percussion instrumental skills. Only 7.4% of the teachers considered that they needed information technology training to conduct creative music making activities.

4. **Preparedness of teachers to implement creating in the music curriculum:**
   Only 18% of the teachers considered themselves ready to implement such activities in class, while a majority of 79.1% felt the need for support in this area.

**Problems Encountered by Music Teachers**
The steady growth in teachers’ preparedness for introducing the new policy has also relied largely on the efforts made by the teachers themselves. Over the years, teachers have already shouldered an enormous amount of workload in their daily work. It is difficult for them to put creative music-making a high priority in their professional development. The increased rate of education reform in Hong Kong, including changes in the senior secondary education system, language (English and Putonghua) proficiency requirements, schools’ quality assurance measures such as the internal and external evaluation of school performances, has led to a build-up pressure for school teachers. In addition, the low birth rate in recent years in Hong Kong has caused the total number of pupils to dwindle and has resulted in the closure of some schools, which in turn has created problems for teachers regarding job security and low morale. Moreover, teachers have already been given extra workload with the acquisition of extra funds to enable schools to offer large quantities of extra-curricular activities, in the hope of increasing their pupil intake. If this pressure is not relieved, it will be difficult to implement the education policy effectively to develop creativity in music, since music subject is usually considered as a secondary or minor subject in the school curriculum.

**Music Programmes for Pre-service and In-service Teachers in the Hong Kong Institute of Education**
The Hong Kong Institute of Education (HKIEd) is the largest teacher education provider in Hong Kong, offering initial and professional upgrading teacher education programmes in both full-time and part-time modes. The Bachelor of Education (BEd) (Honours) Programmes, which have steadily replaced the Certificate in Education courses since 1998, have been preparing pre-service music teachers to teach in the primary and secondary schools. The Institute has also
developed a systematic range of full-time and part-time professional upgrading programmes for primary and secondary schools, such as the Mixed-mode Bachelor of Education (Honours) Programmes and the Postgraduate Diploma in Education Programmes, in order to cater for the need of in-service teachers’ professional development.

The music programmes at the HKIEd aim at inculcating in students strong musical knowledge and musicianship skills, as well as providing them with current education principles and pedagogies that will enable them to become knowledgeable, caring and reliable educators capable of implementing the music curriculum effectively in schools. On the one hand, the Institute has full autonomy and flexibility to design its own programmes to achieve its vision and mission; on the other hand, the programmes must also meet the demands of the ongoing education policy changes and the practical needs of school teachers and the community.

**Growing Importance of Creativity in the HKIEd Music Programmes**

A review of the music modules offered to the music elective students by the HKIEd from 1997 onwards illustrates the growing importance of creativity in the music curriculum. Only one module of Theory and Composition was offered in the Two-year Certificate in Education course in 1997, as compared to five modules of Practical Skills out of a total of eight music modules in the programme. The proportion of Theory remained similar in 1998, with only one Theory module being offered out of nine music modules. This reflected a strong emphasis on musicianship skills and the general expectation that music teachers would be more competent in musicianship skills than in music creativity. However, the situation changed dramatically in 1999, when, for the first time, music was offered as a major subject in the BEd (Primary) (Honours) programme. Besides two Theory modules, there was a module on Music Technology with creative elements and another module on Music Creativity, making a total of eight credit points (cps) on music creativity out of a total of thirty two cps, that is, a quarter of the music curriculum time. In 2000, music was also offered as a major elective in the BEd (Secondary) (Honours) programme. Apart from the Theory module, the course included Music Analysis and Orchestration modules, designed to develop in students a firmer theoretical basis, upon which Music Technology, Composition and the Application of Creative Music-making in the Classroom modules were built. About a third of the music curriculum then was geared towards creating music, and a similar proportion of the Composition and Creative Music-making modules has remained in the curriculum since. Moreover, parts of the Method modules were devoted to equipping students with various strategies to develop pupils’ creativity, including innovative ways to integrate creative performing and creative listening. In addition, all HKIEd students, including those from the other disciplines, are free to choose the ‘Integrative Arts: Visual Arts, Music and Creative Movement’ module from the General Education domain, as a means of experiencing and experimenting with the creative nature of the arts. This module attempts to weaken the curriculum boundaries of an art form such as music, to include other arts, such as visual arts and creative movement, to allow students to explore both the common and unique characteristics of the arts, in order to enhance their understanding of various art forms. In-service primary school teachers of any subjects can experience music creativity by taking a similar module as part of a five-week Professional Development Course. It is hoped that with a better understanding of the nature and value of the arts, teachers will be able to integrate creatively appropriate arts elements into their lessons to enhance children’s learning.

**Strategies to Develop Musical Creativity in the HKIEd Music Programme**

In order to further develop composing abilities among pre-service music students in the Institute, an Artistic Excellence Award (Composition) was introduced in 2004, in recognition of students’ composing competence. Compositions of the finalists were performed by professional musicians and judged by external musicians and composers. This has become an annual event to encourage
and nurture students’ music creativity. Furthermore, visiting scholars have been invited to lecture and conduct workshops on composing, which provide the opportunity for fruitful dialogue between composer-educators and students, help them to understand the creative process of renowned composers and engage them in critical discussion on issues that they find problematic during the composing process.

Music teachers are encouraged to develop in their pupils creating skills, positive attitudes and confidence, to provide adequate resources and an appropriate environment for their pupils to expand their musical creativity and imagination. It is important to provide an environment where sounds and musical ideas can be explored and experimented with, where pupils can engage actively in creative music-making and critical listening, where creativity can be nurtured and progressively developed through making music. Very often in the school environment, support and resources do not facilitate such activities, and music teachers often encounter great difficulties and experience a great deal of frustration in attempting to implement what is being learned in the institute. With joint collaboration among school management, tertiary institutions, the Government and the community, it is hoped that musical creativity can grow in multifaceted ways, so that children can embrace music expressively and creatively at schools and in society.

**THE APPLICATION OF CURRICULUM CONTENT, MATERIALS AND STRATEGIES FOR IMPLEMENTING CREATIVE MUSIC-MAKING IN PRIMARY SCHOOLS**

The Music Curriculum Guide provides only very basic principles of creating, such as defining the terminology of composing, improvisation and arrangement, the process of creating and some notes on designing and conducting creative activities (CDC, 2003, pp. 43-50). There is a lack of substantial guidance to teachers regarding the variety of creative activities that they can be facilitating in the classroom situation, and the teaching strategies that they may employ.

In order to explore suitable curriculum content, materials and teaching strategies for creative music-making in the primary schools, a study (Cham et al, 2006) was conducted by the authors from September 2005 to June 2006. Furthermore, children’s levels of performance were assessed to investigate the relationship between curriculum design, instruction and creative output. The following paragraphs describe how the study was conducted and how children’s creative works were being assessed using Swanwick’s *Eight Cumulative Layers for Assessing the Musical Works of Students*.

**Research Questions**

1. What are the levels of performance of pupils’ creative works in this study?
2. What kind of curriculum content, materials and teaching strategies are suitable for creative music-making in the primary school context?

**Methodology**

The method of data collection and arrangement included trial teaching on assigned projects, lesson observation by consultants, recording and/or video recording of lessons, followed by both qualitative and statistical analysis of students’ creative works, an analysis assisted by using the Eight Cumulative Layers for Assessing the Musical Works of Students, drawn from the work of Professor Swanwick (1994) (Table 10.2).

**Choice of Schools, Teachers and Classes**

The study was conducted in two primary schools with average academic results. They were located in different geographical areas in Hong Kong. All pupils (342) of primary 3 (P3) at the
end of Key Stage 3 (KS1), and all pupils (304) of primary 5 (P5) at KS2 of both schools participated, with a view to investigate the pupils’ creative works at the two key stages. Primary 6 classes were not selected owing to the constraints of their tight study schedule and time frame. In each class, children were grouped into three to six groups, depending on the nature of the four creative music making assignments and the group members were not necessarily be the same in every assignment.

The music teachers of both schools were all music majors in their pre-service training. In order to acquire the skills of guiding creative music-making, they attended ten hours creative music-making training workshops in August 2005 given by the visiting composers prior to the study. During the study, they also attended another three-hour training workshop of similar nature in March 2006. These teachers conducted the creative music-making activities within the allotted music lesson timetable. Therefore, their former curriculum content had to be adjusted to allow sufficient time for the four assignments.

**Procedures**

Four creative music-making assignments designed by the research team were used (Table 10.1). These assignments were so designed to allow pupils to create either a sound project or improvisation of melodic/rhythmic phrases to accompany a song.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 10.1 Four creative music-making assignments for P3 and P5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Primary 3 (age 8)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment 1: Dialogue between two African boys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Improvise 2-bar rhythmic phrases through rhythmic activities such as “Question &amp; Answer” game; 2/4, 3/4 or 4/4 time; crotchet, quavers, minim and crotchet rest could be used.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment 2: The stormy beach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Create a sound project of 1 minute duration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment 3: Sounds of the city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Create a sound project of 1 minute duration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment 4:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Improvise rhythmic ostinato, rhythmic introduction and coda to a song.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These assignments, taking the form of teaching units of between three and six 35-minute lessons, were organised within the normal music lessons throughout the academic year according to individual school’s teaching schedule. The research team observed the lessons regularly and provided feedback to improve the quality of learning and teaching. In addition, audio recording and/or video recording of the lessons were made.

Three works from each assignment were randomly selected from P3 and P5 of each school for assessment. A total of 48 creative works were randomly selected for assessment by the two external assessors with 96 assessment reports produced.

**Assessment Criteria**

Swanwick’s *Eight Cumulative Layers for Assessing the Musical Works of Students* (1994) was
adopted as criteria to assess the pupils’ creative assignments (Table 10.2). The layers are 1. Sensory, 2. Manipulative, 3. Personal Expression, 4. Vernacular, 5. Speculative, 6. Idiomatic, 7. Symbolic and 8. Systematic, in cumulative order. The two assessors first attended a workshop to get familiar with the eight-layer criteria indicators to rate the pupils’ compositions until their ratings came close to each other. Each of the randomly selected assignments was individually assessed by them. Their ratings were compared and discussed against the choices of layers to reach a consensus before doing the actual assessment, so that their judgment could be more reliable and consistent.

Table 10.2 Assessment criteria by Keith Swanwick 1994

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Eight Cumulative Layers for Assessing the Musical Works of Pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Sensory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Manipulative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Personal expressiveness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Vernacular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Speculative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Idiomatic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Symbolic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Systematic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Assessment Procedures

There were two stages of assessment, that is, Assignments 1 & 2 of both P3 and P5 students were assessed at the first stage (in February 2006) and Assignments 3 & 4 of both P3 and P5 students (in June 2006) were assessed at the second stage. Altogether 96 assessment reports were submitted.
The study did not release any information to the two assessors regarding the composition topics and content of the assignments; nor the school names and class levels from which the pupils’ works were selected. Such arrangement was to enable the assessors to focus mainly on the pupils’ creative performances in order to maintain a fair and objective judgment on their works.

After all the ratings for individual assignments were given, composition topics, content and class levels were then made known to the assessors for them to summarise their comments on pupils’ creative works as in the following paragraphs.

Comments by assessors on pupils’ creative works

First Stage of Assessment
The findings indicated that at P3, most pupils achieved Layer 2 **Manipulative**, where they were able to repeat simple phrases and to use glissando, simple scale or intervals to create music, but clear formal structure was lacking in their works. A few assignments with unstable rhythms and chaotic sounds were rated Layer 1 **Sensory**. On the other hand, some assignments, which could demonstrate changes in dynamics, tempo and tone colour, and also contained dramatic elements and structure, were rated Layer 3 **Personal Expressiveness**.

From the audio and/or video recordings, the assessors noticed that most of the P3 pupils seemed not to have understood what to do, they only followed the teachers’ instructions to clap the rhythm they heard. According to the data, the average rating for Assignment 1, *Dialogue between two African Boys*, was 1.25, and that of Assignment 2, *The Stormy Beach*, was 2.5 (Fig. 10.1). This indicates that the open-ended creative sound projects of Assignment 2 elicited more developed musical responses according to Swanwick’s criteria.

As compared with P3 pupils, P5 pupils had higher command in organising sound and creating certain atmosphere related to the theme of the creative sound projects. Most of their works contained simple structure, but they lacked proper development. However, the works could be interpreted dramatically, therefore, they were rated Layer 2 **Manipulative** or Layer 3 **Personal Expressiveness**. A few outstanding works demonstrated the improvisation of rhythmic or melodic phrases in 2, 4 or 8 measures, and were rated Layer 4 **Vernacular**.

From the audio and/or video recordings, the assessors observed that most of the P5 pupils appeared to be much engaged in their creative music-making assignments. They seemed to have acquired a basic understanding of music creativity and knew what to do, and they seemed to be very interested in the assignments and worked seriously at their performances. According to the data, the average rating of Assignment 1, *Conversation between chick and duck*, was 1.92, and for Assignment 2, *The junk food monster*, it was 2.58 (Fig. 10.2). This indicates that they performed better at the open-ended creative sound project Assignment 2.

Second Stage of Assessment
From the audio and/or video recordings, the assessors discovered that most of the works had shown significant improvement. Almost all the works had clear structure; some even showed complex and complete structure. Melodic and rhythmic writing skills were more mature than those in the first stage. According to the data, the average layer for P3 in Assignment 3, *Sounds of the city*, was 1.75, and that for Assignment 4, *Improvisation on rhythmic ostinato, introduction and coda*, was 2.42 (Fig. 10.1). According to the data, the average rating for P5 in Assignment 3, *In a Persian market*, was 4.17, and that for Assignment 4, *Improvisation on pentatonic song: rhythmic and melodic ostinato, introduction and coda*, was 3.67 (Fig. 10.2). A few outstanding ones were rated Layer 5 **Speculative** and even Layer 6 **Idiomatic**. There was clear evidence of progression in the qualitative comments. The data imply that pupils have developed and gained better control of creative techniques after experiencing creative music-making for a period of time.
Data Analysis of the Study
To find out (a) if pupils’ music creativity has progressed over time, and (b) if the open-ended sound project can achieve higher layer of performance than the closed-ended improvisation phrases, the Friedman two-way analysis of variance and ‘t’ tests were used as tools for data analysis.

Classes: P3 and P5
Number of creative works: 48
Number of assessment reports: 96
Assignments 1 and 4: improvisation of short phrases and song accompaniments
Assignments 2 and 3: creative sound projects

There was clear evidence of progression in the numerical analysis. The graphs (Fig. 10.1 & 10.2) below show the mean differences between the four assignments and these are overall statistically significant, for both P3 and P5 assignments.

**Fig. 10.1** Means for P3 assignments (The Friedman Two-Way Analysis gives a $\chi^2=15.47$ and a significance level of $p<0.001$)

**Fig. 10.2** Means for P5 assignments (The Friedman Two-Way Analysis gives $\chi^2=25.17$ and a significance level of $p<0.0001$)
The positive results may be caused by the general maturation of the pupils, the experience of the teachers and pupils getting more familiar with the projects. However, these results, along with the positive qualitative comments from the assessors, make it reasonable to assume that the assignments in the study have contributed to the development of the students’ creativity.

The following refers to the comparison of the combined P3 and P5 Assignments 1 & 4 - improvisation of rhythmic or melodic phrases, with Assignments 2 & 3 - creative sound projects, to find out if there might be a difference between the more open-ended sound projects of 2 & 3 and the closed-ended improvisation of 1 & 4:

Table 10.3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Means</th>
<th>'t' value</th>
<th>Probability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A1 &amp; 4</td>
<td>2.31</td>
<td>-2.52</td>
<td>P&lt;0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A2 &amp; 3</td>
<td>2.75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This gives statistical confirmation of different effects between the more open-ended assignments (2 and 3) and those that have more limited possibilities of pupils’ response (1 and 4). This is an important issue for the future curriculum design of including creative works in the school curriculum, one that Cheung (Cheung-Yung, 2001, p. 221) has addressed in her previous study, that the closed-package convergent type of design provides opportunities for students to acquire various aspects of musical knowledge and skills through a comparatively strong framing setting, while the open-ended type offers children divergent options that they can apply their experience and new knowledge to composing. Assignments where pupils are expected to give predicted and closed responses are unlikely to yield imaginative musical productions than those that are more open-ended. In our data this seems particularly true for the older P5 pupils.

**DISCUSSION ON POLICY IMPLEMENTATION**

**In-service Teacher Training on Conducting Creative Music-making Activities**

During the implementation of a new music curriculum, the human factor, viz., the teacher, plays a key role in the success of curriculum changes (Cunningham, 1982, p. 21). A lack of consensus in developing children’s creativity and a lack of commitment and appropriate approaches will likely to hamper the effectiveness of nurturing creativity in children. To help in-service teachers adapt to the paradigm shift of student-centred learning and to develop children’s creativity, sufficient opportunities are needed for teachers’ professional development. Programmes such as hands-on workshops, seminars on curriculum planning, as well as teaching and learning approaches to develop children’s music creativity should be strategically organised.

The findings regarding in-service teacher training mentioned above reflect a strong need for teacher support in implementing creating activities in school. However, support of this nature for serving teachers has not been sufficiently provided by the Education and Manpower Bureau (EMB), which is the main provider for in-service teacher training. It reflects that one of the short-term goals of the EMB in helping schools and teachers to adapt to the paradigm shift in learning and teaching (CDC, 2002, p. 16) has not been successfully achieved. Since the publication of the Music Curriculum Guide in 2003/04 until the year 2007, only a small number of seminars and workshops have been organised for music teachers on the selection of curriculum materials and methodology for music creating.

Although a series of seminars for arts education curriculum leaders with an optional module on “Pedagogy of Creative Music Making” have been conducted since 2003, this top-down strategy has resulted in only a small number of front-line music teachers receiving the
training to implement this policy. According to the EMB’s information, from 2002 until the end of 2005, only 875 (22%) music teachers out of a total of 3,964 attended the teacher education programmes such as seminars and workshops on creative music-making organized by the Arts Education Section, Curriculum Development Institute in Hong Kong (Appendix 10.1).

**Curriculum Content, Materials and Teaching Strategies**

The findings of the primary school pupils’ creative works reflect that creative sound projects provide pupils with the opportunities to explore musical sounds by all possible means, usually to depict an atmosphere, a mood or a story. It is a common misconception that these projects do not require previous knowledge and skills to understanding music. It is essential to understand that music is sounds being organised in various ways, that there are multiple ways to arrange the musical elements. It is not practical to require teachers to abide by a sophisticated system of handling these elements, but flexible and student-centred strategies are necessary during the process of composing. Not many teachers have tried to develop pupils’ music conceptualization when doing creative sound projects, by guiding pupils to discover, make collaborative decisions, develop deeper musical understanding and discuss critically the outcomes. Conducting creative sound projects could be an effective way of stimulating pupils to think about how to treat musical elements creatively, and flexible strategic planning is most essential.

According to the results of the above study on creative music-making, curriculum content, materials, teaching strategies and teacher guidelines are some factors of effective learning and teaching. If the topics are interesting and related to the pupils’ daily life, sequence of activities is introduced progressively with clear guidance, creativity will be developed more successfully. It is also evidenced in the study that pupils performed better in the open-ended creative sound projects, which have elicited more developed musical response, according to Swanwick’s criteria. Teachers may select appropriate sound projects so that pupils can enjoy the creating process to develop their unlimited musical creativity. Moreover, if the pupils can experience a longer period of creating to acquire various techniques, they would be more involved and their creative performance can be improved further.

Teachers’ recognition of the concept of creativity, understanding of pupils’ creating process, flexible strategies and competence are the factors that affect effective creative music-making. If the teachers are willing to implement curriculum changes, they need to enrich their professional knowledge of composition techniques to guide their pupils compose, and be able to render appropriate guidance and feedback when pupils encounter problems.

In order to enable music subject panels and teachers to fully understand the paradigm shift and be convinced of its benefits to pupils, a detailed and clear guideline should be provided. The EMB should take the initiative to provide more suggestions on curriculum content, methodology, criteria for creating, assessment methods and assessment modes. Such a practice for policy implementation strategy should be made known to all teachers, heads and parents, as well as the community.

**Community Support in Developing Children’s Creativity**

The weakness of including mainly singing and listening, supported by music theories and musical knowledge in Hong Kong schools’ music classroom, where music creativity was neglected was eventually observed by the community (CDC, 1987). About ten years before the publication of the Music Curriculum Guide (2003), a number of projects involving creative music-making had been held by various arts organisations such as the Hong Kong Arts Development Council, the Hong Kong Composers’ Guild, the Hong Kong Arts Centre, the Music Office of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department and the Radio Television Hong Kong. Some of these projects were collaborated with the former Music Section of the Education Department, where musicians were employed as part-time instructors to lead the primary and secondary school pupils with their extracurricular music activities. These artist-in-school projects
were organized successfully with an emphasis on developing the creativity and imagination of the pupils. There have been many successful examples of artists-in-schools programmes and music teachers can learn from the composers’ expertise and experience (HKADC, 1999). However, these artists-in-schools programmes require an enormous amount of funding. During this transitional period of curriculum change, there is a need for the Government to introduce funding policy that will secure financial subsidy and sufficient financial resources for schools to implement the curriculum reform successfully.

RECOMMENDATIONS

In order to effectively facilitate the development of children’s music creativity with joint effort from the school sector, tertiary institution and composer, there is an urgent need for the EMB to take the initiative in supporting the implementation of a policy to develop children’s creativity through creative music-making. As the 2006/7 school year has come and passed, the EMB needs to take a more proactive role to channel teachers’ attention to the significance of developing children’s creativity, particularly to disseminate effective strategies to conduct creative music-making activities in schools.

To implement this music education policy successfully, it is important to have the joint effort of the EMB, teacher educators, school teachers and the community to:

- set guidelines, suitable curriculum content and teaching materials for creative music-making activities and organise creative music performances to build up pupils’ confidence, with joint effort from the composers and teacher educators to provide professional support;
- disseminate good practices to schools through workshops, peer lesson observation and seminars;
- design strategic plans for conducting creative music-making in schools, with reference to the local context;
- develop assessment criteria and assessment guide for schools to implement creative music-making with regard to the scope and approach of the activity, artistic and technical concerns and the aesthetic principles of the pupils’ work; and
- offer professional development courses through the Hong Kong Institute of Education and provide a resource bank for in-service music teachers through the Education and Manpower Bureau’s website; involve composers-in-residence to facilitate pupils’ creating in schools, so that the music education policy on creative music-making can make a real impact on the school music curriculum.

The authors would like to acknowledge Professor Swanwick for his contribution to the section on “The application of curriculum content, materials and strategies for implementing creative music-making in primary schools” in helping with the quantitative data analysis.

NOTES

1. Nine types of generic skills are identified in the new curriculum framework: Collaboration skills, communication skills, creativity, critical thinking skills, information technology skills, numeracy skills, problem solving skills, self-management skills, and study skills.
2. The 2003 Music Curriculum contains a framework of aims, learning targets and learning objectives, together with suggestions on curriculum planning, learning and teaching strategies, resources and assessment. In the guide, no specific curriculum content is stated. According to the guidelines, it requires the teachers to design their own school-based curriculum content.
3. Key Stage (KS) 1 refers to P1 to P3 and Key Stage 2 refers to P4 to P6.
4. The post of curriculum leader is held by the person appointed in a school to co-ordinate the school
curriculum in the areas of planning, implementation and evaluation.

REFERENCES


Curriculum Development Committee (CDC) Hong Kong. (1983). *Syllabus for secondary schools music (Forms I-III)*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government.


Curriculum Development Council (CDC). (2001). *Learning to learn*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Special Administrative Region.

Curriculum Development Council (CDC). (2002). *Arts education key learning area curriculum guide*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Special Administrative Region.


Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC). (1999). *Creative Hong Kong 2000*. Hong Kong: HKADC.


APPENDIX 10.1

Teachers’ professional development programmes on creative music-making organized by the Arts Education Section, Curriculum Development Institute, the Education and Manpower Bureau, Hong Kong

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>No. of event</th>
<th>No. of secondary school teachers participated</th>
<th>No. of primary school teachers participated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2002/03</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003/04</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004/05</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005/06</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Up to Dec 05</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>14</strong></td>
<td><strong>875</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data provided by EMB on 9 February 2006
Chapter 11

Policy to practice: Support for secondary music teachers implementing mandatory Information and communication technology requirements in New South Wales government schools.

Julie MONTAGUE

The recently released New South Wales (NSW) Music Years 7-10 Syllabus has an increased emphasis on incorporating Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) skills into the music classroom. The syllabus has moved from encouraging the inclusion of technology in teaching and learning to making its inclusion a mandatory requirement. A central concern in meeting this requirement is the updating of music teacher’s skills and providing strategies for both accessing and utilising ICT as a tool for delivering effective learning in the music classroom.

This chapter outlines some of the strategies being employed in NSW government schools to implement this requirement and traces the nature of system and syllabus support for government schools over the last twenty years. It discusses the support documents that have been developed for government schools as well as exploring strategies employed in statewide workshop programs to assist teachers in meeting this requirement.

Since 1983, when a policy statement was released on computers in schools in New South Wales (NSW), Australia, there has been a gradual increase in the incorporation of computer skills across the entire curriculum. The direction of policy statements have moved from encouraging learning about computers to mandatory Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) requirements with statewide testing of computer skills. The most recent round of syllabus documents now make specific reference to generic computer skills and unpack these skills within the context of specific subject areas. The current secondary school music syllabus documents in NSW now include specific outcomes for music technology. This chapter will include an outline of the shifting emphasis on technology in the NSW secondary music curriculum and some of the strategies employed to support teachers in meeting this requirement will be explored.

In 1987, to support the Computers in Schools Policy (NSW Department of Education, 1983), the Computer Education Unit of the NSW Department of Education released a document to government schools entitled Music and Computers (NSW Department of Education, 1986). This document was the first system-wide statement for music technology and provided comprehensive information on the advantages of using computers in music, teaching suggestions, technical and practical considerations, information on hardware and software as well as background information outlining trends in electronic music. It also included quotes from syllabus documents for music K-12, demonstrating the potential to implement the Computers in Schools Policy (NSW Department of Education, 1983) which was inherent in existing documents.

The 1994 revisions of the junior and senior music syllabuses incorporated a specific statement on the use of technology in music, reflecting the significance of computers in music and encouraging teachers to incorporate them into their teaching practice. In addition to making specific reference to computer technology, the statement recognised the importance of technological advances on musical instruments and their capabilities and its significance in musical composition and recording. The statement encouraged teachers to incorporate a range of
technology in their teaching as a tool for musical learning. The Use of Technology statement was as follows:

Music has always been at the forefront of technology, e.g. the development of the piano in the early eighteenth century, and the development and introduction of valves to brass instruments.

Rapid technological advances during the twentieth century influences the ways in which musicians work. Some of these include recording techniques, electronic manipulations of sounds, alterations to existing instruments, and the invention of new instruments. Developments in technology have provided the means of using computer programs for composing, performing, notating and reproducing music.

A variety of computer hardware and software exists which is suitable for music education. Software to teach a range of theoretical, aural and compositional skills may be used in computer laboratories in schools. Music specific hardware such as synthesizers (both analog and digital) sequencers and samplers, provide students with a wide range of sounds. Musical Instrument Digital Interface, referred to as MIDI, enables various electronic instruments to be linked to microcomputers.

Teachers are encouraged to use as broad a range of technology as is available to them in the classroom and in the wider school context. It is important to remember that it is the effect of the technology and its influence on music that is to be the focus of the study, not the technology itself (Board of Studies NSW, 1994, p.6).

In 1999, when the senior music syllabus documents (for years 11-12) were revised, an updated version of this statement was included, with a greater emphasis on computer technology. In addition, a specific technology objective was included in each syllabus, with corresponding outcomes. The objective and outcome statements from the Stage 6 Music 1 Syllabus are as follows (Board of Studies NSW, 1999a, p. 13):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective: to develop an understanding of the impact of technology on music.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Table 11.1</strong> Preliminary Outcomes (P)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through activities in performance, composition, musicology and aural, a student:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P7 understands the capabilities of performing media, explores and uses current technologies as appropriate to the topics studied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P8 identifies, recognises, experiments with and discusses the use of technology in music</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In 2003, a new syllabus was released for junior secondary music (Years 7-10). This document also includes an updated statement on the use of technology in music which is similar to the one included in the Stage 6 (Years 11-12) Syllabuses. In addition, it includes specific outcome statements relating to the integration of technology into performing, composing and listening activities. The outcome statements for Stage 4 (Years 7-8) indicate a student:

4.2 performs music using different forms of notation and different types of technology across a broad range of styles;

4.6 experiments with different forms of technology in the composition process; and

4.10 identifies the use of technology in the music selected for study, appropriate to the musical context (Board of Studies NSW, 2003, pp. 23-26).
These outcomes are built on in Stage 5 (Years 9-10) where a student:

- 5.2 performs repertoire in a range of styles and genres demonstrating interpretation of musical notation and the application of different types of technology;
- 5.6 uses different forms of technology in the composition process; and
- 5.10 demonstrates an understanding of the influence and impact of technology on music (Board of Studies NSW, 2003, pp. 30-31).

In keeping with all current NSW Board of Studies syllabus documents for these years of learning, the syllabus includes a specific statement on ICT. The Board of Studies K-10 Curriculum Framework defines broad learning outcomes which are reflected in all syllabus documents. They include ICT applications and each syllabus document for Years 7-10 now unpacks these ICT applications within the context of the relevant syllabus.

The Music Years 7-10 Syllabus, moves from encouraging teachers to include computer technology to a mandatory requirement for its inclusion:

Students are required to engage with ICT throughout the Music course in a variety of ways. In the mandatory and elective courses students must engage with: simulation/modelling using computer-based notational and performance software that is integrated into the learning experiences of performing, composing and listening (Board of Studies NSW, 2003, p. 20).

The increased emphasis on the integration of computer technology across all learning experiences in the music syllabus has increased the pressure on music teachers to update their skills and ability to utilise computers in the music classroom. Professional development opportunities have been available on a number of levels to facilitate the implementation of technology into the music curriculum. The 1983 Computers in Schools Policy (NSW Department of Education, 1983) was supported by professional development in many of the state’s geographic regions.

In the 1990s, when the regions were divided into forty districts, Technology in Learning and Teaching (TILT) co-ordinators were located in each district to provide cross curricular support for technology. Many teachers took the opportunity to participate in introductory computer courses. Some acknowledgement was made of the importance of computer technology in music as a MIDI keyboard and an introductory activity on MIDI and music made available to each district. However few of the TILT co-ordinators had the type of training and expertise required to assist music teachers venturing into music computer technology for the first time.

Music teachers were better serviced through partnerships between schools and organisations such as the Soundhouse Alliance, which have played a key role in professional development opportunities for many NSW music teachers. Some Soundhouses, such as the one located at Normanhurst Boys High School, ran teacher professional development programs over an extended period of time, adapting the courses to target emerging needs in the syllabus as well as providing courses on specific software. These courses attracted music teachers from metropolitan and rural locations. Other Soundhouses work closely with their immediate communities or focused on workshops for students. The NSW Department of Education’s Performing Arts Unit also ran music technology courses for teachers targeting specific software applications.

Outreach programs connected with conservatoriums across the state continue to provide short courses as well as post-graduate qualifications by distance education. These cater for novice music teachers as well as refining the skills of those that are more advanced and contributed to a pool of music teachers with a high level of expertise in this area. Music retail outlets also provide valuable assistance to many schools through both information and workshop opportunities.
Ongoing support for teachers also continues to be available through professional associations, such as the Australian Society for Music Education and other music teacher networks who provide workshops at conferences and teacher professional development courses.

Initiatives such as the partnership between the NSW Department of Education and Training and Macquarie University that have resulted in the establishment of the Macquarie ICT Innovation Centre, have added a further dimension to the pool of available support. This centre provides a designated facility for teachers and students in government schools to explore innovative ICT programs. Teachers can bring their classes to the centre to work on special projects, they can apply to be seconded to work on the development of special projects and to participate in the delivery of existing programs. The centre provides professional development for teachers across the entire curriculum with an annual e-cademy as well as skill-based workshops. This initiative primarily targets the immediate geographic location.

The Curriculum K-12 Directorate of the NSW Department of Education and Training (DET) also provides teacher support for music teachers. As part of the ongoing support for new syllabus documents and new directions in teaching and learning, the Curriculum K-12 Directorate has included music technology sessions in their workshops. Many professional development courses on programming, assessment and new curriculum developments have also included demonstrations of lesson ideas using freeware, interactive web sites and other software applications. All statewide workshop programs since 1999 have included a music technology component as part of the presentations.

Music teachers and creative arts consultants with expertise in computer technology have contributed to both resource development and these workshop programs. In addition to developing teaching activities for Curriculum Directorate publications (NSW Department of Education and Training, 1997), they have contributed programming and assessment ideas, provided student work samples, presented their material at professional development courses and written articles for the Curriculum Support Bulletin which is distributed to all government school teachers each term. In many instances, these teaching ideas were also put on the DET website providing access to a wider audience.

Despite the emphasis on music technology in the curriculum, many teachers still have limited access to designated software and hardware in their school. The inclusion of multimedia in many syllabus areas has increased appropriate facilities in schools, but with competing demands for these facilities, many music teachers still do not have adequate access. In order to provide strategies for teachers with limited access, many of the Curriculum K-12 Directorate sessions focused on teaching activities which used freeware (Barlow, 2004), which could be achieved without music keyboards and by utilising a standard computer laboratory.

Teachers participating in these workshops have found the demonstrations valuable. Many teachers downloaded the freeware that was used and incorporated it into their teaching programs, providing feedback to presenters on how they have utilised the ideas in subsequent workshop programs. However, they have consistently indicated the need for access to hands-on workshops in which they can go through the processes themselves.

In more recent years DET has presented hands-on music technology workshops in metropolitan and country areas. Where computer labs with appropriate software were not available, a set of laptop computers with designated software was used. These workshops have been enormously successful and well attended with teachers valuing the opportunity to develop the necessary skills prior to delivering the teaching ideas in their schools.

Despite the syllabus endorsement and scope of past and present support for the use of music technology in schools, the competing demands on music teacher’s time, and constant changes in technology, mean there are still many music teachers who are only beginning to develop confidence in this mandatory area of the curriculum.

The recently published report on the National Review of School Music Education (Seares, 2005), commissioned by the Australian government, devotes a section to the importance of music
technology in schools. It suggests that the music curricula is failing to keep abreast of the music young people are listening to and argues most teachers involved in music of the last fifty years have a skill gap in this area of music. ‘Music Coaching’ is advocated as an effective way of utilising music technology and cites a number of projects which demonstrate the approach (Seares, 2005, pp. 25-26).

The NSW music curriculum has been innovative and attuned to the music of young people since the introduction of an alternative pathway for senior music students in 1978. The current Music 1 Syllabus (Board of Studies NSW, 1999a) is an updated version of this syllabus and continues to provide a musical pathway for students who may have only informal learning in music, accommodating the widely different needs and interests of students studying music at school. It encourages students to engage in a range of musical styles, including contemporary popular music, and serves as a pathway for many students into further training and employment in the music industry.

An alternate pathway for senior music students requires a formal background in music with the necessary music literacy skills to cover the western art music tradition. However, this syllabus has a number of components which reflect the currency of thinking in all of the NSW music curriculum documents. In addition to studying music from the western tonal tradition, it is mandatory for students to study music of the last twenty-five years. This study must consider current practices in music, and must include both art music and at least one other area from a list including popular music, music for radio, film, television and multimedia, jazz, and music for theatre. In addition, students are required to submit an original composition which reflects this study. The syllabus also encourages teachers to use a full range of technologies in their programming, and includes numerous suggestions indicating where this might occur and expanded on these suggestions through Support Documents (Board of Studies NSW, 1995, 1999b). These two syllabus documents are designed as part of a K-12 continuum of learning and the currency of thinking they exhibit across the K-12 curriculum for music.

The issue in NSW is not a narrow curriculum. It is in the capacity of music teachers to deliver the scope of the curriculum with the facilities in which they work. We need to provide further support for music teachers, facilitate the improvement of the music technology available to them and provide opportunities to further their skills in utilising it with inspiring models that raise the standards rather than limit them.

Opportunities to work with practicing composers and performers are highly valued in NSW. Supplementing the classroom program in this way has produced many outstanding programs. However, music technology and popular music is an area where programs which extend students and encourage them to build on what is familiar, is often confused with mentoring programs. Programs targeting ‘at risk’ students in which the musical involvement is a tool for improving self-confidence, developing a sense of achievement and ability to interact with others are invaluable. However, they are starting points in terms of musical development, not exit points.

One model of ‘music coaching’ that has been successful for NSW government schools has been the hands-on workshop model in which teachers have an opportunity to develop their skills in this area within the context of classroom activities and relevant programming models. The two series of hands-on workshops run during 2005 covered areas such as: downloading and editing MIDI files for classroom arrangements and teaching activities; composing with loop programs and sequencers; using a combination of notation and loop programs to compose works from a visual stimulus and to create movie soundtracks; and editing audio files for use in soundtracks and other classroom composing activities. Within the context of these teaching and learning activities, the participants have been introduced to a wide range of music technology skills as well as working through musical activities which reflect current pedagogy. The focus of both of the workshop series was on using music technology as a creative tool.

The workshops have been attended by a significant proportion of music teachers in NSW government schools. In both series of workshops, experienced teachers were the largest group
represented, indicating a willingness by those that the National Review of School Music Education (Seares, 2005) appears to classify as ‘out of touch’, to further their professional learning in the area of music technology. In the April-May series, 43% had taught for sixteen or more years, 28% had taught for between eight and fifteen years; in November series, 38% had taught for sixteen or more years, 34% had taught for between eight and fifteen years.

Both workshop series used the same software applications but the effectiveness of the workshops was measured in different ways, reflecting the shift in emphasis between each series. The first series placed all of the music technology activities within the context of the pedagogical model of NSW Quality Teaching (NSW Department of Education and Training, 2003, 2004) and the practice of assessment for learning. Participants were asked to evaluate their knowledge and understanding of the specific software applications used in the workshop as well as their knowledge and understanding of programming and assessment strategies incorporating music technology. In both instances, the participants indicated very significant improvement in their knowledge and understanding after participating in the workshops.

Prior to the workshops, 37% described their knowledge and understanding of music software applications as minimal, 33% as adequate and the remaining 30% as either strong or very strong. After participating in the workshops, 5% of the participants still felt their knowledge and understanding remained minimal, 36% as adequate, and 59% as strong or very strong.

Participants found the workshops both informative and practical, providing information on music technology that is difficult to source within the school environment. The hands-on approach enabled participants to both develop their own skills with music technology as well as an opportunity to discover its scope and potential as a tool in the music classroom. Participants included comments such as the following in their evaluation, “An excellent workshop style in-service that really showed me some great technology approaches…. This workshop really made me understand how I can link technology into my programs and explained the many things students learn from using such technologies (NSW Department of Education, 2005, p. 5)”.

Participants were also asked to rank their knowledge and understanding of programming and assessment strategies incorporating music technology. Prior to the workshops, 45% of participants felt their knowledge and understanding was minimal, 35% adequate, 15% strong and 5% very strong. After the workshop, 3% still felt their knowledge was minimal but 33% ranked their knowledge and understanding as adequate, 46% as strong and 18% as very strong.

Participants found the programming and assessment strategies incorporating music technology very clear, relevant and useful. The opportunity to participate in hands-on activities which linked directly to the assessment strategies and work samples, helped to consolidate the strategies and was very well received by participants. Comment from the participants included, “Today’s workshop was one of the very best in-services I have attended in 22 years of teaching…. Great. I am looking forward to using even half of this stuff! It’s exactly what I was needing (NSW Department of Education, 2005, p. 5)”.

The second workshop series, held in November 2005, focused on strategies for incorporating music technology into teaching programs and its evaluation focused directly on knowledge and understanding of specific music technology skills and their relevance to teaching programs.

The participants were asked to address the areas of concerns including skills in editing MIDI files; understanding of how to construct a film soundtrack; understanding of how to edit a soundtrack; and knowledge and understanding of strategies for incorporating music technology in their teaching programs (NSW Department of Education, 2005).

1. Skills in editing MIDI files

Prior to the workshop, only 38% ranked their skills in this area as adequate, strong or very strong. After participating in the workshop, 86% felt their skills were now adequate, strong or very strong.
2. Understanding of how to construct a film soundtrack
Prior to the workshop, 52% of participants indicated they had no understanding of how to construct a soundtrack. The remainder had minimal understanding (21%), adequate understanding (17%), strong understanding (3%) or very strong understanding (7%). After participating in the workshop, the response changed to minimal (7%), adequate (49%), strong (24%) and very strong (20%).

3. Understanding of how to edit a soundtrack
Again, a high percentage of participants indicated they had no understanding of how to edit a soundtrack (48%). The remainder had minimal understanding (17%), adequate understanding (14%), strong (14%) or very strong understanding (7%). After participating in the workshop only 7% described their understanding of minimal, with 45% describing their understanding as adequate, 26% strong and 22% very strong.

4. Knowledge and understanding of strategies for incorporating music technology into teaching programs
A high percentage of participants ranked their knowledge and understanding as either nil or minimal (55%), with 35% indicating adequate knowledge and understanding and 10% as either strong or very strong. Although there were still 3% who indicated their skills and knowledge remained minimal after participating in the workshops, the rest of the participants described their skills as now adequate (38%) or strong to very strong (59%).

This model of ‘music coaching’ has clearly been very valuable for NSW teachers in that participants are involved in hands-on workshops where they develop their own music technology skills within the context of teaching ideas reflecting current curriculum priorities.

The willingness of music teachers to embrace the use of music technology as a tool for music making and strategies for increasing its usage has been explored in a number of studies. Recognition that there is an ongoing need for professional learning opportunities in both metropolitan and rural areas (Jacob, 2000) and guidance on minimal provision of facilities (MENC, 1999) to facilitate the use of music technology has also been well documented.

Most music teachers are aware of the significance of music technology in current music practices. However, a minimum provision of music facilities for ICT in each school, and opportunities for ongoing professional development and collegial support which model musically inspiring and high quality work, are needed in order to enable all music teachers to successfully meet the mandatory requirements in this area.

NOTES
1. The SoundHouse™ Music Alliance is an organisation focusing on educational applications of music and multimedia. The SoundHouses are located in schools, museums and arts centres and their business links provide subsidised equipment for these centres.

REFERENCES
Board of Studies NSW. (1994). Music syllabus years 7-10: Mandatory course and additional study course. Sydney: Board of Studies.


Board of Studies NSW. (2003). *Stages 4 and 5 music years 7-10 syllabus: Mandatory and elective courses*. Sydney: Board of Studies.


Chapter 12

Soundscape, Postcolonialism and Music Education:
Experiencing the Earliest Grain of the Body and Music

Tadahiko IMADA

THE POSTCOLONIAL BACKGROUND

In the late twentieth century, non-Western nations experienced de-colonization and dismantlement of Euro-American imperialism. Postcolonialist thinkers indicate a chaotic state that arose from the term modern, referring to the nineteenth century of the West. They explain the postcolonial situation today using such terms as hybridity, authenticity, multiculturalism and so on. They also state that multiculturalism is to be considered as a result of the political and economic globalization as generated and celebrated particularly by the United States (that is, Loomba, 1998). Many musicians and music educators in Japan, for example, have not yet found the place where they can reclaim their own indigenous identification in music (if such thing really exists). There is a need to bring a new concept or policy in music education, especially in Asia. The humans are always born in particular socio-cultural settings. The term “culture” is certainly related to the term “cultivate”, that is to say, a culture cannot be separated from the ground to be cultivated. When I hear the term “culture” I can somehow feel a Steven King odor with a Poulenc tune. Yes, the human also has his/her own feeling inside. In short we humans always face our inside and outside after all. Why don’t we, musicians and music educators, deal with both sides? But how can we achieve this? Based on the concept of soundscape by R. Murray Schafer, this chapter attempts to enter that discourse.

Traditional Western aesthetics based on Platonic and Aristotelian mimesis has exerted a great influence on Japan. However, the concept of “man”, for example, creating “meaning” through rational thought was originally absent in Japan (for example., Karatani, 1989). Some confusion, at the same time, surrounds the relatively new term of postcolonial. This is mostly because, similarly to the concept of soundscape, the term postcolonial has become so interdisciplinary. However, it is the only theory, which has been developed by non-Anglo-Saxon thinkers such as Said, Bhabha and Spivak in the late twentieth century. Thus the term postcolonial is indispensable to music and education in order to explain the situation of fusion, hybridity and deculturation in the non-West.

A doubling, dissembling image of being in at least two places at once which makes it impossible for the devalued, insatiable evolue (an abandonment neurotic, Fanon claims) to accept the colonizer’s invitation to identity: “You’re a doctor, a writer, a student, you’re different, you’re one of us’. It is precisely in that ambivalent use of “different”, – to be different makes you the same – to be different from those that are different makes you the same – that the Unconscious speaks of form of Otherness, the tethered shadow of deferral and displacement. It is not the Colonialist Self or the Colonized Other, but the disturbing distance in between that constitutes the figure of colonial otherness – the White man’s artifice inscribed on the Black man’s body. It is in relation to this impossible object that emerges the liminal problem of colonial identity and its vicissitudes (Bhabha, 1994, p. 117).

This black and white liminality reminds me of the Singaporean musician Dick Lee (1989), who actually says on his CD the mad chinaman: “an endless dilemma regarding this identity problem.
Now you know what it’s like to be a banana (that is, yellow on the outside, white inside).” Dick Lee was from a wealthy family in Singapore and educated in English. He studied fashion design in London, UK after completing his army duty in Singapore. The center of his music education was European classical music since his childhood. He is not fluent in Mandarin in spite of his Chinese background. English is his first language. Lee, however, takes advantage of this hybrid stereotype “banana” for his music. In terms of the surface of his music, it sounds like banana since he skillfully assimilated British and American pop tunes. However, his strong hybrid Singaporean taste makes his music unique. Lee (1989) explains in his CD:

Why the Mad Chinaman? Well, sometimes, trying to identify the Asian in my Western make-up is enough to drive me crazy! I suppose this clash of cultures is really easy to take for granted, so through my music I am trying to face the paradox, and perhaps come up with some answers. You see, going all put Oriental is too easy, too obvious, and frankly, isn’t natural (to me) – and if I just wrote straight from the heart, it just comes out – well Western! So I picked out the local elements of my Asian, (more importantly, Singaporean) heritage and applied it to the musical medium most comfortable to me – ie POP, with just a hint of fusion. Most of the songs were inspired by folk songs and nursery rhymes I grew up with. Mine was a musical household, and we were always singing – from my nanny chanting Ai Te Loti Ai to Pa’s Glen Miller – these tunes have always stuck with me.

This hybrid mind can be found not only in Singapore but also many non-Western countries in Africa, South America and Asia, and produced many kinds of pop tunes. Even though these tunes shared some Euro-American tastes, they are not culturally 100 % compatible at all. We should call this phenomenon “postcolonial”. As John Blacking (1987) says, exoticism is always magical and drives people crazy in this postcolonial world:

It is sometimes said that the English cannot possibly understand African, Indian, and other non-English musics. This seems to me as wrong-headed as the view of many white settlers in Africa, who claimed that blacks could not possibly appreciate and perform properly Handel’s Messiah, English part-songs, or Lutheran hymns. Of course music is not a universal language, and musical traditions are probably the most esoteric of all cultural products. But the experience of ethnomusicologists, and growing popularity of non-European musics in Europe and America and of “Western” music in the Third World, suggest that the cultural barriers are somewhat illusory, externally imposed, and concerned more with verbal rationalizations and explanations of music and association with specific social events, than with the music itself…When the words and labels of a cultural tradition are put aside and “form in tonal motion” is allowed to speak for itself, there is a good chance that English, Africans and Indians will experience similar feelings. (pp. 129-130)

The following questions are put forth: Does Blacking assume all music serves the same function to all human beings, and all human beings have the same brain function and cultural differences arise only from social context? Why should non-Western music be researched by Euro-American musicologists? To me what Blacking really suggests here is all about authenticity that musicologists as well as ethno-musicologists innocently seek, and what is possibly translated by them regardless of the culture, environment, gender, social class and so on. Unfortunately, we have not yet got into our brains. In short we have not yet found any universals of music with its authentic presence. In order to search for authenticity of music, we have to take for granted that it surely exists somewhere out there. But who decided this? The Japanese composer Toru Takemitsu (1996) explains with nonchalance:

Even today when I go abroad I am sometimes asked the unsettling question “Why does a
Japanese person compose Western Music?” It’s as silly as saying that a foreigner can’t understand Noh theatre. There are Japanese people who do not get Noh, and many French people with no feeling for Debussy. What does it mean to “understand”? It is possible that when listening to a work by Brahms my understanding is quite different than that of a German’s. But the passages that move us would be the same. Although it would be fine if we were each moved by different passages…. Used properly, misunderstandings can help us to deepen our understanding, and they are better than a superficial understanding…. I would very much like to be able to write a rich Western-style music. I would very much like to get that sensual sound Debussy achieves. But when I perform my work abroad, people tell me that it sounds very Japanese. That it is like Japanese vegetarian cuisine. (pp. 109-110, translated by S. Forth and T. Imada)

The term “misunderstanding” is a key to consider what postcolonial is all about. Traditional European aesthetics based on such philosophers and aesthetes as Schopenhauer, Kant, Hegel, Hanslick and Schlegel and Suzanne Langer has exerted a great influence on music education in non-Western countries including Japan. In recent decades, many Asian nations are very enthusiastic about the migration of the European symphony orchestra, opera and ballet. Their interpretation or translation of music might be different from Europeans, that is to say they positively misunderstand it. As Daniel Barenboim (Barenboim & Said, 2002) talks about the Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, even among Europeans, it is not easy to find a stable, unchanged authenticity of music:

The Fifth Symphony comes into being only when an orchestra, somewhere in the world, decides to play it. Therefore, the peculiarity of music resides in the fact that there’s this phenomenon of sound and that music means different things to so many different people, whether it’s something poetic, mathematic, or sensual, whatever it is. But in the end, music expresses it only through sound, which is, Busoni says, sonorous air. That’s basically all it is. And therefore, when you talk about fidelity, fidelity to what? You’re talking about the fidelity of a very approximated, poor system. (pp. 111-112)

Edward W. Said (Barenboim & Said, 2002) says that Wagner was obsessed with authenticity to play the true Beethoven, which nobody else understood (p.125). According to Barenboim (Barenboim & Said, 2002), this authenticity is not “authenticity” itself, but “he wanted authenticity of feeling (p. 126)”. The human has gotten his/ her own feeling right inside. Dick Lee, for example, does not seek his identity as a Chinese person but pays more attention to his Singaporean hybridity. Postcoloniality shows us a natural flow of our spirits. Since we have our own body and mind, we cannot and do not have to control cultural metamorphosis at all.

“IT”: THE BEGINNING

In the morning you suddenly notice that you have a body. It is not quite clear whether or not you recognize “yourself” at that moment. You, however, have a certain uncomfortable feeling about finding that “it” within your body but “it” surely is there. You, however, cannot see and touch “it”, you just start sweating, unable to stay there, so you get up and try to walk. In your back, neck and head, you can somehow feel the touch of soil. A crow may be flying away if you look up the sky. You may notice that you are not a crow, while at the same time you may also believe that “it” would be a crow later on. The sun is covered to a cloud before long, and it is a thunderstorm getting nearer to you. You suddenly wish that you could let “it” out from your body to see, to touch, to listen, to smell, and to lick “it”. This feeling you have now is called “desire”. Since it is not easy to let “it” out from your body, what you can do at the moment is simply to shiver and
shout in frustration. Our memory is always unreliable. If many things are naturally forgotten, you can leave these memories alone. You, however, cannot leave them alone, and then start using words as écriture (writing). “It”, therefore, has so many names because of écriture. These names are: “self”, “spirit”, “mind”, “consciousness”, “recognition”, “identity”, “imagination” and “I”, for example. Now “it” successfully gets a name, however, you still cannot lick “identity”. It is quite unfortunate for you. You can only find fear so you decide to sing and dance for a while.

OF SOUNDSCAPE

The American bio-psychologist James Gibson (1966) advocated the concept of “affordance”. He argues, for example, that the earth “affords” people to walk; water “affords” people to drink. Following Gibson’s concept, we can think of possibility that the earliest experience of music (i.e., singing and dancing) came about as a kind of mimicry of a certain particular acoustic space. Like Gibson, it is the acoustic space “affords” the Canadian composer R. Murray Schafer to compose. His assimilating process between “it” and the acoustic space has, in a sense, created works such as his Concerto for Flute & Orchestra (1984), Concert for Harp (1987) and String Quartet (1970). Schafer (2006) comments that:

If there is no word to describe a phenomenon or an activity, does the phenomenon or activity really exist? When I first began to think seriously about the acoustic environment, there was no word to describe what I wished to study. I began to use the word “soundscape” but that did not mean that others understood what I meant.... I remember being laughed at during a conference in 1963 when I spoke of “noise pollution”. Noise was a sign of progress. It was exciting to fly fast in jet aircraft. It was exciting to go to rock concerts. It was exciting to see our cities growing. (p. 14)

In the beginning, Schafer probably found “it” in his body as well, and then tried to assimilate “it” into an acoustic space. In short, he found “it” in his auditory nerve. As a musician, a clear acoustic space, therefore, is indispensable for Schafer to develop “it”. The following line by Schafer (1977): “Man echoes the soundscape in speech and music (p. 40)” implies that inspirations, which any artists historically needed, must have always come from nature itself. Susan Sontag (1990) quotes Nietzsche’s words in The Birth of Tragedy: “Art is not an imitation of nature but its metaphysical supplement, raised up beside it in order to overcome it (p. 30)”. Without the existence of nature, musicians were not able to take advantage of their inspirations at all. Schafer, therefore, faced a severe condition in terms of his creative environment. When Schafer first visited Vancouver, BC in Canada in the late 1960s, the acoustic environment of the city unfortunately could not afford him anything. He, therefore, proposed the concept of soundscape urgently. The term soundscape is a word coined from landscape by Schafer, who established the World Soundscape Project (WSP) at Simon Fraser University in Vancouver, in the early 1970s. The definition of the concept of soundscape by the WSP (Truax, 1978) is:

An environment of sound (sonic environment) with emphasis on the way it is perceived and understood by the individual, or by a society. It thus depends on the relationship between the individual and any such environment. The term may refer to actual environments, or to abstract constructions such as musical compositions and tape montages, particularly when considered as an artificial environment. (p.126)

Schafer (1977) also explains:

The home territory of soundscape studies will be the middle ground between science,
society and the arts. From acoustics and psychoacoustics we will learn about the physical properties of sound and the way sound is interpreted by the human brain. (p. 4)

The concept of soundscape therefore is the idea of perceiving various sounds such as the sound of nature, artificial sounds in cities, and music, as total scenery. Soundscape is also a method of research that not only conceives of sounds as physical objects, but is also concerned with the kinds of sounds people are hearing, and what values are revealed in their interpreting particular areas of sound. Schafer also proposes that the purpose of soundscape research is to eventually design soundscape. He calls this process “soundscape design”. According to the WSP, the term “soundscape design” is explained:

Soundscape design attempts to discover principles and to develop techniques by which the social, psychological and aesthetic quality of the acoustic environment or soundscape may be improved. The techniques of soundscape design are both educational and technical.... To the extent that it attempts to understand individual, community and cultural behavior, soundscape design takes the broad perspective of communicational discipline, and touches such other areas as sociology, anthropology, psychology and geography. (Truax, 1978, pp. 126-127)

Though a poststructuralist thinker Derrida’s analysis, for example, is pretty much limited within a text, because of this proposal of soundscape design, the concept of soundscape indicates some possibility to connect more directly with the actual socio-cultural movements and activities. Since the concept of soundscape has an element of understanding communities and their environment, this concept is also closely linked to ecology. The concept of soundscape ecology is therefore needed in order to study the effects of the acoustic environment on the physical responses or behavioral characteristics of those living within it (Truax, 1978). Schafer (1992) mentioned:

To me soundscape design is not design from above or abroad but from within, achieved by stimulating larger and larger numbers of people to listen to the sounds about them with greater critical attention. Which are the sounds we wish to keep? How can they be encouraged so that the essential character of our environments can be preserved and become more beautiful? We must sensitize the ear to the miraculous world of sound around us. (p.92)

Again, we humans are always born in particular musical-cultural settings. Schafer probably casts us a never ending question or an unfinished business here that whether the humans are musically shaped by socio-cultural settings, or we ourselves first create music. We are certainly surrounded by many different genres of music, and we music educators somehow in Japan know that kids can nicely sing new pop tunes in karaoke box without having any proper music education, for example. “Let’s forget public music education and leave it to musical industry!” As a result, many politicians can easily go for this way. “Critical attention” proposed by Schafer is a key to rethink what music is all about. With this regard, we should not take for granted any musical genres. What all we should do is to open our ears and listen. We, too, should use our inner ears after all.

**INSIDE & OUTSIDE: SIGNS AND SYMBOLS IN SOUNDSCAPE**

Our auditory system is simply the mechanics of the ear and the organs of hearing. At the same time, we have our ontological and epistemological acoustic environment or mimetic soundscape
inside. This mimetic soundscape, which can be considered as mindscapes (Wakao, 1990), is developed by both our inside and outside. In order to reveal the outside environment, Schafer (1977) pointed out the relationship between the concert hall today and the technical, industrial environment:

The lo-fi soundscape was introduced by the Industrial Revolution and was extended by the Electric Revolution which followed it.... The Industrial Revolution introduced a multitude of new sounds with unhappy consequences for many of the natural and human sounds which they tended to obscure; and this development was extended into a second phase when the Electric Revolutions added new effects of its own and introduced devices for packaging sounds and transmitting them schizophonically across time and space to live amplified or multiplied. (p. 71)

The term “lo-fi” that Schafer uses here is the abbreviation for “low fidelity”. The lo-fi system reproduces less than a full frequency spectrum, and has a poor signal-to-noise ratio (Truax, 1978). The term of schizophonia was first created by Schafer in The New Soundscape (1969) to refer to the separation between an original sound and its electro-acoustic reproduction. Schafer explains (Schafer & Imada, 1996), “if you speak to a friend it is your friend who hears you; but a voice on the radio or television is multiplied by as many radios or TV sets as are turned on (p. i)”. According to Schafer, the existence of the modern concert hall that urban audiences take for granted is, in reality, a very recent institution and is historically linked to the awareness of noise pollution. In this condition of sound environment, referential meanings such as acoustic signs, signals and symbols that each sound portrays can be heard clearly.

The semiotic concept of signs and symbols has been widely used by sociologists and anthropologists to relatively look at and decode this world. In short they try to find their way around outside humans. However, Schafer’s approach of semiotics is uniquely designed. He can find to ways to go to both inside (his own musical creativity) and outside (critical analysis of soundscape from the past to the present time). Schafer (1977) points out:

A sign is any representation of a physical reality (the note C in a musical score, the on or off switch on a radio, et cetera). A sign does not sound but merely indicates. A signal is a sound with a specific meaning, and it often stimulates a direct response (telephone bell, siren, et cetera). A symbol, however, has richer connotations. (p. 169)

For example, the bells in eighteenth century Europe used to function as a symbol for a certain particular community. Schafer (1977) says, “Most may be said to function in one of two distinct ways: either they act as gathering (centripetal) or scattering (centrifugal) forces (p. 173)”. According to Schafer (1977), in Rome a bronze gong was supposed to drive away ghosts and played a role as a centrifugal function, and in Vancouver in 1895, a small bell on a wagon carrying smallpox victims warned passers-by of possible infection. The role of the bell was also a centrifugal function. In Japan, on the contrary, small jingling bells of newspaper boys were used to attract customers, and played a role as a centripetal function. In Tonga and Fiji Islands, bells summon worshipers, and they also perform a centripetal function. Some bells, however, cannot be categorized according to centrifugal-centripetal function. Schafer (1977) explains:

In the Middle Ages in Europe, knights wore little bells attached to their armor and women wore them jingling from their girdles. Centripetal? But what do we say about the court jester, whose cap was adorned with the same little bells? And then there are the countless bells attached to animals all over the world in order to inform their owners of their whereabouts, or to identify the lead animal. (pp. 173-174)
However, this function of bells has already been eliminated with increased sound levels in environments of modern cities. Schafer (1977) writes:

> While the contemporary church bell may remain important as a community signal or even a soundmark, its precise association with Christian symbolism has diminished or ceased; and it has accordingly experienced a weakening of its original purpose. As the ambient noise of the modern city rises, the acoustic outreach of the church bell recedes. Drowned by merciless traffic, bells still possess a certain stammering grandeur, but the parish to which they now announce their messages has shriveled to a fraction of its once formidable size. (pp. 175-177)

The WSP (Truax, 1978) has researched today's situation of bells around the world. According to the investigation, in the English city of Bath, there are 60 churches with 109 bells. In Vancouver, there are 211 churches, however 156 of these churches no longer have bells. “Of those with bells, only 11 still ring them, though 20 have electric carillons or play recorded music (Schafer, 1977, p.177)”. The native people of Papua New Guinea are able to distinguish the voices of many birds by their distinctive sound system. Some of them sing a song, some cry, some imitate the flute and speak language. Consequently, the forest becomes a microcosm of acoustic messages (Feld, 1982). Schafer is a composer who wishes to listen to the voices of spirits who live in a specific mountain or lake or forest. For example, Schafer (1995) explains his orchestral work *Manitou* (1995):

> Manitou is the Algonquin word denoting the “mysterious being” who, for the woodland Indians of North America, represents the unknown power of life and the universe. Sometimes Manitou is associated with the sun to suggest omnipotence, though, like the Christian God, he is unseen. When I discussed native spirituality with a Manitoba Indian he kept using the word “monster” to describe Manitou and mentioned that his people used to believe that lightning was a serpent vomited up by him.... and I have no doubt that the climate, the geography and the “mysterious being” contributed strongly to the shape and character of what was written there. (p. 6)

Schafer (1977) also introduced a description by the Canadian painter Emily Carr to explain the relationship between an environmental sound and a person:

> The raindrops hit the roof with smacking little clicks, uneven and stabbing. Through the open windows the sound of the rain on the leaves is not like that. It is more like a continuous sigh, a breath always spending with no fresh intake. The roof rain rattles over our room's hollowness, strikes and is finished. (p. 19)

One of Schafer's works *Miniwanka* (1973) is closely linked to the sound of water. This composition describes various aspects of water opening with the words “the wise man delights in water”. The text is chosen from the languages of Native Americans, particularly their expressions for water including rain, small river, big river, fog and ocean. Schafer (1977) says, “Water never dies and the wise man rejoices in it. No two raindrops sound alike, as the attentive ear will detect (p. 19)”.

To hear those environmental sounds, noises which symbolize capitalism today must be a real obstacle for Schafer. He is a person who has his own particular criteria for defining the environment where people can listen to the natural relationship between signifier and signified in terms of soundscape. Barry Truax (1984) says:
Jacobson (1978) has described the linguistic relation of sound to meaning on the phonemic level in terms of Saussure's concept of the sign through which the signifier and the signified are linked (Saussure, 1966). Although originating in the theory of signs, these terms and the model within which they function are useful for describing how sound communicates. In situations where sound is the conveyer of information, it functions in a quasilinguistic sense as a "signifier" of that information. One identifies a particular sound as indicating the environment. (Truax, 1984, pp. 47-48)

Truax (1984) thinks that the concept of soundscape describes the various systems of acoustic communication in relationship to each other. Saussure (1966, p. 67) referred to the arbitrary nature of the sign and the same concept of this arbitrariness applies in acoustic communication to some extent. A nature of the concept of soundscape as Truax explains above, many scholars believe that Schafer belongs an alternative camp and is different from those traditional and logocentric Euro-American composers. He, however, creates another acoustic world, by making a copy of a real soundscape where he actually lives. The following hypothesis is put forth (Imada & Yamagishi, 2005), Schafer needs the hi-fi acoustic space where all the sounds may be heard clearly and afford him to compose.

SOUNDSCAPE CONSIDERED AS POSTCOLONIAL EARS

Schafer’s original voice probably secreted naturally from his inner ear or life, he wants to mimic outside acoustic environment including the wolf howling, for example. As a result, he naturally releases music from nineteenth century Western aesthetics and relocates it in more chaotic physical acoustic space and tells us the importance of postcolonial ear. A certain chaotic state can be observed in some twentieth century musical practices, that is to say, Western classical music entered a period where familiar sounds such as melody and harmony were abandoned. Therefore the relationship between language and music which European music in the nineteenth century had supported was deconstructed. Fredric Jameson (1995) explains:

What happens in textuality or schizophrenic art is strikingly illuminated by such clinical accounts, although in the cultural text, the isolated signifier is no longer an enigmatic state of the world or an incomprehensible yet mesmerizing fragment of language but rather something closer to a sentence in free-standing isolation. Think, for example, of John Cage's music of material sounds.... it is followed by a silence so intolerable that you cannot imagine another sonorous chord coming into existence and cannot imagine remembering the previous one well enough to make any connection with it if it does. (p. 28)

Schafer attempts to reflect on Western society from the bottom up like the American composer John Cage did. In fact, he (Schafer, 1995) says:

The orchestra as we have it today is an invention of the colonial powers of the 19th century Europe.... what they were really celebrating was their empire overseas as a museum of sentimental sound objects mostly from that period.

Schafer proposed the concept of soundscape with an awareness of his duty as a composer in the twentieth century. That is to say, what is important for music education is to figure out how to reach the stage in which critical listening can be taught. The concept of soundscape should be more deeply involved in postcolonialism, which subsumes cultural studies. And more practically, what activities can we possibly do in the music classrooms to find the earliest experience of the ears? Schafer and Imada (1996) attempted to contribute this challenge:
Sit very quietly for a few moments and listen. Now take a sheet of paper and write down all the sounds you hear. Everyone will have a different list. Read your list out loud to others and then listen as they read their lists. (Schafer & Imada, p. 3)

The earliest experience of music must have started from listening to the universe. And then a person began to use any handy materials such as woods and waters. Today, we can take advantage of a piece of paper in our music classroom:

Take a sheet of paper and try to pass it around the room absolutely silently. It’s harder than you think. As soon as your fingers touch the paper they make a sound. Now imagine that the sheet of paper is a musical instrument. Each person in the class has to make a different noise with it. How many different sounds can we think up? We could fold it, blow on it, drop it, tear it...what else? But don’t crush it up until the last. (Schafer & Imada, 1996, pp. 45-46)

Students can find many musical aspects such as rhythm and harmony, dynamics and timbre along with musical form, style and content. When students find a difficulty to make a melody by a sheet of paper, they naturally pay attention to their own voice as a musical instrument:

The better you get to know a sound the more it changes. Have you ever repeated your own name softly to yourself over and over until it begins to sound strange? It doesn’t even seem to belong to you any more. Other words are the same. Supposing the whole class takes one word, a simple word, say the word “animal”, and repeats it together over and over for a long time until finally it loses its meaning and seems to become a strange sound floating it. (Schafer & Imada, 1996, p. 84)

The purest experience of words was probably incantatory related to ritual. Language we speak it today is useful to indicate, explain and interpret things and/or matters indirectly. Poets, however, try to forget the efficacy of words to make it direct something like music! Roland Barthes (1994) says:

The “grain” is the body in the voice as it sings, the hand as it writes, the limb as it performs. If I perceive the “grain” in a piece of music and accord this “grain” a theoretical value (the emergence of the text in the work), I inevitably set up a new scheme of evaluation which will certainly be individual – I am determined to listen to my relation with body of the man or woman singing or playing and that relation is erotic – but in no way “subjective” (it is not the psychological “subject” in me who is listening; the climactic pleasure hoped for is not going to reinforce – to express – that subject but, on the contrary, to lose it). (p.188)

We have just learned how to make the grain of music by the ears, the paper and the voice. And then our attentions finally move towards the body itself.

**SHIFTING FROM LISTENING TO MOVING: DANCING DEGREE ZERO**

Schafer considers him self as an Apollonian composer. He (Schafer, 1977) explains:

In the Apollonian it is external sounds, God-sent to remind us of the harmony of the universe. In the Apollonian view music is exact, serene, mathematical, associated with transcendental visions of Utopia and the Harmony of the Spheres...In the Dionysian view music is irrational and subjective. It employs expressive devices: tempo fluctuations,
music is irrational and subjective. It employs expressive devices: tempo fluctuations, dynamic shadings, tonal colorings…Above all, it is the musical expression of the romantic artist, prevailing throughout the nineteenth century and on into the expressionism of the twentieth century. It also directs the training of the musician today. (p. 6)

Both Apollonian and Dionysian concepts of arts are very important when considering the nature of music. As Nietzsche (1992), who considers himself as a Dionysian philosopher, suggested, that arts should include the dichotomy or conflict between these two ideas. One of the challenges confronting music educators is to discover how we can possibly and efficiently teach Apollonian and Dionysian views of music in our classrooms. First, Apollonian concept brings our attentions to form in art and music. Apollonian view also makes us to hear soundscape descriptively rather than prescriptively. Creating a good shape or form is the only way to make a style in music. And then style automatically creates grain and atmosphere in music. Style, therefore, always repels semiotic system. Dionysian concept, however, always allies with another semiotic system to make contents in art. It, therefore, is quite prescriptive. Our attention in music education should firstly go to Apollonian concept since style has the highest value in music and art. I would propose that our body is going to be a key. How much can we possibly be sensitive to our body through our ears?

Some people think that when trees are cut down they scream. The Canadian painter and author Emily Carr used to call the stumps of trees that had been cut down “screamers” to remind us of the horrible fate they suffered when they were cut. (Schafer & Imada, 1996, p. 70)

The British motion picture Billy Elliot (Daldry, 2000) illustrates what Carr actually felt about a body transformation. An eleven-year-old boy Billy Elliot faces an audition of the Royal Ballet School in London, England. The few lines from this film include:

**Judiicator:** Just one last question. Can I ask you, Billy? What does it feel like when you are dancing?

**Billy:** Don’t know. Sort of feeling good. It’s sort of stiff and that…but once I get going, then I, like, forget everything and sort of disappear. Sort of disappear. Like I feel a change in me whole body. Like there’s a fire in me body. I’m just then….flying like a bird. Yeah, like electricity. Like electricity.

Though the original “it” probably secreted naturally from his or her inner life, there might be a slight possibility that “it” tried to mimic many things such as a bird, fire, tree and water. The human, in a way, is the only creature that he or she can become anything. Billy describes his experience as a human transformation and ancient Greeks called it “mimesis”. The concept of mimesis eventually became the concept of art itself. The spirit that tries to transfer is created as a result of careful listening, seeing, touching and so on. A body practicing music is therefore the process of identifying one’s life. Once upon a time, “it” and its body tried to listen to the Music of the Spheres. “It” has danced based on their desire to worship what they imagine to be the untouchable in nature. “It” may perhaps have started dancing naturally for “itself” in a kind of monologue and, then danced for the mountains and oceans to respect and communicate with “its” own God. Remember, Barenboim (Barenboim & Said, 2002, p. 111) quoted Busoni: “Music is sonorous of air”. As soon as music is cast into the sky, it will disappear quite easily with “its” feeling. Since sonorous of air is invisible, the reason why this vibration of air became the concept of music, moreover, interpreted as one of arts is all because of “écriture: notation”. Notations always appear on the paper, thus it is analyzable and transferable to any other socio-cultural settings.
Sontag (1990) says, “What is important now is to recover our senses. We must learn to see more, to hear more, to feel more….In place of a hermeneutics we need an erotics of art (p. 14)”.

In the film Billy Elliot, Billy’s life has nothing to do with interpretation of dance or écriture in arts at all. His use of the word “electricity” perhaps expresses “erotics of art” by Sontag. The body stimulated by sonorous air is visualized in gesture while at the same time the gesture creates a “meta-language”. Choreography, therefore, applies to any musical performance without regard to vocal or instrumental, composition or improvisation. Both written (écriture) and spoken (speech) words also have rhythm and gesture, so we may consider dance as a matrix of all the artistic performances. Refer to the following exercise for the body in music classroom:

Two people go to opposite ends of the room. Then on a signal each begins to walk towards the other making a different sound. Any sound will do—a word, a funny noise, clapping hands in a rhythm…. When the two people pass each other they exchange sounds. The whole class could try this, two at a time. It becomes even more interesting if the two people each make a gesture as well as a sound. Walk in a funny way, limping or hopping or swinging your arms. Then you have to exchange gestures as well as sounds. (Schafer & Imada, 1996, p. 81)

FINAL THOUGHTS

European music's autonomy has been accepted for at least a hundred years. The music curriculum in Japan has been based on Western aesthetics as articulated by Mursell and Glenn (1938) and Langer (1942), for example, according to the musical situation of European society in the nineteenth century, in which critics such as Hanslick (1957) had developed a position where music could exist as an autonomous aesthetic object. In order to investigate what is actually going on in music education today, the collaborations between the concept of soundscape and postcolonialism should be critically important. Schafer paid attention to individual (personal) experience. The process of each person's listening is more important than the product (that is compositions by students). Since the introduction of Western music education in Japan, Western music and its cultural conditioning have included simultaneously an auditory illiteracy and cultural bias among Japanese people. The concept of soundscape presumably tries to eradicate Western music's hegemony. Sontag (1990, p.3) says, “The earliest experience of art must have been that it was incantatory, magical; art was an instrument of ritual”. How can we possibly experience the luminousness of music itself today? In order to do this I postulate that we look back at our own body, and based on the concept of soundscape, develop a postcolonial “body”.

REFERENCES

New South Wales (Australia) has a centralised curriculum authority with all curriculum and public examinations being developed and conducted by the Board of Studies and the Office of the Board of Studies. Of the 20.6 million people in Australia, 1.2 million attend New South Wales schools and the Board of Studies is responsible for all curriculum for these students. In 2003 the New South Wales Board of Studies released the *Music Years 7-10 Syllabus*. This syllabus was revised after considerable consultation with teachers, key groups and academics and drew on research and best practice from both Australia and around the world. A significant part of this revision centred around effecting change in teaching and assessing practice through the use of the philosophy known as *assessment for learning* (Black & Wiliam, 1998a). This philosophy is intended to become an integral part of teaching and learning. Following the release of this syllabus, support materials including a CD-ROM were developed that highlighted this philosophy and provide teachers with formats, sample tasks and work samples to assist in implementation from 2005 onwards. This chapter explores the philosophy of assessment for learning, its application in the music classroom and the materials provided to support teachers in the implementation of the new syllabus and assessment practices.

**FORMATIVE ASSESSMENT AND ASSESSMENT FOR LEARNING**

Formative assessment is concerned with gathering information about learning as learning is taking place. In contrast, summative assessment is concerned with gathering information about learning after the learning should have occurred (Anderson et al. 2001, pp. 101-102). Rowntree (1987) argues that assessment can be seen as a human encounter. He further states:

> assessment in education can be thought of as occurring whenever one person, in some kind of interaction, direct or indirect, with another, is conscious of obtaining and interpreting information about the knowledge and understanding, or abilities and attitudes of that other person. (p. 4)

Bransford et al. (2000, pp. 24-25, 140) argue that ongoing formative assessments that are designed to make students’ thinking visible to both teacher and student are essential. Formative assessment involves the use of assessments (usually administered in the context of the classroom) as sources of feedback to improve teaching and learning. This form of assessment permits the teacher to understand student preconceptions, their progress and allows them to design instruction accordingly. In the assessment centered learning environment, formative assessments should be learner friendly and assist both teachers and students to monitor progress. Opportunities for formative assessment increase students’ learning and transfer, and they learn to value opportunities to revise (Bransford et al., 2000). These authors argue that assessment and feedback are crucial for helping people to learn, and assessment that is consistent with principles of learning and understanding would:
- Mirror good instruction;
- Happen continuously, but not intrusively, as part of instruction;
- Provide information (to teachers, students and parents) about the levels of understanding that students are reaching. (p. 244)

Their belief is that effective teachers see assessment opportunities in ongoing classroom situations and are continuously attempting to learn about students’ thinking and understanding relevant to the tasks and, in doing so, do a great deal of monitoring of students’ work (p. 245).

Black et al. (2004) describes assessment for learning in the following way:

Assessment for learning is any assessment for which the first priority in its design and practice is to serve the purpose of promoting students’ learning. It thus differs from assessment designed primarily to serve the purposes of accountability, or of ranking, or of certifying competence. An assessment activity can help learning if it provides information that teachers and their students can use as feedback in assessing themselves and one another and in modifying the teaching and learning activities in which they are engaged. Such assessment becomes ‘formative assessment’ when the evidence is actually used to adapt the teaching work to meet learning needs. (p. 10)

Black and Wiliam (1998b, p. 2) state that teaching and learning must be interactive and that teachers need to know about their pupils’ progress and difficulties with learning so as to adapt their own work to meet the students’ needs. They further add that teachers can find out about their students in a variety of ways, including observation and discussion in the classroom as well as the viewing of students’ written work. Their definition of assessment refers to “all those activities undertaken by teachers – and by their students in assessing themselves – that provides information to be used as feedback to modify teaching and learning activities” (p. 2). The writers identified three main obstacles for improved assessment practice in the classroom:

1. Assessment methods teachers were using did not promote good learning;
2. Assessment grading often emphasized competition between students over personal improvement;
3. Assessment feedback often had a negative effect on students, particularly lower achieving students, thus leading to a belief they lacked ability and were not able to learn. (p. 4)

They further argue that to improve formative assessment requires the following steps:

1. Improving the self-esteem of students - feedback to any pupil should be about the particular qualities of his or her work, with advice on what he or she can do to improve, and should avoid comparisons with other pupils.
2. Self-assessment by pupils - if formative assessment is to be productive, pupils should be trained in self-assessment so that they can understand the main purposes of their learning and thereby grasp what they need to do to achieve.
3. The evolution of effective teaching - opportunities for pupils to express their understanding should be designed into any piece of teaching, for this will initiate the interaction through which formative assessment aids learning …in short, the dialogue between pupils and a teacher should be thoughtful, reflective, focused to evoke and explore understanding, and conducted so that all pupils have an opportunity to think and to express their ideas. (pp. 6-7)
Abeles et al. (1995) state:

There is a need to determine students’ achievement and to gather feedback about the effectiveness of the teaching and instructional materials, as well as to identify areas in which students may need additional instruction. To be effective, teachers must assess to determine what their students have learned. Without this information, teachers do not have ways of improving their own teaching or identifying and helping students who need additional assistance. (p. 303)

ASSESSMENT FOR LEARNING IN THE NEW SOUTH WALES YEARS 7–10 SYLLABUSES

Between 2001 and 2003 the Board of Studies revised all syllabuses for the Years 7–10 of schooling. An integral part of this revision was the inclusion of references to, and the advocacy of assessment for learning.

Assessment for learning is designed to enhance teaching and improve learning. It gives students opportunities to produce the work that leads to development of their knowledge, understanding and skills. Assessment for learning involves teachers in deciding how and when to assess student achievement, as they plan the work students will do, using a range of appropriate assessment strategies including self-assessment and peer assessment (Board of Studies, NSW, 2003, p. 56).

The premise underpinning this approach to assessment is the notion that assessment should occur as an integral part of the teaching and learning process and the information gained from this assessment assists teachers in formulating further work that extends student learning or, in fact, remediate learning that has not taken place as anticipated. In using this approach it is hoped that students will be able to monitor and evaluate their own learning through actively encouraging both peer assessment and self-assessment.

Continually emphasised throughout this approach is the importance of giving students quality feedback. This feedback should inform students of their progress against the outcomes and/or the criteria for the task. It should inform them of their successes and the areas which will require further work or consolidation in future learning activities.

The materials produced by the Board of Studies emphasise good assessment practices and state six key assessment principles (APs) in assessment for learning:

AP1 emphasises the interactions between learning and manageable assessment strategies that promote learning
AP2 clearly expresses for the student and teacher the goals of the learning activity
AP3 reflects a view of learning in which assessment helps students learn better, rather than just achieve a better mark
AP4 provides ways for students to use feedback from assessment
AP5 helps students take responsibility for their own learning
AP6 is inclusive of all learners. (Board of Studies, NSW, 2004, p. 5)

Figure 13.1 summarises the model for integrating learning and assessment where the syllabus outcomes are central to the decisions teachers make about the learning to be undertaken. It emphasises the importance of the evidence of learning that needs to be collected with the view to determining how well students are achieving in relation to the outcomes and to provide students with feedback on their learning (Board of Studies, 2004, pp. 7-8).
This model, with the outcomes at its core, highlights the need for teachers to be explicit about the outcomes and content they are addressing and the corresponding evidence required to demonstrate student learning. It reinforces the need to give explicit feedback to students and that teaching and learning methods may need to be adapted to meet the particular learning needs of the students. Samples of activities are provided and are designed to demonstrate that the methods of gathering evidence of student learning can take many forms. References are made to methods such as informal teacher observations, peer assessment, self-assessment as well as more structured forms of assessment.

Materials reiterate than when designing assessment activities, teachers should consider whether the activity:

- has explicitly stated purposes that address the outcomes;
- is integral to the teaching and learning program;
- shows a clear relationship between the outcomes and content being assessed;
- allows students to demonstrate the extent of their knowledge, understanding and skills;
- focuses on what was taught in class and what students were informed would be assessed;
- provides opportunities to gather information about what further teaching and learning is required for students to succeed;
- provides valid and reliable evidence of student learning and is fair. (Board of Studies 2004, p. 10)

Quality feedback is a key aspect to assessment for learning and should be at all times integral to the teaching and learning process and underpins the philosophy of assessment for learning. Feedback should:
• focus on the activity and what was expected;
• be constructive, providing meaningful information to students about their learning;
• correct misunderstandings;
• identify and reinforce students’ strengths and state clearly how students can improve.  
  (Board of Studies, 2004, p.13)

This is supported by Bransford et al. (2000) when they argue that assessment should occur “continuously, but not intrusively, as part of instruction” (p. 140) and that assessment feedback can be both formal and informal. They state that feedback is most valuable when students have the opportunity to use it to revise their thinking as they are working on a unit or project (p.141). Rowntree (1987) states that feedback from assessment comes in many forms, of varying degrees of usefulness and that effective assessment enables the student to identify strengths and weaknesses and shows them how to improve or build upon what they do best (p.24). He further argues that assessments only begin to become useful when accompanied by verbal comments stating that “the teacher who has made the assessment needs to verbalise his reactions to the student’s performance, saying which aspects strike him as strong, weak, or simply interesting. Ideally he should give whatever suggestions he can to help the student improve” (p. 26).

Another key aspect of the assessment for learning philosophy is the use of self-assessment and peer assessment techniques. Black and William (1998b) argue that the link between formative assessment and self-assessment is not an accident, it is merely inevitable and that it is, in fact, an essential component of formative assessment. They explain that students are usually particularly honest and reliable in assessing themselves and others (if not too hard on themselves), but these assessments can only take place when they have a clear understanding of the criteria or targets that their learning is meant to attain. When these targets are understood students become effective and more committed learners (p. 6). This is also supported by Bransford et al. (2000, p.140) when they argue that self-assessment is an important part of the metacognitive approach to instruction.

Black et al. (2004) also make some interesting observations on the importance of peer assessment. They remark that “peer assessment is uniquely valuable because students may accept criticisms of their work from one another that they would not take seriously if the remarks were offered by a teacher”. They further state that peer work is also valuable because “the interchange will be in language that students themselves naturally use and because students learn by taking on the roles of teachers and examiners of others” (p.14).

**ASSESSMENT FOR LEARNING IN THE MUSIC CLASSROOM**

To many music educators, assessment is so much part of instruction (Colwell, 2002, p. 1130). Music teachers must spend time on thinking about what the most important outcomes of music instruction are, and plan their instruction and assessment strategies accordingly (Abeles et al., 1995, p. 304).

Fortunately for music teachers, the use of formative assessment is not new and therefore the philosophy of assessment for learning is embedded in practice in many music classrooms. The change is that for the first time, the everyday practices of the music teacher are recognised and, to an extent, formalised. Music teachers continually make judgments about the progress of their students in a range of activities in the classroom that inform them as to when to progress to the next level of activities. Perhaps the most obvious of these choices is in the repertoire that is chosen to be explored in the classroom, or by individual students. To make these judgments teachers must be constantly observing the knowledge, skills and understandings that their students are displaying in tasks. Other clear examples of assessment for learning in a Music class might be the ongoing advice that a teacher gives students in the development of a composition, or
the assistance in notating those compositions. Even a group listening task can provide invaluable feedback for the teacher on how carefully students are listening to the excerpts of music and how well they understand how the musical concepts are employed within that excerpt.

Successful music teaching requires successful interactions with students. The nature of an active music classroom facilitates these interactions and therefore provides enormous opportunities for teachers to gain information and provide good quality and ongoing feedback to students. Performance activities and tasks, in particular, provide ideal vehicles for students to engage in peer assessment and self-assessment.

The promotion of this good assessment practice is aided by the New South Wales Music curriculum. While it specifies learning outcomes, content and some structures for implementation, it does not specify particular texts or repertoire. This flexibility affords teachers the opportunity to develop units of work that are suitable to the learning needs of students, their interests and their abilities. Even in constructing an overall plan for a class, the teacher is already required to know their students and the develop programs that meet the variety of students in the class and given that there is not a set curriculum or repertoire list to accomplish by a particular time, teachers can continuously observe and make adjustments to their own teaching practice in order to meet the particular learning needs of their students.

The use of this type of formative assessment can provide music teachers with a rich understanding of what their students know and can do. The data gathered is contextual and is perhaps a truer representation of a student’s abilities than simply summative testing. This ongoing gathering of information, both formally and informally, occurs as a result of the pedagogical approaches music teachers engage in on a daily basis.

**SUPPORT FOR TEACHERS IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ASSESSMENT FOR LEARNING IN MUSIC**

The advocacy of new philosophies in the education sector requires support for teachers if educational administrations hope to effect change in teaching practice. In this regard, the Board of Studies has provided a series of support materials to each teacher in the state that highlight the approach taken with assessment for learning and how they might consider implementing this approach into their teaching and assessing plans. In early 2004 the document *Music Years 7–10 Syllabus Advice on Programming and Assessment* was published. This document provided key messages about assessment for learning and also provided sample units of work for teachers that highlighted how this approach could be incorporated into their own practice. While it also contains other means of support for teachers in aspects of syllabus implementation, for this discussion the focus will be on assessment for learning.

Each sample unit is accompanied by an assessment for learning activity. The sample unit highlights to teachers good practice in the designing of a unit of work described previously in this support document:

Step 1 Select outcomes
Step 2 Decide on the subject matter or focus of the unit of work
Step 3 Decide on the evidence of learning
Step 4 Select the relevant syllabus content
Step 5 Plan the teaching, learning and assessment activities
Step 6 Plan feedback opportunities
Step 7 Reflection and evaluation (Board of Studies, 2004, pp. 22-23)
The unit of work is also accompanied by a task that examines how teachers might look at an assessment item within the context of the assessment for learning philosophy. The assessment task describes:

- the context of the task;
- specific syllabus outcomes the task is addressing;
- a clear description of the activity;
- some criteria for assessing learning;
- guidelines for marking (including descriptions of student achievement at each mark range);
- a description of how students will receive feedback; and
- the future directions that could be taken as a result of this learning.

Additionally, the task is annotated to highlight the six key assessment principles in the assessment for learning philosophy.

As further support for teachers in implementing the philosophy of assessment for learning, the CD-ROM *Music Years 7–10 Assessment for learning in a standards-referenced framework* was produced in 2004. This resource contained a number of important documents such as the syllabus, and advice on programming and assessing document. Its true value, however, was the inclusion of further assessment for learning tasks with accompanying work samples. Each of these six tasks followed the same format, and the work samples utilise written work together with video and audio clips of student work. Each work sample is annotated to describe student achievement in each part of the task in relation to the syllabus outcomes and models feedback to students. This feedback is given in regard to what the student has already achieved in the task as well as providing direction on what they will need to do next. A number of the tasks have examples of peer assessment and self-assessment as well as ways of recording student achievement for each student and in the context of the whole class. The tasks are meant to be representative of a variety of musical styles, periods and genres that might be approached in a regular music classroom – ranging from medieval music, to popular music as well as Australian Aboriginal perspectives through to Australian art music and the integration of computer technologies into the composition process.

**THE ASSESSMENT RESOURCE CENTRE (ARC)**

In September 2006, the Board of Studies launched the Assessment Resource Centre (ARC). The aim of this website is to support and enhance professional practice in the assessment and reporting of student achievement across Years K to 12. Eventually, it will act as both a resource and a “clearing house” for assessment items. While it has been developed primarily for teachers, parents and students may also find it useful (Board of Studies, NSW, 2006).

The website provides teachers with advice on awarding an A to E grading system, recognizing standards within their classrooms, and some possible methods of reporting student achievement. Importantly it promotes the understanding of standards through becoming familiar with the standards by reading the descriptions for each grade, viewing student work samples and comparing grade commentaries.

Provision of student work samples that come from real classrooms and were administered by practicing teachers demonstrate a commitment to assisting teachers in understanding standards and ultimately making consistent judgments. Samples come from a range of schools and many samples have already been graded. Grades agreed upon by a number of experienced practicing teachers based on the characteristics of work typically produced by students performing at each grade. Explanations called grade commentaries are provided to illustrate the reasons for each grading. Grade commentaries play an important role in linking both the work
samples and the grades. They are designed so that when teachers read them they can think of their own experiences with other students who produce similar work. Consistency of judgments both within, and between, schools will therefore come through following common syllabuses, using a common grading scale and understanding standards through shared student work samples. To facilitate this process, a grade alignment process is undertaken. This process aims to show, through work samples, standards that are typically produced by students whose overall performance, on balance, best matches that grade description.

Practicing teachers make professional judgments about each work sample, based on their knowledge and experience of teaching students in that subject area at that stage. Teachers consider grade descriptions from a common grade scale, and picture the types of knowledge, skills and understandings in the subject area that students at each of the grade levels typically demonstrate. Central to this is a close analysis of the syllabus outcomes and content for the stage. The Assessment Resource Centre is designed as an ongoing and dynamic project where additional tasks can be trialed, and student work samples and grade commentaries can be continually updated.

Of particular interest to teachers will be the samples and grade commentaries applicable to the end of Year 10. At the end of Year 10, if a student has undertaken an elective course of either 100 or 200 hours of Music, they will receive a grade on the credential of the New South Wales School Certificate. Schools are responsible for awarding each student a grade from A to E from the Course Performance Descriptors (CPDs) that summarizes the student’s achievement in the course. To attempt parity across subjects, all CPDs are based on a set of generic descriptors that summarizes the standard (or quality) of achievement associated with each grade. The scale describes the depth of knowledge and understanding, and the range of skills that students working at that standard typically show (see Table 13.1).

**Table 13.1** Generic course performance descriptors (Board of Studies, 2006)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>The student has an extensive knowledge and understanding of the content and can readily apply this knowledge. In addition, the student has achieved a very high level of competence in the processes and skills and can apply these skills to new situations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>The student has a thorough knowledge and understanding of the content and a high level of competence in the processes and skills. In addition, the student is able to apply this knowledge and these skills to most situations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>The student has a sound knowledge and understanding of the main areas of content and has achieved an adequate level of competence in the processes and skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>The student has a basic knowledge and understanding of the content and has achieved a limited level of competence in the processes and skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>The student has an elementary knowledge and understanding in few areas of the content and has achieved very limited competence in some of the processes and skills.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In applying the subject specific CPDs, teachers are required to make a professional and on-balance judgments. The CPDs are not intended to represent a checklist or comprehensive description of student performance but rather the best overall description of the student’s achievement. This judgment is made through a series of school determined formal assessment tasks as well as information gathered through less formal assessment of student work on an ongoing basis through the philosophy of “assessment for learning” which underpins this syllabus (for a copy of the stage 5 course performance descriptors, refer to Appendix 1).
CONCLUSION

The use of formative assessment practices is not new to music educators. The advocacy of the philosophy of assessment for learning across the entire Years 7-10 curriculum does give validity to the everyday teaching and assessing practices of the classroom music teacher. The success of any such change relies on supporting teachers as they begin to implement and reflect formally new ways of approaching practice. For the classroom music teacher this will largely be in the form of assistance in ways of formalising their practice. Music students in New South Wales now have a greater potential to understand and become more involved in their own learning and their own achievements. As teachers have only just begun to implement this syllabus and approach, it will be a number of years before we see the impact that philosophical change to teaching and assessing practices has on future generations of music students. What is clear is that throughout the process, teachers, parents and students have had access to materials that assist them to understand standards though careful descriptions of student achievements which are supported by samples of student work. In a subject area such as Music, there are obstacles in truly representing student achievement. The framework is now in place to ensure that the integration of curriculum and assessment in New South Wales provides students with a high quality education, and that their relative standards can be clearly reported in a consistent manner to students, parents and the wider community.

REFERENCES

### APPENDIX 13.1 Stage 5 Music Course Performance Descriptors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade E</th>
<th>Grade D</th>
<th>Grade C</th>
<th>Grade B</th>
<th>Grade A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A student performing at this grade typically:</strong></td>
<td><strong>A student performing at this grade typically:</strong></td>
<td><strong>A student performing at this grade typically:</strong></td>
<td><strong>A student performing at this grade typically:</strong></td>
<td><strong>A student performing at this grade typically:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demonstrates elementary understanding of music as an artform in a limited range of styles, periods and genres.</td>
<td>demonstrates a basic understanding of music as an artform in a range of styles, periods and genres and with guidance, makes some connections across a range of music.</td>
<td>communicates an understanding of music as an artform in a range of styles, periods and genres and makes connections across a range of repertoire.</td>
<td>clearly communicates an understanding of music as an artform in a comprehensive range of styles, periods and genres and is able to make connections across a range of repertoire.</td>
<td>confidently communicates an understanding of music as an artform in a comprehensive range of styles, periods and genres and is able to make connections across a range of repertoire.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with support, engages in some musical experiences demonstrating an elementary understanding of the concepts of music.</td>
<td>engages in a range of musical experiences demonstrating a basic understanding of the concepts of music.</td>
<td>engages in a range of musical experiences demonstrating a sound understanding of the concepts of music.</td>
<td>confidently engages in a range of sophisticated musical experiences demonstrating a perceptive understanding of the concepts of music within a broad range of repertoire.</td>
<td>confidently engages in a range of musical experiences demonstrating a perceptive understanding of the concepts of music within a broad range of repertoire.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with assistance, is able to perform a limited range of repertoire and engage in group music-making.</td>
<td>engages in group music-making and may perform some solo repertoire.</td>
<td>performs a range of repertoire in solo and group situations.</td>
<td>performs a range of repertoire as a solo performer, and/or takes prominent roles within group performances.</td>
<td>performs a range of repertoire as a solo performer, and/or takes prominent roles within group performances.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with support, constructs limited musical compositions.</td>
<td>with support, explores, improvises, and constructs basic musical compositions.</td>
<td>explores, improvises, and constructs musical compositions.</td>
<td>explores, improvises, and constructs coherent musical works.</td>
<td>explores, improvises, and constructs coherent and stylistic musical works.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with support, explores the capabilities of some instruments.</td>
<td>with support, explores the capabilities of some instruments and how musical concepts can be manipulated for various effects.</td>
<td>explores the capabilities of a range of instruments and how musical concepts can be manipulated for a range of effects.</td>
<td>explores the capabilities of a range of instruments and understands how musical concepts can be manipulated for a range of effects.</td>
<td>explores the capabilities of a range of instruments and understands how musical concepts can be manipulated for a range of effects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with support, uses limited notational forms in their own work.</td>
<td>with support, notates their own work demonstrating some understanding of notational conventions.</td>
<td>notates their own work, demonstrating understanding of notational conventions.</td>
<td>notates their own work, choosing notational forms and conventions appropriate to the style, period or genre being explored.</td>
<td>confidently notates their own work, choosing notational forms and conventions appropriate to the style, period or genre being explored.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>describes aspects of style, demonstrating a limited awareness of the social, cultural and historical contexts of the music studied.</td>
<td>describes aspects of style, demonstrating some awareness of the social, cultural and historical contexts of the music studied.</td>
<td>discusses style and interpretation, demonstrating some awareness of the social, cultural and historical contexts of the music studied.</td>
<td>critically discusses style and interpretation, demonstrating an awareness of the social, cultural and historical contexts of the music studied.</td>
<td>analyses and critically discusses style and interpretation, demonstrating a clear awareness of the social, cultural and historical contexts of the music studied.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 14

Establishing Standards-Based Assessment in Music Performance

Lai Chi Rita YIP

Policy makers have deemed it necessary to check students’ achievements by effecting a gradual change from norm-referenced to standards-based assessment through increasing the amount of school-based assessment in Hong Kong senior secondary schools (CDC & HKEAA, 2005). Starting with the change in name from the Hong Kong Examinations Authority (HKEA) to the Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (HKEAA) in 2002 to reflect “more accurately the new role of the Authority in providing assessment that facilitates student learning” (HKEAA, 2002), the drafting of a new senior secondary music curriculum and assessment framework began in late 2004 for implementation in 2009. In proposing to bring about the change, the emphasis of assessment for learning more than assessment of learning seemed to be the focus. That is, to enhance students’ learning through assessment rather than to discriminate how well they have learnt. It is considered more important to help students learn through assessment, know what they have learnt, and the standards they have achieved than to grade them and compare their performance. To prepare better for the practice of standards-based assessment in the music discipline, an analysis of the existing publicly recognized assessment formats is necessary in addition to referencing, and benchmarking for the proposal of standards-based practices appropriate to local context. This chapter covers an investigation of what standards are, and analyses the present practice with a focus on learning to perform music. What could be considered in the planning process to ensure a better implementation of the new standards-based assessment policy is examined. Besides, referencing to internationally renowned standards-based assessment practices that demonstrate impact on music performance in Hong Kong are made and other compatible forms scrutinized to shed light on establishing local music performing standards.

STANDARDS OF MUSIC PERFORMING ASSESSMENT

A standard according to O'Neill and Stansbury (2000) is, “One or more statements or phrases that clearly define the knowledge and skills to be taught and/or the level of performance that is expected in a content or career area. A set of standards should represent consensus among stakeholders on what is most important for students to know and be able to do” (p. 8). In the course of planning for the change to standards-based assessment, the Curriculum Development Council, and, the Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (CDC & HKEAA, 2005) together with representatives of music teachers from senior secondary schools and music lecturers from tertiary institutions have jointly started to draft the music curriculum and assessment framework in 2004. These stakeholders all recognized that music performance should be one of the three domains that is worth learning and doing by senior secondary students (the other two domains being creating and listening). With this confirmed two types of standards: content standards and performance standards (O'Neill & Stansbury, 2000) have to be set.

Content standards define the breadth and depth of knowledge and skills to be mastered by students by the time they complete an instructional program. Performance standards define
and illustrate levels of expected accomplishment with respect to one or more content standards. They serve as the foundation of the scoring system used to evaluate student work. (p. 23)

For the music performing domain in the senior secondary music curriculum, there are two modules, one compulsory and one optional. In the draft, the general criteria for the compulsory module require students to:

- sing or play two or more pieces individually in contrasting styles in a recital, and take part in a viva voce to explain their understanding and interpretation of the music performed;
- perform one piece in an instrumental or vocal ensemble;
- sing at sight a simple short melody. (CDC & HKEAA, 2005, p. 9)

The general criteria of the optional performing module, which could be of a higher level than the compulsory module, require students to:

- sing or play three or more pieces individually in contrasting styles in a recital, and take part in a viva voce to explain their understanding and interpretation of the music performed; or
- submit a recognized qualification for exemption. (CDC & HKEAA, 2005, p. 9)

The durations of performances are stated in addition to the use of instruments preferred (Chinese or western) or vocal styles selected (operatic or pop, et cetera). Details regarding possible sight-singing melodies are also listed to provide a reference. As stated in the draft framework, the basic requirement of the compulsory performance module and the optional module is equivalent to the Grade 4 and Grade 6 practical examination levels of the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music respectively. Exact content and performance standards are yet to be developed for benchmarking, and for implementation in school-based assessment or standards-based assessment.

**PRESENT SITUATION OF STANDARDS-BASED ASSESSMENT IN MUSIC PERFORMANCE LOCALLY**

Standards-based assessment in music performance is not uncommon in Hong Kong but has not been a norm in school music education. Since general music classes are usually scheduled in school timetables and, class singing and/or playing of mostly classroom instruments are included in the music performance area of study. This kind of music performance occurs as part of general music classes while only a few schools scheduled class instrumental or choral music performance in school time-table. The assessment of these performances is usually in the norm-referenced manner. The learning of vocal solo, instrumental solo or ensemble music performance is mainly taken place outside of class time as extra-curricular activities in schools, and many might learn from private tutors outside of the school environment. These students are usually encouraged to take external examinations to prove their standards. These external examinations, open to all students, are sponsored by concerned music institutions of international reputations. Students pay a fee to take these examinations and they may register through their teachers, music organizations, or through their parents. As students are not obliged to take vocal or instrumental classes, either privately or in schools, there is diversity in the standards of performing music by students.

Whether to test their standards or to gain recognition, an increasing number of students are immersed in a flourishing practice of taking external music examinations. The music assessment system of the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) has attracted much attention in Hong Kong over the years due to historic reasons. The total candidate entries in 2004
was 85,500 as reported by HKEAA (2004) amongst the 635,000 candidate numbers for ABRSM examinations worldwide (ABRSM, 2004). The number was enormous compared to the 2005 Hong Kong Certificate of Education Examination (HKCEE) (an external examination for senior secondary school students) which was taken by 119,471 students with 225 who took the music examination (HKEAA, 2005c). The number was also far higher than the 33,829 students who took the Advanced Level (AL) examination but with only 22 who took the AL music examination (HKEAA, 2005b). The Annual Review of ABRSM (2004) indicated that: “Reflecting the exceptional rate of growth in Hong Kong, we have introduced a second examination session to take place in the spring of each year in that territory” (p. 9). Although candidates taking the ABRSM examinations could be from various grades 1-10, diplomas, theory as well as practical, while the comparison might not be as appropriate, the high number revealed the widely recognized assessment practice (which implies standards) of ABRSM by the public sector.

Recently, a new graded music examination body, the Central Conservatory of Music (CCOM) from Beijing has forged connection with HKEAA in 2004 and stimulated another wave of enthusiastic students in having their Chinese music instrumental performing standards assessed. The CCOM (2005) reported that there were already 840 students who have taken the practical examinations for Chinese music instruments first held in that year. The number of entry rose to 1986, more than double the 2004-2005 entries (HKEAA, 2005a). The number of candidates again is much higher than the HKCEE and AL music examinations implying the authoritativeness of the standards denote by the new examination body. There are other similar graded music examinations setting up lately in Hong Kong and the standards established are challenging those established by the local government body.

Compatible Forms of Standards-Based Assessment in Music Performance
Music contests and festivals as other forms of assessment (Colwell, 2006) are compatible to the standards-based music assessment. In the local setting, the most prominent one is the Hong Kong Schools Music Festival which is of a competitive nature. The Festival, a series of competitions, assesses individuals and groups in solo and ensemble, vocal and instrumental performance of classical, contemporary, folk, western or Chinese music of various grade levels. Held annually since 1949, the repertoire is recommended by professional musicians and the performances are adjudicated by local as well as overseas experts in the field. External adjudicator has been invited since 1954 and the standards are well recognized by schools (HKSMSA, 2006). Since school choirs, instrumental groups (such as orchestras, bands, and recorder ensembles) can participate in the Festival in addition to solo instrumentalists and vocalist, the number of student participants is enormous. An estimated total of 93,300 participants in 1997 was recorded (HKSMSA, 2006). Competition is great and certifications of student performances in certain high levels from this Festival represent reputable standards, especially for the champions.

Referencing to Renowned Standards-Based Music Assessment Practices
In setting up standards-based assessments in music, referencing to renowned performance assessment practices is necessary to draw parallels in performing standards. An analysis of the content standards and performance standards of selected music examination bodies could shed light on the development of local standards for music performing in school context. The selected examination bodies analysed here are: the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM), the Australian Music Examinations Board (AMEB), the Central Conservatory of Music (CCOM) of Beijing, the Royal Conservatory of Music (RCM, 2005) of Toronto, the Shanghai Music Conservatory (SHMC), and Trinity College London (TCL). They award widely recognized certificates for various music instruments (western instruments and/or Chinese instruments) and voices, solo or ensemble. Common domains of learning to be assessed in these selected standards-based music examination practices are: extensive repertoire for different difficulty levels showcasing a range of styles and periods, technical work, sight reading/singing,
aural sensitivity to certain music elements or performance nuances, and, musical understanding of the repertoire (in the form of program notes presentation or by viva voce, that is oral examination) (Figure 14.1). The domains of learning for assessment in these performance examinations are not limited to music performance only but also to relevant musicianship and music literacy.

Figure 14.1 Domains of learning to be assessed in selected standards-based music examination practices

It is observed that there are sophisticated differences in the setting of performance standards in these examinations. The number of grade levels varied and so are the categories of examinations. There could be eight levels of grades (ABRSM, AMEB, Trinity), nine grades (CCOM, SHMC – vocal), and 10 grades (RCM, SHMC - instrumental). Some offer diploma and/or even higher levels such as performer’s certificate, associate (A), licentiate (L), or fellowship (F) status (Table 14.1). The awards are named more commonly as Distinction, Merit, Pass, Failure or Below Pass, and less as First Class Honours with or without Distinction, Honours, Pass or Failure.

Whereas, most of the vocal examinations provide the option for candidates to enter a grade for assessment of their standards, the vocal assessments of SHMC allow singers to enter one of the three levels of examination (elementary level: grades 1-3, intermediate level: grades 4-6, advanced level: grades 7-9). The exact grade is to be determined by the examiner after hearing the performance. Since the examinee does not need to decide the grade of examination but a general level, the pressure is minimized. Besides, the examiner is more authoritative in deciding the grade level, the standard of the candidate’s performance. While singing in SHMC may be examined in the categories of bel canto, ethnic or pop styles, the ABRSM allows candidates to select a song of an ethnic nature, and RCM includes a popular selection list which may have songs in pop styles for examinations.

Ensemble examinations and some special categories of examinations are offered by some of the music institutions. TCL offers ensemble examinations for many different combinations of ensemble examinations including vocal and/or instrumental music, while ABRSM distinguishes choral singing from instrumental ensembles (with the most likely possibilities listed from duets to quintets), and AMEB examines ensemble performance according to brass, percussion, strings and woodwind categories. Special categories such as Jazz (solo instrumental and ensemble playing) are offered by ABRSM. Similarly, Jazz could be included in the Contemporary Popular Music category of AMEB and the Popular Selection List of RCM.
Assessment contents for all of these examinations are mostly prescribed, and some allow free choice for a small section of the examinations. The information about prescribed pieces or free choice is published, and some institutions have it posted on their web-sites for public access through the Internet. Apart from the clear listing of repertoire for relevant grade levels, all includes technical work (such as scales and arpeggios) or studies, sample copies of sight reading pieces, in addition to sample tests for aural sensitivity. Some of the examinations allow candidates to select pieces outside of the prescribed lists (AMEB; SHMC; TCL) (Table 14.2).

The content standards presented in the form of examination syllabuses may not be a complete curriculum of learning but they provide guidelines for reference to learning. As the Chief Examiner of ABRSM Clara Taylor (2001) said, “whilst nothing focuses all round practice

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>Grades 1-8</td>
<td>Grads 1-8</td>
<td>Grades 1-9</td>
<td>Grades 1-9</td>
<td>Grades 1-9</td>
<td>Grades 1-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LRSM</td>
<td></td>
<td>AMusA</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Performer’s Certificate</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Performer’s Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRSM</td>
<td></td>
<td>LMusA</td>
<td></td>
<td>ARCT</td>
<td></td>
<td>ARCT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Grades 1-10</td>
<td></td>
<td>Grades 1-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Vocal)</td>
<td></td>
<td>(Instrumental)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grading of Awards</th>
<th>Distinction (not for FRSM)</th>
<th>Merit (for Grades 1-8)</th>
<th>Pass</th>
<th>Below Pass</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High Distinction, Honour</td>
<td>Credit, Satisfaction, Not Satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Merit, - Pass, - Failure</td>
<td>- 1st class, Honours w/Distinction, - 1st class, Honours, - Pass</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Merit, - Pass, - Failure</td>
<td>- 1st class, Honours w/Distinction, - 1st class, Honours, - Pass</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Distinction, - Merit, - Pass, - Below Pass, - Not Satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Solo Exams (Vocal or Instrumental)</th>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Chinese &amp; Western</th>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Chinese &amp; Western</th>
<th>Western</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brass, Mixed Ensemble, Percussion, Strings and Woodwind (Level 1 (Grades 1-4), Level 2 (Grades 5-8) &amp; Level 3 (AMusA and LMusA))</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>Many combinations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ensemble Exams (Vocal or Instrumental)</th>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Chinese &amp; Western</th>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Chinese &amp; Western</th>
<th>Western</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Choral Singing (Initial, Intermediate &amp; Advanced)</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>Many combinations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brass, Mixed Ensemble, Percussion, Strings and Woodwind (Level 1 (Grades 1-4), Level 2 (Grades 5-8) &amp; Level 3 (AMusA and LMusA))</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>Many combinations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Special category of Exams</th>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Chinese &amp; Western</th>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Chinese &amp; Western</th>
<th>Western</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jazz (solo instrument)</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jazz Ensembles</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contemporary Popular Music use of digital pianos for examination for the Piano Syllabus (with models specified)</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Popular selection list</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Accordion</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Electric piano (model of instruments specified)</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- For vocal class: bel canto, pop, ethnic, or classes</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assessment</th>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Chinese &amp; Western</th>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Chinese &amp; Western</th>
<th>Western</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jazz (solo instrument)</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jazz Ensembles</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contemporary Popular Music use of digital pianos for examination for the Piano Syllabus (with models specified)</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Popular selection list</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Accordion</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Electric piano (model of instruments specified)</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- For vocal class: bel canto, pop, ethnic, or classes</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td>- Nil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Establishing Standards-based Assessment 145
as effectively as an examination, it is the progress made during this preparation period that really matters. Examination syllabuses are not intended to provide a complete curriculum or choice of repertoire to the exclusion of all other music” (p. 6). Always, examinations offer “a measure of personal progress and attainment against internationally recognized benchmarks” (p. 6). Amongst the content standards exhibited in the different assessment systems, there are similarities in the listings of repertoire (pieces that may be considered standard repertoire) although the placing of individual music pieces might vary since the numbers of grade levels are not the same. Taking into consideration also of the types of music instruments involved in relation to the different numbers of grade levels, the setting of content standards is an enormous project. The variation in content standards in the form of examination syllabuses is inevitable.

**Table 14.2** Content standards (including repertoires) information of selected music performance examinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Technical work</td>
<td>Prescribed (for Grades 1 – 8 only)</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
<td>Prescribed (May take keyboard musicianship as alternative)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Prepared repertoire</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
<td>Prescribed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Sight reading</td>
<td>Samples published</td>
<td>Samples published</td>
<td>Samples published (include rhythm reading and sight singing)</td>
<td>Samples published</td>
<td>Samples published</td>
<td>Detailed information &amp; Samples provided</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Aural sensitivity</td>
<td>Samples published</td>
<td>Samples published</td>
<td>Samples published</td>
<td>Samples published</td>
<td>Samples published</td>
<td>Detailed information &amp; Samples published</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Viva voce (Oral presentation)</td>
<td>Questions related to music (for Diploma/LRSM/FRSM)</td>
<td>Questions related to music</td>
<td>Questions related to music</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Questions related to music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Others</td>
<td>- May select own traditional song for voice - May include self selected piece for diploma or above levels - Free choice of repertoire for choral singing - Extra list selection by self</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>May include self selected piece for some instruments</td>
<td>May include self selected pieces or own composition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The presentation of performance standards vary in details. Some music examinations publish the information in great detail on their web-sites (ABRSM; TCL) for individual instruments and even
for individual grades. Others are more general in nature pertaining to either the specific instrument/voice across different grade levels (CCOM, SHMC). Standards as specific as, for example, metronome marks of playing technical works in various grades (see Appendix 1) are indicated by ABRSM and TCL making it explicitly clear what their standards mean. Generally, students performing music of a certain grade are expected to achieve the standards of the prescribed dimensions of knowledge, skills and music understanding. Students attaining a higher level certificate are assumed to have achieved the standards achieved in the lower levels. The mechanism provides generally unambiguous information about what standards the students accomplished and how good they are in those levels.

The setting of performance standards seems to involve less complication upon analyzing and comparing the information published by the assessment bodies (Table 14.3). Even for other assessment systems which show differentiations in performance standards for individual instruments, most of the standards indicators are similar in wording (see information in CCOM, 2005; SHCM, 2006; TCM, 2005). There is slight nuance in the use of words to pinpoint the differences in nature regarding performing specific instruments. As such, an all-in-one set of performance standard for assessing performing music is discerned.

Table 14.3 Performance standards information of selected music performance examinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Technical work</td>
<td>Detailed</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>Detailed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e.g., Specified tempi for scales &amp; arpeggios of different grade)</td>
<td>(Web versions) &amp; some Web versions</td>
<td>(Web versions)</td>
<td>(Hard copies)</td>
<td>(Web versions)</td>
<td>(Web versions) &amp; some Web versions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Prepared repertoire</td>
<td>Detailed</td>
<td>Detailed</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>Specific</td>
<td>Specific</td>
<td>Detailed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Not specific for individual instrument or voice but for grades)</td>
<td>(Specific for individual instrument &amp; grades)</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>(For individual instrument but not for grades detailed for individual vocal grade)</td>
<td>Specific</td>
<td>Specific</td>
<td>(For individual instrument &amp; individual grade)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Sight reading</td>
<td>Detailed</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>Detailed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Aural sensitivity</td>
<td>Detailed</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>Detailed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Viva voce (Oral presentation)</td>
<td>(For Diploma/ LRSM/FRSM only)</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>Detailed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Other requirements</td>
<td>- Play from memory encouraged</td>
<td>- Play from memory encouraged</td>
<td>- Play from memory (for age below 18)</td>
<td>- Rudiments required for Grade 5 or above</td>
<td>- For Grade 5 or above: Passed theory test or For Grade 10: Passed theory, aural &amp; sight reading test</td>
<td>- No need to pass a theory test for any grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- (Songs to be performed from memory)</td>
<td>- For Grade 6 or above: Passed theory or musicianship test</td>
<td>- For Grade 5 or above: Be able to tune the instrument by self</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Play from memory could take the place of viva voce</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REFERENCING TO REGION-BASED SCHOOL MUSIC PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT PRACTICES

Other than referencing to conservatory-style standards for music performance deliberated above, region-based school music performance assessment practices are scrutinized for setting up standards in the local context. These cover assessment practices of school music performance programs in Australia, England, and the United States. School-based assessment from various national models may be more appropriate as references for content and performance standards although not necessary better than the models deliberated so far in this chapter. In drawing parallels to the content and performance standards of these practices, local standards could better justify equivalence in international status.

For Australia, music performance courses are available for students (Watson & Forrest, 2004) up to Year 12 as compulsory or elective music curricula. In schools, there are instrumental and studio music teachers who help to prepare students for solo or group performance courses. The courses are named variously in different states: such as Performing in Australia Capital Territory; as Music 1, Music 2, and Music Extension in New South Wales; as Music, Music Extension (Performance) Solo, and Music Extension (Performance) Ensemble in Queensland; as Ensemble Performance, Performance Special Study, and Solo Performance in South Australia (SSABSA, 2005); as Music Performance (Solo) and Music Performance (Group) in Victoria. The assessments are either external or school-based and assessment criteria are set by individual states presenting variations from state to state. Reflected in the criteria are performance standards generally required for solo or ensemble music performance. For some of the states (the Tasmanian Secondary Assessment Board, 2005; VCAA, 2005) the music performance programs are shown to be well-developed in the education system and significant information on performance standards are found. There are also clear content standards and listings of repertoire are accessible on the web. Watson and Forrest (2004) reported and suggested that performance standards are better guaranteed when instrumental and studio music teachers are co-ordinated with the classroom music teachers.

For England, music performance in the National Curriculum is included in Key Stages 1, 2 and 3 as one of the four domains of study. It is stated generally as “Controlling sounds through singing and playing – performing skills” (The Qualifications and Curriculum Authority, England, 2004). In Key Stage 4, it is optional. Students have the choice to take music performance, and obtain an approved qualification from the General Certificate of Education Examinations (GCE) and the International General Certificate of Education Examinations (IGCSE) which has long been known to set widely recognized performance standards (CIE, 2005). Both solo and ensemble music performance are incorporated in addition to a viva voce. Backing tracks are permitted for displaying ensemble skills and “teachers / parents / friends are very welcome to be present during the performances (with the consent of the performer” (Guy, 2005, p. 13). Transparency of the assessment process and performance standards is obvious. There is no
specific content standard and the choice of music performed “varied in style, content and range of difficulty” (p. 14). Classical pieces, popular works including music for stage and screen are featured in the performance assessments. The assessment criteria showed the generally required performance standards regarding fluency and accuracy, technical control, realization of performance markings and/or performing conventions, aural awareness, and stylistic understanding (Appendix 2) in details.

The National Standards of USA which were set in 1996 (Lindeman, 2003) include performance standards for music performing. Two of the overarching National Standards for music education in the general sense are “Singing, alone and with others, a varied repertoire of music” and “Performing on instruments, alone and with others, a varied repertoire of music” (MENC, 2006, National Standards for Music Education section). The national association for music education, the Music Educators National Conference (MENC, 1996) Committee on Performance Standards further elaborates these National Standards for grades PreK-12. The performance standards are set in three levels: basic, proficient, and advanced. In each grade, every student should be able to achieve the proficient level. Basic level is set to distinguish those who attained the proficient level upon reasonable teaching and those whose achievements are unacceptable. Advanced level indicates achievements of students who are exceptionally talented or have spent much extra time to reach the goals. A student should have attained the standards indicated in the previous level(s) before the achievement standards in the next level. If only some of the criteria in an upper level are met, the student is still not considered to have attained that level but a lower one until all the criteria are met. Benchmarks are shown (MENC Committee on Performance Standards, 1996) for reference in conducting school-based assessment of students’ singing or instrumental performances in different grade levels, in solo or ensemble style. These benchmarks are samples of performing standards but content standards are not provided. There are no set works or lists of repertoire (standard pieces) that soloists or ensemble players have to follow or be able to perform.

ISSUES AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ESTABLISHING STANDARDS-BASED ASSESSMENT IN MUSIC PERFORMANCE

The scrutiny of the present situation related to standards-based assessment in music performing in local environment revealed a dominance of non-local based assessment practices. Students taking non-local based standards assessment much out-numbered the music examinations designed by the local examination authority. From the analysis of what standards are (which comprise of content standards as well as performance standards), the attraction of non-local music examination bodies are found in presenting clear and detailed content standards especially regarding repertoire and technical works for individual instruments (including voice) and grade levels. While content standards include clear listings of repertoire for specific grade levels and specific instruments, there are also other content standards comprising technical works, sight reading, and aural sensitivity. Some assessment of content standards further take into account students’ musical understanding as reflected through a viva voce or a submitted program notes. For performance standards, there are non-local examination bodies which post up standards applicable to different instruments and grade levels in a general sense; while for others, more sophistication are found and more specifically for individual instruments or even grade levels. Comparing to music performance assessment practices in school context in Australia, England and USA, performance standards similar to those set by non-local music examination bodies are presented rather than content standards in most cases. Benchmarks, however, are put forth for reference in many school environments. Similar practice could be applied in Hong Kong school context, that is, establishment of performance standards and benchmarks, not necessarily content standards in the short run.
In the long run, the establishment of standards-based assessment for performing music in local context could be an enormous project for the government. The work may include setting of not only performance standards but content standards for individual instruments and individual grade levels in addition to ensemble performances, and benchmarking of all these music performances. There is also the work of deciding and setting the different levels of standards. A large amount of expertise, from professional musicians and music teachers may need to be called upon to engage in the work. Coupled with this work is the issue of nurturing quality instrumental and studio music teachers to provide quality teaching. Teacher education institutions would need to attend to this matter. Furthermore, to better monitor teaching standards, it is recommended that a policy requiring the registration of instrumental and studio music teachers with the Education Department is necessary in establishing standards-based assessment in music performance.

Associated with the establishment of standards-based assessment in solo and ensemble music performance is the requirement of a systematic music performance program to be set up, possibly from primary till senior secondary school level. The Education Department would need to consider proposing and supporting a proper music performance program in the school curriculum since general class music is not in a good position to foster standards in music performing. In this connection, England has already taken the initiative, “the Education secretary underlined the right of every primary pupil to learn a musical instrument. There will be new money to fund the buying and repairing of musical instruments for children and part-supporting professional developments for teachers” (DfES, 2007). The attainment of substantial music performing standards appropriately is a long and gradual process. In establishing standards-based assessment to promote assessment for learning, sequential learning and teaching according to clear content and performance standards in school environment is recommended.

To conclude, it must be emphasized that policy makers in directing a shift to standards-based assessment in music performance need to be careful in the establishing, referencing and benchmarking of standards while attending to local situations regarding public recognitions of music performance standards. Non-local music examination bodies with the conservatory-styles standards may have their attraction and public recognition due to their national or international status, but the local education department might need to note the actual standards, and attend to the exam-oriented situation of increasing numbers of students taking these graded music examinations to prove their standards. In the process of establishing standards-based assessment for music performance in the local school context, adapting and adopting of foreign systems could be an alternative, but to build up local standards with public support and recognition would be of more value. Concisely, to push through standards-based assessment needs content or performance standards with local characteristics to be followed by measures of proper implementation in school environment and monitoring of teaching to ensure quality learning.

REFERENCE


Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (HKEAA). (2005a). Other exams: Entries of international and professional examinations in recent years. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority.


APPENDIX 14.1 – Samples of performance standards

Tempi for scales and arpeggios (piano) (Trinity College London, 2005, p. 6)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Scales</th>
<th>Arpeggios</th>
<th>Scales in thirds</th>
<th>Scales in sixths/octaves</th>
<th>Sevenths</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Initial</td>
<td>🕋= 66</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 1</td>
<td>🕋= 68</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 2</td>
<td>🕋= 72</td>
<td>🕋= 60</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 3</td>
<td>🕋= 84</td>
<td>🕋= 72</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 4</td>
<td>🕋= 96</td>
<td>🕋= 84</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 5</td>
<td>🕋= 108</td>
<td>🕋= 90</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 6</td>
<td>🕋= 120</td>
<td>🕋= 96</td>
<td>🕋= 60</td>
<td>🕋= 120</td>
<td>🕋= 66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 7</td>
<td>🕋= 132</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>🕋= 60</td>
<td>🕋= 120</td>
<td>🕋= 72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 8</td>
<td>🕋= 132</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>🕋= 60</td>
<td>🕋= 120</td>
<td>🕋= 80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recommended minimum speeds for scales and arpeggios (piano - ABRSM) (Taylor, 2001, p. 32)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Piano</th>
<th>Scales</th>
<th>Broken chords and arpeggios</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade 1</td>
<td>🕋= 60</td>
<td>🕋= 46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 2</td>
<td>🕋= 66</td>
<td>🕋= 63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 3</td>
<td>🕋= 80</td>
<td>🕋= 69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 4</td>
<td>🕋= 52</td>
<td>🕋= 76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 5</td>
<td>🕋= 63</td>
<td>🕋= 88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 6</td>
<td>🕋= 76</td>
<td>🕋= 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 7</td>
<td>🕋= 80</td>
<td>🕋= 56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 8</td>
<td>🕋= 88</td>
<td>🕋= 66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 14.1 (cont.)

Performance standards for sight reading in singing (Trinity, 2005)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section C: Sight Reading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The main criterion for a pass mark is an even flow at the stated speed coupled with awareness of pulse and tonality. The importance of a regular pulse and sense of tonality is such that a pass mark is unlikely to be awarded if there are weaknesses in these areas. Attention to such matters as dynamics, phrasing, musical shaping and confidence of delivery attracts higher marks. The following criteria are used:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Distinction</th>
<th>Fluent and persuasive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alert to details of phrasing/articulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dynamics implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Musically perceptive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Merit | Generally accurate |
|       | Consistent and appropriate tempo |
|       | Some details of phrasing/articulation and dynamics |

| Pass | Adequate continuity, lacking details of musical interpretation |
|      | Reasonably consistent pulse, if tempo perhaps cautious |
|      | Correct awareness of tonality |
|      | Note values and pitches substantially correct |

| Below Pass 1 | Hesitations, stumbles and/or resumptions |
|              | Tonality not observed |

| Below Pass 2 | No sense of tempo, tonality or pulse |
|              | Evident guesswork |
APPENDIX 14.2

GCE Advanced Music Performing Assessment Criteria (University of Cambridge International Examinations, 2005, p. 20-21)

**Assessment Criteria**

**A  Fluency and accuracy (of pitch and rhythm)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17-20</td>
<td>Wholly accurate in notes and rhythms and completely fluent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-16</td>
<td>Almost wholly accurate; some slips but not enough to disturb the basic fluency of the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-12</td>
<td>Accurate in most respects but with a number of mistakes which disturb the fluency in some parts of the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-8</td>
<td>Basically accurate but hesitant to the point of impairing the fluency of more than one item in the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-4</td>
<td>Accurate only in parts, with persistent hesitancy, showing little fluency throughout most of the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>All items marred by persistent inaccuracies and hesitancies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**B  Technical control**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17-20</td>
<td>Very secure technical control in every respect across a wide range of techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-16</td>
<td>Mainly secure technical control in all significant respects across a fairly wide range of techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-12</td>
<td>Moderately secure technical control, with minor problems in some areas, across an adequate range of techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-8</td>
<td>Sometimes erratic technical control with significant problems in some areas, across a narrow range of techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-4</td>
<td>Poor technical control with significant problems in several areas, across a very limited range of techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>No technical control at any point</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**C  Realisation of performance markings and/or performing conventions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17-20</td>
<td>All markings of tempo, expression, articulation and phrasing convincingly realised and/or appropriate performing conventions applied throughout the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-16</td>
<td>Most markings of tempo, expression, articulation and phrasing convincingly realised and/or appropriate performing conventions applied throughout the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-12</td>
<td>Some markings of tempo, expression, articulation and phrasing convincingly realised and/or some appropriate performing conventions applied in parts of the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-8</td>
<td>Markings of tempo, expression, articulation and phrasing realised in a few passages and/or appropriate performing conventions applied in a few passages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-4</td>
<td>Very few markings of tempo, expression, articulation and phrasing are observed and/or very few appropriate performing conventions attempted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Markings and/or performing conventions wholly ignored</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### D  Aural awareness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17 - 20</td>
<td>Acute aural awareness is demonstrated throughout the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 - 16</td>
<td>Good aural awareness is demonstrated throughout the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 - 12</td>
<td>Fairly good aural awareness is demonstrated throughout most of the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 8</td>
<td>Some aural awareness is demonstrated in some of the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - 4</td>
<td>A little aural awareness is demonstrated in only a few parts of the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>No aural awareness is demonstrated</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### E  Stylistic understanding

The depth of the candidate’s understanding of the stylistic demands demonstrated in the programme as a whole will be assessed. The relevance of the spoken introduction and the extent to which its content is reflected in the performance will be taken into account.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17 - 20</td>
<td>A well-developed, coherent understanding of the chosen stylistic focus is communicated in a wholly convincing performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 - 16</td>
<td>A fairly well-developed, coherent understanding of the chosen stylistic focus is communicated in a mostly convincing performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 - 12</td>
<td>A moderate understanding of the chosen stylistic focus is communicated in a competent performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 8</td>
<td>Some understanding of a style is communicated in a limited performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - 4</td>
<td>Little understanding of style is communicated in any part of the performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>No understanding of style is communicated</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 14.3

Samples of criteria for assessment of music performing in Australia (Table 2 & 6) (Watson & Forrest, 2005)

**Table 2  New South Wales**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Music 1 and Music 2</th>
<th>Music Extension</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Candidates assessed on their musical effectiveness through:</td>
<td>Candidates assessed on their musical effectiveness through:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstration of technical skills</td>
<td>Musical sophistication and sensitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stylistic interpretation of the chosen repertoire</td>
<td>Demonstration of technical skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of musical expression and sensitivity to the chosen repertoire</td>
<td>Stylistic interpretation of the chosen repertoire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstration of solo and/or ensemble techniques</td>
<td>Sense of personal expression and personal interpretation of the chosen repertoire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understanding of solo and/or ensemble techniques</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(HSC Marking Guidelines, Music 1 p. 2; Music 2 p. 2; Music Extension p. 2)

**Table 6  Victoria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Music Performance: Solo</th>
<th>Music Performance: Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The extent to which the solo performance of the prescribed program demonstrates:</td>
<td>The extent to which the performance in the group demonstrates:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. compliance with the requirements of the task</td>
<td>1. compliance with the requirements of the task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. accuracy in performance of the program of works as notated</td>
<td>2. skill in using performance techniques accurately</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. characteristic tone and artistic variation of tone</td>
<td>3. skill in using performance techniques with control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. fluency, in performance of a range of performance techniques, and in performance of the program of notated works</td>
<td>4. skill in using a range of performing techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. control in performance using contrast, as appropriate to the styles, of expressive elements</td>
<td>5. skill in producing a range of tonal qualities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. differentiation of the parts of the structures and characteristics of the works in the program</td>
<td>6. skill in articulating and phrasing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. differentiation of the main musical idea and accompaniment</td>
<td>7. understanding of a range of styles through historical and/or conventional interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. skill in historical interpretation of a range of styles</td>
<td>8. skill in performing with musicality through creativity and individuality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. skill in contemporary conventions in interpretation in performance</td>
<td>9. skill in placing the instrument (or voice) appropriately within the group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. skill in personal interpretation</td>
<td>10. skill in performing as a member of the group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. presentation techniques appropriate to the style/s represented in the work/s and conventions of performance</td>
<td>11. skill in the presentation of a program of music from a range of styles</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 15

Reflections on Issues Related to Assessment and Creativity,
and Music Education Policies in the United States

Cecilia Chu WANG

REFLECTIONS ON ISSUES RELATED TO ASSESSMENT

The Chapters in Part Three titled “Creativity and Assessment” collectively address the two topics that might be considered among the most important issues in music education today. These issues are not new, many teachers have taken for granted that music is somehow linked to creativity, and under that perception these teachers have been assigning grades to their music students. However, it is only within the last decade or so when accountability became the basis for funding, and research-based instruction is required of the teachers, that accurate assessment becomes crucial. We have witnessed education reform taking shape in the last ten years. Instruction became student-centered rather than teacher-centered or curriculum-driven. We recognize that students are unique individuals, that they learn with different modalities, and that they progress at different rates and in different directions. We look at them in terms of profiles of multi intelligences, rather than as measures of specific abilities in language and math. We realize that students learn best when they are comfortable in their social environment, and that lessons are meaningful to them personally. We now understand that it is far better to help students to think creatively and critically, to reflect and be responsible for their own learning, rather than to give them extensive facts by rote. We no longer demand minimum competencies from our students, but attempt to guide them to their full potential. We provide standards for them as learning expectations. To accommodate all these facets of the individual learner, single knowledge tests are no longer adequate to indicate educational outcomes. Multiple assessment tools must be designed for specific students, in specific environments, and for specific domains overtime. These assessment results are designed to provide feedback to students for self-reflection, to teachers to improve instruction, and for administrators to evaluate program effectiveness and definitely for funding decisions. These chapters reflect the current education climate in several countries and exemplify how these music educators attempt to lead music education towards the right direction. My attempt here is to point out the important highlights of these chapters. As the last part of this text, I will take the liberty to present my views related to these issues here in the United States of America where I have been a music educator for thirty years.

Creativity in the Last Hundred Years

Chapter nine, Policy and music education: A “new” culture of “creativity”, presents an excellent synopsis of different popular viewpoints of “Creativity” in the last 100 years, many of them deemed important by educators. In general, creativity could be viewed as a process or as a product. The process of creativity can be that of divergent thinking, or a more complex process involving awareness, originality, fluency, flexibility, and commitment. The process could imply problem solving in a linear fashion along the problem-incubation-illumination-verification route; or it could involve a more complex combination of convergent and divergent thinking. The creative style could be one of measured, problem solving, or that of emotional and free expression. Note that creativity has been viewed as a normal trait shared by all individuals only after the mid-twentieth century! Along with the advance of sciences, creativity was to be evaluated by observable measures. For example, divergent thinking can be measured by “how
many ways”, “how many different ways”, “how unique”, and other types of counts one can perform. The products of creativity can be evaluated for quality, quantity, uniqueness, newness, and other ways. Modern technology now measures the level and locations of brain activity of people identified as more creative or less creative. The variety of measures of creativity reminds us that our understanding of creativity is far from being complete. With so many definitions and views of creativity, putting research findings in practical teaching is certainly a daunting task.

Jeanneret and Forrest are successful in making us aware of a current trend where scientists and industrial leaders exert tremendous social influence by “equating” creativity with problem-solving skills. They want workers who can find problems where others do not, solve them in alternative and innovative ways, resulting in more efficiency and quality products, and therefore prosperity. Since they are the people who drive the economy, creativity must now be recognized as an all-important skill that educators must pay attention to develop in schools. Now that policy makers in Australia have taken a step in the right direction in officially including the development of creativity across disciplines in the Curriculum and Standards Framework, it is time to shift the attention to designing music pedagogy as well as appropriate assessment strategies. At the same time, music educators also must recognize that “creativity” means different things to different people and one must respect the diversity.

Music Creativity Education in Hong Kong
Chapter ten, The impact of music education policy on creative music-making in the school music curriculum, provides a good example of how music educators in Hong Kong took leadership in guiding and negotiating the transition of policies into the new era when creativity is first recognized as an important ingredient of the school curriculum, including the curriculum for the arts and therefore music. One strong point of the new policy is that it has a built-in timeline for specific short-term, medium-term, and long-term goals for steps in the curriculum change. Often, education policies are made in a top-down fashion such that new mandates are enforced without consideration, or without adequate time given for professional training for teachers. In this case, the music educators underscored the importance of this teacher-preparation phase by conducting an actual research study to collect empirical data to indicate the results of their effort. Furthermore, the planning of the procedure as well as music teaching-learning strategies were carefully carried out over a whole academic year. Nothing is more powerful than having real data to show policy makers the degree of success of curriculum implementation.

The Hong Kong Institute of Education has taken a significant and positive role to effect school curriculum change by being proactive in preparing future music teachers. This institution provides knowledge and maximizes opportunities for pre-service teachers to experience creative activities in various courses in the degree program. Apart from an increase in proportion of study related to creativity to the total requirements, students also have the freedom to choose courses in a variety of arts disciplines having modules in creativity. Furthermore, to motivate students to acquire more knowledge and experience in creativity, the institution provides incentives such as Artistic Excellence Award in composition, workshops, and invited lectures for their students. In addition, the faculty collaborates regularly with other arts agencies in the government and in the community. These innovative ways serve to inspire not only their students, but also educators everywhere!

In the last part of the chapter, Cheung-Yung, Cham-Lai and Mak presented a composer’s insights gathered through innovations and experiences in promoting creative music making. Here the key factors involving the development of children’s music creativity are discussed. These factors are universal and can be adapted to all music education situations. In addition, the authors also pointed out aspects that are cultural-specific, such as the influence of Cantonese popular music on the composition of children in Hong Kong. Indeed, one’s own cultural environment exerts enormous force on one’s musical preference and taste. It is logical to assume that
including the study of world musics in the curriculum will enable students to appreciate diverse cultural ideas and consequently serves to promote creativity as well.

Two other issues of importance were also addressed in this chapter. First is how creative products by students can be appraised. It is crucial to give feedback to students in their creative journey. It is also crucial for teachers to be able to evaluate student products while they interact with students. Teachers must practice this circular teaching-learning-feedback sequence regularly in their daily teaching. Thus, the authors’ suggestion to provide teachers with assessment tools for the creative process and product is a most valid one. Second is that teachers should be able to model what they are teaching. The Pulse with You project serves as a concrete example of the type of workshops that need to happen regularly to offer in-service teachers new techniques and ideas in developing children’s creativity in music. The chapter presents a wealth of valuable observations and tips for music educators.

Information and Communication Technology in Music Education

Chapter eleven, Policy to practice: Support for secondary music teachers implementing mandatory ICT requirements in NSW government schools, gives an account of how educational agencies in New South Wales, Australia have supported secondary music teachers in the implementation of technology in the last twenty years. Computer technology is here to stay. During this period, both software and hardware have been developing at a fast pace. Beginning in the early eighties, educators realized that knowledge in using technology is important for both in-service and pre-service teachers and the educational policy statements presented here definitely trace the refinement of such from broad objectives to detailed requirements. Many of the trials and tribulations mentioned here seem to be universal for teachers in other places as well. A demand to learn new technologies takes music teachers out of their comfort zone. Music teachers are busy enough with what they are already doing, and the school may not have the proper equipment or software. Thus the hands-on workshops, the partnership with industry and universities, and other forms of support become crucial for its success. The “music coaching” model is most relevant as its focus is on pedagogy rather than technology itself. While technology to compose and notate music has been around for many years, it is only during the last ten years that it has become practical for classroom music teaching. Apart from decreased cost and increased hardware capabilities, it took time to develop music software that is pedagogically sound, attractive to students, user-friendly, and age appropriate.

Montague is to be commended by citing statistics and evaluations by teachers to show the effectiveness of these technology workshops. Such figures serve as indicators that progress is being made in specific areas in the technology implementation process at the instructional level. This process is not complete until we have results of learner outcomes at the student level. It would be most interesting to know how these teacher workshops translate into student skills in using music technology in follow-up research. As more teachers become skilled in music technology, I hope that they will become more engaged in designing the next generation of music software for instructional use. Furthermore, I hope that they will mentor pre-service music teachers to integrate music technology in designing lessons so that they will begin their teaching career already skilled in using technology creatively in music classes.

Soundscape Education in Japan

I see the main mission of chapter twelve, Soundscape, postcolonialism and music education: Experiencing the earliest grain of the body and music, is to raise the conscience of music educators by making them aware that music is universal by itself. Human beings are capable to hearing sounds and producing designs in sounds we call music. How one perceives and interprets what one hears and how one manipulates sound materials for specific meanings and emotions depends on the cultural context. In over a century, western music has dominated music education in many parts of the world. Western music and western-style music education were deemed
superior and served as a model to many non-western countries. No one can dispute that western music has a long history of development, that it is the subject of research by many scholars, that it has the most studied harmony, and that it comprises of enormous amount of repertoire in many genres. On the other hand, non-Western music can be just as complex and sophisticated in their melody and rhythmic styles, not to mention its significance in cultural history and its functions for society and man. It is now time that music educators should wake up to the fact that the education of one’s indigenous music should not be ignored in the school music curriculum. Every child should have an opportunity to learn about and participate in the music of his/her own heritage. The school curriculum is the best place to provide this knowledge systematically while music educators should promote appreciation and music making of folk and traditional music in their own communities.

Imada suggested that the “Soundscape” design created by R. Murray Schafer may present a way for students in any culture to realize the deeper meaning of music. This design is rather abstract in nature, and like meditation, one does not know it until one has experienced it. The readers should read Murray’s writing for their own understanding. In this design, the learner is responsible for his own learning, first by wanting to learn about music by discovery, then by integrating all he hears, decides the aesthetic quality of the sound, its meaning in the cultural context, and/or its effect on his emotional self, continually building and enlarging his/her own personal Soundscape. My experiences in teaching tell me that most of our students do not take responsibility for their own learning, and we have not given them enough opportunity to do so. Part of this is due to the fact that teacher-induced learning style still prevails over student exploration and discovery. This in turn happens especially if the teacher is driven to meet curriculum goals in a rigid manner, and with limited time allotted for music.

The process of developing musical sensitivity following the Soundscape design is a personal and creative process. It requires generations and regenerations of new sound combination, and arrangements, adding to the previous knowledge. Murray Schafer and John Cage are contemporaries and Cage’s aleatory music is akin to experimentation and discovery of sound materials. Both have inspired music educators in providing ideas for creative activities in the music classroom. The use of graphics to represent music one hears or one produces allow students to create freely without the hindrance of musical notation, and provides a more direct link between the inner feeling of sound and the outer manifestation of it.

Imada concluded the chapter by reiterating that change in music education is needed from the pure western emphasis to embody the culture of his country Japan. The Soundscape design offers a way to provide Japanese-style music education. This sentiment that music education should embody national identity is in agreement by music educators in many other Asian countries as well. I only wish that the author had enlightened us with lesson examples designed to guide students towards the Soundscape.

Assessment for Learning in New South Wales
Chapter thirteen, Assessment for learning in the New South Wales Music Years 7-10 syllabus: An approach to promote best practice, presents a model to implement a newly developed curriculum based on the philosophy of “assessment for learning” in New South Wales, Australia. McPherson provided a discussion section on the background of “formative assessment” and “assessment for learning” as a backdrop to the current policy. He then introduced how this philosophy forms the framework for educators in New South Wales. Specifically, the Board of Studies identified six key assessment principles (APs) deemed to promote best practices in schools. These APs emphasize student-centered learning using continuous assessment and with the learning outcomes at the core. This model is supposed to be self-corrective, providing evidence and feedback to both students and teachers for ongoing improvement in teaching and learning. Furthermore, the evidences are being evaluated for its effectiveness in terms of amount, quality, as well as student progress. Quality feedback is of paramount importance in this approach and
Reflections on Issues Related to Assessment and Creativity

Thus much emphasis is given to self-assessment and peer assessment as well. Having such a good assessment practice in the education policy, it is up to the leading music educators to assist music teachers to implement this. Here, I think they have done a marvelous job.

*Music Years 7 – 10 Syllabus Advice on Programming and Assessment* published in 2004 is a terrific tool for several reasons. First, along with the curriculum items and assessment notes, sample units are provided for teachers to indicate the incorporation of best practices. Second, the teachers are given the flexibility to choose and adapt materials for their own classrooms. Third, the teachers are given step-by-step task lists for designing their own lesson unit and checklist for assessment strategies. Finally, these samples are adequately detailed in describing the activity, learning outcomes, scoring rubrics, recommended feedback content, and future directions. Furthermore, teachers have available to them in a CD-ROM format actual audio and video clips of student work, and with annotation indicating appropriate assessment of them. This is a great example of using multi-media technology for effective teacher training, by using authentic examples of actual music activities and related quality feedback. Even teachers learn well by following good models! Looking towards the future, the Board of Studies launched the Assessment Resource Centre (ARC) website in 2006, to be used as a “clearing house” for assessment items. Based on a sound philosophy, with careful planning and genuine support for music teachers, the implementation of the new curriculum is off to a great start.

**Standards for Music Performance**

In chapter fourteen, *Establishing standards-based assessment in music performance*, Yip examined and scrutinized standards for music performance in various countries. After some in-depth look at the various facets of the available models, the author concluded that it would be best for the local education authorities in Hong Kong to establish their own standards and benchmark. The spirit and effort of first researching the music standards used in other countries, evaluating well-established guidelines, and maintaining objectivity is very admirable. It is also beneficial to find out what good practices exist elsewhere so one can adapt as needed without reinventing the wheel. However, it is more important that the learner expectations and their assessment fit the students’ cultural context. Hong Kong has been a British Colony for many years until 1997 when it became a Special Administrative Region of China, thus it is natural that some British ways continue to affect the citizens. During the British years, students in the schools were taught mainly western music. Even though many expert musicians of Chinese music settled in Hong Kong, Chinese music has not flourished in schools. With the current emphasis of both western and Chinese cultures in the school music, it is necessary to establish new standards to reflect the new curriculum. It is thus most appropriate to include music standards from China among other western countries in this project.

Hong Kong has always been in the forefront in international trades and technology, and her people welcome diversity and progress. Thus, when the need arises to set up new music performance standards, music educators in Hong Kong hope to profit from existing guiding principles in countries with reputable music education programs. They also observe that individual music performance for children primarily takes place outside the school environment and many of these students sign up for graded certificate exams of the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music. In addition, only in the last few years, students performing on Chinese musical instruments entered the graded exams of the Central Conservatory of Music of Beijing in great numbers. For assessment of performing groups as well as individual performers, the annual Hong Kong Schools Music Festival has enjoyed much popularity. This festival started in 1949 and has been very successful over the years, the judges being professional musicians from both Hong Kong and overseas. Yip took these evidences to indicate that there is a great demand for standards-based music assessments by performers in Hong Kong.

The task then was to research on existing reputable standards elsewhere and to analyze and compare the contents. Six examination bodies were chosen for inspection in this project and
these are held in high regard in the field. This representation reflects Hong Kong’s musical links to the British Commonwealth and to China. The tables and charts are very useful in highlighting the content standards and the performance standards. Furthermore, they allow the readers to view and compare the content of all examination bodies at a glance. Realizing that the standards discussed above were based on conservatories, Yip proceeded to address regional standards for school systems from Australia, England, and the United States. In the end, the author was convinced that the Hong Kong government should make the effort to establish standards for music performance for its own citizens so that they would align with the expected music outcomes, cultural characteristics, and local educational environment in Hong Kong. It is also imperative that the government should aim at building local support, engage community resources, and promote the recognition of such examinations.

MUSIC EDUCATION POLICIES IN THE UNITED STATES

Now that I have shared my observations of these six chapters, each one contributing to our current trends in music education in a unique way, I would like to share my thoughts about the current status of music education in the United States. Comparing the education in other arts area, music teachers have a long history of holding their own conferences, making policies specific for the music discipline, demonstrating new teaching techniques and sharing materials for each other in the United States. The National Association for Music Education (MENC, 1994), 100 years old this year, is a self-governing organization that promotes the teaching of music at all age levels and oversees the professional development of music educators. National Association of the Schools of Music (NASM), founded 1924, is the policy-making agency that governs the standards of post-secondary schools of music. It oversees 610 accredited institutional members that offer undergraduate and graduate degrees in music. It is currently undertaking a four-year review and research project that will conclude in 2008 when new proposals and actions will be announced regarding standards.

The United States is a democratic country and teachers in all subjects have enjoyed much freedom of what and how they teach. Both MENC and NASM can be considered grass-root organizations, that is, they are powered and supported by music professionals, and not government agents. When government educational policies seem to threaten or limit the welfare of music educators, MENC lobbies for its members. On the other hand, government agencies provide support with MENC and other arts organizations when faced with a common goal. In the United States, the education reform movement started in the early 1980’s. In 1983, the publication of A Nation At Risk served as a wake-up call that only by including all subject areas in the schools that our children will be ready for the new global economy. In 1992, the National Council on Education Standards and Testing (NCEST) requested voluntary national standards for the core subjects. In 1994, the US Department of Education, the National Endowment for the Humanities, and the National Endowment for the Arts provided a grant, and joined force with MENC (on behalf of the Consortium of National Arts Education Associations) in developing the National Standards for Arts Education. The arts areas were the first “other” non-core subjects to receive funding support to develop voluntary standards. These standards are the first comprehensive educational standards for K-12 arts instruction in the United States. The passing of the legislation “Goals 2000: Educate America Act” recognized the arts as a fundamental academic subject for the first time.

The national arts standards for dance, music, theatre, and visual arts, are listed in three sections by grade level: K-4, 5-8, and 9-12, in the publication titled National Standards for Arts Education: What Every Young American Should Know and Be Able to Do in the Arts (Consortium of National Arts Education Associations, 1994). Since then, over thirty publications and CD’s were produced by MENC to explain the standards in music and to show benchmark
activities, lessons, repertoires, assessments, et cetera. for specific age levels (PreK-12) as well as performance areas in music. Included as part of the publications is the Strategies for Teaching series to help teacher implement the Music Education Standards and MENC’s Pre-kindergarten Standards. This series alone is comprised of fifteen books thus far, addressing various music areas such as band, chorus, general music, technology, orchestra, keyboard, and guitar, with each strategy pertaining to a content standard, and related achievement standard. For 9-12 grades, the rubric of achievement standards is further divided to denote “proficient”, or “advanced”. Each student is expected to take at least one year of an arts discipline and achieve the proficient level at high school graduation, whereas the advanced level pertains to students who have continued their arts study for 2-3 more years. Much information about the arts standards can be obtained online (MENC, 1994).

President Bush signed the No Child Left Behind Act of 2001 (NCLB) (United States Department of Education, n.d.) on January 8, 2002. As indicated by the US Department of Education, this new law redefines the federal government’s role in K-12 education, and is the most sweeping reform since the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965. This law mandates annual testing in each of the fifty states according to the standards set by each state as a measure of accountability as well as student achievements in reading and math in grades three through eight. The government also encourages using standardized tests and hiring “highly qualified” teachers. These annual report cards for students and of each school constitute the basis for teacher re-assignments, changing school programs, et cetera, in the quest of meeting the short-term and long-term achievement goals. An informal survey conducted by MENC in June 2005 with 1265 members responding indicated that the NCLB testing made teaching music more stressful (60%), that music should not have a high stakes test requirement (51%), and that other indicators such as the arts should be included in the student achievement profile (87%).

Whereas the current national trend in the United States is to emphasize meeting academic standards in reading, mathematics, and sciences, the importance of “educating the whole child” is not ignored. College graduates whose resumes show diverse abilities and experiences are being selected over those who only have high academic grade points for high-paying jobs. Critical thinking and problem-solving skills are valued over book knowledge by many employers and for admittance to some professional schools such as medical schools and business schools. The notion of teaching arts across the curriculum has been the band-wagon for the last two decades. Grants were available in the 1990’s for various initiatives to integrate arts into the classroom curriculum. Projects such as Disciplined-Based Arts Education, Different Ways of Knowing, Arts in Education, sprouted in various locations. The Education Commission of the States (ECS, 2007) reported that as of November 2005, 49 states (except Iowa) and the District of Columbia (DC) have established state content standards in the arts, 44 states and DC required schools to provide instruction in the arts, 36 states and DC required an arts course for high school graduation, and in 31 states and DC regular teachers must complete arts requirements for teacher certification. Kentucky was the only state to implement a state-level assessment of the arts while 8 states included district-level arts assessment. Twenty-five states have policies to support teacher professional development in the arts disciplines, this support ranges from providing artists-in-residence, to distance-learning courses for teachers, and other forms. In 17 states, state-sponsored School for the Arts are offered to talented high school students as summer programs. These graduates are intensely recruited by higher institutions for training to become professional artists. The state-by-state arts standards can be viewed online (ECS, 2007).

The Preamble of MENC: The National Association for Music Education states:

Music allows us to celebrate and preserve our cultural heritages, and also to explore the realms of expression, imagination, and creation resulting in new knowledge. Therefore, every individual should be guaranteed the opportunity to learn music and to share in musical experiences. (MENC, 2007, para. 1)
Notice that it includes the words Expression, Imagination, and Creation as well as Cultural Heritages in this statement for Every Individual. It is a powerful statement and it does reflect the tone of music teachers in the US on the whole. These words can be found in the arts standards of just about every state. Since the establishment of the national arts standards, few universities have attempted to change the curriculum to align with the national standards. Indeed, state standards are usually a variation of the national standards, perhaps with more details. Actually, it is the individual school districts and schools, governed by site-based committees of parents, teachers, and the school principal that take up the task of enforcing the standards to varying extent. In addition, there are often curriculum guidelines published for the individual districts!

How does a teacher integrate all these national and states guidelines and standards in their teaching to please the parents, the principal, and the site-based council? At the moment, most teachers will continue to teach as before, except that they now label their lesson plans with the necessary standards. In Kentucky, because state assessment is required in the arts and humanities, music teachers make sure to prepare their students for testing by providing practice tests. The testing includes authentic music assessment in music listening, improvisation, playing, singing, as well as open-ended essay items. At the same time, the core standards and assessment standards have been undergoing revision, along with other support materials such as How to Develop a Standards-Based Unit of Study (Kentucky Department of Education, 1998b). The latest version of the Assessment Standards for music, version 4.1 appeared in August of 2006 (1998b). Based on this, the learner outcomes for students in Grade 5, 8 and 11 are “scored” according to given rubrics to denote four levels of performance (Distinguished, Proficient, Apprentice, and Novice) and at five categories about Arts and Humanities (Knowledge, Application, Concepts and Vocabulary, Communication, and Critical Thinking). Many educators are beginning to realize that the results of these music tests affect the overall school score. Consequently, school councils who have put more resources for the study of language, mathematics, and sciences should rethink their priorities.

Most state Music Educators Association continue to host music festivals where the performance of music ensembles are judged by criteria and repertoires set by a committee of music educators in that state. There are also solo and ensemble days in individual school districts. In addition to state festivals, there are regional and national festivals at various sites in the US. In this manner, many school music teachers and students are very much competition-driven. On the other hand, two national organizations provide assessment opportunities where private students are evaluated on their own progress rather than ranking with other students. The Federated Music Club is a community-based organization that follows the national guidance by using the official bi-annual national repertoire list and grading criteria for various musical instrumentalists. Local music professionals are usually invited to serve as judges, and the aim is to encourage and provide feedback to music students of school age. Another more prominent outfit is that of the Piano Guild (n.d.), a division of the American College of Musicians, currently with over 118,000 pianists participating at annual international auditions held in over 800 locations throughout the U.S. and abroad. This is comparable to the graded music performance tests of the Associated Board, where students obtain detailed evaluation of their performance by a core of traveling judges.

In spite of all the standards, the classroom teachers are still the ones who dominate the actual materials covered and the style of teaching delivery. According to my observations, general music teachers who had Orff-Schulwerk training appear to be flexible, and seem to have little or no trouble adapting to the education reform and changes in policies. The Schulwerk approach fosters musical creativity in both the teacher and the student. Orff teachers integrate creative music making in teaching music concepts and students learn by getting in a habit of improvising beginning at a young age. I believe that creativity is best nurtured continuously over the entire school career, prek-12 and beyond! Creative music thinking can only be learned when
children are guided to practice critical thinking and problem solving skills on a regular basis, and in a musically-rich, comfortable, enjoyable environment that is emotionally and socially rewarding.

REFERENCES


Chapter 16

Points of Intersection and the Problems of Agency and Place in Assessment and Creativity in Music

Sandra L. STAUFFER

Diversity in education and among educators may be either a cause for celebration or a matter of consternation, depending on one’s perspective as policy maker, practitioner, parent, student, or citizen. The themes of the chapters in this section of *Music Education Policy and Implementation: International Perspectives* direct readers to matters that are central in contemporary education discourse and about which considerable diversity of policy, perspective, and practice exists: curriculum, assessment, and creativity. In fact, this collection of articles represents not only an interesting array of perspectives about curriculum, assessment, and creativity, but also an opportunity to consider the points of intersection between and among them.

These chapters also offer an occasion to consider how place—the combination of time, space, and experience (Cresswell, 2002; Maplas, 1999)—confounds questions and influences thinking and practices in education, particularly music education. The authors of these chapters offer perspectives grounded in particular curricular structures, specific educational-political agendas, and/or individual inquiry into distinctive dimensions of assessment, curriculum, and creativity. Their essays are (perhaps necessarily) place-bound, and there is something to learn from each. Taken collectively, the authors provide an opportunity to consider how the specifics of place, including the structures and practices these authors describe, both inform and inhibit the potential “to release human potential and nurture the human spirit” (Schubert, 2004, pp. xi-xii).

The purposes of this essay, then, are to summarize possible interpretations with respect to curriculum, assessment, and creativity that readers might glean from these authors; to raise questions about curriculum, assessment, and creativity; and to consider how the lens of place and a place-conscious perspective (Gruenewald, 2003a; 2003b), rather than one that is place bound, might contribute to the conversations opened by the authors.

Chapters about assessment here and elsewhere are permeated with questions, tensions, and even paradoxes—explicit or implied—that surface when human beings are called upon to make judgments about their own work or that of others. What are the functions of assessment in education contexts? Who participates in assessment, and when, and why? How should assessment be approached? What constitutes assessment? What is it not? What does assessment capture? What does it miss? How is assessment linked to curriculum?

One possible interpretation readers might derive from the chapters about assessment in this book is that, at this particular historical moment and in the contexts these authors describe, assessment is about accountability. Assessment holds students accountable for attaining specified curricular goals and teachers accountable for helping students achieve certain standards listed in curriculum documents. Curriculum documents and the assessments related to them provide accountability to policy makers, government agencies, or the general public—those who invest (meagerly or generously) in education. Whether one agrees with the accountability interpretation or not, contemporary pressures upon school people to provide evidence pertaining to the outcomes of their activities (and sometimes outcomes in non-arts domains) is undeniable, and at least among some stakeholders in education, assessment is viewed as the means of providing that evidence.

Another possible interpretation derived from the chapters, both in this text and elsewhere, is that assessment serves specific and sometimes diverse functions that shift, depending on the aim
of the evaluation. While assessment may generally be understood as a means of checking student performance relative to standards and objectives, for example, in some settings assessment has become or is becoming a means of evaluating teacher ability relative to how well students perform. When the latter becomes the focus, assessment authors include various recommendations about how to improve teachers’ abilities to evaluate and to deliver instruction. Program or curriculum evaluation, yet another function of assessment, may be engaged on local, regional, and national scales, and may shift the focus to state or national initiatives regarding matters such as technology integration or developing creative abilities.

Still another perspective readers of the assessment chapters might glean is that assessment is an everyday practice of music educators who have at their disposal multiple means of evaluating students’ accomplishments. Indeed, the very vocabulary of the assessment literature, both here and elsewhere, indicates myriad way to evaluate ranging from the formulaic to the imaginative: formative and summative assessment, written tests, performance assessment, auditions, portfolios (analog, digital, multimedia), structured response protocols, rubric-based scoring procedures, reflection and self-reflection, and peer response.

Yet one more possible interpretation of the assessment chapters is that assessment can or should be a means of engaging learners in examining, thinking about, and thereby improving their own developing musicianship. In these conditions, assessment becomes a dialogue among learners or between learner and teacher-mentor that is focused on process, product, or both, with the goal of developing students’ abilities to learn independently in school contexts and elsewhere.

While each interpretation may be useful (or not), the problematic matter underpinning all of them and left largely unchallenged by the authors of the assessment chapters has to do with agency—with matters of power and decision making. Agency is inherently neither good nor bad; it is only problematic if and when it remains unquestioned. Who, then, decides what is assessed, and how, and when, and by whom? In the articles in this text, agency appears to reside largely in curriculum documents, government policies, assessment models, or, sometimes, in teachers when their decisions are aligned with curriculum documents, government policies, and assessment models. Even in the “assessment for learning” paradigm, which is designed to be student-centered and aimed at student decision making, agency seems to reside largely with the teacher and the model (at least in the model of assessment for learning outlined in this book).

Again, the problem is not necessarily (or inherently) agency derived from or vested in curriculum documents, assessment models, government policies, teachers and teacher decision-making, or even students’ voices. The problem lies in how agency plays out in decisions about learning and assessment, and in the privileging, either intentionally or unintentionally, of certain perspectives or voices. To grapple with agency, one must grapple with context, for as Nealon and Giroux (2003) suggest, “agency is both constrained and enabled by the contexts in which we find ourselves” (p. 195), and school people find themselves situated in multiple places—in classrooms, in school structures, in communities, in domains and fields, in curricular contexts, in policy discourse, and in public debates about education.

The places that dominate thinking have a great deal to do with agency in assessment. For example, if decisions about assessment derive primarily in reference to a national curriculum document, then assessment aimed at national achievement standard may become a dominant narrative that defines or delimits what is considered knowledge and achievement. A top-down power structure may result in which students (and even teachers) become less likely to be co-creators of learning experiences and voices in assessment, and assessment become a means of verifying curriculum and teaching practices. In other words, if students reach standards-based goals, then teaching and curriculum is “good,” and if they do not, then teaching or curriculum (or both) has failed.

This type of perspective might be characterized as place-bound rather than place conscious—a perspective (and practice) that is bound to the place of curriculum as the impetus for decisions rather than a perspective and practice that takes into count the overlapping and
nested places represented in schools and among school people. And, while curriculum can
certainly be one of the places from which thinking about assessment is derived, reliance on this
or other structures inherent in schools has certain disadvantages. Barone (2007) cautions that
teachers may become bound by structures to the point that they may no longer think
imaginatively about curriculum or assessment, or even about the experiences in which learners
are engaged. Similarly, writing from the domain of visual arts, Irwin and Chalmers (2007) note
that “prescribed assessment practices have increased teachers’ reliance on particular kinds of
projects that are regarded as safe” (p. 185), thereby removing teachers and students from
advances in the domain (and perhaps diminishing teachers’ sense of professionalism) and
“displacing” not only popular and community cultures but also teacher and student agency.

Agency serves us well here as a pivot to creativity, for agency is a subtext in the essays
about creativity (specifically composition in this volume) here and elsewhere. What is creativity
in general, or how has it been conceived of or defined, by whom, and to what purpose? What
does “creativity” mean in music education contexts? Who decides what or who is creative? How
do conceptions of creativity shape practices, curriculum, and assessment in arts education? How
might the contexts and places of arts education and practices of arts educators variously enable or
limit the agency and creativity of children?

Historically, creativity was viewed as the workings of mature minds (adults) involved in the
production of unique and (sometimes) culture-changing products. These conceptions of adult
creativity so dominated both the general creativity literature and the music creativity literature
that children’s creativity was overlooked, ignored, or simply denied. Runco and Charles (1997)
describe a “surprising debate…concerning the possibility that children’s creativity is not actually
creative” (p. 140). They attribute the debate to views of adult creativity as purposeful and goal-
directed and children’s creations as accidental and serendipitous, to the tendency to apply adult
models and norms of creativity to children, and to problems inherent in studying a subjective
human experience. The historical marginalization of children’s creativity also parallels rather dim
historical-social views of children; only in the last several decades has “the study of children
[been] seen by…disciplinary scholars as worth of focal rather than peripheral consideration, and
vital to understanding culture and society” (Campbell, 2007, p. 883).

In music and music education, the shift toward inquiry informed by ideas and theories from
anthropology, sociology, and ethnomusicology (as well as those of other perspectives highlighted
by authors in this text) brought about a new body of literature in which the cultures of children
were considered worthy of study (see, for example, Campbell, 1998) and the child and her
experiences were placed (or re-placed) at the center of arts education (see, for example, Stake,
2007). Recognition of children and young people as creators of music in their own right and for
their own socio-cultural purposes grew as scholars examined the diverse ways and in diverse
contexts of music making by children and youth (for example, Barrett, 1998; Campbell, 1995;
Gromko, 1994; Harwood, 1998; Marsh, 1995; Stauffer, 2001; Wiggins, 1994). The articles by
authors in this volume provide ample evidence of the continuing interest in the possibilities of
creativity, particularly composition, in music education practice.

And yet, within the growing research literature on creativity in music and among the various
practices in music education (particularly composition), tensions related to creativity and matters
of agency and place are abundant. Who defines or decides upon what constitutes creativity in
music in school contexts? Are decisions aligned with national curriculum documents, community
(local) practices, the impulses of the learners, and to what affect? What happens to the
idiosyncratic voices and ideas of individual children and young people when they create music in
groups, and what does group creating (whether in garage bands or general music classes)
contribute to individual understanding and development? What are the impacts of place—time,
space, and experience—one the musical creating of children and young people? Music educators
seem well aware, for example, that schools hold no proprietary claim as the places in which
children and young people create music, and yet the kinds of creative music making in which
music educators engage young people can seem quite removed from the lived experiences of children in every place other than school. How do musical models—structural, stylistic, performative—used as pedagogical tools (a common practice in the United States) either limit (and perhaps impede) creativity or develop craftsmanship? And how should the musical creativity of children and young people working in school contexts be assessed?

The latter question—that of assessment of musical creativity—is a particularly thorny problem, and one about which music educators hold quite diverse points of view. Murphy (2007) notes that “assessment [in music education] is fuelled by ardent passion on the one hand and blithe disregard on the other” (p. 361), and perhaps nowhere are these extremes more evident than when considering assessment of creative work of students. Those on the “ardent” end of the assessment spectrum point to accountability arguments made earlier. Those who eschew assessment point to the improbability of assigning scores or developing rubrics that can adequately account for qualities such as imagination or inventiveness of creative product, as well as the unlikelihood of predicting and monitoring the creative process. Still others worry that assessing in a music context will trample the creative spirit or sense of enjoyment in music making, or cling to a belief that arts education should be a context in which students are not subjected to evaluation.

But as Eisner (2007) points out, “assessment is both pervasive and inherent in teaching” (p. 423) and in learning in the arts. He suggests a “multilingual” approach to assessment that not only engages both students and teachers (and other school people and community stakeholders) but also takes into account idiosyncratic learnings and multiple meanings. A multilingual approach to assessment, Eisner suggests, would examine the extent to which students do something that is distinctive or inventive, could accommodate the unanticipated and imaginative, and would aim at “productive diversity” (p. 425) rather than predictability. Consistent with his earlier writings on connoisseurship, Eisner suggests that assessment in the arts will require “the use of refined sensibilities to notice what is subtle but significant, and the ability to provide reasons for one’s appraisal…” (p. 426), in effect, as Higgins (2007) maintains, to transform assessment from a perfunctory happening to a means of developing perceptivity. The questions about evaluation that should be important, Higgins suggests, are “not which method to choose or how to employ it, but how to notice aspects of schools hidden by our stereotypes of schools, the qualities of teachers and learners obscured by our cynicism or sentimentalism, the dimensions of classrooms that are hiding in plain view” (p. 393).

What might be the result of such thinking? Perhaps greater agency among music and arts students and teachers; perhaps a means of interrogating curriculum among school people or of viewing curriculum as a place-bound guide rather than rule or mandate; perhaps a renewed interest in place-conscious practices in music education; perhaps an expanded and expanding view of children and young people as musicians capable of significant and meaningful music making; and perhaps, in the end, a renewed purpose directed at what we believe to be the heart of the matter—invention, imagination, surprise—lived out in arts education experiences everywhere.

REFERENCES


Traditional and Contemporary Music
Inheritance of Traditional Music Faced with Globalization Impact in Schools of Mainland China

Jia Xing XIE

Education research cannot neglect the fact that school-based music is only intelligible in the context of general musical life. Today, if asked whether their social life or their school music education had the greater impact on young people I am afraid that few would opt for the latter. If school education were to neglect the social music life that has such a great impact on young people, it would be an ‘ostrich policy’ that deceived both itself and others. For this reason, I want to stress the historical importance of the establishment of the Commission on Music in Cultural, Educational, and Mass Media Policies in Music Education (CMCEMMP). I think there are three key words in its policy research targets: culture, education and mass media. These encapsulate the complicated relationship between social musical life and school music education. Consequently, this chapter refers to these three concepts throughout.

Due to the historical inertia of modern education, we tend to limit our research in music education to school music education, thereby overlooking the fact that it is faced with a series of new problems and challenges. With respect to school music education in Mainland China, one such challenge concerns how its national music heritage handles in schools the impact of globalization.

The essential significance of the relationships between globalization, school and national music inheritance is encapsulated in the three central concepts of the Commission on Music in Cultural, Educational, and Mass Media Policies in Music Education (CMCEMMP) namely culture, education and mass media. The concept of globalization is the one that most needs interpretation. Although there are many understandings of globalization, its main significance lies in the commercial operations of the global mass media. According to Taiwan scholar Long (2004), it concerns ‘not merely materials of food, clothing, living and transportation, it also includes cultural values and concepts about entertainment, which, under globalization, has become a universal commodity, fully infiltrated our lives, and no one can avoid its influence’ (Long, 2004, p. 1). Hence, in this chapter, the challenges of globalization refer to the impact of mass media on school education and the national music heritage.

CULTURE: RICH TRADITION, PERILOUS FATE

China is an ancient civilized nation with a long history, and a rich variety of music. Chinese music began to be recorded 8000 years ago in the form of the music and dance played by the Chinese forefathers. China’s 56 ethnic groups preserve its own characteristic local music, in addition to the rich music of the Han. In terms of musical genres, there is a wealth of repertoire. According to incomplete statistics from the 1980s, there are 394 types of opera in China, including those of the Tibet, Bai, Dong, Korean, and Manchu ethnic minority groups, who each have their own types. Then again, there are more than 400 kinds of Quyi (popular narrative musics), each belonging to one of the 55 ethnic minority groups, over 600 traditional folk musical instruments, and a wide variety of compositional styles. According to the incomplete work, Collection of Compositions for Chinese Traditional Folk Instruments, the number of compositions is nearly ten thousand, and incomplete statistics enumerate over 45,000 folk songs.
The Chinese Government and scholars have been committed to developing traditional music culture. Since 1949, there have been many discussions concerning learning and the inheritance of traditional music. The central topic of this discussion has been how to encourage traditional musical arts, and how to understand, master, and display the rich Chinese musical heritage. In order to excavate and preserve traditional folk arts, many researchers have dedicated themselves to this work, and have harvested rich fruits. One of their prominent achievements since the 1980s has been the huge project of amassing a traditional music collection, which has only recently been completed.

With the accelerated development of globalization and modernization, Chinese cultural ecology has experienced the great changes that have also happened in many other countries. Pop music, supported by strong commercial operations and various other factors, has threatened traditional music, and posed obstacles to its preservation.

According to official statistics, there were around 4000 traditional opera troupes in the middle of the 1980s. Since which time, the number has decreased to only 2600 in 2003, a quarter of which had not performed in that year. The total number of performances is also decreasing. The number now is 400,000,000, whereas in 1985 it was 700,000,000. It is the same with audience numbers (Fu, 2006). Many traditional sorts of music and songs, such as Qu, are dying out (Hu, 2003 p2). In Points of View on Strengthening Chinese Intangible Cultural Heritage Protection by the Office of the Chinese State Council (Qing, 2005), it is pointed out that:

….along with the enhancement of globalization, and the sudden economic and social transition, many new situations and problems come to the fore, such as the protection and development of the Chinese intangible cultural heritage, which is faced with critical situations….more and more impact has been imposed on the intangible cultural heritage. Many cultural heritages based on oral and actions that have been passed on to the next generation, are disappearing year by year, the living environment is experiencing sudden transitions….The protection of Chinese intangible cultural heritage is very urgent now. (p. 1)

MASS MEDIA: COMMERCIAL OPERATION OVERFLOWS OF POPULAR CULTURE

Along with the implementation of China’s ‘Open Door’ policy of the 1980s, the mass media, including film, TV, and the Internet has developed rapidly, gradually becoming the main channel for people to receive cultural information, and playing an increasingly important role in forming youngsters’ aesthetic tastes.

With the economic wave of Western (US-American in particular) globalization, cultural products have been spread worldwide by the commercial mass media, demonstrated by the contemporary popularity of US movies, popular music, Broadway musicals, TV, plays and various magazines and novels among Chinese young people. The pursuit of maximum economic interest through the commercialization of the mass media has spread popular culture everywhere. On April 17th, 2006, the Chinese Brand Research Institute announced the 100 Top Valued Chinese Individual Brand of 2006, naming the pop singer LI Yuchun, who was popularized by Hunan Cable TV in 2005, the ‘Super Girl of American Pop singers’. Her Western-style music, with Chinese and sometimes English words, was economically the third most successful, earning her 96,200,000 Yuan (Chinese Brand Research Institute, 2006). These sales figures demonstrate the sensational effect of China’s rising wealth (Ke, 2005), and the massive impact of pop culture on its young people.

On the other hand, sample investigation data shows that 90% of middle school students like pop music (Liu et al., 2005), and only 2% like national music (Wang, 2003). Some sampling investigation questionnaires show that 90% of college students like pop music (Lv, 2003), 53%
like Western symphony or vocal works, yet only 26% like traditional Chinese music (Lei, 2005, p. 31). Another sampling investigation in music departments and the conservatories of normal universities shows that only 2% of future music teachers hope they could pass on the practices of traditional Chinese music (Zhang, 2003). This data, although only partial, demonstrates well how the young generation in China, under the impact of Western pop music culture, has become indifferent to traditional Chinese music.

EDUCATION: THE CONTRADICTION BETWEEN PRACTICAL NEEDS AND HISTORICAL TRADITION

Since the 1980s, the Chinese government and scholars have been realizing that school music education, as the main channel for cultural inheritance, should take responsibility for establishing a conception of national music, and for strengthening its cultural heritage, about which scholars have written many articles concerning its relationship with school-based music education. In his Speech in the National Intangible Cultural Heritage Protection Conference, the Chinese State Councilor, and former minister of the Ministry of Education, Chen (2005) pointed out, ‘the rich resources of Chinese intangible cultural heritage constitute not only a rich culture, but also Chinese national cultural factors. . . We must try our best to protect traditional culture for the sake of the nation and next generations (p. 1).

However, China’s contemporary school-based music education and traditional music heritage face a contradiction between realistic demands and modern historical traditions. Although the Chinese Government has done a lot to ensure and protect traditional music since the founding of the People’s Republic of China (PRC), school-based music education harbors the inertia of history. Chinese contemporary musical historians have thought that school songs had suffered from “violently criticizing traditional music and vigorously introducing American and European music” (Li, 1997, p. 7). As a result traditional music has not been reflected fundamentally and systematically in the guidelines and textbooks of China’s school-based musical education, and has not therefore been easy to promote.

Chinese school-based musical education has had to cope with ‘Western music going Eastward’ in the twentieth century. The melodies of the ‘School-based Songs’ movement came mostly from Europe, the USA and Japan, whilst all the lyrics were concerned with anti-imperialism, anti-feudalism and national survival. After the 1920s, China totally accepted German and Austrian music instructional modes and theories, and traditional music was criticized as being part of feudalism. In the 1950s we borrowed professional music instructional modes from the Soviet Union. In the 1980s we introduced modern composition techniques from the Western world, and imported pop music from Hong Kong, Taiwan, the USA and Europe. Although this trend has not been unidirectional, because we have witnessed a revolutionary traditional music movement led by folk songs in the 1930-1940s, and advocacy to learn folk music in the 1950s, Euro centrism has gradually become mainstream.

TRADITIONAL MUSIC INHERITANCE: REFLECTION, POLICY AND PRACTICE

It is against this background, that, since the 1980s, Chinese scholars, the government and music educators have developed, through theoretical reflection, policy-making and practical exploration, the inheritance of traditional music in schools.

Reflection on School-Based Musical Education since the Twentieth Century
In February 1993, at the ‘Seminar on Thoughts of the National Music Community of the
Twentieth Century’, which was jointly hosted by The Chinese University of Hong Kong and the Hong Kong Ethnomusicology Society, delegates reviewed both the positive and negative effect of introducing Western music education from the beginning of the twentieth century through to the 1980s. Some scholars argued that, on one hand, it had replaced the traditional model of Chinese music education by a modern Western one, thereby broadening its vision, promoting exchange of musical cultures between China and the Western world, and to a certain extent, the development of Chinese music. On the other hand, the negative impacts of Eurocentrism could not be ignored. Scholars pointed out that European music theories mitigated against in-depth discussions of the Chinese musical system, fostered ideas of unduly belittling oneself, having blind faith in things foreign, and harming the spread and development of excellent Chinese traditional musical culture. They warned against the overwhelmingly negative impacts of Eurocentrism on various social communities, basic music theory and national musical life (Wang, 1994). They also analyzed the historical causes for the ‘Lagging Behind View’ of Chinese music, and proposed to uphold the relative equality of musical cultural values.

A dilemma arises when comparing contemporary Chinese and foreign music education, because the former is grounded in either the Euro-American model, which was introduced into China in the 1920-1930s, or the Soviet one introduced in the 1950s. Such phenomena trigger scholars’ fundamental question: ‘where is China?’ (Zhang, 1993, p. 3). They further propose to look at Chinese contemporary music education from the cultural perspective, and point out that we must experience with Chinese musical culture, enhance traditions, and fully develop a culture-based music education.

**Establishing Music Education with Chinese Culture as Its Mother Tongue**

On the basis of the fundamental question just mentioned, scholars began to discuss the specific contents of traditional musical culture to be taught in school. In October 1995, the 6th Seminar on ‘The Reform of National Musical Education’ was held with ‘music education with Chinese culture as the mother tongue’ as its theme. Some scholars proposed that such an education should include the philosophical basis, thought pattern, aesthetics, typology and evaluation of Chinese music, and should establish a theoretical framework, whilst conducting diachronic and comparative research into the historical development of the musical cultures of Eastern and Western nations and Chinese ethnic groups. This “mother tongue” system would research the historical formation of traditional, civil, ethnic, and national aesthetic mentality.

Some experts continue to discuss the nature and significance of music education with Chinese culture as the mother tongue, believing that its establishment must also absorb the diversified musical cultures of all nationalities, and that there is no contradiction between emphasizing musical tradition as important resources of local cultures and musical diversity across the world.

**Enabling Each Student to Sing the Songs of His/Her Hometown and be Aware of the Diversity of Chinese Traditional Music**

China is a country with multiple nationalities, and each of its 56 ethnic groups has its own characteristic musical culture. Therefore, the musical culture of any one group and its relationship with that of others is an important and complicated research issue. Because of concerns about the inheritance of traditional music in school, scholars are paying more and more attention to the diversity of Chinese music across multiple ethnic groups and territories.

In 1999, the National Academic Seminar on Ethnic Music Education, which was held in Hohhot, Inner Mongolia, focused on issues such as how to introduce into school-based music education the rich resources of traditional music cultures, which have been discovered by China’s professional music community over the past 50 years. Delegates also discussed teacher training, proposing that *Enabling Each Student to Sing the Songs of his/her Hometowns* (Xie, 2000), and expounded the value of traditional music whilst discussing the far-reaching significance and
practicalities of protecting the diversity of Chinese traditional musical cultures.

POLICY-MAKING RELATED TO SCHOOL-BASED TRADITIONAL MUSIC INHERITANCE

Syllabus
In order to help students in primary and middle schools to become familiar with traditional culture, the Ministry of Education (MOE) has issued a series of guiding papers since the 1980s, specifying the types of traditional music that can be used in school.

The Nine-Year Compulsory Education Music Syllabus for Full-Time Primary Schools (Trial), which was promulgated by the MOE in 1989, points out: ‘It is necessary to know the excellent traditional and folk music of all ethnic groups and to cultivate students’ passion for Chinese music, as well as their sense of national pride and self-confidence’ (MOE, 1989, p. 1). It also clearly states that: ‘In order to spread excellent traditional music and display characteristics of music instruction in various regions, all schools may select their own local textbook, which could account for 20% of the total instructional contents’ (MOE, 1989, pp. 1-2).

The 1995 Syllabus of Arts Appreciation in General High School (first draft for examination) (MOE, 1995) and a series of syllabuses for normal, primary and elementary schools required students to ‘value excellent Chinese traditional and folk music so as to promote Chinese musical culture’ (p. 1). It emphasizes that ‘China is a large country and the development of music education is unbalanced . . . so try to compile some folk music textbooks’ (p. 2). It also points out that ‘China is a nation with multiple ethnic groups, a long history and a splendid culture, and it enjoys diverse contents and forms of music. In order to promote traditional music culture, musical items in textbooks should follow the principle of unity of ideological and artistic qualities, and choose Chinese masterpieces as their main contents, such as songs, instrumental pieces, folk songs, folk art forms, opera arias, and traditional instrumental music, which have strong ethnic characteristics and ideological qualities. At the same time, we must also learn excellent music from other countries’ (p. 2). It clearly points out that Chinese traditional music has a multi-ethnic nature.

National Curriculum Standard
The MOE issued Music Curriculum Standards (Experimental Draft) for full-time compulsory education in 2001. Its fourth part Development and Utilization of Course Resources states: ‘We practice national, local and school levels of administration; courses developed by the locality and school should account for a certain proportion; locality and school should integrate the local humanistic geography and ethnic cultural traditions to develop music course resources with local, ethnic and school features’ (MOE, 2001, pp. 22-23). Since the publication of the Music Curriculum Standards, all textbooks have incorporated, together with foreign folk music, representative examples of the music of the 56 ethnic groups, such as the Han, Hui, Tibetan, Mongolian, Uigur, Kazak, from the northwest to other parts of China. This collection is in accord with the two guiding principles of all being within the ‘Chinese mother tongue’ and exhibiting ‘diversity’. Furthermore, local textbooks are also compiled across China.

PRACTICAL EXPLORATION OF NATIONAL MUSIC TEACHING

Teaching Practice
With the help of some guiding papers and various kinds of textbooks, many music teachers across the country have explored instructional practices. They start with the local or ethnic music known
by students, adopt flexible teaching methods, and try to integrate classroom instruction with extra-curricular activities. All these efforts have achieved good results and worthwhile experiences of traditional music.

A relatively successful example of this is the work of Zhao Guoping, a middle school teacher in the Fangshan District of Beijing, who introduced Ping Opera to pupils. Because she is enthusiastic about opera and musical dramas, she can teach by personal example as well as by verbal instruction and curriculum design; and she helps students to understand and love music by leading them into communities to investigate local dramas and to interview audiences. Liu Ying, from Xiamen of Fujian Province, the author of Research and Practice on Minnan Ethnic Folk Music in Classroom, is another example. She combines in-class and out-of-class instruction, and introduces music cultural resources from various levels. She invites artistic troupes and folk performers to the campus to perform the colorful folk music of southern Fujian for pupils. Pu Hong, a teacher in Guizhou Province, introduces Dage (a kind of ethnic art song) of the Dong Ethnic Group into the classrooms of primary and middle schools, which are welcomed by students. Music teachers in all parts of China are gradually emphasizing the inheritance of traditional music, as is reflected in national competitions of music instruction. For instance, in the 4th National Competition of Music Lessons in Primary and Middle School, many outstanding teaching demonstrations were filled with vivid music from various regions and ethnic groups.

In terms of extra-curricular activities, the ‘Nanyin Music on Campus’ Movement, which has been practiced for more than a decade in Quanzhou of Fujian Province, has been particularly successful. They carry out ‘Small Nanyin Singers Competitions’ in order to arouse students’ interest in Nanyin Music, and to cultivate local singers, who later become the main characters in Nanyin productions. This movement motivated hundreds of schools in Quanzhou to set up Nanyin Music courses, for which hundreds of thousand students in primary and middle schools have enrolled. The government of Quanzhou City has combined with local organizations, schools and research institutes to integrate the school-based inheritance of traditional music with the reestablishment of local traditional musical culture.

Admittedly, the aforementioned examples cannot be said to have universal significance. The situation of traditional music instruction is not satisfactory across the whole country, particularly in terms of local textbooks. Teachers’ general reaction is that they are unfamiliar and do not like local traditional music, so the goal of using local textbooks to ‘account for 20% of the total instruction’ (MOE 1989) is far from being achieved. These phenomena reflect the importance of teacher education and building resources.

**Teacher Training**

Many normal universities and colleges as well as music and arts colleges have realized that the critical point for whether traditional music inheritance is successful or not lies in cultivating teachers’ abilities to teach traditional music. University and college education programs have added traditional music courses and established local musical courses in the light of local conditions, so that future music teachers can learn to understand traditional musical cultures. Some normal universities and colleges have even started exploring local traditional music teacher training.

A typical case of this is the Music Department of Hulun Buir College in Inner Mongolia, which began to enroll junior college students to music education courses in 1997, and first introduced Hulun Buir (Hulunbeier) folk songs into the classroom. Later, the department also established the course Folk Music of the Mongol Ethnic Group, compiled a textbook to help students understand local traditional music and its history, and engaged the folk song singer Boindeleger as a guest professor. The department has made useful explorations in teaching methods and contents, which have been recognized by society and relevant experts. Besides, some universities and colleges of higher education, like the Nanyin Music Junior College Program in Quanzhou Normal University and the Dong Music Junior College Program in the
College of Art in Guizhou University, as well as some music and arts universities and colleges, have made valuable trials in cultivating traditional music teachers.

At present, the inheritance of traditional musical culture is attracting more and more attention from normal universities and colleges and music and arts colleges. Traditional music courses have been consolidated and strengthened in many universities and colleges.

Scientific Research
Reflections on modern school-based music education are gradually beginning to provide theoretical support for the inheritance of traditional music in schools. Traditional Music Inheritance in School, a sub-project of Research on the Practice of Arts Education in School, which was the research topic of the National Education and Science Ninth ‘Five-Year Plan’, was conducted in 1996; and The Inheritance of National Culture and Research on School Arts Education, the research topic of the National Education and Science Tenth ‘Five-Year Plan’, was conducted in 2002. They point out that the key roles of education are to inherit national culture, and to promote the practice of traditional music in classrooms across the country. The research has employed many methods to analyze and support the combination of school-based music education and traditional musical cultural arts, such as collecting historical data, thematic research, survey reports and research papers, translations and introductory collections, information resources, and so on.

In the research topic, ‘Traditional Music Resources and School-based music Education’ in Beijing, which emerged from the Tenth Five-Year Plan of philosophy and social sciences in Beijing in 2002, attempts were made to investigate music resources there, and to explore the school-based inheritance of traditional music. Through interviews, field studies, literature collection and data input, the Beijing Traditional Music Resources database, which has collected 72 traditional music resources in Beijing (including six types of drama, 19 kinds of Quyi (popular narrative musics), seven genres of folk songs and various kinds of names of dramas and musical forms), have been used in primary and middle schools and universities. Various music classroom experiments, which have also been opened in primary and middle schools, have explored the introduction of traditional musical culture resources into school-based music education in Beijing, and have provided the experiential basis on which to consider and practice traditional music inheritance in schools, using traditional music resources.

Theoretical Basis of Policy-Making of School Music Education - Setting Up School Music Education Based on National Music Cultural Inheritance
To summarise, since the 1980s China has been reflecting on school-based music education, and exploring traditional music inheritance in schools. Education departments at various levels, and teachers in primary and middle school, as well as at normal universities or colleges, have begun to attend courses in traditional music. In all the schools that have been engaged in these projects, students’ understanding and love for traditional music has increased.

As we have seen, the introduction of traditional music inheritance in school-based music education involves the overall restructuring of schools, and the re-establishment of a music education system based on the traditional music of local cultures. Given the inertia of history, these demands cannot be met overnight. According to the questionnaire given to more than 1700 students from Zhuang, Yao, Miao, Dong and other minority ethnic groups in various parts of Guangxi concerning ‘how many students can sing songs of their hometowns’, only 3% of Zhuang students, 5% Yao students, 29% Miao students and 31% Dong students could sing songs of their hometowns (Li, 2003). This shows that the cultural heritage of traditional music is being lost by these ethnic groups.

The Chinese Government is highly committed to restoring traditional music culture. As it points out in Papers and Opinions on Intensifying Intangible Cultural Heritage Protection Work: “We must hold responsibility for our nation and generations to come and try our best to do this
long-term and arduous work of intangible cultural heritage protection” (Chen, 2005, p. 1). In 2002, China formally launched the project of saving and protecting China’s verbal and intangible cultural heritage. In 2006 the Chinese Government designated the second Saturday in June as ‘Cultural Heritage Day’. People’s awareness of traditional music protection has been strengthened, but at the same time we should also realize that school education is a very important channel for social culture inheritance in the contemporary world.

For a long time, China’s traditional music inheritance has been carried out by artistic organizations, professional traditional music institutions and non-governmental music organizations, and supported by the cultural sector at various levels. However, school-based music education (including teachers’ higher education) still uses ‘school-based songs’ as its main content, and always neglects traditional musical resources, particularly local ones. This must be one of the causes for students’ lack of awareness of traditional music culture, and for the threat to the cultural heritage of traditional music. How to set up school-based music education on the basis of traditional music inheritance is still a pressing task.

In order to set up a music education aimed at traditional music inheritance, it should be based in schools music education. On one hand, only by introducing traditional music into school-based music education can there be any possibility of re-establishing the traditional musical cultures of the 56 ethnic groups. As some scholars point out, schools should become the stronghold for traditional music inheritance. Only in this way can traditional music culture be protected and inherited in any real sense. On the other hand, from an educational perspective, school-based music education should be grounded in the heritage of traditional music. As mentioned earlier, due to historical reasons what constitutes the basis of current school-based music education is an unsolved question in China.

After years of exploration, we have realized that traditional music culture should be considered as the main resource and basis for music education, in the same way that we learn dialects first, then Mandarin Chinese, and then foreign languages. In this way, students will be rewarded with the gift of their own culture, and become the new generation with cultural accomplishment, which is the sacred mission of present Chinese school-based music education, as well as the theoretical basis for music education policy in the future.

REFERENCES


Inheritance of Traditional Music 181


Chapter 18

The Enjoyment of Popular Music as a Valuable Experience in Music Learning

Chi Cheung LEUNG and Chi Chung HUNG

In the past ten years, education in Hong Kong has undergone a reforming process. Policies in education have been revised, and new ideas have been raised concerning the curriculum. Music and Visual Arts were incorporated in Arts Education as one of the eight Key Learning Areas (including Chinese Language, English Language, Mathematics, Personal, Social and Humanities, Science, Technology, Arts and Physical Education) in the newly developed Basic Education Curriculum Guide (Curriculum Development Council, 2002a), which covers primary and junior secondary education. The Curriculum Guide for Arts Education (Curriculum Development Council, 2002b) highlights the importance of aesthetic development for students’ whole-person development. The design of the new Guide is significantly different from the two previous music syllabuses for primary (Curriculum Development Committee, 1983) and secondary schools (Curriculum Development Committee, 1987). It adopts an open and flexible framework which aims to help students develop creativity, critical thinking, and communication skills through a balanced arts curriculum, while the previous music syllabuses were prescriptive in the teaching and learning content. The Guide emphasizes school-based curriculum design to suit the interests and abilities of students. Areas related to popular music such as jingles for commercials, blues, and Cantonese pop songs (Cantopop) are mentioned in some of the examples of learning activities in the Guide. It states:

As students are readily exposed to popular music, jingles and cartoon music, teachers can adapt the music as learning materials to arouse student interest in learning. When guiding students to learn popular music, teachers should help them understand the relationship between music and culture, for instance, by comparing the ways of voice production of pop singers with Western and Cantonese operatic singers, and exploring different types of voice production in relation to their cultural contexts. (Curriculum Development Council, 2002b, pp. 41-42)

In Hong Kong, the inclusion of popular music (including jazz) in the new Curriculum Guide is a breakthrough compared with the previous music syllabuses, which have never mentioned any genres related to popular music. Being a British colony from 1898 to 1997, music education in Hong Kong was highly westernized, focusing mainly on western classical music (Leung, 2004; Yu-Wu & Leung, 2000). Leung and Yu-Wu (2003) point out that popular music has been ignored in the previous primary and secondary music syllabuses. With the inclusion of popular music for the first time in the history of official curriculum documents in Hong Kong, the teaching and learning of popular music becomes an agenda for discussion. Issues such as the situation of popular music education in Hong Kong, students’ actual experiences of popular music in music classes, and whether teachers are prepared to teach popular music become the focus of studies.

This chapter aims to reveal the gap between the content provision of school music education in the past, and students’ expectations of music education at present in order to alert music teachers of students’ interest in music when planning their school-based music programmes. The focus is on popular music and education, but there is no intention to suggest that popular music is the only genre or the most important genre to be included in music education. The study in this
The Enjoyment of popular music

Chapter aims to identify possible directions for future development in school music education in Hong Kong in order to facilitate, enhance, and diversify the learning experiences of the students.

POPULAR CULTURE AND SCHOOL MUSIC EDUCATION

Popular culture, or sometimes known as mass culture, is immensely pleasurable but controversial, and sometimes even offensive and addictive, making it hard to avoid (Grossberg, 1989), especially because it exists at the core of the public sphere. It is largely driven by commercial interests, produced for the sake of profit-making (Dolby, 2003), and closely related to the media industry in the form of advertisements, comics, movies, lyrics, novels, soap operas, sports teams, superheroes, video games, and websites. Popular culture is not limited to adolescent interest. People of all ages love popular culture. In the United States, youth of all socio-economic backgrounds are rap fans, and Hollywood movie goers are from all ages. Despite academic critique, popular culture continues to draw people in, as it is always a source of pleasure (Dolby, 2003).

As early as 1967, the Tanglewood Symposium of musicians and music educators issued a declaration which called for a greater representation of folk and popular music in the school curriculum in the United States (Choate, 1968). Numerous articles on promoting the role and importance of popular music in schools have been published since then. Among these are the three special issues published by the *Music Educators Journal*: *Youth music: A special report* (1969), *Popular music and education* (1979), and *Pop music and music educators* (1991). Yet, Mark (1994) writes, “After more than 25 years of experience with popular music, we should question whether music education has been improved because of it” (p. 81). Hebert and Campbell (2000) state, “Despite the widespread presence of popular music in society, much remains to be examined and developed with regard to its placement in the schools” (p. 15).

The distinction between high culture and low (popular) culture has always been an agenda of discussion. Many related studies are overwhelmingly negative about the effects of popular culture on youth and society. Adorno (1975) argues that popular culture “impedes the development of autonomous, independent individuals who judge and decide consciously for themselves” (p. 18). Rodriguez (2004) points out that popular music is often treated as music that is “simple, memorable melodies, catchy ‘sing along’ choruses and instrumental ‘hooks’ that provide immediate, albeit short-term appeal” (p. 15). Bowman (2004) also reflects that popular music has been commonly considered as “cheap, quick, or easy” (p. 32). Woodson (2004) lists various arguments why popular music, especially rock, should not be brought into the classroom: there is no need to teach rock music when students are exposed to it outside of school; rock music is linked with sex and drugs; and lacks the kind of intrinsic value classical music possesses. Furthermore, there is insufficient time in the curriculum for additional repertoire and skill development. Resources and teacher training courses are also limited; and there are insufficient curricular guidelines on the use of popular music in the classroom.

The negative image of the personal lives of popular musicians has always been the focus of the media, which has overshadowed the quality of the music these musicians have produced. Stokes (2004) states that the mass media treat popular singers in a particular way. He studied magazine interviews with popular singers in China, and found that issues concerning fame, fans and packaging were the main areas of discussion in interviews with popular singers but the music they produced was rarely mentioned. This is common in how the media reports popular music around the world.

In 2003, Robert Fripp was voted by readers of the *Rolling Stone Magazine* as one of the 100 greatest guitarists of all time (“The 100 Greatest Guitarists”, 2003). He made the following statement when he recalled the music education he received in his generation:
The formal musical education available to one of my generation (born 1946) was clear: the music of Old (preferably Dead) White guys from Europe was the only music to be taken seriously. In the 1960s, to wear long hair signified proof of delinquent musical talent, aberrant moral values and an implicit threat to society; the electric guitar was not quite a proper musical instrument; and improvisation— or ‘making it up as you go along’— not quite an intentional musical act. (Fripp, 2001, p. ix)

This view perpetuates and could become some of the negative factors which have affected teachers’ preference in the teaching of popular music in music lessons. Despite the above criticisms and misconceptions about popular music, Hebert and Campbell (2000) argue for using popular music in education. They provide strong arguments from six perspectives. First, a number of scholars (Frith, 1996; Keil & Feld, 1994; Walser, 1993) have revealed the aesthetic dimension of various rock music genres, its complexity and uniqueness in musicianship, creativity and evaluation. Second, the lives or life styles of many classical musicians were equally corrupt compared with those of the rock musicians; and there are equally countless lyrics of the popular songs which address positive and encouraging humanistic themes. However, the public often highlight the negative sides of rock music and rock musicians, but seldom raise concerns about classical music and musicians. Third, although students are exposed to popular music constantly, it does not necessarily mean they understand it fully. Popular music has its unique nature and power of expression, and thus should be treated as an integral genre but not merely as a means to enhance students’ interest. Fourth, teacher education and music education at university have had numerous popular music related courses such as jazz, gospel ensembles, steel drum ensembles, mariachi bands, African-American and Latin-American genres. Music teachers should be able to integrate popular music into the music curriculum. Fifth, both anti-education and pro-education lyrics exist in popular songs. Educators should utilize the power of music to the advantage of the curriculum rather than responding defensively. Sixth, textbooks, sheet music, method books, internet and websites, academic publications, CDs and videotapes are widely available for teachers to use. With appropriate guidance in teacher education, this wide range of resources can readily serve the provision of popular music in education.

Popular culture should not be dismissed as irrelevant and insignificant. On the contrary, popular culture of the past could become classics of the present. Shakespeare’s plays and Mozart’s operas were popular culture in their times, but are considered classics of high value now. Grossberg (1989) identifies three positive themes of popular culture: popular culture is a major affective force in people’s lives; it is a place where “commonsense” interpretations and understandings of the world are made; and a meeting point where our identities are produced and extended.

Willis (1990) argues that popular culture has a more powerful and penetrating force on young peoples’ lives than schooling. He writes:

The field of education is likely to come under even more intense pressure. It will be further marginalized in most people’s experience by common culture. In so far as educational practices are still predicated on traditional liberal humanist lines and on the assumed superiority of high art, they will become almost totally irrelevant to the real energies and interests of most young people and have no part in their identity formation. Common culture will, increasingly, undertake, in its own ways, the roles that education has vacated. (p. 147)

A study by Finnas (1989) also found that peers and disc jockeys influence students’ musical taste more than their teachers and other adults. Other studies (Christenson & DeBenedittis, 1986; Larson & Kubey 1983) show that adolescents’ musical taste is developed through listening to music on their own or influenced by peers; family and educational influences are comparatively weak. The issue is how school music education could be adjusted in order to better facilitate the
music learning experience of the students. Robinson (1997) identifies that film and television industries in the United States employ more people than car manufacturing while rock musicians earned more foreign exchange than people from the steel industry. In addition, the statistics from the International Federation of the Phonographic Industry (IFPI) reveals that albums in pop, rock and dance music often occupy over 90% of the top 50 albums being sold globally (IFPI, n.d., a; IFPI, n.d., b). These figures affirm that popular cultural industry and popular music play a pertinent role in people’s lives. It is therefore important to consider its unique role in society, which reflects the current cultural context of the young generation, the public at large, and thus its importance in the school curriculum.

Furthermore, the teaching and learning of popular music in the music classroom can help to explore the musical potential of students. Ginocchio (2001), an instrumental music teacher, planned and taught popular music courses in a high school. He found that through the learning and performing of popular music in different ensembles, students learnt to work together as a group. After a year of teaching popular music, he professes:

Great musicians can be found in many unlikely places and groups. To teach music is truly to teach a student to think, to feel, and to communicate. It does not really matter what style of music we choose to teach…. Even as we are teaching music, we are teaching students about life and about the world in which they live…. Through traditional music study, coupled with the study of popular music, every student can be a musician. (Ginocchio, 2001, pp. 41-42)

A gap between the education of music teachers and the cultural context in which students live has, however, existed for decades. Even for music teachers who played popular music themselves were under the pressure of the conservative view that popular music should not be promoted within their classrooms. Green (2003) states the lack of knowledge of informal (popular) music learning practices among formally trained teachers is one of the factors why school music education tends to pay less attention to popular music. Green (1999) suggests that music teachers should emphasize the connection between music and society in order to understand students from their perspective. Dunbar-Hall and Wemyss (2000) stress that popular music is one of the areas missed in music teacher education.

POPPULAR MUSIC AND EDUCATION IN HONG KONG

In Hong Kong, popular music can be divided into mainstream and non-mainstream types. The market of mainstream popular music in Hong Kong is rather small as compared to that of the United States (Ogawa, 2004). As a result, the major concern of most of the local record companies is to make profit rather than to foster music creativity. In other words, commercial value overrides the importance of artistic creativity in music. The resulted industry-oriented and market demand-driven business produces Cantopop ballads, which are simple and easy to listen to, and are commonly accepted in the mainstream market (Ho, 2003). Chu (2000) points out that the highly competitive market in popular music in Hong Kong has led to the creation of an idolized-market. Record companies spent huge resources on singers to create images that the consumers love. A large number of love ballads were created to attract adolescents.

Non-mainstream popular music includes music which is non-profitable, weird and subjective, created by anti-commercial musicians, used as a tool to express political or social messages, and which the media are not interested to promote (Wong, 1996). Over the years, non-mainstream popular music, for example, rock, “band sound” music and folk songs, did not achieve much success in the commercial market. Band sound has never made a major impact on the local market, except during the 1960s when the western bands such as the Beatles and the
Rolling Stones achieved global success, a few local bands were then able to achieve a certain level of success in the 1970s (Wong, 1996). However, only a few of them could sustain their popularity. They were short-lived, and eventually received less attention in the 1980s when solo singers became the major attention of the local market.

In 2005, 60% of the songs awarded by the four major broadcasting media in Hong Kong were love ballads. The love ballads in the local market, the issue of morality in relation to the controversial content of these ballads, and the negative images of popular musicians make music teachers hesitant to teach popular music in the classroom. They find it hard to select suitable ballads as teaching materials, and it is also difficult to keep up-to-date with the trend of what students love. As observed in Hong Kong schools in the past ten years, popular music, if taught, was taught mainly for two very different purposes. The most common purpose was using popular music as a means to attract students’ interest in learning music or their attention in class. Some music teachers felt that they were unable to find interesting classical repertoire (in both Western and Chinese music) to attract students’ attention or they were unable to teach classical music in interesting ways. They thought that popular music was the “best drug” to maintain class discipline and to lead on to exciting students’ interest in learning classical music. The other purpose for some music teachers, however, was to teach popular music as a unique genre of its own, which has its own musical expression, language, context and meaning. These teachers were usually able to teach various music genres not limited to popular music in creative ways. They usually possessed good musicianship and teaching skills.

A few scholars have conducted studies with regard to the musical preference or musical behavior of school students in Hong Kong. The study of Morrison and Yeh (1999) found that students had a slightly higher rating for Western classical music than Chinese music and jazz. Unfortunately, Cantopop was not included in the study. Fung, Lee and Chung (1999-2000) found that the participating students preferred Cantopop most, amongst western classical music, jazz, rock, and Jiangnan sizhu music (traditional Chinese string and wind instruments with a light touch of percussion instruments). They suggested that local popular music can act as a learning bridge to other musical types. Ho (2002) found that students’ musical taste was developed on their own, or influenced by their peers and the mass media. School music teachers, instrumental tutors, and parents had little impact on cultivating their musical taste. Popular music (including Cantopop, Western pop, Japanese pop and Mandarin pop) was preferred to classical music (western and Chinese) and folk songs (Chinese and other world music), though no significant differences were shown. Over 60% of the students who participated in the survey admitted that they would like to learn popular music in school.

In addition, the results of a questionnaire (Leung, 2007) shows that secondary school students who are planning to study music at tertiary level are interested to study popular music. A total of 168 students from seven secondary schools in Hong Kong participated in the survey. They were asked to identify three areas of studies they are most interested in. The results show that the three most interesting areas are popular music (including jazz) (25.6%), instrumental and vocal performance (20.0%) and western classical music (14.1%). The results bring to light a substantial need for the provision of popular music at tertiary level music studies. Though the survey does not provide any evidence of a comparable need at the secondary level, it is still worthwhile to consider the inclusion and development of popular music in secondary school music programmes as a necessary preparation for students’ tertiary education, and for the sake of the students’ interest in popular music.

THE STUDY AND RESEARCH DESIGN

In this study, interviews were conducted with six amateur or professional (in this chapter, “professional” refers to musicians whose works have been published commercially) musicians
including performers, a composer and a lyricist who write/play what is generally described as popular music (including jazz). The lyricist was included in this study because she works closely with musicians in popular music. The six interviewees received their school education in Hong Kong, and thus have a similar educational background. They have graduated from secondary schools for a number of years, and have already become members of the working population. Four of them are amateur musicians from two non-contracted bands, and the other two are a professional composer and a lyricist. They pursue and play the music they are interested in, or work in the music industry either as a professional or a freelancer.

To acquire an in-depth understanding of the situation of popular music education in Hong Kong, a semi-structured interview approach was adopted for this study. Due to the different roles as performers, composer or lyricist, two sets of interview questions were constructed. The interview questions focus on the four aspects of the interviewees: demographic information and interest in music, their opinions on popular music in Hong Kong, experiences in and views on music education, and suggestions for improvement in music education.

The interviews reveal the profiles of the interviewees, and their concerns about their music education in primary and secondary schools. The data collected provide valuable information for understanding more about the interviewees’ development of interest in music, how this development is related to their school music education, as well as how the interviewees perceive their music education, and the music they are interested in. They carried on their interest in music after leaving school until the present day. Although they left their respective secondary schools about ten years ago, their reflections are still relevant to the consideration of music education in Hong Kong. This is because the recent changes have not yet shown significant differences of change since their graduation. Their views on and experiences in music education can still be considered as reference point for the implementation of the new music curriculum.

**PROFILES AND VIEWPOINTS OF INTERVIEWEES**

The interview data of the demographic information of the interviewees, their opinions on popular music, experiences in and views on music education, and suggestions for improvement in music education are presented in the following four sub-sections.

**Demographic information**

The interviewees were between 26 to 28 years old. All of them studied at local secondary schools and received their tertiary education in two of the universities in Hong Kong. To respect the interviewees’ privacy, pseudonyms including Albert, Benny, Ellen, Eric, Greg, and Polly are used. They graduated four to five years ago and were working in different professions, mostly irrelevant to the field of music, at the time of the study (except Polly, who was a piano teacher and a composer) (see Table 18.1). Three of them had five years or more experience in a band. Most of the interviewees played instruments and were self-taught. Three played the guitar/bass guitar; one played the drum, and the other the piano. Albert was the only one who had learned Chinese instruments when he was in secondary school, in addition to his own instrument.

Eric, Benny and Albert formed their bands with friends in the university they studied. They stated that playing in the band was something they could seriously focus on and enjoy. Greg formed his first band with his secondary school friends. Eric felt that playing in the band, was his hobby. Albert thought it was something he could commit himself to financially. Ellen, the lyricist, was introduced to the music industry to write lyrics for a schoolmate who became a contract singer. At that time, Ellen was still a secondary school student. It should be noted that almost all lyricists in Hong Kong are working on freelance basis, and inevitably, Ellen is one of the freelance lyricists in the field. Polly, the composer, realized her ambitions in the music industry by sending demos of her works to record companies. Her interest in singing and the attractive idea of her
songs being performed in public motivated her to continue composing.

Not surprisingly, all the interviewees revealed that they started to play music and carried on playing because of their deep love of music. For the amateur musicians, their primary objective was to pursue their interest or to improve their skills in either performing or composing. For the professionals, the sense of achievement and satisfaction obtained in producing and performing music was the major motivation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 18.1 Demographic information of the six interviewees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Name of Interviewee</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AMATEUR BAND PLAYERS</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benny</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROFESSIONAL COMPOSER/LYRIST</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polly</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Popular music in Hong Kong**

When asked about how they compared the music they played with popular music in Hong Kong, the interviewees expressed consistent views. To a certain extent, they considered the music they played popular. However, their music was in a way considered outside the ‘boundary’ of popular music in Hong Kong because popular music in Hong Kong had a narrow range of genres. To summarize, popular music in Hong Kong, known as Cantopop (popular songs sung in Cantonese), resembles karaoke music, which is simple, easy to sing with easily memorized melodies, and commercial in nature. These features attract a wide range of audiences. Other musical styles, such as rock or blues, are not considered ‘pop’ in Hong Kong. The views of four of the interviewees on popular music in Hong Kong are presented clearly in the following quotations (the interviews were conducted in Chinese, transcribed to English, and verified by respective interviewees):

Hong Kong’s [musical] style is very ‘pop’, the style is very different from what [my] band is playing. Blues rarely exists in Hong Kong’s pop music. (Benny)
I think it [my band’s music] is more like popular music with band sound...to a certain extent, it is similar [to Hong Kong’s popular music], but I think we are somewhere in between... but in Hong Kong, it [rock music] is not exactly considered a kind of popular music. But in the markets like USA or UK, I’d say rock is one of the genres of popular music. But in Hong Kong, popular music only means those easy catchy songs. (Eric)

There are only very few band sounds in Hong Kong. There are not too many genres too. (Albert)

It’s [the music my band plays is] more like pop, something less complicated, and quiet, not like those noisy ones...I think it’s more like band sounds, but not those you [commonly] heard from karaoke [in Hong Kong]. (Greg)

**Experiences of and views on school music education**

The interviewees were asked to describe their experiences of music lessons in school. As noted earlier, all the interviewees received their education in Hong Kong, their experiences were similar (Table 18.2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewee</th>
<th>Classical music</th>
<th>Music theory</th>
<th>Singing</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Greg</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Recorder playing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albert</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Music history</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eric</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellen</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Music history</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benny</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polly</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Folk music and musicals</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above data reflect that popular music is not evident in the implemented curriculum. Most of the interviewees (except Eric and Polly) did not mention that popular music had been included in their music lessons. What the interviewees said as shown below confirm this:

There was really not much [content about popular music]. I just remember in one of those lessons, I forgot in which grade, the teacher mentioned joy, anger, sadness and happiness. Something [about rock] was mentioned when [the teacher] talked about anger. Other than that, I would say classical music was the main thing. (Eric)

Eric further pointed out that the lack of popular music in their music lessons was because of the background of the music teachers. He said, “Those (teachers) who were formally trained in music seldom listen to popular music. Therefore, there was not much chance to listen to [popular music in class]. I listened to popular music after school.” Greg responded that he treated music as a normal academic subject in school and it was not helpful for the development of his musical interest. He said, “Not at all [helpful]! I just treated it [music] as a subject like history or geography.” Benny felt that the songs he sang in music lessons were irrelevant to his life. He stated, “Because the songs used in the music lessons would only be sung during the lessons. When will you sing those songs outside music lessons? I would never sing those songs.”

Ellen stated that popular music was not covered substantially in the music lessons, hence she was not motivated to learn. Her motivation in music came from other sources:

They [the music lessons] were boring, so I was not motivated...I always felt disappointed because some good music like the Beatles’ was never covered in the music lessons...I think my interest [in music] was developed among friends, and my sense in popular music was developed by self-taught. (Ellen)
When the interviewees were asked whether their experiences in music lessons had helped them to develop their interest in music, most of them said “no”. The band musicians said that the music lessons did not help much in their musical development, but they agreed that some of the basic music theory learnt in school was helpful. Greg mentioned, “I think only those major scales, like C major, D major and harmonic minor scales [are helpful]. That’s all! But for playing in a band, there is not much help.” Alert added, “I think the most direct help are those parts and bits of theory which I can still remember… [I can] only [remember the names of] those musical periods.”

For Polly, it was the extra-curricula activities in school which facilitated her development in music:

I have learnt nothing from the music lessons. But I did learn something from extra-curricula activities such as the singing contests. I was motivated by these activities, and to actually look for a song I like. Then, I learnt how to play it by figuring out the chords. That’s what I’ve learnt to do from that time onwards. (Polly)

**Suggestions for improvement in music education**

After reflecting their personal experiences of music education in school, the interviewees were asked to make recommendations on what could be done in order to enhance students’ interest in music. Their suggestions are shown in Table 18.3. They are highly relevant to some of the current concepts or practices in the teaching and learning of music.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewees</th>
<th>Suggestions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eric, Greg, Benny</td>
<td>Include popular music elements in music lessons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benny, Ellen</td>
<td>Enforce the compulsory learning of musical instruments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albert, Polly</td>
<td>Encourage students to play instruments during lessons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellen, Polly</td>
<td>Organize extra-curricula activities in popular music to arouse students’ interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellen</td>
<td>Provide resources/chances for students to actually touch the instruments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greg</td>
<td>Teach composition techniques</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Eric took Physical Education as an example to elaborate on the limitations of styles covered in music education. He noted, “Yes, [there could be] more areas, just like P.E. lessons. You do not only play basketball, you can also play soccer, badminton, and many other sports.”

Both Benny and Ellen suggested that popular music should not only be included as a genre in music education but can also serve as a tool to teach various music concepts, and to arouse students’ interest for further musical development:

Sometimes the song is just a tool, it all depends on how you use the tool to teach the things you want to teach. But, if we still use those outdated songs, I think it is difficult to help students…at least it [popular music] can arouse [students’] interest. (Benny)

Since karaoke is so common, we can organize more contests like lyrics writing and composing competitions; or invite more professionals to give talks to the students. I do not favour karaoke music, but to arouse students’ interest is okay. (Ellen)

Lastly, the interviewees were asked to share their views concerning music education in Hong Kong in general. Albert pointed out that music was not treated seriously in Hong Kong:

Music is less respected than sports. It is ignored. Like an alternative art form…I really just sat, listened and looked at the textbook [in music lessons], and sang songs which I was not
familiar with and seldom listened to. I hope music lessons could be lively, and more could be done so that students can remember [the music]. (Albert)

Ellen suggested one possible reason why music was generally considered less important, “Music education fails to explicitly let students know that music is actually a part of their lives, and therefore, students just treat it as a normal school subject.”

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Popular music is included in the new music curriculum in Hong Kong. It will be interesting to observe its implementation. Musicians, music teachers and educators at large seem to have different views on popular music. As such, seeking their support is crucial to the success of the implementation of the new curriculum. The interview results provide some views on the provision of popular music education in Hong Kong. The views raise five issues of concern about popular music and education in Hong Kong. First, most of the interviewees revealed that they were self-taught in popular music. Music provision in school was far from satisfactory. Second, extra-curricular activities in popular music could be an effective means of providing popular music education in school. Third, the broadening of popular music education is needed; Cantopop should not be the only genre used in the teaching and learning of popular music. Fourth, the past experiences of the interviewees show that the music taught in school was limited in scope, and did not reflect the cultural context, which has been strongly emphasized in the new Curriculum Guide. Last, the gap between the implemented music curriculum and the students’ musical interest is an important issue to address.

First, the demographic information of the interviewees reveals that most of them were self-taught in popular music, and formed their own bands in school or university with friends or schoolmates. Their initial interest in popular music has persisted after graduation because they enjoy music and they want to improve. Most of them have regular income alongside their music hobby or professional practice. Unfortunately, school music education only provides very limited musical knowledge and no practical techniques in popular music for these musicians. There is an obvious gap between the implemented music curriculum, and what could have been better provided for in terms of the needs and expectations of these musicians. Better provisions could have helped to facilitate the enhancement of the students’ interest and even their professional pursuits in popular music.

Second, popular music education should not be limited to the provision in general music classes only. The study clearly shows that extra-curricular activities, such as singing contest and lyrics writing competition, can be a major platform where students could acquire musical experiences, which stimulate and enhance their interest in popular music. Music teachers and school principals could consider expanding or upgrading the provision of extra-curricular activities in popular music. Policy makers could consider the provision of financial support and expertise for these activities. Grants and funding could be obtained from the government as well as the private sector, but thorough planning is necessary. The provision of popular music education in both general music classes and extra-curricular activities could offer a more balanced support for students’ development of knowledge, skills and interest in music.

Third, the interviewees also reflected that existing popular music in Hong Kong is narrow in genres, and the understanding of popular music among students and teachers is limited. Most of the popular music is limited to Cantopop which is the mainstream of local popular music. Non-mainstream popular music is at the periphery. Most of the interviewees stated that the popular music they are playing is different from the popular music generally known to the Hong Kong public. Thus a wider range of popular music could be taught. In line with this, music teacher education programmes could provide different perspectives, knowledge and skills in
popular music. This could help music teachers to select appropriate popular music for their students. Furthermore, opportunities for the development of non-mainstream popular music in Hong Kong are needed. This can help create a more vibrant and diverse cultural life in Hong Kong. The responsibility lies on not just policy makers in education, but also those working in the mass media and the cultural fields.

Fourth, the music the interviewees learnt in school was very similar. It included classical music, music theory, music history, singing and recorder playing. The interviewees did not think that their music education experiences helped to enhance their interest or facilitate their development in music, except for some basic music theory that they could remember. In fact, their views on their experiences in music education were rather negative. Though all of them admitted that music is important to them, music taught in school was not relevant to their life. Some of them reflected that they treated classroom music as just an academic subject they learnt in school. Music learnt in school was uninteresting and they did not enjoy it. They need the context relevant to their lives. As such, the cultural context in music could be one of the major solutions that could solve the problem of teaching music be it popular, Chinese or western music. With this, music teachers could consider to make a balance in the teaching of musical knowledge and the context in music.

Lastly, this study reveals that there is a big gap between the implemented music curriculum and the students’ musical interest. This disconnection is a major issue found in this study. Further investigations are needed to explore the teaching approaches of popular music, the genres of popular music taught, the selection criteria of the repertoire of popular music, the training of music teachers in popular music, and the lack of teaching resources. These could help teacher educators understand better how popular music can be taught in schools. The literature has also highlighted issues such as the negative image of some of the popular singers, and the controversial content of some popular music, which are considered barriers to the use of popular music in school. The negative views to the value of music education in schools should also be noted (especially the meaning of certain song selection in music classes). These issues are therefore worth further investigation.

To conclude, the enjoyment of music learning experience is crucial to maintain the learning interest of the students, no matter it is popular music or western/Chinese classical music. As evidence from this study, the enjoyment comes from the experience of practicing, performing and creating the music. As such, the teaching and learning of popular music in schools could consider incorporating the singing and playing as well as improvising and composing of the popular music as the two major learning activities, with the support of other different aspects, such as critical appreciation, historical and cultural understanding, and the musical knowledge in popular music. Popular music can be an effective as a means to enhance the interest of students in learning music, it can also be taught as an individual genre for its own sake. The enjoyment comes from the continual in-depth understanding, improvement and the ownership of composing and improvising the music, which are characteristics of the learning of popular music. The valuable experience motivates and maintains the players or participants to continue their interest of learning popular music. This is what music educators could consider when designing a programme in popular music, that is, what is needed that can interest the students to learn.

Popular music is included in the new Music Curriculum Guide in Hong Kong. This means that music teachers will have to select appropriate repertoire of popular music and suitable teaching approaches. Music teacher education programmes will have to further support teachers’ development in popular music. Further investigation and discussion on the teaching and learning of popular music will be helpful to education policy makers and music educators in implementing a balanced curriculum which can cater for students’ best educational needs and interests in music.
REFERENCES


Chapter 19

Between Popular and Classical Music: The Creative Process of a Digital Film Scoring Project in Hong Kong

Chi Wai Jason CHEN

Over the past two decades, there has been a significant move in research associated with film scoring and in particular digital film scoring. Music technology has been regarded as a tool by Davis (1999), Karlin and Wright (2004), and Sussman (2005) to compose in a digital film scoring project. The sequencing software can integrate MIDI, audio and video effectively in a project studio setting. Different approaches to treat visual images have been well-established in film scoring by Lipscomb (1995). The textbook on film scoring by Davis (1999) expressed that “successful film scoring is not a matter of just writing good music; it is writing good music that supports a dramatic situation. The most important thing for beginning composers to learn is how to approach writing this kind of music in finding the heart and soul of the film and express music. It can be guided and pointed out in a certain direction, either by a teacher, a director, or simply a reaction to a particular scene” (p. 10). Karlin and Wright (2004) further explained how the musical elements, such as using melody, harmony, rhythm, and orchestration are employed as the compositional devices during the creative process in film scoring.

There are two distinct approaches to the actual writing of a score: composers could write on a synthesizer and then sequence the music, or composers could write with a pencil and paper, and then input the score on the notation software. The main advantage of using a synthesizer and sequencer is that it can be faster. A composer can play his or her ideas, or play along with the video, and it is instantly recorded and notated. For example, Post (2000) taught a digital film scoring class at Humboldt State University with a Power Mac G3, Performer 6, a Roland XP-10 synthesizer and a set of headphones. He tried to offer a basic approach for digital film scoring that does not require a large amount of expensive equipment. The class included music sequencing programs, Quick Time movies, instrumentation and scoring techniques. Scoring techniques included soft hits, hard hits, and mathematical equations for calculating hit points. Another example is presented by Sussman (2005) who taught a digital film scoring class at the Manhattan School of Music, and explained the basic techniques of scoring to picture. The use of markers, tempo, meter changes and intuition to create musical underscoring can support and enhance visual images and dramatic content. The function of a music cue is to support and enhance the visual images and drama taking place on screen. There are some obvious considerations that a film composer must deal with in order to make a music cue work. Specifically, a method for converting visual timings or sync points which are usually given in SMPTE (Society of Motion Picture and Television Engineers) formats into “musical notation” format, such as measure, beat, tempo and meter. To convert “timings” into “musical notation” is investigated in the creative process of students’ compositions in this study.

DIGITAL FILM SCORING

The creative process of digital film scoring provides links between four areas: 1. music technology, 2. composition as problem-solving, 3. style, genre and musical language, and 4. popular music in Hong Kong. This section presents recent research in these four areas and the interaction between these four areas is emphasized in the present study.
Music Technology
Extensive research (Conant, 1988; Crow, 2006; Folkestad, 1996; Hess, 1999; Jennings, 2003; Kozerski, 1988; Ladanyi, 1995; MacInnis, 1996; Meynard, & Davidson, 1988; Mills & Murray, 2000; Nelson, 1998; Reese, 1995; Savage, 2005; Scripp, Younker & Smith, 1992; Stevens, 1996; Upitis, 1989; Younker, 1997) has since been undertaken into the use of music technology in composition by children and adults. The research into composition studies has also been supported by the use of music technology. Two recent writers, Savage (2005) and Crow (2006) investigated the link between music technology and creativity in their studies.

Savage (2005) suggested the use of sound design in composition with software Sound2picture. He documented the works of two electro-acoustic composers who demonstrated a sound design process. “The compositional process drawn from the work of electro-acoustic composers included six steps as follows: 1. thinking in pictures, 2. choosing the colour palette, 3. the source: choosing the overall sounds, 4. the visual cue: choosing specific sounds, 5. additional elements, and 6. the final mix” (p. 337). Savage (2005) recommended that the use of sound design can be integrated into the music education curriculum in music composition and music technology context.

Crow (2006) explored the position of music technology in relation to musical creativity. He mentioned that “creativity in music education is generally believed [to be] a good thing. However, the curriculum does not always engage or motivate students” (p.121). Crow used software such as DJ remix, loop-based sequencers and musical accompaniment generators. These software did not require traditional musical skills or conceptual understanding. The software was attractively presented as a set of creative tools, which offered a range of musical choices. The choices were drawn from banks of readymade musical material, which could be controlled in a variety of ways. Crow (2006) found that the software could engage the students into active learning by composing a three-minute track with the software DJ remix. However, the music teachers need to rethink, redesign, develop and resource a new music curriculum that may include the engaging manner with music technology for the students.

Both of these studies by Savage (2005) and Crow (2006) suggested that the use of music technology in composition could engage students more in the new music curriculum in the United Kingdom. The use of sound design and sequencing software might provide insights for the students to re-design, re-think and re-develop a creative product in this study.

Composition as problem-solving
From the perspective of cognitive psychology, the concepts of creativity and problem-solving are seen as related. Creative processes are described in terms of problem-solving and the process of problem-solving is described as a chain of creative processes in which decisions are made. The general view of cognitive psychology is that all problem-solving is carried out in the same way, involving the same steps and operations, almost regardless of the content and context of the problem. The problem-solving approach is generally well established in music composition (Gardner, 1983; Sloboda, 1988; Webster, 1988; Webster, 1990) and for investigating composition (Davidson & Welch, 1988; Scripp, Meynard, and Davidson, 1988; Webster 1992) as “one might expect to find strategies in musical composition similar to those reported in studies of general problem-solving” (Davidson & Welch, 1988, p. 263). The present study is based on a problem-solving approach. The presentation of the creative process of a student’s composition is a problem-solving task used to clarify the similarities and differences between individuals.

Scripp (1988) established that adults in general succeeded better in solving a composition task than children, and these results were interpreted as “powerful evidence of musical development without musical training” (p. 87). However, if the task is to find the right sound or drum pattern to a hip-hop tune, the result would probably be the reverse of the original study, with the children being more successful than the adults. In fact, the only relevance that can be drawn from such investigations is an understanding of how the participants succeed in solving a
particular task in a particular situation within a particular musical style.

Berkley (2004) extended the problem-solving skills into the composition pedagogy in her study. She noted the importance of an understanding of composing as problem solving in a student’s capacity to perceive the problem structure, to search for a musical form as the students compose, and in their capacity to sense musical possibilities. From Berkley’s (2004) findings, by conceptualizing composition as problem-solving skills into the composition pedagogy, the students developed skills and knowledge in problem finding, hypothesising, applying the conventions of the style and idiom, and perceiving answer as series of interrelated problems. Furthermore, students’ personal development indicated an increase in ownership, autonomy and authority. In the present study, students come to understand the total composing problems comprises interrelated problems with multiple potential answers which require the students to combine systematic application of different musical elements and compositional techniques. Students use skills of hypothesis (musical ideas and imagination) and verification (sequencing software) to explore, predict and test potential solutions as the students compose in two different composition tasks by using music technology.

**Style, Genre and Musical Language**

Two concepts - style and genre are used in this research during the creative process of digital film scoring project. Although the concepts are sometimes used interchangeably in our everyday life, the distinction between style and genre is as follows. Style is the music related to its musical context, a description and classification strictly based on its musical features. Genre is the music related to its function in a social context (Olsson, 1993). Style and genre are related to the function of music. In style, the aesthetic function and features are emphasized. In genre, the social function of music is emphasized. Olsson (1993) pointed out that the tradition of classical music has emphasized the aesthetic function, picturing music as art, while popular music as rock and punk have emphasized the social function. Definitions of musical style are often centered around formal and external observational features of how the music is organized (Ruud, 1992). Ruud (1992) stated that “such a traditional understanding of the concept of style leads the researcher to search for the patterns in the musical parameters” (p. 76). Therefore, the definition of style includes many of the features of what is described above as genre.

In studying both classical and popular music, the mastering of musical language is essential. Since this study is undertaken in Hong Kong, a melting pot of Eastern and western cultures, bimusical plays an important role in studying the creative process of digital film scoring. From the perspective of music anthropology, Merriam (1964) and Nettl (1983) defined the term bimusical as deep knowledge of the music culture of one’s own and of a foreign music culture. Today there is a plurality of musical styles and genres existing which mutually stimulating and changing one another. Therefore, the mixture of different musical styles and genres may be found in the creative process of digital film scoring. It would be interesting to observe how the student’s bimusical listening habits influence their music making habits in this study.

**Popular music in Hong Kong**

Hong Kong, a multi-cultural metropolis that combines Chinese with western cultures, has been called the melting pot between East and West. A music educator and researcher, Ho (2003) viewed Hong Kong popular music as “the localization of Hong Kong popular music involves a struggle for Cantopop to build a sense of its own authenticity in order to supersede English pop and Mandarin pop” (p. 146). Cantopop has developed since the early 1970s with a demand from Hong Kong audiences for popular music in their own dialect, Cantonese.

With the growth of globalization of popular music, Britain and the United States dominated the production and distribution of popular music in Hong Kong from 1960’s to 1990’s. Hong Kong experienced a period of cultural imperialism. Despite this imperialism, local songwriters such as Joseph Koo and Martin Lai flourished in the 1970s in composing Cantopop songs
demonstrating that Cantopop no longer depended on copying foreign tunes. In the 1980’s, Hong Kong popular music changed to be more localized with their own songwriters, such as Lam Man-Yee, Anthony Lun, James Wong, and Lowell Lo. They composed popular music for local singers with record distributions to Hong Kong, Taiwan, and South-East Asia countries.

Besides the westernized and localized influence in its popular culture, Hong Kong has been inclined towards Japanese youth culture in the 1990s, particularly with the Japanese comics. In the 1990s, Hong Kong has also been influenced, along with Taiwan and China, by Korean popular culture, particularly TV dramas. As a result of these developments from the 1960s to 2000, Hong Kong popular music becomes a product of multi-culturalism. In this study, the use of different musical styles was demonstrated in the student’s digital film scoring project and how these popular cultures influenced the musical styles of the 45 students’ compositions will be examined.

Furthermore, Ho (2003) also pointed out that the changes in economy and technology resulting from globalization had reformed the patterns of production and reception of Hong Kong popular music. “Hong Kong has become a leading centre of high technology in Asia, with its employment of synthesizers, sampling, MIDI sequencing, digital recording, digital sound effect processing, audio-visual synchronization” (p. 153). The new technological tools transformed the use of music technologies in the popular music in Hong Kong. In this study, the investigation involves how music technological tools affect the creative process in the digital film scoring project.

**RESEARCH QUESTIONS**

Students have to compose an original soundtrack for a movie as a task using sequencing software to integrate video, audio and MIDI. This chapter focuses on the significance of using different musical styles in a movie soundtrack. This study consists of 45 participants, cross-stylistic comparisons in their use of musical styles are classified between popular music, classical music, jazz and world music to approach the dramatic situation of the movies provided in the digital film scoring project. Furthermore, the chapter provides two in-depth case studies to compare how student-composers integrate different musical styles in their compositions through the use of music technology.

The research questions addressed in this study are:

1. How does the digital film scoring project reveal the cross-stylistic trends of musical styles in the students’ compositions?
2. How do the participants react to the scene in this project?
3. What are the considerations in choosing the appropriate musical styles during the creative process of a digital film scoring project?

**METHODOLOGY**

For the purpose of this study, the use of different musical styles in students’ composition was analyzed and categorized. From the 45 participants, the researcher observed the MIDI file on the student approach to their musical elements, compositional trends and style traits in the project. Compositional trends and the “cross-over” of musical styles were analyzed. Two student-composers were asked to participate in an in-depth interview about their intuition, problems encountered during the creative process, musical style traits and problem-solving techniques.
In terms of movie selection, two different movie clips were provided for the students to choose to compose their own soundtrack for the selected movie. The first one is *Sherk 2* and the other one is *Shark Tale*.

The purpose of selecting two participants was to compare and contrast the creative process of composing popular music and classical music in this project. Comparative structures by Yin (1994) were adopted to compare the alternative descriptions or explanations of these two cases. A multiple-case report was presented in a question-and-answer format, the advantages are potentially enormous. Yin (1994) reported that “a reader need only examine the answers to the same question or questions within each case study to begin making cross-case comparisons because each reader may be interested in different questions. The entire format facilitates the development of a cross-case analysis tailored to the specific interests of its readers” (p. 135).

**DEFINITIONS**

The use of musical styles in the digital film scoring project was classified into four categories: Pop music, Jazz, World and Classical music. The scope of the study was to observe the generalization of musical styles in the students’ compositions. Different musical styles were defined as follows:

2. Jazz includes: ragtime, swing, big band, blues, Latin, bossa nova, samba, fusion, *et cetera*.

**FINDINGS**

There were 45 students involved in the digital film scoring project. The overall figures for each style may add up to much more than the total number of students because some students include more than one style in the digital film scoring project. There were 30 students composing in classical music, 32 students in pop music, 5 students in jazz and 7 students in world music in their project. Findings were presented and classified into four categories as follows:
MUSIC EDUCATION POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

Page 200

Figure 19.1 The number of students composed with the intended musical style in their digital film scoring project in 2005

Popular music
There were 30 students who composed popular music in their digital film scoring project. Most of their popular music was written in a Cantopop style. Stylistic traits such as recitative melody, simple piano accompaniment, use of long strings line, simple forms were observed. This also revealed strong listening preferences towards popular music of the students in Hong Kong.

Jazz
There were five students who composed jazz in their digital film scoring project. Most of the jazz style was written in swing, blues, or a Latin style. Style traits such as “swing the tune”, re-harmonization techniques, chord substitutions, chord extensions were found. Since some of the students had studied basic jazz harmony and arrangement as one of the electives in the Associate Degree program, these arrangement techniques provided the students an opportunity to apply what they have learnt in this project. However, the small numbers of students writing in jazz also implied that jazz required high levels of harmony background, performance abilities and improvisational capabilities.

World music
There were eight students who composed the soundtrack with non-western instruments. Chinese music or those containing musical elements from other cultures were classified as the world music category in the present study. Stylistic traits such as heterophony texture in Chinese music, traditional scales from Japanese music, the use of non-western instruments such as Gamelan and African drums were observed in the category. Nevertheless, the small numbers also implied that multi-cultural music education required a vast amount of field work research and studies to be able to fully understand music from other cultures.

Classical music
There were 32 students who composed their soundtrack in classical style. Since most of the students received classical training on their first instrument, classical music has been chosen by the students as the mostly selected style in this project. However, most of their compositional techniques were quite limited to the use of arpeggios, scales, alberti basses, and ostinatos. Only a
few advanced students applied chromatic harmony, some twentieth century harmony and the orchestration techniques in their soundtracks.

To sum up, different styles and genres of music were observed in their music-making habits in the soundtrack. The intention of their compositional style implied that the multi-culturalism in Hong Kong popular music has a vast amount of influences in both their listening habits and music-making habits in this study.

TWO CASE STUDY REPORTS

Following the findings of the overall distribution of the musical styles in the students’ compositions, two in-depth individual interviews were conducted after the submission of the projects. The data was presented as two case studies of a detailed description during the creative process in this project. The purpose of selecting two participants was to compare and contrast the creative process of composing popular music and classical music in this project. These two exemplary cases were chosen from the survey from the above-mentioned figure 19.1 that the top two selected categories were: Classical and Popular music. One case was selected from classical music and the other case was selected from popular music based on these five criteria mentioned by Yin (1994) who states that case studies must be significant, complete, consider alternative perspectives, display sufficient evidence, and composed in an engaging manner. Student profiles from these two cases were presented and evidence of the students’ scores to approach the movie were illustrated in the following two sections.

The Profile of the Two Student Composers

Wong C. K. obtained Grade 8 in Piano and Grade 8 in Vocal from the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM). She graduated with distinction in the Associate of Arts (Music) degree program from HKIEd. She won the third prize of competition for children’s choral music composition from the Hong Kong Treble Choir Association and champion in songwriting from the Hong Kong International Institute of Music. Below is her composition (Figure 19.2).

![Figure 19.2](image)

Lo C. obtained Grade 8 from ABRSM in both piano and saxophone. He was the Champion of 55th School Music Festival Senior Class Saxophone Solo and the first runner-up of Yamaha Wind Instrument Karaoke Contest 2004. He graduated from the Associate Degree program in music with an emphasis in music production, such as jazz arranging and film scoring. Below is his composition (Figure 19.3).

![Figure 19.3](image)
A Comparative Study of Two Cases in Classical Music and Popular Music during the Creative Process of a Digital Film Scoring Project

A multiple-case report was presented in a question-and-answer format with the interview questions and responses of the two students.

Wong for Wong C. K.
Lo for Lo C.

1. What was your overall impression about this “Digital Film Scoring” project?
Wong: I thought it was an interesting project to pursue because there were new things to encounter, such as composing for media. It was a great challenge to me. This project provided professional knowledge about the music industry.
Lo: It was an exciting and creative experience for me to be a film composer in this project. Overall, it was a practical module equipped with professional music production knowledge.

2. What did you learn from this project?
Wong: I learnt a lot from the sequencing software applications, particularly the interaction between visual images and music. This project enlightened me to encounter some musical styles that I had never composed before. Previous research in a particular musical style was important to suit the overall mood of the movie.
Lo: I learnt a lot in the applications of the sequencing software and composing for the media.

3. What was the decision-making process of the musical style you intended to compose for your soundtrack?
Wong: I intended to compose in ternary form (ABA). However, the repeated A section did not fit the storyboard of the movie. To solve this problem, I changed to binary form and extended the B section.
Lo: I intended to compose with tensions and clusters used in twentieth century music to describe the storyboard of the movie “Shark’s tale”.

4. Are there any style traits in your piece that could represent the musical style you intended to compose?
Wong: I would classify my soundtrack into three sections. The first section was in pop
ballad style with descending bass pattern. The second section was like a scherzo with chromatic ascending scale when the music was chasing the images, like “mickey-mousing”. The third section was a dance suite with syncopated rhythm.

Lo: I would classify my soundtrack into three sections. The first section started with ostinato in accelerando. The second section was inspired from the *Rite of Spring* by Stravinsky with the irregular accent describing the primitive instinct of the sharks. The third section ended with an ostinato in a whole tone scale.

5. Where did you learn the style traits from the musical style you intended to compose?
Wong: I learnt the style traits from mass media, such as the New Generation concert, Radio 4, and movies from DVDs. Also, I did some score analysis in popular tunes and classical music. I found out lots of similarities in their harmony.
Lo: I learnt the style traits from mass media, such as TV cartoon network and movies from DVDs.

6. What were the differences between studying popular music and classical music?
Wong: I studied popular music by myself with chord symbols. I studied classical music with an instructor because it was more exam-oriented.
Lo: From my intuition, classical music was strict. When you played the music, you must follow the rules. However, popular music was more flexible although it also had certain rules to follow. Popular music gave me more room to be a creative improviser. That was the main difference.

7. What was the role of music technology in your creative process?
Wong: I really liked the multi-track recording functions of the sequencing software. It was really handy to revise the music with the editing functions. The marker in the software was accurate to synchronize the video, MIDI and audio at the same time. Also, the MIDI keyboard saved me lots of time to write the piano part with a pencil.
Lo: I really liked the instant feedback functions of the sequencing software. It was really handy to revise the music with the editing functions. The marker in the software was accurate to synchronize the video, MIDI and audio at the same time. This saved lots of time, particularly in arranging for large ensembles.

8. How did you convert the timing in the movie into musical notations in the sequencing software?
Wong: I would follow the instructions given by the instructor. The methodology started with creating markers, thinking of musical styles, deciding instrumentation, composing musical phrases and then finally adding the sound effects.
Lo: I would follow the instructions given by the instructor. The methodology started with creating markers, thinking of musical styles, deciding instrumentation, composing musical phrase and then finally adding the sound effects.

9. What was the role of the instructor of this project?
Wong: The instructor provided the methodology, workflow and tutorial in this project.
Lo: The instructor had provided the methodology, musical examples, workflow and tutorial in this project.

10. Were you satisfied with this project and how can it be improved?
Wong: More musical examples would be helpful in learning a new musical style that I had not encountered before. Now, I would pay more attention to the film music,
and music for TV commercials in how the music could be improved.

Lo: I learnt a lot from this project and would like to be a composer for media or film as my career in the future.

RESPONSE TO RESEARCH QUESTIONS

From the interview scripts of the case study, a comparison between the creative process of composing popular music and classical music was articulated to answer the Research Questions 1, 2 and 3.

1. Responding to Research Question 1 - how does the digital film scoring project reveal the cross-stylistic trends of musical styles in the students’ compositions?

   The digital film scoring project revealed the cross-stylistic trends of musical styles in interview questions 3, 4 and 5. For example, in interview questions 4, Wong responded, “I would classify my soundtrack into three sections. The first section was in pop ballad style with descending bass pattern. The second section was like a Scherzo with chromatic ascending scale to chase the images, like ‘mickey-mousing’. The third section was a dance suite with syncopated rhythm”. Lo responded, “I would classify my soundtrack into three sections. The first section started with ostinato in accelerando. The second section was inspired from the Rite of Spring by Stravinsky with the irregular accent describing the primitive instinct of the sharks. The third section ended with an ostinato in a whole tone scale”. Therefore, the cross-stylistic trends were clearly shown in the creative process of film scoring in case study I and II.

2. Responding to Research Question 2 - how do the selected participants react to the scene in this project?

   Lo in interview question 8 described that the methodology of converting the timings in the movie into musical notations in the sequencing software, “I started with creating markers, thinking of musical styles, deciding instrumentation, composing musical phrase and then finally adding the sound effects”. Wong had a similar methodology of approaching the visual images with the musical notations. This reveals that the use of different musical styles in the digital film scoring project did not affect the methodology of treating the visual images in the movie.

3. Responding to Research Question 3 - what are the considerations in choosing the appropriate musical styles during the creative process of a digital film scoring project?

   The decision-making process of choosing the appropriate musical style for Wong had to do with the storyboard, and the form and structure of the music. For Lo, the compositional technique was emphasized in “tensions and clusters” in the decision-making process.

DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS AND IMPLICATIONS

Film Scoring as Problem-Solving Techniques

The significance of the present study reflects the importance of studying film music. Professional composers, Karlin and Wright (2004) explain how the musical elements, such as melody, harmony, rhythm, and orchestration are used as the compositional devices during the creative process in film scoring. Students have to provide a musical treatment to the storyboard and overall mood with the use of different musical elements. The marker in the sequencing software saves lots of time to align the visual images and music. However, the musical form is also limited by the frame and the length of the movie. This project involves a high degree of creativity in music, problem-solving techniques, and critical thinking skills to the students. Digital film
scoring can be perceived as a composition task for the students to develop their problem-solving skills in their capacity to sense the musical possibilities. Students have to make musical decisions with many possible answers (musical treatment) to the musical problems (sync point). In this setting, they experience how to think divergently when constraints or a number of musical problems have been imposed.

**Music Technology and Creativity**

Savage (2005) suggests the use of sound design in composition with software *Sound2picture*. There were six steps to follow in the compositional process. Some of the findings from Savage (2005) concurred with the present study. In the present study, students had to think visually and understand the storyboard first and correlated with “thinking in pictures” by Savage (2005). They found a suitable musical style to fit in and compose section by section and correlated with the source: choosing the overall sound and the visual cue: choosing specific sound by Savage (2005). Finally, students came up with different sections with different musical styles and this correlated with “the final mix” by Savage (2005). Similarities were found in the creative process of using software in sound design and digital film scoring. This correlation showed that the creative process of using music technology to compose was essential in the teaching and learning process, but not only the creative product.

**Teaching and Learning of Different Musical Styles**

Findings from the present study reflected the teaching and learning process of a digital film scoring project and the use of different musical styles in the soundtrack. Researchers seek approaches to teach different musical styles by means of film scoring with music technology. The intrinsic motivation to learn a new musical style was reflected in the interview scripts of the case study. Students applied their previous musical knowledge in their creative process and learnt new styles from listening to CDs, DVDs, score analysis, mass media, *et cetera*. In order to understand a musical style thoroughly, students have to explore how different musical elements interact in a musical style to accomplish their project. During the creative process, *bi-musicality* is observed. Wong borrowed the descending bass line pattern from popular music, and minuet and trio form from classical music in her project. Lo borrowed the improvisation techniques from popular music and used irregular accent from the Stravinsky’s *Rite of Spring*. The borderline between classical music and popular music become more and more obscure in the next generation’s compositions.

**CONCLUSION**

To conclude, the findings of Figure 19.1 in the digital film scoring project implies that the use of different musical styles played a vital role in the creative process of the digital film scoring project. In this study, the students use formally-acquired skills and knowledge to produce their scores. However, the style that the students use were not only classical music, but also involve other musical styles in their soundtrack. In this study, the popular music that the student has composed is heavily influenced by classical music procedures. Since the teaching and learning of different genres in Baroque, classical, romantic and twentieth century music have been adopting in the school music curriculum, a formal music curriculum in popular music, especially in the teaching and learning of different musical styles are included in the New Senior Secondary (NSS) Music Curriculum and Assessment Framework in 2009. To enhance the awareness of how the popular musicians learn in a particular musical style for the in-service teachers, seminars and workshops in composing and arranging with popular music are provided in 2007. Furthermore, the study of film scoring techniques can be further extended in the future research, particularly in the alignment of visual images and musical accent. Moreover, from the findings of the case study,
it implies that the teaching and learning process of popular music and classical music is found quite different, especially in composing, performing and listening. This would lead to the development of formal music training in popular music to prepare for the future teachers’ education in Hong Kong.

REFERENCES


discover what we know. *Journal of Aesthetic Education, 22*(1), 75-88.


Chapter 20

A Discussion of the Effects of the Yo-kyoku Experiential Learning Program for Music Teachers

Yayoi BITOH

The sensitivity of contemporary people is not the same as ancient people whose food, clothing and shelter were different. Through studying and experiencing yo-kyoku, a kind of Japanese traditional vocal music developed 640 years ago, Japanese people could feel and develop empathy for the culture, way of thinking, and spirituality of the period. Today there is a need to promote education for international understanding in Japan. It is indispensable for Japanese people not only to understand and accept other peoples’ cultures but also the Japanese culture. As such, people in Japan are more conscious to learn about their own culture. Music is one of the cultural activities that could be understood, acquired, and conceptualized through continuous participation. However, most Japanese including music teachers have limited opportunities to listen to Japanese traditional music and musical instruments, except for example, during the New Year’s Day celebrations.

In Japan, the national music curriculum for junior high school and senior high school, 2002 and 2003 respectively, require students to play Japanese traditional instruments and sing traditional songs (The Ministry of Education, 1999a; 1999b). Before the revision of the national music curricula, school education merely focused on the appreciation of Japanese traditional music such as choral performances because teachers lacked the relevant experience in other genres of traditional Japanese music. Moreover, in-service and pre-service music teachers could obtain music credits through learning Western music. As a result, most Japanese music teachers have little experience of learning traditional Japanese music. Since the announcement of the new national music curriculum, music teachers are obligated to learn traditional music in order to teach. Teachers started to acquire the teaching methods, to assess students’ performance techniques, and to experience and understand the features of Japanese music and culture. However, the methods in training music teachers to play Japanese traditional instruments among universities varied, and the training have not been well implemented.

Most Japanese traditional music, except shakuhachi, is accompanied by voice. For examples, shoumyou, hei-kyou, noh, nagauta, and bunraku have their own vocal sections. Noh, flourished in the Muromachi Era (1368- ) and has passed on for over 640 years, greatly affected modern Japanese music established in the Edo Era (1603-1868). Recently, the United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) added noh onto the Intangible Cultural Heritage list.

This chapter focuses on the study of teaching yo-kyoku and the vocal part of noh. The writer aims to create and implement a program to teach a basic way of singing yo-kyoku in a short period of time, and examines and considers the learning outcomes, in order to utilize the results for future instruction.

REVIEW OF THE RELATED LITERATURE

Features of Japanese Music Culture and Japanese Traditional Music in Yo-kyoku

Japanese music was influenced by Confucianism (which cherishes manner and music), Buddhism,
and Japanese traditional ideas on nature (Kikkawa, 1975). According to Kikkawa (1975), Japanese music consists of five features: love of monophony, lingering sound, noise, songs, and timbre. Motegi (1995) proposes to study Japanese music through intervals and tonality; tempo and meter; collective sound such as harmony; and the relationship between compositional method of music works and other arts in order to understand the precise features of Japanese music. In an earlier publication, Motegi (1988) points out that Japanese traditional vocal music consists of three elements: tone, word, and breath. Tone relates to the voice, vocalism, and lingering sound; word includes accent and the pronunciation to convey meaning to the listener, and breath has to do with various expressions made by the changes of rhythm, tempo, voice tone, and others.

With the comprehensive consideration of the relation between yo-kyoku and the above three elements, yo-kyoku seems to be relating to all elements, prioritized to singing as discussed by Kikkawa (1975). Specifically, a playing method called umi-ji. It involves vowel alliteration such as “Ka-a-a-a-” in which tunes change with the extension of the last sound of a word. It is connected with a single tone and lingering sound with higher priority, and then the ‘timbre’. This connection creates three ways of singing:

1. Mitsu-yuri is the way of singing in which after a vowel in a word is repeated three times by changing the pitch, it is pronounced like “I I I — I —”;
2. Hon-yuri is the way of singing in which a vowel in a word is repeated nine times by changing the pitch occasionally, and emphasized like “I I I I I I I I I — I —”; and
3. Iri-mawashi is the way of singing in which by changing the pitch the vowel in a word is repeated twice to express, and emphasize the interpretation of the word (shown in the circle in Figure 20.1). (Miyake, 2001; Fujinami, 2004)

Moreover, there is another way of singing in which voiced and unvoiced sounds are mixed, and appropriate expressions are used depending on the scene and sentiment of the singer. It is also related to the timbre and unpitched sound, word, and breath. This is why yo-kyoku includes all the features of Japanese music.

Figure 20.1  Horizontal writing score showing lengths of sound and changes in pitch in issei
About the learning methods of Japanese traditional music

The following is a summary of the learning methods of traditional Japanese music:

1. The acquisition method requiring the learners to listen to and imitate playing. It is a comprehensive way of learning which emphasizes the learners’ intuition.
2. The learners’ attitude of independent learning is stressed.
3. The learners study and acquire the techniques wholeheartedly and accept the master’s model of playing. The learners may then refrain from using the model and demonstrate their own individual styles of playing.

Due to fundamental differences in places where traditional Japanese music is taught, duration of time and periods allocated in schools, the number of learners and their diverse learning motivations, it is difficult to apply the traditional learning methods. This is also true in the training of the incumbent teachers. In order to learn under various constraints, it is best to adopt the diversified teaching method of Miyagi (1936) who supports “teach part-by-part and let the learners recognize the whole later” (pp. 267-268). This method is designed for the learners to learn the techniques and contents in a short period of time.

Literature on the implementation of Yo-kyoku

In Japan, there are a few cases focusing on practicing yo-kyoku in teacher education programs, and other school curricula. One of the few examples is the development of teaching materials including the learning of noh by experiencing music through practice. The program was conducted by the music education study group of the Kanazawa City Junior High School (Appreciation Group, 2004) through the instruction of a noh actor. However, to date there is no study examining the effectiveness of the program.

Furiya (2000) suggests cross-cultural learning through music. A learning program for Japanese folk music and its practice was proposed. It emphasized five aspects: the use of original cultural instruments and ways of singing; the musical aesthetics of the original culture; the authentic way of disseminating an original culture; the direct teaching approach inherited through cultural successors; and the cultural background and musical sense of traditional music.

RESEARCH METHOD

The Yo-kyoku teaching program in this study

The main points of the teaching program in this study are:

- the experience learning approach on yo-kyoku;
- the use of a horizontal written score which shows the length of sound and pitch changes (Figure 20.1), and the vertical written score which shows the meter and pitch (Figure 20.2). These are modified scores that are more easily understood by learners in learning to sing yo-kyoku, and are similar to the learning of much traditional Japanese music which emphasizes, “Listen to the teacher’s playing, imitate, express, and acquire the music” (Ikuta, 1987. In the past, learners only used original scores (Figures 20.3 & 20.4, Kanze, 2000) which, from the author’s own learning experience of yo-kyoku, is not effective in understanding and learning to sing yo-kyoku;
- a focus on the interesting parts of the ways of singing yo-kyoku one-by-one in order to understand the features and differences of the three parts mentioned in Table 20.1;
- not to follow the instructions given by noh actors, instead use the singing of the noh actor in the CD (Tsukiji Shobou, 1995); and
- to try to teach as much as possible in two and a half hours.
Figure 20.2  Vertical writing score showing meter and pitch in nori-ji
Figure 20.3  Original score of issei

Figure 20.4  Original score of nori-ji

Figure 20.5  Score of speech
Table 20.1  Contents of the yo-kyoku teaching program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning Contents</th>
<th>Survey</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Watch and listen to the highlights of <em>Hagoromo</em> (NHK Software, 2003) for 15 minutes</td>
<td>Pre-Program Survey / Survey about noh: Items 1 and 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Explain briefly the outline of noh, the musical instruments, the stage, and the roles of the characters (Bitoh, 2004)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Explain various ways of noh singing, such as the words and fushi [a kind of melody], strong and weak chanting, and various sub-sections (Asami, 1993)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Distribute the score of <em>Hagoromo</em> (Kanze, 2000)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Translate the words to modern Japanese and explain the meaning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Practise singing by using the *horizontal written score which shows the length of sound and changes in pitch in the issei part (Figure 20.1)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Practise singing by using the *vertical written score showing meter and pitch in nori-ji (Figure 20.2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 *Present the score of “speech” (Figure 20.5) which is the basic form of word intonation of each character: shite (main character), waki (sub-character), and practice singing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Explain the ways of reading the original notation in each part</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Sing in a dialogue form between shite and waki</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Watch and listen to the highlights of <em>Hagoromo</em> after learning for 15 minutes</td>
<td>Post-Program survey / Items 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Survey Items and Methods

In this study, 24 people (including 7 teachers and 17 students) took the program (Table 20.1). A survey was conducted before and after the end of the program in both quantitative and qualitative aspects. The quantitative part utilizes a 5-point scale (5: very much, 4: yes, 3: moderately, 2: slightly, 1: no) for 38 questions about the understanding (questions 1-19) and sensuous impression (questions 20-38) with respect to various musical elements of yo-kyoku; levels of singing using different scores; and self-evaluation of the learning of yo-kyoku. The qualitative part invites open comments before and after watching and listening to the video of *Hagoromo*; and after learning yo-kyoku.

SURVEY RESULTS

Survey on noh

The results of the pre-program survey in Table 20.2 shows that only four of the 24 people have enjoyed noh live, and none of them has the experience of learning yo-kyoku. As for knowledge about noh and yo-kyoku, they had only superficial knowledge such as putting on a noh face and watching noh on television. Nobody knew any titles of noh plays or musical features of noh. The results indicated that 75% of the learners showed interest in noh primarily because they wanted to know something about Japanese traditional culture, the history and the playing method of noh, the ways of singing yo-kyoku, and enjoying noh live. In other words, they are interested in noh. However, they have had no opportunities to enjoy it. Thus it is necessary to provide teachers with a program for learning yo-kyoku.

Table 20.2  Results of the survey about noh (n = 24, survey of 7 incumbent teachers and 17 students)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Number of responses</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Would you like to use noh in your class? (only for seven incumbent teachers)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No response</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
214 MUSIC EDUCATION POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

2 Are you familiar with noh?
   Yes 10 42%
   No 13 54%
   No response 1 4%

3 Have you ever seen noh live?
   Yes 4 17%
   No 20 83%

4 Have you ever experienced noh play?
   Yes 0 0%
   No 24 100%

5 Are you interested in noh?
   Yes 18 75%
   No 6 25%

6 Would you like to be able to sing yo-kyoku?
   Yes 13 54%
   No 10 42%
   Unknown 1 4%

Quantitative survey before and after watching and listening to the highlights of Hagoromo
This part is the results of a t-test of an average of a five-grade survey (see Table 20.3) and of differences in samples corresponding to differences in pre-program and posteriori averages. Results of 18 questions had significant differences with less than 5% of significant level. They are questions number 1, 2, 3, 7, 15 and 22 (p=0.000), 4, 12 and 16 (p =0.001), 8 (p=0.015), 9 and 14 (p=0.004), 11 (p=0.003), 20 (p=0.018), 25 (p=0.029), 26 and 30 (p=0.002), and 36 (p=0.015). For various musical elements in yo-kyoku, 12 out of 19 questions had significant differences. For sensuous impression, 6 out of 19 questions had significant differences.

Table 20.3 Survey before and after watching and listening to the highlights of Hagoromo (n = 24)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Pre-program average</th>
<th>Post-program average</th>
<th>Difference in average</th>
<th>Significance probability (both sides)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Did/Do you understand roughly the contents of the story?</td>
<td>2.68</td>
<td>4.09</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Did/Do you understand the meanings of the words?</td>
<td>2.52</td>
<td>3.73</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Can you comprehend the words?</td>
<td>2.72</td>
<td>3.95</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Can you identify changes in pitch or movement of sound?</td>
<td>3.86</td>
<td>4.47</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Can you feel the expression of the intonation of words?</td>
<td>3.90</td>
<td>4.50</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>0.056</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Can you recognize kobushi, mawashi, yuri, or portamento?</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>4.04</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Did/Do you think that there was/is difference in expression between shite and waki?</td>
<td>2.73</td>
<td>4.52</td>
<td>1.78</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Did/Do you think there was/is a change in tempo in one sentence?</td>
<td>2.81</td>
<td>3.68</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Did/Do you think there was/is a change in tempo depending on the contents of expression of the story?</td>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>4.09</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Did/Do you think there was/is difference in strength of expression, sound power and ways of inserting ki?</td>
<td>3.58</td>
<td>4.04</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Did/Do you think there was/is rhythm in reciting the words?</td>
<td>3.04</td>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Did/Do you think there were/are metric and non-metric pulses?</td>
<td>2.66</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Was/Is the expression of words (motifs and nuances) complicated?</td>
<td>3.28</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>0.055</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Was/Is the sentimental expression of words</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>3.86</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In terms of various musical elements, the averages of the learners’ understanding of yo-kyoku increase in all the 19 questions. Through experiential learning, the learners were able to understand not only the general content of the story but also the words and meanings in the performance. Moreover, they began to appreciate yo-kyoku and recognized the subtle changes in the expression of the characters, and their differences depending on scenes and sentiments of the characters.

As for sensuous impression, yo-kyoku is difficult to become familiar with. For example, the comment of a learner before taking this program was, “I feel sleepy; it seems difficult; I do not appreciate it”. This impression is generally found from the learners before taking the program. However, after taking this program, there were significant differences in results with regard to questions such as number 20: Was/Is the way of singing easy to become familiar with?; 30: Did/Do you like yo-kyoku?; and 36: Did/Does yo-kyoku make you sleepy?. These are the major results of the experiential learning. In other words, the learners became familiar with the ways of singing yo-kyoku, became interested in yo-kyoku, came to like yo-kyoku, and did not feel sleepy when listening to yo-kyoku. In short, by giving them the experience, they came to appreciate the expressive details of performance and started to enjoy yo-kyoku. There are also significant differences for questions number 22: Did/Do you think that yo-kyoku have cheerful sound? 25:
Did/Do you think that yo-kyoku have a comfortable tempo?; and 26: Did/Do you think that yo-kyoku was/is beautiful? Consequently, through the experience of playing nori-ji, learners found it wrong that the music of yo-kyoku was quiet, dark, and slow. Instead, they felt that the music of yo-kyoku was rich in rhythmic sense.

Even though there is no significant difference, improvements in learning outcomes can still be found in four questions (Number 23, 32, 37 and 38 respectively):

1. Did/Do you think that yo-kyoku have complicated expression of words? The average decreases 13% because learners began to feel that yo-kyoku was not very complicated as they understood how to sing yo-kyoku.
2. Did/Does yo-kyoku have a slow tempo? The average declines 34% because learners recognized that yo-kyoku did not only have parts with a slow tempo but also parts with rhythmic sense like nori-ji. Moreover, they did not feel yo-kyoku slow because they recognized the slight changes in nuance in the performance.
3. Was/Is yo-kyoku simple? The average increases 17% because they no longer felt that yo-kyoku was difficult, but it was in fact rather simple as they understood the structure and ways of singing yo-kyoku in the learning program.
4. Was/Is yo-kyoku gloomy? The average decreases 34% because they recognized that yo-kyoku was rhythmical and beautiful after they learned from the program. Moreover, they recognized that each word had its sentiment.

Through this experiential learning, the learners deepened their understanding of yo-kyoku, came to appreciate it, and became more aware of the differences, and thus fostered their appreciation of yo-kyoku.

Devices of Musical score

This section discusses consideration of the results of the quantitative survey, comments, and the qualitative survey about ease of singing by using different scores (Table 20.4 and 20.5).

Table 20.4  Survey of easiness of singing using different scores (n = 24, multiple answers allowed)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score Form</th>
<th>Ease of Singing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Original score of yo-kyoku (Figures 20.3 and 20.4)</td>
<td>4 persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vertical writing score showing meter and pitch in nori-ji (Figure 20.2)</td>
<td>19 persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horizontal writing showing length of sound and changes in pitch in issei (Figure 20.1)</td>
<td>10 persons</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 20.5  Results of self-evaluation of the learning status of Hagoromo (n = 24)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Very good</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Fair</th>
<th>Failure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Issei (Figure 20.1)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speech of shite</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speech of waki</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nori-ji (Figure 20.2)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the survey about ease of singing by using different scores (Table 20.4 and 20.5), it is found that the vertical and horizontal writing music scores were easier for beginners to learn and acquire the singing of yo-kyoku. About 79% and 42% responded that it was easier to sing yo-kyoku when they used the vertical and horizontal scores. Reasons for these responses include:

- It was visually easier to understand meters and pitches.
- We understood the parts by singing with the meter.
It was easier to understand yo-kyoku using musical scores which show the rise and fall of the pitches in the diagram.

Musical scores which show the ways of singing were better because it was impossible to understand the original score at a glance even after an explanation of how to read it.

The result reveals the reasons why the scores showing the framework of different ways of singing were easier to use.

As for self evaluation of the learning status of Hagoromo (yo-kyoku) (Table 20.5), all the 24 learners replied “very good”; “good”; or “fair” for issei, speech of waki, and nori-ji, and 23 for speech of shite. The results show that in using a score showing different framework of ways of singing, most learners can acquire the specific ways of singing and singing pattern of yo-kyoku. Reasons for these responses include it was easier to sing yo-kyoku using the nori-ji vertical score and to approach the song’s melody in nori-ji. The results show that it was especially easier for those learners who had learned western music to sing yo-kyoku using the vertical score.

Pre-program and Post-program Qualitative Survey of Watching and Listening to the Highlights of Hagoromo
The study divides the pre-program and post-program comments of learners into three categories on the understanding of the story, the vocal part and expression of the words, and noh in general (except for singing). For the understanding of the story, comments in the pre-program survey include, “I do not understand either the word’s meaning or contents” and “I cannot understand the content.” However, comments in the post-program survey include, “I understood the words” and “I enjoyed it because I was able to understand the flow of the story”. It is clear that by understanding the content and the words, the learners increased their appreciation of yo-kyoku.

For the vocal part and the expression of the words, comments in the pre-program survey include, “I cannot understand the melody”, “it is just like the Buddhist scriptures” and “I can hardly understand its tempo”. These responses reflect that the learners did not understand various musical factors. However, comments in the post-program survey include:

I understood nori-ji’s rhythm quite well.

Nori-ji was rhythmical and I enjoyed it very much.

It was easy to get familiar with it.

It made profound expression.

The genuine character gave perfect vocal sound,

It had very mysterious atmosphere depending on ways of singing yo-kyoku.

These comments indicate that the learners appreciate various musical factors. There are also some other comments of satisfaction: “I enjoyed singing yo-kyoku very much”, and “once I started to sing yo-kyoku, I enjoyed it very much”. Consequently, we found that the learners appreciate the differences in the ways of singing and the subtle nuances. The effects of experiential learning in this study are evident. For noh in general except in singing, comments in the pre-program survey include:

This is the first time for me to listen to noh seriously.
Since it is unfamiliar to me, I feel it is complicated.

However, traditional music has its own flavor because it has a strong spirit, I enjoy it.

I feel strange about the fact that both the actors and the musicians appeared on the same stage.

It was a very good performance with high spirits because those who sang yo-kyoku and those who played the instruments behind or by the side of actors pumped up the performance.

Learners have a rough understanding of the stage, playing format, and the performance of the noh as a whole. However, it is difficult for them to grasp the details of the performance. Comments in the post-program survey include:

I knew fairly about the story of Ama no Hagoromo, but listening to the story in yo-kyoku made it more mysterious and with deeper expression.

I enjoyed the rhythmical nori-ji because it had instrumental performance; I found a peculiar sense of tension in the form of the characters’ posture and clothes.

I found a spiritual power and sense of tension.

I could not let my mind drift away from yo-kyoku and considerable amount of concentration is required.

After the studying the program, the learners have a deeper understanding of the performance through the various expressions.

**Learning of Yo-kyoku**

Three aspects were examined in the learning of yo-kyoku: the vocal parts and expression of the words, noh in general except in singing, and the preparation for teaching students. For the vocal parts and expression of the words, there were many comments about what the participants felt from their experiences, including difficult points to perform, and the desire to learn further. Through their experiences, they commented, “I enjoyed nori-ji and felt it was close to me because it had melody and meter; I had thought that yo-kyoku had few changes in sound or rhythm, but I was surprised to find out that it was very intricate; I learned many things through experiencing yo-kyoku”. With regard to learning difficulties, they stated, “I understood the differences in ways of expression between shite and waki, but it was difficult to distinguish it in singing; I felt it is easier to express the words of waki.” As for their future desire to learn yo-kyoku, they said:

I hope I can sing a piece of yo-kyoku by looking at an original score.

I believe I would perform better if I add emphasis to each word and improved ways of extending the words.

I want to know how to produce a specific voice and words that are not indicated on the score.

For noh in general except in singing, there were many comments about what they wanted to
know and could recognize about noh. For comments about what they wanted to know, some stated:

I want to know the difference in expression of different actors and performance schools.

I want to study Japanese traditional culture further.

I want to listen to a yo-kyoku performance live.

I want to know what stories are available in yo-kyoku.

For comments about what they could recognize, two mentioned, “I recognized that it was a distinguish culture with rich expression”, and “I thought it was one of the Japanese classical arts that we should inherit”.

As for the preparation for teaching students, there were many comments about the important focus in instruction and methods of instruction. For comments about focus in instruction, some stated:

Students can learn good things about Japan such as manners.

This is a good teaching material to let students ponder the traditional Japanese quiet and comfortable mind.

I think it is appropriate for Japanese people to experience this peculiar rhythm and pitch in yo-kyoku.

For comments about methods of instruction, some said, “I believe it is interesting to allocate roles to students like we did this time”, and “I believe we can teach this because yo-kyoku has changes in pitch and beat”. Therefore, through experiencing it, learners not only recognized the details of musical elements but also came to have a strong desire to learn further. They also recognized that they could develop teaching materials using yo-kyoku.

CONCLUSION

Before the program, 75% of the learners showed interest about noh. However, they knew nothing about noh, yo-kyoku or their musical features. Because of the implementation of the learning program in this study, they understood features of Japanese musical culture inherited from noh. By experiencing yo-kyoku they:

1. Understood characters of the story and meanings of their scripts;
2. Recognized that yo-kyoku was music with a variety of changes in musical elements such as rhythm, pitch, tempo, timbre, and vocal tone;
3. Recognized the complexity of intonation of words and nuances of expression, and also understood differences of each way of singing and were able to sing yo-kyoku; and
4. Learned with ease and were able to understand the ways of singing in a short period of time and to sing yo-kyoku through reading the scores (including the horizontal, vertical, and the diagram score).

Even though learners understood the value, complexity, and difficulties of learning yo-kyoku, it is still necessary to make further improvements and ingenuity of learning methods, and secure
more time for learning, so that learners could have confidence to teach yo-kyoku and develop their own singing techniques. To further enhance the quality of the program, I would like to invite a noh specialist actor as guest performer for the learners to learn the spirit of the expression and to acquire delicate techniques, and in turn pass this on to their students.

REFERENCES


Chapter 21

The Learning Motivations, Adjustments, and Career Expectations of Taiwanese University Students Majoring in Chinese and Traditional Music

Chia Ling LU and Chun Fei YANG

In Taiwan, Chinese music refers to modern Chinese classical music in a restricted sense, usually performed by the instruments of modern Chinese orchestra. It is a reformed genre of music influenced by western classical music, and was also a product of the desire to modernize (Wong, 1994). Another term “traditional music” refers to the traditional genres of Taiwanese music. It includes the musical traditions of the Han people in Taiwan and Taiwanese indigenous people. The musical traditions of the Han people in Taiwan, mostly refers to the musical traditions of Hokkien and Hakkanae immigrations (Lin, 1995). In a broad sense, the term “traditional music” also includes the musical traditions of other immigrations from Mainland China (Lin, 1995).

CHINESE MUSIC EDUCATION IN TAIWAN

At the end of the nineteenth century, Taiwan became a colony of Japan. The Japanese government started a modern educational system in Taiwan by modelling western school systems and curricula. After the Republic of China took over Taiwan in 1945, the music curriculum remained westernized, though the Japanese contents were removed (Yik, 1976). There were two main forces that brought Chinese music into the school music curriculum. First, the government made Mandarin Chinese the main language. All dialects were prohibited in schools, and limitations were set on using dialects at public occasions as well as through mass communication from 1948 to 1993 (Tzeng, 1996). The purpose of the promotion of Mandarin Chinese as the national language was to remove the Japanese influences and to accelerate the process of unifying people of different linguistic backgrounds. As a result of the restriction, most traditional genres of music associated with the dialects declined, only modern Chinese music and Peking operas were promoted. They were advocated because they were deemed to be the cream of traditional Chinese music (Lin, 1995).

Second, during the 1960s, the government in Taiwan advocated nationalism and patriotism attempting to preserve Chinese culture to counter-act the Cultural Revolution in Mainland China. Chinese orchestras were founded in schools as extra-curricula associations at first (Wong, 1994). In 1963, the first Chinese music department was founded in the National Arts School, a 5-year public junior college. It was upgraded to be a 4-year college called the National Taiwan College of Arts in 1994, and the National Taiwan University of Arts (NTUA) in 2001 (NTUA, 2007). Currently, there are three Chinese music departments: two 4-year university programs and one 7-year program (from high school levels to university levels). In addition, some music departments and music education departments in Taiwan accept a few Chinese music majors, though they are western music oriented programs. Regarding the talented music programs between 1st grade and 12th grade in Taiwan, talented music students are assembled in a music division, and they take all academic courses together. Only a few of these music programs are called talented Chinese music programs. The majority of the talented music programs specialize in western music; however, some of them also take a few Chinese music majors in addition to western music majors.
The inclusion of traditional Taiwanese music

Traditional genres of Taiwanese music were not included in formal educational programs until after the former president Teng-hui Lee declared the termination of the Period of National Mobilization for Suppression of the Communist Rebellion, and abolished the Temporary Provisions Effective During the Period of Communist Rebellion in 1991 (Office of the president, 2005). The Department of Taiwanese opera was then established in the National Fu Hsing Dramatic Arts Academy in 1994, which was expanded and renamed the National Taiwan Junior College of Performing Arts in 1999, and the Department of Hakka Opera was also established there in 2001 (NTJCPA, 2005).

A theatre music department was founded in the National Fu Hsing Dramatic Arts Academy in 1988, originally for training accompanists for Peking operas only. The department was renamed the Department of Traditional Chinese Music later, and placed emphasis on training accompanists for both Chinese and Taiwanese operas (NTJCPA, 2005). It was a 10-year program from 5th grade to junior college level. In addition, another traditional music department was founded in the National Institute of the Arts in 1995, which was renamed Taipei National University of the Arts in 2001 (TNUA, 2005). Although the above-mentioned traditional music departments focus on the teaching of traditional musical genres, the musical genres taught in the departments varied.

TALENTED MUSIC PROGRAMS

The following studies mainly reported the situations of western music majors in Taiwan because no studies concerning students’ learning in Chinese or traditional music programs could be located. Regarding the motivations of studying in talented music programs, individual interests and parental expectations seemed to be the most important reasons. Lee (2000) reported that 53.0% of the students enrolled in talented music programs in Taiwan for personal interest, 50.6% for parental expectations, and 20.3% were encouraged by their teachers. Shaw (1995) pointed out that being in talented music programs added considerable expense to students’ parents. Parents’ expectations also added significant pressure on them.

Chuang (2002) revealed that using the Chinese Type A Behavior Pattern Inventory (Lin, 1989), students in talented music programs showed significantly stronger tendencies than common students in the following three scales: time urgency, striving for competitive achievement, as well as aggression and hostility. However, the phenomena needed to be further examined because the sample only came from four Taiwanese senior high schools. The general program and talented music programs in the same senior high schools in Taiwan often had different rankings. A different sampling process might produce different results.

According to Shaw (1995), to be a performer was indicated by the most talented music students at Taiwanese senior high schools as their favourite future career. Lee (2003) further found that while students in talented music programs at senior high schools often wanted to study abroad and become performers in future, the majority of their parents preferred them to be school music teachers or private studio teachers. To be a performer was least supported by the parents. Lee (2000) studied elementary to college music majors and found that 42.6% of them chose to be music teachers, 36.8% studied music for interest only, 30.9% wanted to be performers, and 20.6% wanted to be music researchers. Lee (2000) and Liu (2001) explained that because there were only a few professional music performance organizations and not many classical music audiences in Taiwan, music students had to give up their dreams of being professional performers, the main objective of taking the long-term training in talented music programs in Taiwan. Therefore, the graduates often chose to be school music teachers, but vacancies were few and very competitive.
Lee (2000) also reported that more than half of the talented music students at high school felt that course loads were too heavy, and regarded the music curriculum too repetitive. Nearly half of the students were unable to spare time to study other non-music subjects. Due to limited time and energy, talented music students at high school often had to make decisions between their majors and minors (Shaw, 1995). Students also complained that the talented music program put too much emphasis on performance training and ignored the importance of music theory, music history, musicology, acoustics, and computer music, and as a result, limited their career possibilities (Liu, 2001). Similarly, Lee (2000) reported that 68.6% students felt their career options were limited, and college music students were better than senior high school music students in facing the realities of job markets. Based on their research findings, Lee (2000) and Liu (2001) suggested that the curriculum of talented music programs in Taiwan should be redirected from performance-oriented programs, and systematically reconstructed to avoid repetition. Shaw (1995) found that high school music students also had difficulty in making career decisions because they had broad interests in music, and could perform multiple musical instruments.

THIS RESEARCH STUDY

Currently, the available literature regarding learning issues and career decisions of students in talented music programs in Taiwan either did not differentiate Chinese music and traditional music majors from western music majors, or mainly focus on western music majors only. Chinese music and traditional music majors were minorities when compared with the number of western music majors. The audiences and job opportunities were even fewer than those of western music. The situations of Chinese and traditional music majors might even be worse. Therefore, the research was designed to shed light on the situation of students in Chinese and traditional music programs by exploring students’ learning motivations, adjustment in the programs, and future career expectations. The research questions were: 1. What are students’ motivations for studying Chinese or traditional music? 2. To what extent do students adjust to the life of learning Chinese or traditional music? 3. What kind of jobs do Chinese or traditional music majors want to do in the future? In addition, this study traced and analyzed the possible impacts of government policies and social movements on students.

This study employed a questionnaire to survey students who enrolled in different 4-year Chinese or traditional music departments in Taiwan. Each department had a scheduled time for the students to complete the questionnaire. The questionnaire (Table 21.1) was developed according to the research questions which contained three sections: learning motivations, learning adjustment, and career expectations. Each section corresponded to a research question. These three aspects were selected as the key to understand students’ learning situations. By exploring the interrelationship among the three, the authors attempted to offer suggestions to the policy makers in Chinese and traditional music departments as well as in the government. In each section of the questionnaire, the first five items were set according to a 5-point Likert-scale which indicates strongly disagree, disagree, neutral, agree, to strongly agree, and the last items were open-ended questions. Students were also asked to write their name, gender, grade, major, and minor.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning Motivations</td>
<td>1. I am interested in Chinese music*.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. My parents (family) want me to learn Chinese music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. I am capable of learning Chinese music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. My personality is appropriate for learning Chinese music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. I believe in the value of learning Chinese music.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A total of 380 students participated in this study. Among them, 307 students were from three Chinese music departments and 73 students were from a traditional music department. There were 59 male participants and 321 female participants. Because few students indicated attitudes in strongly agree or strongly disagree, the data were then transformed to become three categories: agree, neutral, and disagree. The data was analyzed by Chi-square tests.

**Learning Motivation and Adjustment**

Regarding students’ motivations toward studying Chinese or traditional music, the majority of them agreed with every statement in that section. It seemed that most of the students had intrinsic learning motivations; they believed in the value of music and were capable of learning it. No significant differences were found between the attitudes of Chinese and traditional music students. However, there were significant differences between male and female students’ attitudes toward item 2 “My parents (family) want me to learn Chinese music”, and item 5 “I believe in the value of learning Chinese music”. Although more male than female students tended to disagree with the two statements, the majority of the male and female students still agreed (Tables 21.2 & 21.3).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Learning Adjustment</th>
<th>Learning Adjustment</th>
<th>Career Expectations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Item 1</td>
<td>5.24</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>14.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 2</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>31.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 3</td>
<td>2.84</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>20.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 4</td>
<td>3.59</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>29.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 5</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>17.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The term “Chinese music” was replaced by “traditional music” when the questionnaire was administered in a traditional music department.

Table 21.2 The analysis of attitudes of Chinese and traditional music majors (α=0.05, df=2)
Most of them also had multiple majors, including western and Chinese music, before they entered university. In addition, majors in cello, double bass, percussions, voice, and composition could enter either western or Chinese music departments. Four reasons could be identified from students’ responses to the open-ended question regarding their decisions in entering Chinese or traditional music programs rather than western music programs. First, the number of students learning Chinese music was much fewer than that of western music. Students thought that entering Chinese or traditional music departments might not be as competitive as entering western music departments, and they could get into better universities if they chose Chinese or traditional music departments. Second, some students wanted to expand their musical knowledge to learn different musics. Third, some students were very interested in Chinese cultures, looked upon modern Chinese music as the best representative of Chinese classical music, and wanted to investigate more. Fourth, some students specifically chose the traditional music department because they were curious about Taiwanese cultures or looked upon traditional music as the authentic Taiwanese music. They were eager to preserve the music so they joined the traditional music department. They wanted to dedicate themselves to the transmission of traditional music.

Regarding students’ adjustment to the life of learning Chinese or traditional music, most Chinese and traditional music students agreed with the listed statements and did not show significant differences in attitude in most items except for item 9. The Chinese music students tended to be more willing to practice their majors than the traditional music students. The majority of the male and female students also tended to adjust well toward all the conditions except for item 8, which read “I am satisfied with my Chinese/traditional music performances”. The majority of them agreed with this statement but about one third of the male and female
students disagreed. The percentage of students who disagreed with this statement was higher than
the percentage of students who disagreed with other listed statements. While the percentages of
female students’ responses in agree and neutral on this statement were similar, there were more
positive than neutral responses from male students. Many students further indicated frustrations
in their responses to the open-ended question.

Problems Perceived by Students
There are many problems perceived by students. Firstly, the lack of audiences and performing
opportunities disappointed the students. The society was modernizing fast. People in Taiwan
preferred western classical and popular music. The available support from government and
private institutions for Chinese or traditional music was much less than that for western music.
The environment that used to nurture the traditional music was disappearing. The situations that
traditional music lacked opportunities to perform at elegant occasions made the students feel
inferior. Secondly, available literature for research on traditional music was limited. Thirdly,
some of the students majoring in cello and double bass did not have a sense of belonging to the
Chinese music departments. Some of the students who used to be in western music programs had
difficulty in adjusting to the Chinese or traditional music programs at the beginning. Especially,
having their minds formatted by western music theories, they felt Chinese or traditional music
theories hard to understand. Fourthly, students sometimes experienced hardship in learning some
performing skills and in interpreting some specific musical styles through performances. Students
who could not speak the Hokkien dialect also had difficulty in learning Hokkien music in the
traditional music department. Finally, some students indicated that they suffered from
performance anxiety. They could not bear the pressure of examinations and stage performances.

Western music is the mainstream musical genre in Taiwan. It is a common policy that some
Chinese music departments list western music fundamentals as required study for freshman year,
and students were required to have a minor in piano. Based on the finding of this study, it is
suggested that Chinese or traditional music fundamentals be offered starting from the freshman
year to help students adjust to the Chinese or traditional musical thinking. Language (dialect)
learning courses and courses which introduce the cultures of the people could also be offered to
help students understand the context of the music. In addition, more attention from the
departments should be drawn to help students relieve performance anxiety, and teach students to
handle performing pressure. Emotional management courses need to be offered. The available
resources and assistance from the Student Counselling Center in universities should be
introduced to the students.

Positive Aspects Perceived by Students
In spite of the above-mentioned frustrations, students’ responses in the open-ended questions
showed that students felt having a sense of achievement in the following aspects. First, the major
sources of achievement are coming from excellent performances on stages, excellent
performances in examinations, and teachers’ positive comments. They also cared about
comments from peers when performing in ensembles. Making steady progress in performance
made them feel satisfied. Second, they felt like excelling in knowing something that their
counterparts in western music programs did not know. Getting cultural identification from the
music they were learning excited them. Third, some students were surprised at the profundity of
the music, desired to further explore it, were honoured to be transmitters of the music, and were
proud of being able to introduce the music to people through performances. It seemed that the
multiculturalism in Taiwan reinforced students’ motivation toward learning Chinese and
traditional music, and their input was also rewarded with the sense of being special, the honour as
cultural transmitters, and the achievement as performers.
Career Expectation

Regarding students’ career decision-making, significantly more Chinese music students than traditional music students desired to be performers, Chinese/traditional music teachers, and composers in their field. Male students’ career preferences were performers, music teachers, music administration, and composers (76.3%, 72.9%, 64.4%, and 64.4% respectively). Female students’ career preferences were music teachers, music administration, performers, and composers (74.5%, 65.4%, 60.7%, and 53.9% respectively). Other professions that students suggested in the open-ended question included early childhood music teachers, music therapists, and salesmen of musical instruments.

Many students also indicated that it did not matter to them to have a job in the field of Chinese, traditional or western music, as long as the job was related to music. As a matter of fact, 248 students (65.3%) learned piano as minors. Majors in cello, double bass, percussions, voice, and composition could also work in either western or Chinese musical contexts. However, there was a tendency that some students majoring in traditional music wanted to have a job related to Chinese music, and some Chinese music majors wanted to have a job related to western music. Because the latter was more popular than the former, there were more career opportunities for them to make their living if they chose the latter. Students seemed to understand the realities. They understood that there were not many Chinese orchestras in Taiwan, and as such there were few vacancies. Professional traditional music ensembles and vacancies were even fewer. There were also far less people learning traditional and Chinese instruments than western instruments. The hourly pay for teaching traditional and Chinese instruments was lower than that for teaching western instruments. It was quite common for them to play in ensembles at funeral parlours.

In summary, the study found out that many of the university music students joined talented music programs out of personal interest and parental support at first when they were young. Then, having a skill made them feel confident about themselves. As they continued, their excellence in music, as compared to common students, further reinforced them to continue their study in college music programs. However, their long-term devotion of most of their time in learning music comparatively put them at a disadvantage in their knowledge of non-musical subjects. This phenomenon was also consistent with what Lee reported (2000) about students in talented (western) music programs. The feeling of deficiency also discouraged them from transferring to other academic programs even if some of them no longer desired to have a musical career in the future.

This study suggested the motivation of being in a traditional or Chinese music program was that the learning of the music intensified students’ cultural identification and aroused their intention to preserve the music. They deemed the advocacy and transmission of the music their responsibility. The students’ attitudes might have been influenced by multiculturalism, which has become a claim of social movement in Taiwan since the 1980s.

Despite the fact that the students’ efforts were rewarded with the feeling of being unique, the honour of being cultural transmitters, and the sense of achievement in performance, students experienced hardship in adjusting from learning western music to learning Chinese or traditional music, and the reality of the job market further disappointed them. The fact that Chinese and traditional music were not as popular as western music on the one hand, might make getting into universities comparatively easier. On the other hand, it might also make finding a Chinese or traditional music related job comparatively more difficult. Therefore, the students also considered being school music teachers or jobs related to western music.

DISCUSSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

The findings pointed out the imbalance between education (supply) and career opportunities
(demand). It is recommended that increasing the audiences of Chinese and traditional music is fundamental to the increase in career opportunities. The education of audiences should start from the very beginning of school education to adult and community education. To shed light on the problems perceived and on the ways of improvement, the related policies of the Ministry of Education and related governmental institutes were discussed as follows.

In school education, although the school curricula started to reform toward multiculturalism since the 1990s, and the Ministry of Education have been encouraging the production of related teaching resources and in-service teacher trainings, there were still problems. First, there were negative influences from current educational reform. According to a study conducted by the National Taipei Teachers College (2003), the administration of integrated approach in the Grade 1-9 curriculum (Ministry of Education, 2000; Ministry of Education, 2003) hampered music teaching because the hours for music classes were reduced and teachers without music background had difficulty in teaching music systematically.

Second, there were junior and senior high schools which did not value music education (National Taipei Teachers College, 2003) or which made quality music learning the privilege of the students in talented music programs (Lee, 2000). Lee (2000) suggested that the resources and courses in talented music programs at schools be opened to common students. In addition, the local education bureaux should encourage the extra-curricular associations in traditional and Chinese music in schools to increase students’ opportunities to participate in learning the music. To relieve the negative impact from financial difficulty, the school should call for parental and community support.

The adult or social education facet is closely related to the policies of the three central governmental agencies in Taiwan: The Council for Cultural Affairs (CCA), the Council for Hakka Affairs (CHA), and the Council of Indigenous Peoples (CIP). The Council for Cultural Affairs promoted both western and traditional arts. One of the most important functions of the CCA is to provide funding to support the performances and exhibitions of music, dance, visual arts, architecture, traditional theatres and operas, as well as modern theatres after competitive selection processes (CCA, 2004).

In 2005, the CCA launched the Cultural Citizenship Movement, which promoted civic aesthetics, multiculturalism, and the expansion of local and national cultural facilities. However, the annual budget of the CCA was only five to six billion NT dollars. Its involvement in promoting Chinese and traditional music was very limited. There used to be a local Chinese music orchestra affiliated to the Department for Cultural Affairs in most of the counties in Taiwan. In recent years, because of financial difficulty of the government, the affiliated relationships were either terminated or the orchestras were dismissed. To solve the financial difficulties, more and more performing troupes have to turn to look to enterprises to support their performances.

The Council for Hakka Affairs (CHA) and the Council of Indigenous Peoples (CIP) were founded to protect the rights of the ethnic minorities in Taiwan (CHA, 2006; CIP, 2003). The CHA and the CIP invested their funds in the preservation of the culture of Hakka and indigenous people in Taiwan as well as improving their living. The main task in the preservation of cultures is to educate minority people to know and cherish their traditional cultures, including languages, arts, history, and geographical environments. The main tasks in improving the living were to increase minority people’s abilities and opportunities to make a living, and provide assistance in the social welfare for the minority people. Recently, because the CCA promoted cultural and creative industries, the CHA and the CIP also advocated the production of performances in their musical traditions. It was expected that through this promotion the opportunities for people to be exposed to the traditional music would be increased. However, it seemed that the education of common adult Taiwanese (non-Hakka and non-indigenous people) to appreciate and understand the arts and culture of the Hakka and indigenous people had been weak.
Aiming at enriching adult education, the first community university was founded in Taipei in 1998. Currently, there are 72 community universities and 14 aboriginal community universities (National Association for the Promotion of Community University, 2006). Their funds are partially supported by the Ministry of Education. The CIP also financially supports the aboriginal community universities. The community universities have become a new force in lifelong learning in Taiwan. Although they do not award official diplomas, the credits are accepted in many places. Many community universities have music classes. Lu (2005) reported that a total of 429 music courses were available at community universities in Taiwan in the semester of fall 2005. Eleven types of courses were offered: playing Chinese instruments, singing popular and folk songs, playing western classical and popular instruments, appreciation of music, traditional genres of music, traditional genres of opera, choruses, world musics, music therapy, composition of songs, as well as music education in early childhood, from the most to the least accordingly. The data showed that playing Chinese instruments were the most popular music classes in the community universities. Although playing Chinese instruments accounted for 37.18% of all music courses, traditional genres of music only accounted for 5.59% and traditional genres of opera for 4.89%. It was suggested that courses in traditional music and operas be improved to attract more people to take them (Lu, 2005). It could then be expected that through the promotion from community universities, more and more citizens would be educated to be able to appreciate Chinese and traditional music. Career opportunities of the Chinese and traditional music students might then be increased. However, more attention from the government should be drawn to the career development of traditional music students.

NOTES

1. It should be noted that majors in cello, double bass, percussion, voice, and composition could enter either western or Chinese music departments. The first two instruments are especially adapted to be used as low strings in Chinese orchestras.

REFERENCES


Lee, T. L. (2000). The comparison of the education of the education models of Taiwan and Britain for students with music talents (I) [菁英教育模式與通才教育模式對音樂資優學生之社會成就生活適應及其相關因素之比較研究—以台灣及英國為例(第一年)]. Taipei, Taiwan: National Science Council. (NSC89-2413-H134-006)


Chapter 22

Meaning, Autonomy, and Authenticity in the Music Classroom

Lucy GREEN

First published by the Institute of Education, University of London as an inaugural lecture, December 2005.

It seems fair to suggest that musicologists have in recent years decidedly dispensed with the notion of musical autonomy, which has become no more than a pejorative label to expose the elitism of anyone who attributes superiority to high culture and classical music, against the inferiority of mass culture and popular, or any other vernacular, music. For their assumption has been that music is most valuable when it proceeds according to an inexorable logic of its own, with no concern for social contextual issues such as making profit, providing entertainment, or gaining fame for its practitioners; and that music’s meanings and value lie properly within its forms and processes. Such an assumption tended to go hand-in-hand with a musicological approach which, its critics declared, reified music by focussing on the musical text itself, usually the score, to the exclusion of all else around it.

As a rebuttal to such assumptions and approaches, contemporary critical musicologists, sociologists of music, ethnomusicologists, music educationalists and many others have been concerned to understand music, its value, and its meanings, precisely in relation to its social contexts of production, distribution and reception. Adorno’s highly original and provocative approach to musical meaning was the first serious examination of the relationship between musical form and music’s social contexts. It was also the very one to most forcefully argue the case for autonomy. Today few people accept either his argument that music’s meanings (‘true’ or ‘false’ ones) lie in its structural analogies to society, or his insistence that only the most autonomous music has enough critical distance from society to act as a political challenge.

Whilst the debt to Adorno is acknowledged, attention has turned away from such macro-level, elitist perspectives and towards micro-level investigations of how music is “put into action (De Nora, 2003)”. Research has focussed on the particular uses to which music is put, and the meanings that it thus engenders for particular actors in particular social contexts – not only contexts of reception but also those of distribution and production.

In parallel with, and perhaps somewhat replacing the concept of autonomy, has been a slow but steady increase in attention to the concept of authenticity. On one hand, interest has focussed on the authenticity of the musical product, in other words, on replicating as closely, or as authentically as possible the sounds of music as they were configured in the music’s original social context. On the other hand, researchers have sought to understand listeners’ and musicians’ real, deep, or authentic responses to music as they put music into action in their everyday lives.

In this essay I want to suggest that in spite of its disrepute, there is some point in preserving the notion of musical autonomy. Furthermore, and ironically, it is precisely by grounding our investigations of musical meaning within particular contexts and uses, that the critical potential of autonomy emerges. I will firstly revisit a theory of musical meaning which has been my companion on quite a few journeys in the past, but each time in pursuit of a different goal. Here, the goal is to illuminate the concept of musical autonomy as a virtual, critical aspect of musical experience; and to suggest some ways in which such autonomy can be experienced through
musical production practices within the school classroom. At the end of the essay I will also connect the concept of musical autonomy to that of personal autonomy – the personal autonomy of musical learners. Through recognising both musical and personal autonomy, we can perhaps also throw light on some of the issues concerning musical authenticity, and especially the role of authenticity within music education. I will suggest some ways of recognising autonomy and authenticity in the classroom, which aim to ease the split between pupils’ music and classroom music – otherwise known as the pop/classical split – that has continued to dog music education since the rise of the mass media in the early twentieth century.

MUSICAL MEANING

How do we recognise music as music? If we hear the sounds of a lorry backing into a side-street, or a steel-pan being tuned, we don’t consider them to be music. In order to perceive music, the listener has to be immersed in a complex range of social conventions, which are discernible in relation both to the organisation of the sounds themselves, and to the social contexts surrounding their production, distribution and reception.

Sound is the raw material from which music is made. For music to come into existence and for musical experience to occur, this raw material must be organised in such a way as to have relationships which are perceived in the mind of a listener. For example, the listener might notice features such as patterning, opening and close, whole and part, beginning and end, repetition, similarity, difference, and so on. These features are perceptible in several ways. One is that the flow of musical materials through time is organised in such a way as to cause listeners to anticipate future sonic events, as L. B. Meyer (1956) so persuasively demonstrated. We wait for the final chord or the next note after the pause, we expect the music to break out into a melody at the next strong beat, we hear the string flourish or the drummer’s extended up-beat as an announcement of the reprise, and so on. Not only does music raise expectations for what might be going to happen next, it also causes us to make retrospective connections between present and past events, so that the present makes the past meaningful; and the musical past colours the present, just as much as the present raises expectations for the future. In many musics, perhaps even most, expectation and retrospection seem to play a relatively small part in the experience. On one hand, experience is focussed on the quality of the sounds: texture, timbre, a crack in the voice, a pitch inflection so slight as to be barely noticeable; on the other hand, experience takes in a wide field of processual flow, such as the feeling of being carried along on a relentless beat. But of course that quality, or that sense of travelling along, nonetheless only comes into existence in relation to what went before and what comes after any particular moment.

The mental acts involved in processing music backwards and forwards in time, and in attending to the quality of the moment or processual flow, involve the making of meaningful connections between parts of the music being heard. But these connections are not restricted to the particular piece of music in question, for they arise from the listener’s previous experience of a number of pieces of music that together make up a style, sub-style or genre. Thus the connections can cut across from one piece of music to another. Understanding of the connections within and across pieces of music is learnt, acquired through repeated listening and therefore, through some level of familiarity with the style of the music in question. If the listener does not have familiarity, relatively few meanings will be conceived. Therefore a piece of music which is highly meaningful or very rewarding to one individual, might be relatively meaningless or lacking in interest to another. Any one piece of music can give rise to a multiplicity of possible meanings.

I refer to the meaningful connections that are forged within and across musical pieces, as “inherent musical meanings (Green, 1988; 1997; 2005a)”. The word “inherent” has at least two meanings in the English language. It can mean that a property of an object is essential, ahistorical
or natural, which is quite the opposite of how I am using the term. It can also mean that a property of an object is contained within the object, but without any suggestion of this containment being essential, ahistorical or natural. This is how I am using the term. ‘Inherent musical meanings’ are ‘inherent’, in the sense of being contained within the musical object, in relation to the historically-constituted, logical properties of the meaning-making processes. These processes involve meaning-making constituents, or to put it crudely, ‘signs’ which are made of musical materials (a chord, a note, a phrase); and meanings-being-meant corresponding with ‘referents’ (the anticipated chord or note, the re-cognised melody) that are also made up of musical materials. Both ‘signs’ and ‘referents’ are incorporated, embodied, or they inhere and are thus inherent within the raw materials that constitute the music in question. However, they are of course entirely socially constituted, and recognition of them, as I have already suggested, is dependent on listeners’ acquired familiarity with the stylistic norms of the music in question. To return to the example of the lorry backing into a side-street or a steel-pan being tuned: such sounds could only become music and therefore only carry musical meaning by virtue of a complex set of social conventions. The organisation of the materials into meaningful relationships, or what I call inherent musical meanings, is one such convention.

Someone could object to my claim that musical experience relies on the listener making connections between the past, present and future of the musical materials, as follows: that if we turn on the radio and hear only the shortest snatch of sound, less than a second, we can still tell it is music that we are hearing, rather than, say, a spoken voice, a lorry turning or some other sound. We can tell this even though we are quite unable to make any connections between the snatch of sound that we heard and any ones that preceded it or followed after it. How then can we recognise the sound as music, if it is the case that such recognition requires a perception of inherent meanings arising from making connections between parts of the music as they pass in time, as suggested above? One response is to say that we do not actually have a musical experience in that situation. Rather we recognise that the snatch of sound comes from one or more musical instruments or sung voices, and we assume that because it was heard on the radio, putting two and two together, it must be part of a piece of music.

This is so, but there is in fact something else going on which is of much deeper significance. For our assumption that the snatch of sound comes from a piece of music derives from a quite different aspect of musical meaning, an aspect that relates not to the interrelationships of musical materials, that is not to musical inherent meanings; but to music’s social context and its mediation as a cultural object through historical social institutions. In other words, it derives from musical meanings which point outwards from the musical text towards concepts, relationships or things that exist independently of it. I refer to such meanings as ‘delineations’, (Green, 1988; 1997; 2005a) in other words, as meanings which are loosely suggested or metaphorically sketched by the music in relation to its social context. Factors such as the clothes and hairstyles of the musicians, their listeners or fans; the venues in which the music is relayed; the social or political values associated with the music, which may or may not be embodied in lyrics; the musical practices of the listeners, and indeed other social practices connected with them, and so on, all come into play.

Any particular piece of music may mean something we can relate to, something we dislike, something we desire and so on. Individuals will have a multiplicity of responses to musical delineations, some of which are shared and generally agreed upon by the majority of people in any particular society or social group; others of which will be entirely idiosyncratic. For example a National Anthem delineates the nation, monarchy, president or whatever is relevant to practically everyone in and beyond a particular nation; but to some individuals it can delineate pride whereas to others it delineates shame; to some love, to others hatred. Not only are there obvious examples such as National Anthems, wedding songs, or football songs which acquire generally-recognised conventional meanings, but there are far more subtle levels of delineation, such as the sound of a particular flute, the way an electric guitar is distorted, a rhythm, a vocal
inflection, the precise bend of a pitch; all of which can carry delineated meanings which are conventionally recognised to a greater or lesser extent. A piece of music may also delineate a particular event or feeling that arose on one occasion for one particular individual when she was listening to it, that has nothing whatsoever to do with the meanings conventionally attributed to it by the rest of her society.

Some sociologists of music have argued that it is not possible to fully appreciate a particular piece of music unless one is an insider to, or at least unless one has some insider-knowledge of the culture in which the music was originally produced. Detractors from this position have pointed to the capacity of music to carry across times and places, allowing people from one culture to enjoy music from other very different cultures (see the debate between Vulliamy & Shepherd, 1984a, 1984b, 1985; Swanwick, 1984a, 1984b). Notwithstanding fundamental disagreements, both sides would tend to agree that one can have a fuller, richer understanding if one is an insider; and that if not, the acquisition of some knowledge about the social context in which the music was originally produced is likely to enhance the listening experience. But it is not only the context of production, for unavoidably, the context of reception also contributes to the music’s delineations. No music can ever be heard (that is, heard-as-music) outside of a social context. Taking music out of its original context of production and putting it into even a completely new and different context of reception does not cause it to lose delineated meanings; it merely replaces some delineations (related to the context of production) with others (related to the context of reception). We can still have a musical experience even if we know absolutely nothing about the original social contexts, so long as we can recognise the piece as being a piece of music in the first place.

For that recognition to take place we must rely on the perception of inherent meanings. But I have suggested that unless the listener has some familiarity with the style, then no experience of inherent meanings will occur. So to return to the example of the snatch of music on the radio: it is precisely the radio, the social conventions surrounding radio broadcasting, or other circumstances such as the concert platform, the gathering of dancers in the centre of the village and so on, in combination with the musical inherent meanings, that tell us it is music we are hearing. In short, recognition of the social, collective definitions of what counts as music is a necessary component of what makes something music. No music can exist at all without its transmitting some delineation or other. Musical delineation is not merely an add-on to inherent musical meaning. On the contrary, it goes on at a fundamental level from the very first moment of recognition of sounds as being music at all. Delineation is therefore as fundamental to musical meaning as inherent meaning and indeed, without experience of musical delineation, no musical experience could come about at all. For without some understanding of the fact that music is a social construction, we would ultimately be unable to recognise any particular collection of sounds as music. So, when we listen to music, we cannot separate our experience of its inherent meanings entirely from an awareness of the social context that accompanies its production and/or reception.

Past commentators have occasionally misunderstood or objected to this understanding of musical meaning, because, they say, the difference between the two aspects of meaning is not clear-cut. I wish to respond to that in two ways, firstly by disagreeing with it, then by agreeing with it. The distinction is clear-cut in a logical sense, in terms of the processes by which the meaning is made. As I suggested earlier, with inherent meaning the ‘signs’ and the ‘referents’ all consist of musical materials. A sound refers to another sound either in the same piece of music or beyond it in another piece, or within the style in general terms. With delineated meaning, the ‘sign’ is made up of musical materials, that is, sounds, but the ‘referent’ is made up of non-musical constituents, that is, constituents related to the social context of the music’s production and reception. In short, with inherent meaning the process of signification occurs from sound to sound, whereas with delineation it occurs from sound to non-sound. That encapsulates the logical distinction between the two types of meaning.
Secondly, however, I agree that in other ways the two meanings are not distinguishable, and indeed it is precisely the difficulty of distinguishing between them that interests me most. The point of making the distinction is to contribute to a theoretical understanding of musical experience; but we do not tend to distinguish between the two types of meaning, or to separate them out experientially when engaging in music. This presents no problem for the theory to my mind, quite the opposite in fact, for it is quite normal as well as helpful to make theoretical distinctions between things that we find hard to distinguish experientially. Take the example of love. We can theoretically distinguish between different types of love: sexual love, parental love, filial love, love between siblings, love between friends, and so on. We can also make distinctions between other cognate areas, for example liking, desire, lust. But experientially it is not always easy to separate these feelings out from each other, and indeed that difficulty leads to a great deal of confusion and complexity in our lives. But that does not mean we give up the idea of making the distinctions theoretically, for there are so many cases where they are clear and helpful. The fact that other areas exist where they are confused, only serves to remind us of the complexity of human culture, and that theory is a mere tool to help us achieve a better understanding of that complexity, rather than undermining theory per se, or refuting a particular theory. So it is with the dialectical theory of musical meaning which I am putting forward here.

Although as I have argued, our prior experiences and our social circumstances will greatly affect our responses to music, they cannot be said to be wholly determining factors. For even though music relies on social convention for its existence, this does not mean that it has no objective properties which would carry across different social contexts, or which lend themselves more-or-less forcefully to particular types of response or meaningful experience. To that extent music can be said to have objective properties existing independently of convention. Music is not merely a symptom of our musical practices and meanings, but it acts back on us, through its capacity to influence our beliefs, values, feelings or behaviour; or as Moore (2002), De Nora (2000; 2003) and E. Clarke (2003) put it, adapting the concept from the psychologist Gibson (1986), it affords different responses. As a simple example: if an adult in any country that I can think of, asks young children to dance to some fast, loud music with an explicit beat, the children are likely to jump around vigorously; if she asks them to dance to some soft, slow music, they will glide about gracefully. To what extent have the children learnt these responses from conventional usage of music in the particular social context to which they are accustomed; and to what extent are these responses natural and universal? It would be hasty to altogether throw out the idea that their responses retain some natural or universal elements. An example of the different types of funeral music or music used in death-rites in different cultures is often used to point to the social constructedness of musical meanings: that in some societies such music is slow whereas in others it is fast. But this does not mean that the same characteristics of music (fast or slow) afford different responses in different social contexts; rather it means that the responses to death and bereavement are different, or are expressed differently.

THE DIALECTICS OF MUSICAL MEANING AND EXPERIENCE

The theory which I am putting forward posits a dialectical relationship between the two types of musical meaning identified. Musical experience, in this model, cannot occur at all unless both aspects of meaning are in operation to some extent or other. However, this is not to imply that both types of meaning always co-exist to the same degree, or that we are always conscious of both, or even either, of them. Indeed, our responses to each aspect of musical meaning can be in contradiction, each aspect can have a different effect upon musical experience as a whole, and more interestingly, each can influence and overpower the other.

In order to think through these claims, it is helpful to understand our responses to each aspect of musical meaning in terms of polar extremes, although in practice of course individuals
will experience a variety of subtle shades at different points along each pole. Figure 22.1 is intended to provide some graphic aid to thinking through these matters. With regards to inherent meaning, we can have a highly affirmative, or positive response. This will occur when we are very familiar with the style or the particular piece, we understand its nuances, and we are carried along securely or pleasurably in its ebb and flow. The greater our familiarity with the style of the music, the more affirmative the experience is likely to be. For when we are familiar with the normative stylistic terms of reference in a piece of music, we are able to distinguish disruption from normality and resolution from disruption. If the music surprises us with, say, an unexpected event, we understand it. Although our expectations may have been negated, we assimilate the negation in terms of a wider field of presence related to other parts of the music and to the style, and thus we enjoy it; without negation, disruption, difference and so on, at whatever level, no inherent musical meaning could arise. Only through these and through our understanding of them do we relate meaningfully to music. Hence ultimately, our negation is understood in the light of its own affirmation: we are negated only because we understand, to whatever extent, the style of the music; and we are thus affirmed in our overall musical experience as it takes place in time.

![Figure 22.1 Musical meaning and experience (Green, 1988, p. 138, 1997, p. 251)](image)

At the other extreme, there is a negative response. This is likely to occur when we are unfamiliar with the musical style, for we are then less likely to understand the music, and may have difficulty making sense of it or responding to its internal similarities and continuities, differences and changes. An event which would surprise and delight a listener who has greater familiarity, will go completely unnoticed, so the music seems uneventful and dull. In such circumstances, the capacity of a piece of music to engage our interest is relatively limited. Not being aware of what is and is not normative, we cannot readily distinguish disruption or its resolution, are unable to hear constituent parts as things in themselves, and cannot relate them to other constituents within.
the piece or across pieces. We therefore receive few, or merely confused, inherent meanings; we
cannot engage with the music, are rarely negated and rarely affirmed. Such an experience can be
boring, but it can also be more forceful and quite painfully aggravating or irritating. When
musical style is this unfamiliar, we may find the music random or incoherent. Our experience is
fragmented, tossed to and fro on apparently unrelenting, arbitrary waves of meaningless
movement.

Such an experience can be illustrated by an anecdote of a music student in a class on the
twentieth-century atonal composer Schoenberg. On listening to the vocal and instrumental piece
‘Mondstruncken’ from his Pierrot Lunaire, she declared she found the music incoherent,
chaotic and random, and that listening to it was like a form of ‘slow torture’. Unfamiliarity with
Schoenberg’s compositional procedures and the style of the music in general, had prevented her
noticing a high level of organisation of the musical materials, for example a distinctive seven-
ote motif which is uninterruptedly repeated four times in the piano at the beginning, repeated
again and taken up in varied forms by other instruments throughout the rest of the piece. As a
result of her unfamiliarity with such stylistic factors, amongst others, she received few meanings
from the music, which is one reason why she had such a negative response to it.

We are uplifted, affirmed, bored or aggravated by music’s inherent meanings in as many
different ways as the diversity of musical style and of our individual understanding and prior
experiences allow. Similarly, we can have a range of responses from positive to negative in
relation to delineated meaning.

At one extreme we have a positive response when we feel the music in some way expresses
our feelings, when we identify with the music because it delineates our social class or supports
our political values, when it affirms our preferred clothing, hair-style, our age, ethnicity, gender
and many other factors. At the other extreme we have a negative response when we feel the
music delineates social or political values of which we disapprove or from which we want to
disassociate ourselves, social groups from which we are excluded, and so on. To illustrate such
responses here are two snippets from Bennett’s ethnographic work with Asian youth and their
relationship with Bhangra music in Newcastle, UK in the late 1990s. Some used it to celebrate
‘tradition’, and valued it as a family music crossing generations; others rejected it as a way of
articulating their separateness from these same traditions and family values. For example:

It’s good to go to a bhangra event because…it brings back memories…it’s like tradition. It’s
the same with the dancing like. There is a traditional dance…nowadays some people just
move how they want to. But I think it [the traditional bhangra dance] does matter in some
ways, ‘cause it gives you a buzz to be doing something a bit traditional (Bennett, 2000,
p.111).

Alternatively:

I was brought up listening to bhangra, because that’s what my parents listened to…there
was nothing else to listen to really. Then, as soon as I got to about thirteen or fourteen…I
had different friends, white friends, and a different kind of atmosphere. I started listening to
their tapes and I’d find out what I really liked which is dance music…. Now I can’t stand
bhangra (ibid., p. 117).

What is meant by ‘I can’t stand bhangra”? Is it that the person is aggravated by the inherent
meanings of the music, or negated by the delineated social values the music carries?

It would not be unreasonable to assume that our responses to inherent and delineated
meanings usually correspond. If we dislike the one we are likely to dislike the other. For example,
if we are already negative to music’s delineations, we are unlikely to be affirmed by its inherent
meanings; and indeed, unlikely to get ourselves in a position to become sufficiently familiar with
its inherent meanings for affirmation to take place. If school children are perfectly sure that Western classical music is intended only for ‘boffins’ and very boring, as well as old, adults (delineations), they are likely to dismiss its inherent meanings as being equally boring. They will therefore avoid listening to it and for that reason will continue to be unfamiliar with its inherent meanings; and for that reason in turn are highly unlikely to suddenly get a kick out of listening to the last movement of Brahms’ first symphony.

Conversely, if our responses to inherent meanings are already negative, it is likely we will dismiss the delineations too. Some classical musicians today still believe that all popular music is wholly simplistic and very easy to play. The pop-musicological challenge to that perception includes the point that such listeners seek the ‘wrong’ qualities in the music, expecting to hear motivic development for example; and in so doing, miss out on hearing the ‘right’ qualities, such as timbral change, rhythmic inflection or textural organisation (for example, Middleton, 1990; Walser, 1993; Brackett, 1995; Ford, 1997; Moore, 2002). The Schoenberg student is another example, because not only did she find the inherent meanings tortuous, she dismissed the whole enterprise of modernist abstract art and atonal music as pretentious. Suppose instead of hearing the Schoenberg excerpt in a class on modernist music, she had been watching a 1950s Hollywood horror film? Indeed Schoenberg surprisingly enough lived in Hollywood and taught several of the film composers. It is likely that she would not have even noticed the music as problematic at all.

What I term ‘celebration’ is experienced when a positive experience of inherent meanings is accompanied by positive inclinations towards delineations. Contrastingly, ‘alienation’ is experienced when a negative experience of inherent meanings is accompanied by negativity towards delineations.

But sometimes the two aspects of musical meaning are in contradiction, and this will engender an experience of ‘ambiguity’. There are two ‘ideal types’ of ambiguity. In one of these, the experience of inherent meaning is negative, whilst that of delineated meaning is positive. For example, we can think of a person who dislikes Mozart’s music and hears it as boring, frilly and superficial. As a result he hardly ever listens to it, which means in turn that his familiarity with the style is quite low. All in all such factors are liable to make him negative towards the inherent meanings. But at the same time, he can nonetheless approve of and identify with the delineations: the practice of taking important overseas business colleagues to the opera, perhaps (he would never consider taking them to a rock gig!); the social-class values with which the music is associated in his mind, and so on. He is thus positive towards the music’s delineations.

Alternatively, experience of inherent meaning can be positive whilst that of delineated meaning is negative. In such a case we can think of the classical music-lover who is totally familiar with the inherent meanings of Wagner’s music, say; who has perhaps listened to, played or sung his music for many years, and has thus developed a profound knowledge of the style, allowing her to be thoroughly affirmed by the inherent meanings. But, simultaneously, she has strong antipathies to Wagner because of his anti-semitism and the harnessing of his music by Nazi Germany; or perhaps she simply dislikes going to the opera because she thinks the rest of the audience are ‘stuffy’; or she is critical of most operatic plots because she finds them sexist, and so on.

Not only may the quality of the response to one type of meaning contradict that of the response to the other, but something else can occur which is perhaps one of the most provocative aspects of music, and raises some interesting issues for music education. This is that the response to one aspect of meaning can overpower, influence and even change the other.

On one hand, the experience of delineation can override and influence that of inherent meaning. For example, a late nineteenth-century Scandinavian music critic was in the habit of writing very positive reviews about a particular composer. After many reviews, he found out that the composer was a woman. He carried on writing good reviews, but his language changed. Instead of using words like ‘strident’, ‘virile’ or ‘powerful’, he began to use words like ‘delicate’
and ‘sensitive’. What had happened was that the gender of the composer had entered the delineations of the music for this listener, as a problematic aspect that challenged contemporary assumptions about gender, musical practice and compositional creativity. This new delineation then affected the way that the critic heard the inherent meanings (Green, 1997).

On the other hand – and I need to phrase it this time as a question, because it is the central question that I now want to address – can the experience of inherent meaning override and influence that of delineation? The notion that inherent meaning can act back to change our perception of delineation appears at first to be a logical impossibility. For inherent meaning, as I have cast it, is devoid of content; it exists as a virtual aspect of musical experience, which can itself only occur if there is also a delineated content. However I will argue that experience of inherent meaning can indeed change, and challenge, our musical responses and presuppositions concerning delineation; and that it is in this logical moment of music’s virtual autonomy from its social contexts, that some of the most challenging questions and interesting possibilities arise, particularly for music education.

MUSICAL MEANING AND EXPERIENCE IN THE CLASSROOM

Most music educators would probably agree that for young children, encouraging as many ‘celebratory’ musical experiences of as many styles and pieces of music as possible would be a legitimate and indeed, highly desirable aim. As children get older, and especially for those who go on to study music in Higher Education, we would certainly want to encourage some critical distance, so that celebration could give way to a more balanced judgement, allowing considered responses and evaluation of different musics in relation to a variety of criteria. But achieving such criticality is more likely to occur if pupils’ ears have already been opened through positive experiences of a variety of musics in relation to both inherent and delineated meanings; that is, through what I have been referring to as musical celebration.

Unfortunately most music educators would probably also agree that overall the response of school pupils to music in the classroom is less enthusiastic than everyone would like. Even the most successful and inspiring music teachers tend to be amongst the first to suggest that music education does not reach the majority of pupils. Many pupils are bound to have ‘ambiguous’ experiences, or worse, ‘alienated’ experiences resulting from negativity towards both the inherent and the delineated meanings of much classroom music. The reasons for this are by no means straightforward.

Firstly, let us consider delineation in the classroom. In the post-second world war period it was unthinkable that anything resembling popular music, jazz or any other vernacular form apart from folk music, could be brought into a classroom. This was partly because the delineations of such music were, and continue to be, associated with issues such as teenage rebellion, sexuality, drugs, and so on. Indeed, the very delineations of popular music which most attract its listeners, are likely to be those which make it least suitable for the school. Pupils were required to become educated in Western classical music and folk music of the British isles, mainly through singing and listening activities. The fact that the original delineations of much classical and folk music were also about rebellion, sexuality and other nefarious issues was presumably neutralised by historical distance and, of course, the autonomous status that such music had acquired from everyday life (ironically so, particularly in the case of folk music). Pupils were, in other words, required to study music with whose delineations they largely had no point of identification.

Secondly, let us consider inherent meaning in the classroom. Pupils tend to be unfamiliar with the inherent meanings of classical and folk musics. Even pupils who take classical instrumental lessons are unlikely to listen to classical music in their leisure time, nor do they sit and listen to it with their teachers. Whilst folk music in some countries, usually those who have been colonised, has a stronger and more positive presence in family and social life across the
generations, folk music in many other countries, especially ex-colonial powers such as the UK or Japan for example, has rather more negative delineations in the social and political climate generally; and for many children, as well as teachers, it has taken on the mantle of a somewhat problematic museum culture (for example, Green, 2002b, Endo, 2004). Overall, listening to classical and/or folk music is simply not a part of the cultural practices of most school children. Without repeated listening, stylistic familiarity cannot develop, and without some stylistic familiarity, positive experience of inherent meaning is unlikely to occur.

Overall, then, pupils in the post-second-world war period were likely to be in a negative relationship to both the delineated and the inherent meanings of music in the classroom, and thus, alienated. As a response to this situation, educators started to introduce music which pupils could be expected to welcome. Popular music and jazz, along with what is unfortunately now known as ‘world music’, were accepted into the curriculum very slowly from the end of the 1960s until their formal inclusion in the 14+ general music syllabus (GCSE) in 1986, and the National Curriculum in 1992 after much wrangling.7 The situation today regarding the role of classical music in the classroom has almost gone into reverse, for in many countries the curriculum is possibly more loaded with various sub-styles of popular and world musics than with anything else (Green 2002b; also see for example Lundquist & Szego, 1998; Campbell, 1991; Volk, 1998).

Therefore, one could suppose, pupils should no longer be particularly negative towards the delineations or the inherent meanings of music in the classroom. However musical meanings are slippery modes of communication. One preliminary point of caution is that popular music is of course a broad category. For children of compulsory school age, not only does ‘what counts as popular music’ change every few weeks, but there is evidence that some pupils conceal their ‘real’ musical tastes when at school, in favour of appearing to be a part of the mass mediated music of the Top 40. This may be particularly so in the case of children from minority cultures. It is therefore, ironically, reasonable to suggest that mass music provides a ‘safe’, if not always authentic, cultural space which pupils can inhabit, and behind which any private cultural identities that they wish to conceal can remain hidden.

But the situation is more complex still. Let us consider delineation. As I suggested earlier, the social context of musical reception always already forms a part of music’s delineations. Therefore as soon as any music is brought into a new context of reception, its delineations are liable to change. Indeed when popular music is introduced into the classroom, its very presence often means that it ceases to be considered as ‘pop music’ at all by the pupils. In interviews, or sometimes in passing conversations, pupils have often told me that their curriculum contains only ‘classical music’; whilst their teacher and the departments’ Scheme of Work make it perfectly clear that the curriculum contains a variety of popular, jazz, traditional and world musics. Most teachers would I am sure, agree that so far as pupils are concerned, the Beatles belong to the classical realm. Even teachers who go to great lengths to include up-to-date popular music, cannot in all reasonableness change their curriculum materials at a speed which reflects pupils’ changing allegiances. So, curriculum music which unproblematically carries positive delineations for pupils is hard to come by, and even harder to sustain as a serious part of an extended curriculum.

One way around this is to allow pupils to bring in their own music. However, what to do with it then? Let us consider this question in relation to popular music’s inherent meanings in the classroom. Even when popular music is brought into the classroom, in spite of the mounting enthusiasm with which it has been greeted (see note 6), once in there it tends to have been treated by teachers, exam boards and National Curricular requirements, largely as though its inherent meanings warranted the same kinds of attention as those of classical music (Green, 2002a, 2002b). Not only is this musicologically dubious as I mentioned earlier, but as Vulliamy observed many years ago, analysing popular music, and generally treating it as curriculum knowledge, went against pupils’ taste (Vulliamy, 1977a, 1977b). In the words of one Year 9 student in Paula Jackson’s recent doctoral research, “It becomes like classical music when we do
Meaning Autonomy and Authenticity

it in school (Jackson, 2005)”. Furthermore, not only may the classroom context change delineation, but as I have suggested, delineation can override and influence our experience of inherent meanings. This is what happened when the Scandinavian critic above heard inherent meanings differently once he knew the music had been composed by a woman. So pupils’ taken-for-granted familiarity with the inherent meanings of mass popular music is not, on its own, enough to engender a positive experience of inherent meanings in the classroom.

All in all, music which engenders a positive experience of both delineated and inherent meaning outside the classroom may well take on new, problematic delineations inside the classroom; these may in turn negatively affect responses to its inherent meanings; and on top of that, pupils’ familiarity with popular music’s inherent meanings is likely to turn sour if those meanings are approached in formal educational ways. In short, whilst popular music has been present in the classroom for many years, identification with its delineations, and familiarity with its inherent meanings have not been leading to experiences of ‘musical celebration’ for overwhelming numbers of school children. Thus many pupils tend to find themselves in an ambiguous or even alienated relationship to much classroom music, even when it is music that celebrates them outside the school.

POPULAR MUSIC, MEANING AND PRACTICE IN THE CLASSROOM

We have seriously overlooked something. One of the strongest, if perhaps implicit, delineations transmitted by popular music is the notion that its musicians acquire their skills and knowledge without any apparent need for education in the first place! Indeed, it has been a central part of musical ideology from rock to hip hop, and soul to reggae, that the music is a direct, unmediated and authentic expression of feeling, untrammelled by the dictates of convention, and arising naturally from the ‘soul’ of the musicians. In my current research, when 13 to 14 year-old pupils were asked how popular musicians acquire their skills and knowledge, two exemplary answers were: ‘They just play what they feel and stuff’; and ‘They get a guitar, and they go up to their bedroom’. Some children did also suggest that, for example, ‘They practice’ and ‘They get lessons’. However none of them showed any awareness of more fundamental and essential popular music learning practices. Whilst it is increasingly true that some popular musicians take formal lessons and even degrees in popular music nowadays, all popular musicians must engage in what have come to be known as informal learning practices. These differ greatly from formal music educational procedures and from the ways in which classical musical skills and knowledge have been acquired and transmitted, at least over the last two centuries or so (Green 2002a).

It is helpful to identify five main characteristics of informal music learning practices, along with some of the ways in which they are distinguished from formal music education. Firstly, in the informal sphere learners choose the music themselves, music which is therefore already familiar to them, and which they enjoy and strongly identify with. By contrast, in formal education, teachers usually select the music, and aim to introduce learners to areas with which they are not already familiar. Secondly, the main learning practice in the informal realm involves copying recordings by ear, as distinct from responding to notated or other written or verbal instructions and exercises. Thirdly, not only is the informal learner self-taught, but crucially, learning takes places in groups, through conscious and unconscious peer-learning involving discussion, watching, listening to and imitating each other. This is quite distinct from the formal realm, which involves adult supervision and guidance from an expert with superior skills and knowledge. Fourthly, informal learning involves the assimilation of skills and knowledge in personal, often haphazard ways according to musical preferences, and starting with whole ‘real world’ pieces of music; whereas in the formal realm pupils follow a progression from simple to complex, often involving a curriculum, syllabus, graded exam, specially composed music or exercises. Finally, throughout the informal learning process, there is a deep integration of
Production of the inherent meanings of popular music, in other words, seems devoid of the kinds of skills and knowledge normally associated with long and arduous study, such as would be appropriate for an education system and are necessities within the classical sphere. Perhaps it is partly this delineated lack of education on the part of its musicians that has in the past ‘deafened’ many music educators and musicologists to the specific properties of popular music’s inherent meanings. Again, like the Scandinavian critic, one could suggest, musicologists for much of the twentieth century allowed their understanding of the delineations of popular music to influence their perceptions of its inherent meanings. As mentioned earlier, new musicologists have been developing new analytic criteria that are more suited to the inherent meanings of vernacular musics, and such approaches may now be starting to enter the school. But to reiterate: analysis of popular music is not likely to engage school pupils in the classroom; and in any case, analysis bears no resemblance to how popular musicians actually learn to produce the music themselves.

How are we to bring a cultural form into an education system, when that cultural form loudly proclaims its own virtually complete independence from education? And not only how, but what for? Until recently popular music’s presence in the classroom has been restricted to a change of curriculum content. In developing this new content, we have focussed mainly on the music itself – the product – and have largely failed to notice the processes by which this product is transmitted in the world outside the school. Thus the changes we have made in our curriculum content lacked any corresponding changes in our teaching strategies. The point is crucial, because the ways in which music is produced and transmitted give rise to the nature of its inherent meanings, as well as, in different ways, to its delineations. If its authentic production and transmission practices are missing from the curriculum, and if we are unable to incorporate them into our teaching strategies, we will be dealing with a simulacrum, or a ghost of popular music in the classroom, not the thing itself. Positive experience of both delineated and inherent musical meanings will thus continue to slip out of the classroom so far as pupils are concerned, and an opportunity to engage pupils, not only in popular music but in music per se may have been lost.

INFORMAL LEARNING PRACTICES IN THE MUSIC CLASSROOM: SOME CURRENT RESEARCH

The main aims of my current research are to investigate the problems and possibilities of bringing at least some aspects of informal music learning practices into the secondary music classroom. This work, which is on-going at the time of writing, is supported by a large number of organisations and individuals, to whom I owe an enormous debt of acknowledgement and thanks. Details of how the work was done, and further examination of our findings to date can be found in other publications, although there is still much more to be done. Here I will restrict myself to considering those contours of the research which I hope can illuminate, or be illuminated by the theory of musical meaning put forward above.

The project has taken, and is taking, place in 22 schools so far, although the data here come from only eight of them: one pre-pilot and three pilot schools in London, and four main study schools in Hertfordshire. In each school we focussed on one Year 9 class (age 13-14). The project involves a series of teaching and learning strategies, each of which attempts to replicate, as far as possible, two or more of the characteristics of informal popular music learning suggested above; that is: allowing learners to choose the music themselves; learning by listening and copying recordings; learning in friendship groups with minimum adult guidance; learning in
personal, often haphazard ways; and integrating listening, playing, singing, improvising and composing throughout the learning process.

The first stage of the project, which contains the essence of the approach, draws on the first four of the above characteristics. In this stage, pupils were asked to bring in their own CDs, form small friendship groups, take the CDs into a practice space and choose one song (songs being the only genre that pupils brought in). They then had to copy the song aurally from the recording as a group, using their own choice from a selection of instruments. The role of the teacher was to spend much less time than usual teaching, and more time standing back. Teachers first of all observed and attempted to empathise with the goals that pupils set for themselves; then their task was to diagnose problems, and only at a later stage to offer guidance and act as a musical model for pupils to watch and imitate if they wished to do so.

What happens when a group of 13 and 14 year olds are told they can go into a room with several of their own CDs, a CD player, a selection of instruments, and copy a chosen song in any way they wish? All the teachers, myself and other project team members, were in some trepidation about how things would turn out. We have been consistently, pleasantly surprised. Here for example is an annotation from a recording of a group of five boys in an inner city London school in their second lesson. There was no teacher in the room, and the boys were not aware that they were being recorded. (Later they gave their permission for the recording to be used in research.)

David and John’s group are apparently mucking around. It sounds like chaos. Someone is playing something on the piano, nothing to do with the chosen song. The radio is put on. There is random drumming and talking.

David and John’s group 10 minutes later, still having had no teacher input. Something is emerging; John is working out the notes of the song on the piano (D E D E D E D E in a syncopated rhythm in the right hand, with a downwards-moving bass answering the upper melody in the left hand). Someone is playing the snare drum, trying to keep to the same rhythm as John. Discussion is occurring. Someone is singing along to the piano pitches.

A further twenty minutes later: you can hear the guitar now, and the opening has been organised. There is a beat using floppy sticks on the rim of the snare. Listening and counting are evidently occurring:

John: How many beats are there?
Inaudible discussion.
David: Hey you guys, I’m playing it now.
More inaudible talk.
Rahul: Hurry up.
John: How many beats, how many beats are there?
Rahul: Sixteen.
John: It’s either sixteen or thirty-two.

At the end of the lesson, the group gave a performance to the rest of the class, in which the drum-kit played a 16-beat opening in a quasi-rock style, finishing with a crash on the ride cymbal. Along with this the guitar played a melody of the opening notes as indicated above. At the ride cymbal crash the piano entered for a repetition of the melody, now played in unison with the guitar. There was hand percussion with pauses at appropriate structural moments. There was a sense of vitality in the playing, and we observed an air of serious concentration on the faces of the boys, who afterwards expressed considerable pride in what they had achieved.
How did these pupils move, with very little guidance or supervision, from apparent chaos to something musically organised and celebratory? Many answers emerge, from which I have picked just three strands here.

Firstly, I would like to consider the notion of ‘natural learning process’. At the very first stages of attempting to copy their chosen song, it was noticeable that in several groups, including the one above, the percussion played along with the rhythm of the vocal line or main melody, rather than the rhythm of the percussion. For example, in another concealed recording of a group of five girls in a different school, the kit-drummer can be heard attempting to play the rhythm of the lead vocal line of Jennifer Lopez’s hit ‘My Love Don’t Cost A Thing’. During the second lesson an explicit beat emerges, then disappears. At one point there is some discussion of whether the drums ought to be playing a beat. Gradually something approximating to a rock beat emerges. By the end of the third lesson the drummer is playing a basic rock beat with an occasional habanera rhythm inserted into it. She plays with sensitivity to the overall structure of the song, marking structural moments with an up-beat figuration, and enhancing occasional climactic moments with a hit on the ride cymbal. The idea of a beat, and the use of the drums to mark structural features, seems to have come to this group, and indeed most of the groups, almost ‘naturally’ and certainly without any teaching. This raises several questions, including whether children in general would tend to hear the relationship between percussion, melody, beat and structure in a similar progression, for example.

Secondly, there are issues of group ensemble and listening to each other. We have several examples of children all playing together in time to a common beat, whilst one of them is playing on the beat but in the wrong part of the bar – for example, playing one beat ‘out’ with everyone else. There are also quantities of examples of children playing together, but with one or more persons simply in a different time-zone to everyone else. In the classical world if this happened musicians would be bound to stop and start again. But in this informal classroom situation the pupils simply carry on as if nothing is the matter. In fact they tend to go on and on without stopping, for several minutes at a time. Some of them afterwards show signs of awareness that notes were in the wrong place; others are presumably unaware of it; either way, no-one says anything. This tendency to keep going and to avoid correcting each other raises all sorts of questions concerning the concepts of ‘flow’ and pleasure, co-operation, the kinds of aims that this approach to music-making and music-learning might entail, and their differences from those in the worlds of formal education and classical music.

Thirdly, the project raises questions about the nature of progression in connection with the role of the teacher. With several groups, children started off the first lesson by playing and singing quite accurately and well in time together, but in many cases there seemed to be a dip in about the second or third lesson, when they got ‘worse’ in various ways. In such situations our tendency and indeed, duty as teachers, is conventionally to offer help. However as already mentioned the role of the project teachers was to stand back and observe rather than to intervene in the normal way. To the surprise of all the project teachers, after a dip the pupils would ‘right’ themselves without our input. They also progressed much further than expected. As one Head of Music said ‘In a normal class I am working so hard, I am just making such an effort; they’re not working nearly as hard as I am. In this class, they’re doing the work; they’re learning’. In this way, the project has both raised the expectations of many of the teachers concerning their pupils’ capacities; and called into question whether progression always proceeds in straight, upwards sloping lines, or whether it involves what may be a natural process of getting worse before getting better.

At the end of the activities described above we interviewed pupils in the three pilot and four main study schools, in their small groups. One of the strongest responses concerned motivation, enjoyment and relevance. Here are a few comments taken from different interviews:

I’d prefer music if it was like this for like the whole of school.
This way we can actually learn about music.

This is more like the sort of thing you’re going to need when you’re older – like how to play an instrument rather than just how to read notes and stuff.

I thought it was good, it was fun, it was a challenge and I enjoyed it, I really enjoyed it.

It’s well fun – it’s probably our best lesson so far.

It’s unlike any other lesson that we’ve done before.

We asked pupils what they thought of the fact that they were ‘thrown in the deep end’ without any help from teachers. Nearly everyone agreed that not being taught was part of the fun. Some said it would have been ‘nice’ if they had got more help from the teachers. However on further investigation, many of these meant it was nice to have helped when it was wanted, but not when it wasn’t:

John: ….let’s say you’re learning, let’s say you’re in a band and have to do what we did or create a song, (inaudible) send us into a practice room and gives us some instruments and we can get on with it ourselves, and then if we had any problems, he could tell us how to solve things and we can learn it that way. By trial and error….

Researcher: And you feel that that’s a good way of learning, do you?
John: Well, yeah. ‘Cause you can learn what mistakes you made.
Wesley: I think that’s a better way. So, we tried to handle it ourselves but if we can’t do it someone will help us.

Many others implied that not being taught was educationally beneficial. For example:

You can learn more by yourself; you can experiment; there’s no-one telling you it’s wrong; you can’t do nothing wrong.

It teaches you that you can learn music on your own, you don’t need a teacher telling you what to do.

If you teach yourself, you feel better, ‘cause you realise that like you’ve done it all by yourself.

I’ve learnt that if you haven’t got any goals set for you, you’ve got to find some yourself.

I’ve learnt more in the last five weeks than I did in the whole of music last year.

Many pupils identified improvements in their listening abilities. We asked: ‘Since you’ve been doing the project, have you noticed any differences in the ways that you listen to music, say if you’re watching Top of The Pops [the most famous UK charts show], or something at home?’ Some looked bemused and shook their heads (although there are some interesting reasons for this which there is no space to examine here). Several immediately and forcefully said ‘yes’. For example:
I’ve been listening to music recently and I’ve like kind of picked up the different rhythms and stuff.

I think I listen to more the instruments now than the actual words.

I listen more to the beat more than the lyrics… I think [inaudible] we were really concentrating on the, like, rhythm and the beat of that song, and now, to me, like, in songs, the rhythm and that stands out more than… I don’t really take any notice of the words.

I listen to the instruments whilst playing in the background. Before I used to watch the musicians, see how they dance (laughs). Now as I listen to it - the instruments, how they’re playing in the background – I try to figure out what instrument they use.

Amongst a number of other findings, several pupils identified co-operation as a learning outcome.

Josh: I think I’ve learnt to, like, work more as a team, like listen to each other, whereas before like I used to like always be speaking over everyone kind of thing –

Researcher: Really?

Josh: Yeah but I’ve like got used to working as a group now better.

Sam: …before we was like told what to do, this time like we didn’t have to, we done it our own way –

Muhammed: We done it ourselves.

Sam: Yeah.

Muhammed: We didn’t have no teachers with us either.

Josh: And we chose to go in the group, we wasn’t told to, so we probably enjoyed it more and listened to each other.

Teachers unanimously identified music-listening as the main skill that developed, along with ensemble playing, instrumental and rhythmic skills. They were unanimous that motivation and enjoyment levels were significantly higher than normal, and were surprised to find group co-operation better than usual. They estimated that the majority of pupils, including and even especially those who are normally disaffected, applied themselves to the task all, or nearly all of the time. For example, one teacher said he was ‘shocked’ by the high levels of co-operation and application. A major factor in all this, it was felt, was the greater freedom and responsibility invested in the pupils. Teachers also agreed that whilst at first they found it a challenge to stand back, they learnt valuable new things about their pupils’ abilities and characteristics by doing so.

For the next four to six lessons (in the three pilot and four main-study schools only), pupils continued to listen and copy, firstly using structured materials taken from a funk song, ‘Word Up’ by Cameo. The song was broken down into separate riffs, so that each riff could be heard and played along with independently, making the task of listening and copying much easier. The riffs could then be combined within the student-group to form their own version of the song. Following this, pupils (in the main study schools only) had a second opportunity to choose a song to copy, then for the rest of the spring term they wrote their own songs in bands, with input from visiting musicians on some occasions.

CLASSICAL MUSIC: THE LITMUS TEST

That took us to the next major challenge which I wish to focus on here: the introduction of classical music. The rationale of this was to build on the increased motivation and the skills
acquired so far, and to continue the informal learning practice of listening and copying in friendship groups, but now drawing pupils away from what they already know and into the wider world of music. My hypothesis was that through a direct and positive engagement with the inherent meanings of music whose delineations were negative, pupils would experience that critical potential of musical autonomy which I posited at the beginning of this essay: that logical moment in which inherent meaning virtually frees itself from the narrowing straits of previously unquestioned delineations, through which freedom the delineations can reveal themselves as contingent, and thus, capable of changing.

Pupils were asked to listen to, choose and copy a piece of music from a CD selection representing the core of the classical canon – pieces by Bach, Handel, Brahms, Clara Schumann, Verdi, Strauss, Borodin, Satie and one contemporary piece played on ‘classical’ instruments, by the Penguin Café Orchestra. Six of the ten pieces were likely to be familiar to the pupils through contemporary television advertisements or common knowledge (such as Strauss’s ‘Also Sprach Zarathustra’ from the Kellog’s Cornflakes advert, or Beethoven’s ‘Für Elise’, the opening of which is regularly picked out on keyboard instruments by thousands of school children every term, at least in the UK). The other four pieces were completely unknown to pupils (such as the last movement of Brahms’ first symphony). Pupils undertook the exercise twice for three lessons each time. The first time they were given five pieces, all from TV adverts, and asked to choose one and copy it, with no structured guidance. The second time they were given ‘Für Elise’ and four other of the more obscure pieces. This time they had guidance from the CD, on which the recording of each original piece was followed by a simplified version in two parts, then independent, repeated 4 to 8-bar segments of the melody and bass parts, as with the funk song earlier in the year.

‘Miss, can we have another CD? This one’s all classical!’; and ‘Miss, why are all the songs slow?’ were amongst the first responses. In interviews both before and after this exercise, pupils had left us in little doubt about their views of classical music, or at least, the views they were prepared to express in a school context and in front of peers. This is not to belittle the importance of that context and those peers, for it is of course, precisely through social context and interaction that musical delineations take on their content and significance. Below is a representative excerpt from an interview conducted at the end of the exercise. It illustrates some of the ways in which pupils expressed their views of classical music; and also how, for these and many other pupils, those views began to change as they worked, through the informal learning practice of listening and copying, on the inherent meanings of classical music.

Researcher: …how do you think you would describe your views of classical music before you did this?
Bobby: I didn’t like it at all.
Joe: It’s not really my thing.
David: It’s pretty boring.
Bobby: Yeah.
David: Classical music is like –
Ahmed: Old people.
David: Yeah, this thing again, you’re like… It’s just boring. It does my ear in.
Matthew: It’s just repeated over and over again.
David: Yeah, pretty much.
Researcher: Right, OK. So what was your response when you first listened through to the CDs?
Matthew: Oh no!
David: Pretty boring. Didn’t really want to know ‘cause it’s like classical music, like, [yawns] I might as well fall asleep….
Researcher: Erm, how do you feel about the music that you chose and that you worked on?
David: Well, ‘cause we didn’t really know about it, we didn’t really know what it was about, and it was pretty boring. But now, I’ve progressed and know how to play it a bit, which is pretty cool.

Researcher: So, you don’t think it’s so boring now, is that what you’re saying?

David: Not at the moment.

Matthew: It’s boring when you don’t know how to play the tunes, but once you know how to play the tunes it’s like –

Bobby: It’s good.

David: It’s cool.

Matthew: ‘Cause you can actually get on.

Bobby: I wouldn’t say it’s as cool as like normal music.

David: Nah, it ain’t as street as like rap or hip hop….

Matthew: Before I thought it was rubbish because our grandparents listen to it.

Researcher: So what’s changed?

Bobby: Well we’ve learnt to play it kind of thing.

Matthew: We’ve added our own sort of new bits in it.

Bobby: And made it better.

Ahmed: And you get used to it.

Some other examples, each taken from a different group interview, are:

Maybe we don’t like listening to it, but as you do it yourself you’re like really proud of yourself, saying ‘Yeah, I can do classical music’, erm maybe I won’t listen to it on the radio or whatever, but I’ll still do stuff with it.

Before we did this I didn’t really like classical music. I’d still listen to it but not for a long time. And like, as, I think my views have changed because like I can have a little bit of joy in playing it – now that I know like how to do stuff.

If you don’t really like classical you can get to like it really, ’cause you can experience doing it.

Before we started the classical project we didn’t think it was as appealing to listen to classical music, but as we went on with the project we saw that people must have had a lot of talent, a lot of practice to be able to play the pieces. So it’s a lot more appealing than it was before.

Yeah, it’s like, like originally we personally would have thought that the people playing the music are like, no offence, but a bunch of show-offs really, cause like they were playing all the really complicated bits. But as it goes on, and as you’re trying to play it yourself, you’re like ‘oh you must have talent to be able to play something like that’.

Now I’ve listened to a bit more I see that it takes a lot more work to try and do classical music than it does like the pop music. ‘Cause most of the pop music they’ve all got like the same drum beat and things like that, where classical music is totally different.

Normally if I heard classical I’d just turn it off straight away, but I probably would actually listen to it now if it was on the radio.
THE POP/CLASSICAL SPLIT: MEANING, AUTONOMY AND AUTHENTICITY IN THE MUSIC CLASSROOM

Can the theory of musical meaning and experience that I put forward earlier shed any light on the project’s findings? I have argued that the distinction between the inherent and delineated aspects of musical meaning is purely logical. When we engage with music the two aspects come to us experientially as one unified whole. We do not usually, and often cannot, distinguish the one from the other, just as we sometimes find it hard to distinguish different kinds of love from each other. Because of this difficulty in distinguishing between the two meanings, they appear to be entangled. Thus delineated meanings appear to be a part of the inherent meanings – of the ‘music itself’. Our responses to delineations therefore seem unquestionable. The inherent meanings appear to contain the delineations as if the delineations do really reside immutably inside the music. The delineations seem to be immediate, that is, un-mediated by history and convention, not constructed, but natural, unquestionable and ‘true’.

I have suggested that the classroom context has a tendency to change pupils’ perceptions of music’s delineations, and that the delineations of popular music in particular do not fit well in the classroom. Additionally, popular music’s inherent meanings have been rather distorted by a pedagogy that has been slow to recognise the particular demands of popular music’s informal learning practices. Contrastingly, whereas popular music’s delineations do not fit in the classroom, those of classical music match very well with pupils’ pre-conceived notions of classical music as associated with work, studiousness, boredom, old people (read: teachers), irrelevance, and removal from everyday life. But such delineations, like all delineations according to my argument, do not stop there; they go on to affect pupils’ perceptions of classical music’s inherent meanings too – confirming that these also really are as boring as they seem!

This is where I wish to reclaim that discarded notion of musical autonomy. By paying attention to how children learn informally in music, whether it is applied to popular or classical or any other music, I wish to suggest, we allow an engagement with musical inherent meanings as a logical aspect of virtual musical autonomy from social contexts. For when they engage with music’s materials themselves, not only but especially through aural, informal learning practices, pupils are touching on an aspect of inherent meaning which is virtually freed for a moment from social context. They are having a direct effect upon inherent meanings, indeed they are bringing inherent meanings into being. They are thus able to imbue the music with a new delineated content of their own. They touch a quality of musical experience which, precisely because of its fleeting freedom from delineation, at the same time exposes the inevitability of delineation. Previous assumptions about classical music being old and boring, or about its listeners and practitioners being old, boring people or shows-offs, or about any other musical delineation, are then able to surface. The delineations are made audible as historical contingencies, rather than as a fixed and immutable part of the ‘music itself’. Then a host of new delineations, new conceptions become possible. It is through such experiences of inherent meanings as logically separable from delineation, and thereby open to any content, that new musical and social horizons can appear. The potential freedom, or autonomy, of such content from previously taken-for-granted assumptions and definitions of what music means is thus exposed. In that moment is the glimmer of an alternative reading of, and response to, the music as a whole.

In the case of popular music, to which school children are already generally positively inclined, such an experience simply makes the inherent meanings available to them – ‘Look, I can do this!’ . The delineations are then less likely to be negated by the formal educational demands of the classroom context, but turn around to belong once more to the pupils. But the litmus test of this theory is in the pupils’ responses to a music whose delineations they decry. As I have illustrated briefly above, in working directly with the inherent meanings of classical music through informal learning practices, pupils’ responses and openness to the music as a whole, and many of their assumptions about its delineated meanings, did in many cases change in positive
directions. Informal learning practices, now applied in some measure to classical music’s inherent meanings resulted, through that logical moment of virtual musical autonomy, in changing pupils’ understanding of not only the music’s inherent meanings but also its delineations. So, to give a short answer to the question that I raised earlier: can the experience of inherent meaning override and influence that of delineation? Yes, I believe so.

Before the project started, several teachers were concerned about issues of musical authenticity in the classroom, particularly in relation to the pupils’ ‘own’ culture of popular music. The lack of authentic popular music instruments, especially in the pilot schools where no funding was sought for additional instruments, would, teachers feared, be a disincentive; for the sound pupils could produce would bear little relation to the authentic sound on the recording.

Teachers also felt that the technical difficulty of replicating professionally produced music would be off-putting: pupils would consider their own products inferior and, therefore, inauthentic. But there has been nothing in our findings to suggest that pupils are as concerned about the authenticity of their musical products as adults expect them to be. I wonder whether the problem of authenticity in the classroom is an adult construction, caused by too much focus on the product, and as Christopher Small (1980) argued so eloquently many years ago, not enough on the process of music-making.

Perhaps we should aim, not for the authenticity of the musical *product*, but for the authenticity of the musical learning *practice*; or in other words, not for ‘musical authenticity’ so much as ‘music-learning authenticity’. In the case of popular music, this would involve changing pedagogy so as to approach popular music’s inherent meanings in ways that are more authentic to how the music is created in the world where it is born, outside education. But there has always been a problem of authenticity in the classroom with relation to classical music too. Indeed, no ordinary class of mixed ability children is likely to be able to play *any* kind of music in a way that is musically authentic. Again, the learning practices of classical musicians have also been removed, over a few hundred years, from the original contexts in which they too, used to be much more informal, deeply located within musician-family or apprenticeship networks, whereby young learners acquired their skills and knowledge by immersion in an adult community of practice, through listening, watching and imitating others. Perhaps we have gone too far in removing these practices too, into what could be called an ‘inauthentic’ realm of formal educational principles and procedures.

Finally, I want to connect the two concepts, of ‘musical autonomy’, and ‘music-learning authenticity’, to the concept of the ‘personal autonomy’ of the learner. For some attention to informal learning practices within music education could offer pupils a level of autonomy from their teachers, which would increase their capacity to carry on their learning independently, and thus to participate further in both formal and informal music-making beyond the school. It is no irony that practical involvement with musical inherent meanings through aural copying leads to an enhancement in the ability to listen to music; nor that this ability is likely to reach beyond the familiar and into new musical styles. For once ears have been opened, they can hear more. When they can hear more, they can appreciate and understand more. As I argued earlier, the greater the familiarity, the more positive the experience of music’s inherent meanings; and there is no better way to gain familiarity than by playing or singing music oneself, most particularly in the immediacy of aural transmission. Pupils can thus be celebrated by music in the classroom, through positive experiences of both inherent and delineated meanings, accessed via an engagement which is as authentic as possible in relation to musicians’ real world aural practices, and to how children and young people learn in music. Furthermore, beginning with pupils’ own, self-selected music, and using learning practices that come relatively naturally to them, pupils can be lead out: e-ducated.

In summary, what I am suggesting is that if we employ informal music learning practices in the classroom, at least for some of the time, this will help us to enhance the authenticity of the learning experience, allowing learners to ‘get inside’ the inherent meanings of music, freed for a
moment from specific, and therefore limiting, delineations. That way, learners can imbue music with their own, alternative, delineations. In so doing, music’s apparently immutable, fixed and ‘true’ delineations – about the nature of the music itself, the people who made the music, the people who listen to it, their social, political or religious values, beliefs and actions – is challenged. Precisely by acknowledging music’s logical moment of virtual autonomy from social contexts, we can appreciate how readily music becomes filled with social content and significance. By allowing learners some personal autonomy to explore authentically the inherent meanings of music in a moment of musical autonomy, we open their ears to the possibility of imbuing music with a much wider variety of delineations than children and young people usually realise are available. In so doing we also make available a new wealth of responses to musical inherent as well as delineated meanings from a variety of styles.

So many people have contributed to the makings of this chapter, in so many ways over the years, that it is impossible to name them. I would like to thank all my friends and colleagues at the Institute of Education and beyond, who have discussed their ideas and my ideas, who have shared teaching, tutoring, examining, course development, administration and editorial duties, taken part in research and offered support and inspiration in a hundred ways; with whom I have both laughed and cried, and from whom I continue to learn so much. I am grateful to all my students, who never cease to challenge and amaze me; and as always, my husband Charlie for being my intellectual soul-mate, and for the love and encouragement which have made my academic career possible.

NOTE

Parts of this chapter also appear with some minor differences in L. Green (2005a).


3. For authenticity in musical performance practices see Kenyon (1988), Cook (2003); for the issue of authenticity in music more generally see Fornäs (1995), and regarding popular music, for example, Middleton (1990), Moore (1998), Leach (2001).

4. In Music on Deaf Ears (Green, 1988) the theory was put to the task of trying to unravel the concept of musical ideology in relation to the reproductive effects of schooling; in Music, Gender, Education (Green, 1997) it was to interpret the gendering of music and how schools contribute to that. In (Green, 1999) these perspectives are conjoined. In a recent article, (Green, 2005a) I have re-worked the theory and made some tentative suggestions about the possibility of retrieving the concept of musical autonomy. In this essay I want to substantiate and ground that project by connecting the theory directly to current classroom research. Also see D. Clarke (2003) for an argument about the validity of the concept of autonomy.

5. This section and the one that follows it also appear in Green (2005a).

6. For history, information, critical accounts and arguments concerning the entrance of popular music into the curriculum in the UK, see for example, Swanwick (1968); Vulliamy (1977a, 1977b); Vulliamy and Lee (1976; 1982); Green (1988); Shepherd and Vulliamy (1994); Department of Education and Science (1986, 1992); Department for Education (1995); Swanwick (1992); Gammon (1999); and for Australian, US-American, Hong Kong and Thai perspectives respectively, Wemyss (1999); Dunbar-Hall and Wemyss (2000); Dunbar-Hall (1996); Rodriguez (2004); Ho (1999); Maryprath (1999).

7. For example see Bennett (2000) on the complexities of globalisation and localisation in relation to ethnic and social class identities and musical taste among young people; also see Alden (1998) with relation to young children, musical taste and ethnicity; and there are of course gender issues surrounding children’s concealment or revealing of musical taste, for which see Green (1997).
8. Amongst many others, I would like to thank Abigail Walmsley, our Research Officer and Project Manager, for her invaluable, insightful and extensive contribution to this research; John Witchell for having invited me to work with the Hertfordshire Music Service, and for his enthusiasm and support throughout; David Price and the Paul Hamlyn Foundation for including the work in their national ‘Musical Futures’ project and for their unflagging support; Hilary Hodgson and the Esmée Fairbairn Foundation for believing in the work in its early stages, and for continuing support; the Department for Education and Skills Innovation Unit for their support; the Heads of Music and many other music teachers in Hertfordshire and London, who have put heart and soul into trying out the teaching strategies in their classrooms; and of course, the children for being so inspiring and rewarding. Further information and updates about the national project of which this work is a part are available on the website of Music Futures (n.d.). Further details of the teaching strategies and outcomes, along with a set of necessary teaching resources and a documentary CD-ROM of the project is available in Green and Walmsley (2006). A full discussion of the project will be available in Green (in press).

9. Some of the data below are also considered in Green (2005b); further details will be available in Green (in press)

REFERENCES


Contributors

Yayoi BITOH (bitoya@cc.hokkyodai.ac.jp) earned her master degree in composition and in music education from Tokyo Gakugei University in 1980. Her teaching career began in 1980 when she started working as a music specialist in public high school in Tokyo, where she taught general music and Japanese traditional music. In 1999, she was appointed as Associate Professor at the Hokkaido University of Education teaching composition, Japanese music and traditional koto music. She has co-authored three books, including the Teaching Method in Junior High Schools (2000), and has published numerous academic papers. She is currently a member of the International Society for Music Education.

Suk-ching Estella CHAM-LAI (chamsclai@hotmail.com) graduated from the Kingston University, UK in 1985. Prior to that, she obtained her Advanced Teacher Certificate in Hong Kong. In 2001, she was awarded Doctor of Philosophy at the Kingston University, UK. In 2002, Cham retired from her post as Chief Curriculum Development Officer (Arts Education) of the Curriculum Development Institute, Education Bureau. During her service in the Education Bureau, she has launched various research projects that aimed at improving music education in schools. They include the teaching and learning of Chinese music, Cantonese opera and the application of information technology in music. These projects resulted in collaborations with arts organizations in the production of teaching materials and education television programmes. Cham is currently adviser of the Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra and guest lecturer at the Kingston University, Hong Kong Institute of Education and Hong Kong Baptist University.

Chi Wai Jason CHEN (cwchen@ied.edu.hk) graduated from the University of Missouri-Kansas City Conservatory of Music in 1995 with a BMus degree, majoring in composition and piano with a 4-year scholarship. A composer, pianist and researcher, he studied composition under the tutorship of James Mobberley and John Chen, and has written over 40 compositions including works for orchestra, chamber ensemble, electro-acoustic music, music for TV commercials and movie soundtrack. His works were published by Warner music, Universal music, Sony music, Capital Artist, What’s music and EEG Records. Jason has been currently the coordinator of the Associate of Arts (Music) degree program at the Hong Kong Institute of Education since 2002. He received his PhD in music technology at Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology (RMIT University), Australia, researching on multi-media music composition. He has presented research papers at the ISME, ATMI and ASME conferences.

Wai Yee Jane CHEUNG-YUNG (wycheung@ied.edu.hk) is Associate Professor and Music Division Head of the Creative Arts and Physical Education Department at the Hong Kong Institute of Education, Hong Kong. Her research interests are in music curriculum design and pedagogy, technology-based music instruction and the integrative arts. Her recent work was a research project on the effects of classification and framing on arts learning in Hong Kong. Jane has given keynote lectures in China and Japan. She was a member in the Arts Education Committee of the Curriculum Development Council and the Education Sub-Committee of the Hong Kong Arts Development Council. She serves as the Secretary General of the Asia-Pacific Symposium on Music Education Research and the Co-editor of the International Journal of Music Education Practice.

Martin COMTE (mcomte@ozemail.com.au), prior to his retirement, was Dean of the Faculty of Education & Training at RMIT University in Melbourne, Australia. He was appointed to the first Chair (Professorship) in Music Education established by an Australian university. He is a Past President and Honorary Life Member of the Australian Society for Music Education, and a
former Chair of the ISME Commission on Music in Schools & Teacher Education. He was the editor for many years of the *Australian Journal of Music Education* and the *Victorian Journal of Music Education*. Since leaving the university he has worked as an Education and Arts Consultant worldwide. At the same time he has continued to lecture at a number of universities and other institutions, including, the Victorian College of the Arts. He travels overseas to conduct Master Classes in piano and to train piano teachers. He has been a Consultant for the Victorian Education Department. His board membership has included the Australian Ballet School, Musica Viva Australia, the Chamber Strings of Melbourne, and the Youth Music Foundation. He has written on education, the arts and creativity, and is frequently invited as a conference speaker worldwide. In 2007 he was elected as a Fellow of the Australian College of Educators.

David FORREST (david.forrest@rmit.edu.au) is Associate Professor of Music Education in the School of Education at the Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology (RMIT University). He is the Publications Editor and member of the National Executive of the Australian Society for Music Education (ASME). He is a member of the Board of International Society for Music Education (ISME) and is a past-Chair of ISME Commission on Music in Cultural, Educational and Mass Media Policies, and was Convenor of the International Seminar on Implementation and Development of Policy in Music Education (Puerto de la Cruz, Tenerife, Spain July 2004). He is a member of numerous editorial boards of national and international journals.

Schalk FREDERICKS (Schalk.Fredericks@nwu.ac.za) obtained a BMus and Performer’s Diploma at the University of Cape Town in 1974, and plays the violin and piano. He has master degrees in Education, and Public and Development Management. He lectured at the Rand College of Education from 1976 to 1989 for Junior and Senior Primary teacher training and was appointed as music subject advisor in 1990. He is a music examiner for the Gauteng Department of Education and served as external examiner at the Johannesburg College of Education for a number of years. He is presently a member of the Academic Support Services Unit at the North West University in Potchefstroom, South Africa.

Joi FREED-GARROD (Jfreed@tru.ca) is Assistant Professor in the Bachelor of Education Program, Thompson Rivers University, Kamloops, BC, Canada and adjunct professor in the Graduate School of Arts and Social Science, Lesley University, Cambridge, Massachusetts, USA. Freed-Garrod completed her PhD degree in curriculum studies in 1998 from the University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada. Besides her teaching works, she has composed various instrumental and choral works for public performances and authored books for professional education and for children’s literature. She is also an active presenter at various international conferences.

Stan GARROD (sugarod@sfu.ca) received his MA degree in Geography in 1976 from the Simon Fraser University and is currently a PhD candidate in curriculum studies in the same university. He is the Head of Humanities in Brentwood College School in Canada. He is a professional researcher and writer who have published and edited more than 30 textbooks and other curriculum materials in Geography, History, and Economics, as well as many journal articles. Apart from text publications, he has also written, produced, edited and hosted various media programmes which had been broadcasted through television and radio.

J. Scott GOBLE (scott.goble@ubc.ca) is Assistant Professor of Music Education at the University of British Columbia in Vancouver, Canada. He began his music education career teaching in public school districts near Seattle, Washington, later serving on the music faculties of Haverford and Bryn Mawr Colleges, Boston University, and San Francisco State University. A specialist in vocal and choral music, he has conducted choirs and orchestras in professional,
community, and educational contexts throughout North America. His research focuses on topics in history and philosophy of music education, music cognition and semiotics, and music and social issues.

**Lucy GREEN** (l.green@ioe.ac.uk) is Professor of Music Education at the London University Institute of Education, UK. Her research interests are in the sociology of music education, specialising in issues of meaning, ideology, gender, popular music and informal learning. Her most recent work was a practice-based curriculum research-and-development project in which the informal learning practices of popular musicians were adopted and adapted for the secondary school classroom. It is due to be published as a book, *Music, Informal Learning and the School: A New Classroom Pedagogy* in January 2008. Green is the author of three other books, and numerous articles on music education. She has given keynote lectures and seminars in many countries within Asia, the Americas and Europe, and serves on the editorial boards of a number of journals including *Music Education Research*, *Radical Musicology*, *Popular Music* and others.

**Chi Chung HUNG** teaches English in a local secondary school. He received his BA (Hons) in Contemporary English Language from The Hong Kong Polytechnic University in 2001 and obtained his MA degree in Translation at The Chinese University of Hong Kong in 2007. He is also a committee member of The Hong Kong Jazz Association and a member of the Composers and Authors Society of Hong Kong Ltd. HUNG is the drummer of a local band '5 mins break', which has six years of performing experience in popular music. He also composed music and lyrics for the band. HUNG is now pursuing his Postgraduate Diploma in Education at the Chinese University of Hong Kong.

**Tadahiko IMADA** (timada@cc.hirosaki-u.ac.jp) is Professor at Hirosaki University in Japan, teaching music education based on philosophy, body movements and the concept of soundscape. He holds a BMus from Kunitachi College of Music in Tokyo; an MA from Simon Fraser University where he studied as a recipient of the Government of Canada Award; and his PhD is from the University of British Columbia in Canada. His publications appeared on many academic journals in the US, Canada, Australia, Sweden, Korea, Hong Kong, India and Japan. He is co-author of *A Little Sound Education* (together with R. Murray Schafer, 1996). Prior to joining the faculty at Hirosaki University, he was a postdoctoral research fellow at Roehampton Institute London in UK. He was Visiting Distinguished Professor at the University of Tennessee at Martin in the US in 2002. He has been appointed as Vice-director of the International Music Centre at Hirosaki University since 2005.

**Neryl JEANNERET** (nerylj@unimelb.edu.au) is Senior Lecturer and Head of Music in the Faculty of Education at the University of Melbourne. She has lectured to pre-service teachers in Australia, Canada and the United States and her publications include national and international journal articles as well as books and teacher support materials for the Australian Music Centre, Musica Viva, Opera Australia, the Sydney Symphony Orchestra, the NSW Board of Studies and the NSW Department of School Education. She was the National President of the Australian Society for Music Education (2003-05), and has been a member of the Editorial Board of the *Australian Journal of Music Education* since 1996. Her current research includes the role of arts organisations and community artists in education, and the development of educational software for the music classroom.

**Patrick M. JONES** (pmjones@bu.edu) is Associate Professor and Director of Graduate Studies in Music Education at Boston University where he teaches graduate courses in curriculum, research, and foundations of music education. In addition to his academic career, he is a Lieutenant Colonel and *Chief of Air National Guard Bands* being responsible for budgeting and
policy for all 11 Air National Guard bands in the United States. He has enjoyed an international career as a conductor of military and youth bands and is Conductor Emeritus of the *Sinfonisches Blasorchester Eifel-Ardennen*. He has served as an officer and on boards of various professional organizations such as the College Music Society Northeast Chapter, Pennsylvania Music Educators Association, and Philadelphia Academies Inc. He regularly presents research papers at conferences throughout North America and Europe and is an author of articles, reviews, and book chapters that have been published in Africa, Asia, Europe, and the USA.

**Ritsuko KOJIMA** (ritsuko@cc.osaka-kyoiku.ac.jp) is Professor of Osaka Kyoiku University, Faculty of Education Course, received her doctoral and master degree from the University of Nagoya, Japan. Her research topics include problem solving skills in music education, musical expression and thinking, and music curriculum development. She has widely published in international journal and has written six books in her research areas. She has been a member of committee for ministry’s curriculum guideline and valuation standards. She is also the chair of Japan Association for the Study of School Music Educational Practice.

**Chi Cheung LEUNG** (ccleung@ied.edu.hk) is Associate Professor at The Hong Kong Institute of Education teaching music analysis, composition and Chinese music. An educator and a composer, he received his education in Hong Kong, USA and Australia. His research interests cover areas including curriculum development, cultural and education policy, extra-curricular activities, music composition, and Chinese music. His articles have appeared in the *Action, Criticism and Theory, Asia-Pacific Journal for Arts Education, Australian Journal of Music Education, British Journal of Music Education, Finnish Journal of Music Education, and Music Education Research*. His musical compositions have been performed in USA, Hong Kong, and Singapore. He has lectured at various institutions in Australia, Canada, Germany, Hong Kong, and USA. He was the Chairperson of the Commission on Music in Cultural, Educational, and Mass Media Policies of the International Society for Music Education (2004-2006) and is currently Editor of the MayDay Group’s Comparative Music Education Project.

**Chia-ling LU** (chialing@ntit.edu.tw) (BFA in Chinese music; MME, PhD in Education) is Assistant Professor in the Department of General Education at the National Taichung Institute of Technology, Taiwan, where she serves as the coordinator of the arts division. She dedicates time to the teaching of Chinese, Hokkien, Hakka, and the Taiwanese indigenous people’s music, as well as computer music to undergraduate non-music majors. The teaching project of Hokkien and Hakkienese music was awarded a fund from the Ministry of Education in Taiwan in 2004. Her published articles addressed issues in community, multicultural, early childhood, and secondary school music education. She also conducted research projects for the National Science Council and serves on the editorial board of the Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences in Taiwan.

**Clarence MAK** (cmak@hkapa.edu) was born in Hong Kong. After returned to Hong Kong with his master degree in composition, he had been a free-lance composer and guitarist performer for years, giving talks and workshops in creative music making in various institutes and organizations. He joined the music Faculty of the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts (HKAPA) in 1987, teaching composition, electronic music and theory. His compositions have been featured in various concerts locally and internationally. Some of his works were broadcast by radios internationally and also recorded on CDs. He is currently the Head of Composition and Electronic Music of HKAPA, and the Vice-chairman of the Hong Kong Composers’ Guild, active in presenting his new compositions in concerts, as well as promoting music creation and related educational activities in young generation.

**Jay McPherson** (jay.mcpherson@bos.nsw.edu.au) is the Inspector of the Creative Arts for the
Board of Studies, NSW (Australia). In this role he has responsibility for the development of curriculum (Music, Visual Arts, Drama and Dance) from Kindergarten through to Year 12 as well as associated support and assessment materials. Jay completed his BMusEd at the University of Newcastle and his MEd in Creative Arts at the University of New South Wales. He was a secondary school music teacher and has held various other consultancy positions with the NSW Department of Education and Training. Prior to moving to the Board of Studies, he was a Head Teacher of Creative Arts. Jay has presented guest lectures at a number of universities in NSW and has presented at state, national and international conferences. His presentations and publications centre around music curriculum design and assessment practices in music education. Jay is currently the Vice-President of the Australian Society for Music Education and will assume the role of President in 2009. He represents music education on the Music Council of Australia.

**Julie MONTAGUE** (jmontague@tpg.com.au) is Head Teacher of Music at the Conservatorium High School, a specialist high school for gifted and talented music students. For the previous ten years she was the music consultant at the Curriculum K-12 Directorate, NSW Department of Education and Training, where she was responsible for resource development and implementation strategies to support music in NSW government schools. She has been involved in syllabus development, has been the Supervisor of Marking for Higher School Certificate Music, and was the National President of the Australian Society of Music Education from 2005-2007.

**Sandra L. STAUFFER** (s.stauffer@asu.edu) is Professor of Music Education at Arizona State University where she teaches both undergraduate and graduate courses. Prior to joining the ASU faculty, she was a faculty member and Coordinator of Music Education at the Peabody Conservatory of Music in Baltimore. She has taught general, choral, and instrumental music in the public schools of Pennsylvania, Michigan, Virginia, and Arizona. She is active as a textbook author, clinician, and consultant for music curriculum projects for school districts, education agencies, and music organizations throughout the United States and abroad. Her recent research focuses on children and adolescents as composers, and she has worked with composer Morton Subotnick in the development of software children can use to create and learn about music. She is currently working on a series of narrative studies of exceptional music teachers.

**Cecilia Chu WANG** (cecilia.wang@uky.edu) teaches music education at the University of Kentucky where she is Professor and also the Director of the Orff Schulwerk Teacher-Training Program. Currently, she is the Director of Graduate Studies. Wang received her PhD in Fine Arts from Texas Tech University, Lubbock, Texas. She has presented research papers in Asia, Europe, Australia, South Africa, Canada and the United States in the areas of music perception, Orff Schulwerk, multi-cultural music, arts education, and music teaching and learning. Her publication includes numerous articles in American and international journals of music education. She has served on the editorial board of the Journal of Research in Music Education, Journal of Music Teacher Education, and International Journal of Music Education: Practice, and several other journals. She and three co-authors have created an online Webliography for "Research Studies in Orff Schulwerk" (http://itc.uky.edu:16080/orff_research/).

**Jia-xing XIE** (xiejiaxing@tom.com) is Professor and Director of the Music Research Institute of the China Conservatory, the specially hired professor of the Art Institute of Henan University and a member of the External Examination Committee of the Hong Kong Institute of Education. He holds a Masters Degree in Composition and Theory (1988) and a PhD in Music Aesthetics (2004). He is the President of the Music Education Commission of Chinese Musicians Association (CMA), the Director of the Music Aesthetic Committee of CMA, the Director of the Music Psychology Society, the adviser of Asia Pacific Symposium on Music Education Research, and
Commissioner of the Commission on Music in Cultural, Educational, and Mass Media Policies of the International Society of Music Education. Xie’s recent major publications include: *Music Education and Pedagogy* (High Education Press, 2006), *Contexts of Musics —A Vision of the Music Hermeneutic* (Shanghai Conservatory Press, 2005) etc., and he has had over 80 major academic papers published on academic journals such as *People’s Music*, *China Music* and *Music Research* since 1994.

**Chun-fei YANG** (psycf@ntit.edu.tw) (BA in Counseling and minor in Business Education, Master of Counseling) is a licensed counseling psychologist and instructor in the Department of General Education at the National Taichung Institute of Technology in Taiwan. She teaches psychology, interpersonal communication skills, and career planning as well as engages in counseling at the Student Counseling Center. She published articles in professional journals about counseling ethic, cyber counseling, and career planning. She also has an enthusiasm in music, took piano lessons for many years, joined the chorus during junior high school, and served as the conductor of the school band during senior high school. Being a psychologist, she is interested in the psychological state of students in learning music, studying music therapy, and collaborating with others in conducting a research project for the National Science Council in Taiwan.

**Lai Chi Rita YIP** (lcyip@ied.edu.hk) (BA, LRSM, PGDE, MA, PhD) is Assistant Professor of the Department of Creative Arts & Physical Education, and the Course Coordinator of the Bachelor of Education (Honours) (Secondary) Four-year Full-time Programme of the Hong Kong Institute of Education. She has served on the Curriculum Development Council Ad Hoc Committee on Music Curriculum Development for Primary 1 to Secondary 3; the Committee on Music (Senior Secondary) of the Curriculum Development Council and the Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority. She is Commissioner of the Commission on Music in Cultural, Educational, and Mass Media Policies of the International Society of Music Education. In addition to being editors of books, guest editor and reviewer of journal papers, she has numerous papers presented in international music education conferences and published locally or overseas. Her research interests are in music curriculum development, assessment and learning, education policy, music creativity and technology pedagogy, and interdisciplinary education.
About the Commission

The Commission for Music in Cultural, Educational and Mass Media Policies was formed in 1976. Kurt Blaukopf was appointed as the first Chair of the Commission. Below are the names of the Commission Chairs, and themes of past seminars.

COMMISSION CHAIRS
1976-1982    Kurt Blaukopf
1982-1986    Luigi Del Grosso Destreri
1986-1990    Irmgard Bontinck
1990-1996    Peter Etzkorn
1996-1998    Nelly de Camargo
1998-2000    Terry Gates
2000-2002    Siegmund Helms
2002-2004    David Forrest
2004-2006    Chi Cheung Leung
2006-2008    Neryl Jeanneret

THEMES OF THE COMMISSION SEMINARS
1988   Changes in Professional Profiles of Music Educators Prompted by Technological Innovation
1990   Music Education and the Changing Media Landscape
1996   Policy Concerns with Media Influences on Music Listening
1998   Building Bridges between Mass Media, Technology and Music Education
2000   Globalization of the Music Media Industry: Policy Implications for Educational and Cultural Agencies
2002   Media and Music Education between Cultures
2004   The development and implementation of policy on music in cultural, educational or mass media policy and its interrelationships at the local, national and global levels
2006   The Impact of Policies on the Musical Development and Education of the Future Generation
2008   Contemporary Music Education and Local Musics: Policy and Practice

REFERENCE